Bioaccumulation of Uranium and Thorium by Lemna minor and Lemna gibba in Pb-Zn-Ag Tailing Water

## Merve Sasmaz, Erdal Obek & Ahmet Sasmaz

### **Bulletin of Environmental Contamination and Toxicology**

ISSN 0007-4861 Volume 97 Number 6

**Bull Environ Contam Toxicol (2016)** 97:832-837 DOI 10.1007/s00128-016-1929-x



Volume 97 Number 6 December 2016

#### EDITORIAL

Celebrating 50 Years of Publication: Year in Review! J. Gorsuch - D.J. Call 743 Neonicotinoids: Systemic Insecticides and Systematic

ORIGINAL PAPERS

Kinetic-Based Reactivity for Michael Acceptors: Structural Activity Relationships and Its Relationship to Excess Acute Fish Toxicity T.W. Schultz - A.O. Aptula 752

Quantitative Biomonitoring in the Detroit River Using Elliptio complanata: Verification of Steady State Correction Factors and Temporal Trends of PCBs in Water Between 1998 and 2015 K.G. Drouillard - M. Cook - T.A. Leadley - P. Drca -T. Briggs - G.D. Haffner 757

Occurrence and Biological Effects of Endocrine Disrupting Chemicals in the Yellow River (Zhengzhou Section) W.T. Song · Z.J. Wang 763

The Investigation of Perfluorinated Compounds in Surface Waters of the Xixi Wetland, Hangzhou, China H. Xu - J. Zhu - C. Lei - X. Xu - W. Wang - Y. Lu -D. Zhang 770

Cholinesterases in *Gambusia yucatana*: Biochemical Characterization and its Relationship with Sex and Total Length G. Rodríguez-Fuentes · V. Marín-López E. Hernández-Márquez 776

S. Kurwadkar - A. Evans 745 Kinetic and mechanistic reactivity. Isoprene impact on zozne levels in an urban area near Tijuca Forest, RETROSPECTIVE Rio de Janeiro C.M. da Silva - L.L. da Silva - S.M. Corréa -G. Arbilla 781

Spatial and Temporal Distribution of Current-Use Pesticides in Atmospheric Particulate Matter in Houston, Texas A.E. Clark · S. Yoon · R.J. Sheesley · S. Usenko 786

Regulatory Effects of Elevated Carbon Dioxide on Growth and Biochemical Responses to Ozone Stress in Chinese Pine (*Pinus tabulaeformis* Carr.) Z. Liu · W. Chen · X. He · S. Fu · T. Lu **793** 

Study on Airborne Heavy Metals in Industrialized Urban Area of Delhi, India P. Mandal · R. Sarkar · A. Mandal · P. Patel · N. Kamal 798

Long-Term Survey of Cadmium and Lead Contamination in Japanese Black Bears Captured in Iwate Prefecture, Japan I. Sato · K. Yamauchi · S. Tsuda 806

Concentrations of Heavy Metals in Commercially Important Oysters from Goa, Central-West Coast of India P.S. Shenai-Tirodkar · M.U. Gauns · Z.A. Ansari 813

128 BECTA6 97(6) 743-888 (2016) ISSN 0007-4861

Springer

Contents continued on back cover

To visit Springer on the Web: http://www.springer.com To e-mail the journal: bect@springer.com



Your article is protected by copyright and all rights are held exclusively by Springer Science +Business Media New York. This e-offprint is for personal use only and shall not be selfarchived in electronic repositories. If you wish to self-archive your article, please use the accepted manuscript version for posting on your own website. You may further deposit the accepted manuscript version in any repository, provided it is only made publicly available 12 months after official publication or later and provided acknowledgement is given to the original source of publication and a link is inserted to the published article on Springer's website. The link must be accompanied by the following text: "The final publication is available at link.springer.com".





# Bioaccumulation of Uranium and Thorium by *Lemna minor* and *Lemna gibba* in Pb-Zn-Ag Tailing Water

Merve Sasmaz<sup>1</sup> · Erdal Obek<sup>2</sup> · Ahmet Sasmaz<sup>2,3</sup>

Received: 3 July 2016 / Accepted: 21 September 2016 / Published online: 23 September 2016 © Springer Science+Business Media New York 2016

Abstract This study focused on the ability of Lemna minor and Lemna gibba to remove U and Th in the tailing water of Keban, Turkey. These plants were placed in tailing water and individually fed to the reactors designed for these plants. Water and plant samples were collected daily from the mining area. The plants were ashed at 300°C for 1 day and analyzed by ICP-MS for U and Th. U was accumulated as a function of time by these plants, and performances between 110% and 483% for L. gibba, and between 218% and 1194% for L. minor, were shown. The highest Th accumulations in L. minor and L. gibba were observed at 300% and 600% performances, respectively, on the second day of the experiment. This study indicated that both L. gibba and L. minor demonstrated a high ability to remove U and Th from tailing water polluted by trace elements.

**Keywords** Aquatic plants · Bioaccumulation · Uranium · Thorium · Tailing water

Ahmet Sasmaz asasmaz@gmail.com

> Merve Sasmaz msasmaz91@hotmail.com

Erdal Obek eobek@firat.edu.tr

- <sup>1</sup> Department of Environmental Engineering, Firat University, 23119 Elazığ, Turkey
- <sup>2</sup> Department of Bioengineering, Firat University, 23119 Elazığ, Turkey
- <sup>3</sup> Department of Geological Engineering, Firat University, 23119 Elazığ, Turkey

Although uranium (U) and thorium (Th) occur naturally in different geologic environments, drinking water, and food (WHO 2001; ATSDR 2013), they have consequences to human health due to the carcinogenic character and high chemical/radiological toxicities (USEPA 2002; Craft et al. 2004; Bhalara et al. 2014). U ores and their operation are a common anthropogenic source of U. Studies on Th have revealed that Th dust can cause an increase in lung disease, pancreatic cancer, and lung cancer (USEPA 2002). These serious health effects show the need for the decontamination of such areas, which can be achieved through phytoremediation (Lottermoser 2003; Pratas et al. 2014).

Phytoremediation is a method of decontamination that uses plants to substantially or partially remediate the metals or contaminants in sediment, sludge, soil, mining water, waste water, or ground and surface water. This method is also called agro-remediation, green remediation, vegetative remediation and botano-remediation (USEPA 2001). Aquatic macrophytes play a significant role in the protection of aquatic ecosystems, in particular their ability to remove heavy metals makes these plants an attractive candidate for the treatment of sewage, waste water, and industrial effluents (Mkandawire et al. 2004; Sood et al. 2012). The phytoremediation potential of aquatic macrophytes for heavy metals has been studied by Srivastava et al. (2008), Marques et al. (2009), Sasmaz and Obek (2009, 2012), Khan et al. (2009), Goswami et al. (2014), and Tatar and Obek (2014). Some differences in the accumulation potential of heavy metals have been observed.

Aquatic macrophytes have the fastest reproduction and growth rates as compared to terrestrial plants under different climatic conditions (Materazzi et al. 2012). Metal accumulation or uptake by plants has been extensively investigated in the literature, and *L. gibba* and *L. minor*, from the duckweed family, have been used as model

plants. L. minor and L. gibba commonly occur in wetlands. They adapt easily to varying conditions, grow quickly, and have great potential to remove contaminants from water (Dirilgen 2011; Rahman and Hasegawa 2011; Obek and Sasmaz 2011; Materazzi et al. 2012; Bocuk et al. 2013; Rofkar et al. 2014; Tatar and Obek 2014; Pratas et al. 2014; Favas et al. 2014; Goswami et al. 2014; Igbal and Khera 2015; Babarinde and Onyiaocha 2016; Sasmaz et al. 2016; Babarinde et al. 2016). The contaminant-removing ability of these plants has been studied to investigate the removal of U from the contaminated water of U mining areas (Pratas et al. 2012, 2014; Favas et al. 2014; Wang et al. 2015; Qureshi et al. 2015; Matveyeva et al. 2016; Iqbal 2016; Jha et al. 2016). The aim of this study was firstly to investigate U and Th levels in environmental contaminants in the Keban tailing water, which flows into the Karakaya Dam Lake, secondly to remove these metals from the tailing water by using L. minor and L. gibba, and finally to detect accumulation abilities of these plants for U and Th.

### **Materials and Methods**

The Keban mining area (Fig. 1) has been chosen because it is one of the biggest and abandoned Pb-Zn-Ag deposits in Turkey. The syenomonzonite and syenitic rocks around Keban also have high Pb, Ag, Zn, Cu, and As concentrations, and poly-metallic mineralizations such as F–Mo, Fe– Cu, Zn–Pb, and Ag-Mn have been observed there. Among the different types of mineralizations in Keban, Pb–Zn ores with high silver concentration are the largest economic deposits, mined for 6000 years according to Seeliger et al. (1985). Pb-Zn-Ag ores have been produced by these mining galleries (Akgul 2015), which were closed because of security reasons, but the galleries have common effluents. The chemical composition of this water can vary, depending on the type of mineralization and the composition of wall rocks.

In this location, the water samples, together with plant samples, were sampled daily. When these samples



Fig. 1 Geological and location map of the study area (simplified from Akgul 2015)

collected from the study area during an eight-day period, in the same time, the electric conductivity (EC), T °C, and pH of the tailing water were also measured. The T °C, EC, and pH were determined using a digital thermometer, an Orion conductivity electrode, and an Oaktan pH tester 30, respectively. The plants were systematically identified as *L. minor* and *L. gibba*, according to Davis's recommendation (1984).

The L. minor and L. gibba plants were brought to Firat University's laboratory from Istanbul University with separate containers, after that, adapted in separate reactors, and placed in each reactor (Fig. 2) as described in the details provided by Sasmaz et al. (2015). These reactors were operated under a sustained regime of flow volume  $(2.85 \text{ L} \text{ s}^{-1})$  of tailing water. Both *L. minor* and *L. gibba* samples were collected from the reactors daily throughout the experiment. The plant samples were washed with distilled water and then dried in an oven for 1 day. The dried plants were heated at 300°C to be ashed; then they were digested in HNO<sub>3</sub> (Merck, Darmstadt, Germany), mixed with HNO<sub>3</sub> and HCl at 95°C for 1 h, and analyzed with ICP-MS for U and Th. The operation conditions of A Perkine Elmer Elan 9000 ICP-MS to determine U and Th are given in Sasmaz and Yaman (2008). Minumum detection limits of ICP-MS are 0.01 mg kg<sup>-1</sup> for U and Th in the plants and 0.02 and 0.05  $\mu$ g L<sup>-1</sup> for U and Th in the water, respectively.

The U and Th accumulation potentials for *L. gibba* and *L. minor* were calculated by the following formula. The accumulation potential of Th for the second day in *L. gibba* = (LG2-LG0)/LG0; The accumulation potential of U for the eighth day in *L. minor* = (LM8-LM0)/LM0. The analysis of variance (ANOVA) from SPSS 15.0 software was used. The U and Th values belonging to *L. minor* and *L. gibba* were correlated with Na, Mn, Al, Fe, P, Mg, S, and K, using Spearman's correlation.



Fig. 2 L. gibba L. and L. minor L. were separately placed in each reactor

### **Results and Discussion**

The physicochemical parameters, anions, and cations of tailing water have been given by Sasmaz et al. (2015), except for U and Th concentrations. The mean U and Th concentrations in the tailing water were detected to be 42 and 0.22 µg  $L^{-1}$ , respectively, in this study (p < 0.5). The mean pH, temperature, and EC values were 7.36, 19.7°C, and 2.29 mS cm<sup>-1</sup>, respectively; these values remained fairly consistent/regular throughout the experiment. The mean U concentration in the study area was higher than the limit value (15  $\mu$ g L<sup>-1</sup>) of drinking water established by the WHO (2005). While Palmer and Edmond (1993) reported that the average U value in river water is ~0.3  $\mu$ g L<sup>-1</sup>, Favas et al. (2014) indicated that it has high concentrations (139  $\mu$ g L<sup>-1</sup>) such as two mining areas in central Portugal. At these points. U concentrations could be directly linked to mining activities since these streams were directly fed by mine drainage (Favas et al. 2014). U (VI) predominately occurs in an acidic environment (pH < 4.0) as  $UO_2^{2+}$ ; at higher pH ranges (4.0 < pH < 7.0), composite hydrolyzed ionic species occur, such as  $(UO_2)_3(OH)_5^+$ ,  $(UO_2)_2(OH)_2^{2+}$ , and  $UO_2OH^+$ . The average pH (7.36) of the tailing water in the study area is higher than 7.0 and, therefore, Wang et al. (2010) indicated that U (VI) easily precipitated in the water when the pH of tailing water was above 7.0.

Based on common cations  $(Mg^{2+}, Ca^{2+}, K^+, and Na^+)$ and anion  $(Cl^-, HCO_3, NO_3^-, and SO_4^2)$  contents, Mg, Na, and Ca are the dominant metals and represent greater than 90% of the composition of total cations. Sulfate and bicarbonate are the most dominant anions in the studied tailing water and represent 88–95% of the total anion composition in the tailing water. In this study, the water in the selected area has been classified as calcium-magnesium-sulfatebicarbonate water, based on total ion content.

The U levels before the experimental study of L. gibba (LG-0) and L. minor (LM-0) are 0.42 and 0.33 mg kg<sup>-1</sup>, respectively (p < 0.5). These U levels for both species are defined as the control group values of this study. From the first day, L. gibba and L. minor accumulated, respectively, 0.88 and 1.05 mg U kg<sup>-1</sup> on a daily basis. In the study, the values of U that L. gibba removed from low U concentration tailing water increased to 110% the first day, to 131% the second day, and to 200%, 252%, 293%, 326%, 381%, and 483% the following days (p < 0.5). The amounts of U absorbed by L. minor were 218% the first day, 282% the second day, and 406%, 530%, 497%, 797%, 945%, and 1194% the following days (p < 0.5). As presented in Fig. 3, the accumulation of U by L. gibba and L. minor increased linearly throughout the experiment. Although the tailing water had very low U concentrations (mean U concentration: 42 µg  $L^{-1}$ ), L. gibba and L. minor accumulated, respectively, 58 and 102 times more U than was originally





	Mn	Fe	Ca	Mg	Na	Al	К	Р	S
U	0.87	-0.56	-0.61	0.47	0.35	0.86	-0.81	0.88	0.93
Th	0.96	-0.53	-0.28	0.33	0.13	0.78	-0.64	0.65	0.68

Table 2
Spearman's correlation coefficients between some metals

with U and Th in Lemna minor
Image: Comparison of Compa

	Mn	Fe	Ca	Mg	Na	Al	K	Р	S
U	0.66	-0.11	0.15	-0.26	0.14	0.64	-0.58	0.26	0.95
Th	0.89	-0.13	0.14	-0.17	-0.48	0.36	-0.13	0.19	0.69

Fig. 4 Thorium accumula-

tions by Lemna gibba (LG) and Lemna minor (LM) under a sus-

tained regime of flow volume  $(2.85 \text{ L s}^{-1})$  of tailing water



For both *L. gibba* (LG-0) and *L. minor* (LM-0), Th values before the experimental study were 0.01 mg kg<sup>-1</sup>, which was also defined as a control group value in this study (Fig. 4). From the first day, *L. gibba* and *L. minor* accumulated, respectively, 0.02 and 0.02 mg Th kg<sup>-1</sup> on a daily basis (p < 0.5). Th concentrations in *L. gibba* increased to 100% the first day, to 600% the second day, and to 400%, 200%, 500%, 600%, 500%, and 800% the following days



(p < 0.5). As *L. minor* removed Th, these concentrations increased to 100% the first day, to 300% the second day, and then varied to 200% the fourth day, 300% sixth day, 100% seventh day, and 400% eighth day (p < 0.5). But it was observed to release back Th into the water on the third and fifth days. Soldo et al. (2005) reported that the reason of the de-accumulation of metals to the external environment by organisms are the interception of the potential toxic effects of metals to the structures as DNA and protein. Although the tailing water had very low Th content (mean Th concentration: 22 µg L<sup>-1</sup>), *L. gibba* and *L. minor* removed 409 and 227 times more Th than was originally contained in the tailing water.

As seen in Fig. 4, the removal of Th by *L. gibba* significantly increased in the second, sixth, and eighth days of the experiment; afterwards, this was seen by decreases and increases in the removal of Th. *L. minor* was also observed to have considerable increases in Th levels during the second, fourth, sixth and eighth days, and decreases were shown on the third, fifth, and seventh days. *L. gibba* was detected to have a higher Th-removal ability than *L. minor*, compared to control group Th concentration for both *L. minor* and *L. gibba* (Fig. 4). Th had a strong positive correlation (p < 0.5) with the Mn, Al, P and S in *L. gibba* (Table 1) and Mn and S in *L. minor* (Table 2). Th showed weak negative correlations with K and Fe in *L. gibba* (Table 1) and Na in *L. minor* (Table 2).

Based on their study of U mining in Saxony, Germany, Mkandawire and Dudel (2005) pointed out that L. gibba was one of the best examples of accumulator plants, showing that its U concentration ranged between 514 and 612 mg kg<sup>-1</sup> U dry biomass. Sasmaz and Obek (2009) studied the accumulation performance of L. gibba for U from secondary effluents, and they indicated that L. gibba significantly accumulated the highest concentration (122%) of U in the first 2 days. However, in the following days, some decreases and increases were seen in the accumulation level, depending on the saturation level of the plants. Members of Lemnaceae (duckweeds), including Lemna, Spirodella, Wolffia, and Wolffiella, are the most favored plants for phytoremediation, and they have been intensively described in the literature (Miretzky et al. 2004; Rahman et al. 2007; Pratas et al. 2012). Pratas et al. (2012) found a set of vegetable species with the ability to accumulate U in higher values despite very low U content in the fresh water of central Portugal. The highest U concentration was found in filamentous algae in the residual water of the tailing pond at Jaduguda, India. U level in filamentous algae was detected to change between 0.1 and 97.8 mg kg<sup>-1</sup> (Khalid et al. 2004). These species showed great potential for phytoremediation because they were rampant and easy to grow in their native conditions. Among free floating and submerged plants filamentous algae, Jussiaea and Pistia

had high bioproductivity, biomass and uranium accumulation (Jha et al. 2016).

The aquatic plants L. gibba and L. minor were used for the accumulation of U and Th in tailing water belonging to a Pb-Zn mining area as an alternative method for cleaning and rehabilitating water contaminated with U and Th. The results demonstrate that U was absorbed by L. gibba and L. minor with a linear increase during the eight-day period. Th was absorbed effectively by both L. gibba and L. minor on the first 2 days of the experimental study. On the following days, increases and decreases in the accumulation performances of Th were seen, likely due to the saturation levels of the plants being reached. As a result, this study was revealed to be a feasible and cost effective method for the removal of U and Th by the phytoremediation from radioactively contaminated water. Therefore, it is recommended that these plants should be harvested at the right time for the protection of human health and the environment because they contained more concentrations of U and Th in stated days. Future studies should be focused on cleaning and rehabilitating waters contaminated with U and Th in mining areas and municipality wastewater treatment plant.

### References

- Akgul B (2015) Geochemical associations between fluorite mineralization and A-type shoshonitic magmatism in the Keban–Elazig area, East Anatolia, Turkey. J Afr Earth Sci 111:222–230
- ATSDR (2013) Agency for toxic substances and disease registry. A toxicological profile for uranium. U.S. Department of Health and Human Services. Public Health Service pp. 1–526
- Babarinde A, Onyiaocha GO (2016) Equilibrium sorption of divalent metal ions onto groundnut (Arachis hypogaea) shell: kinetics, isotherm and thermodynamics. Chem Int 2:37–46
- Babarinde A, Ogundipe K, Sangosanya KT, Akintola BD, Elizabeth Hassan AO (2016) Comparative study on the biosorption of Pb(II), Cd(II) and Zn(II) using Lemon grass (Cymbopogon citratus): kinetics, isotherms and thermodynamics. Chem Int 2:89–102
- Bhalara P, Punetha D, Balasubramanian K (2014) A review of potential remediation techniques for uranium (VI) ion retrieval from contaminated aqueous environment. J Environ Chem Eng 2:1621–1634
- Bocuk H, Yakar A, Türker OC (2013) Assessment of *Lemna gibba* as a potential ecological indicator for contaminated aquatic ecosystem by boron mine effluent. Ecol Indic 29:538–548
- Craft ES, Abu-Qare AW, Flaherty MM, Garofolo MC, Rincavage HL, Abou-Donia MB (2004) Depleted and natural uranium: chemistry and toxicological effects. J Toxic Environ Health Part B 7:297–317
- Davis PH (1984) Flora of Turkey and East Eagen Islands, vol 8. University Press, Edinburgh
- Dirilgen N (2011) Mercury and lead: assessing the toxic effects on growth and metal accumulation by *Lemna minor*. Ecotoxicol Environ Saf 74:48–54
- Favas PJC, Pratas J, Varun M, D'Souza R, Paul MS (2014) Accumulation of uranium by aquatic plants in field conditions: prospects for phytoremediation. Sci Total Environ 471:993–1002

- Goswami C, Majumder A, Misra AK, Bandyopadhyay K (2014) Arsenic uptake by *Lemna minor* in hydroponic system. Int J Phytoremed 16:1221–1227
- Iqbal M (2016) Vicia faba bioassay for environmental toxicity monitoring: a review. Chemosphere 144:785–802
- Iqbal M, Khera RA (2015) Adsorption of copper and lead in single and binary metal system onto Fumaria indica biomass. Chem Int 1:157–163
- Jha VN, Tripathi RM, Sethy NK, Sahoo SK (2016) Uptake of uranium by aquatic plants growing in fresh water ecosystem around uranium mill tailings pond at Jaduguda, India. Sci Total Environ 539:175–184
- Khalid A, Shabana ES, Almasoud FI (2004) Accumulation of uranium by filamentous green algae under natural environmental conditions. J Radioanal Nucl Chem 260(3):683–687
- Khan S, Ahmad I, Shah M, Rehman MT, Khaliq SA (2009) Use of constructed wetland for the removal of heavy metals from industrial wastewater. J Environ Manag 90:3451–3457
- Lottermoser BG (2003) Mine wastes—characterization, treatment and environ-MENTAL impacts. Springe, Berlin
- Marques APGC, Rangel AOSS, Castro PML (2009) Remediation of heavy metal contaminated soils: phytoremediation as a potentially promising clean-up technology. Crit Rev Environ Sci Technol 39:622–654
- Materazzi S, Canepari S, Aquili S (2012) Monitoring heavy metal pollution by aquatic plants. Environ Sci Pollut Res 19:3292–3298
- Matveyeva I, Jacimovic R, Planinsek P, Smodis B, Burkitbayev M (2016) Uptake of uranium, thorium and radium isotopes by plants growing in dam impoundment Tasotkel and the Lower Shu region (Kazakhstan). Radiochim Acta 104/1:51–57
- Miretzky P, Saralegui A, Cirelli AF (2004) Aquatic macrophytes potential for the simultaneous removal of heavy metals (Buenos Aires, Argentina). Chemosphere 57(8):997–1005
- Mkandawire M, Dudel EG (2005) Accumulation of arsenic in Lemna gibba (duck-weed) in tailing water of two abandoned uranium mining sites in Saxony, Germany. Sci Total Environ 336 (1-3):81-88
- Mkandawire M, Taubert B, Dudel EG (2004) Capacity of Lemna gibba L. (Duckweed) for uranium and arsenic phytoremediation in mine tailing waters. Int J Phytoremed 6:347–362
- Obek E (2009) Bioaccumulation of heavy metals from the secondary treated municipal waste water by *Lemna gibba*. Fresenius Environ Bull 18 (11a):2159–2164
- Obek E, Sasmaz A (2011) Bioaccumulation of aluminum by *Lemna* gibbafrom secondary treated municipal wastewater effluents. Bull Environ Contam Toxicol 86:217–220
- Palmer MR, Edmond JM (1993) Uranium in river water. Geochim Cosmochim Acta 57:4947–4955
- Pratas J, Favas PJC, Paulo C, Rodrigues N, Prasad MNV (2012) Uranium accumulation by aquatic plants from uranium-contaminated water in Central Portugal. Int J Phytorem 14:221–234
- Pratas J, Paulo C, Favas PJ, Venkatachalam P (2014) Potential of aquatic plants for phytofiltration of uranium-contaminated waters in laboratory conditions. Ecol Eng 69:170–176
- Qureshi K, Ahmad M, Bhatti I, Iqbal M, Khan A (2015) Cytotoxicity reduction of wastewater treated by advanced oxidation process. Chem Int 1:53–59

- Rahman MA, Hasegawa H (2011) Aquatic arsenic: phytoremediation using floating macrophytes. Chemosphere 83:633–646
- Rahman MA, Hasegawa H, Ueda K, Maki T, Okumura C, Rahman MM (2007) Arsenic accumulation in duckweed *Spirodela polyrhiza*: a good option for phytoremediation. Chemosphere 69(3):493–499
- Rofkar JR, Dwyer DF, Bobak DM (2014) Uptake and toxicity of arsenic, copper and silicon in *Azolla carolinniana* and *Lemna minor*. Int J Phytoremed 16:155–166
- Sasmaz A, Obek E (2009) The accumulation of arsenic, uranium, and boron in *Lemna gibba* exposed to secondary effluents. Ecol Eng 35:1564–1567
- Sasmaz A, Obek E (2012) The accumulation of silver and gold in *Lemna gibba* exposed to secondary effluents. Chem Erde Geochem 72 (2):149–152
- Sasmaz A, Yaman M (2008) Determination of uranium and thorium in soil and plant parts around abandoned Pb-Zn-Cu mining area. Commun Soil Sci Plant Anal 39:2568–2583
- Sasmaz M, Topal EIA, Obek E, Sasmaz A (2015) The potential of Lemna gibba and Lemna minor to remove Cu, Pb, Zn, and As in tailing wastewater in a mining area in Keban. Turkey. J Environ Manag 163:246–253
- Sasmaz A, Dogan IM, Sasmaz M (2016) Removal of Cr, Ni, and Co in the water of chromium mining areas by using *Lemna gibba* L. and *Lemna minor* L.. Water Environ J. doi:10.1111/wej.12185
- Seeliger TC, Pernicka E, Wagner GA, Begemann E, Schimitt-Strecker S, Eibner C, Oztunali O, Baranyi I (1985) Archaeometry of underground mining works of North and East Anatolia, Turkey. In: Jahrbuch des Romisch Germanischen Zentralmuseums. Romisch Germanischen Zentralmuseums, Mainz, p 597–659
- Soldo D, Hari R, Sigg L, Behra R (2005) Tolerance of oocystis nephrocytioides to copper: intracellular distribution and extracellular complexation of copper. Aquat Toxicol 71:307–317
- Sood A, Uniyal PL, Prasanna R, Ahluwalia AS (2012) Phytoremediation potential of aquatic macrophyte, *Azolla*. Ambio 41:122–137
- Srivastava J, Gupta A, Chandra H (2008) Managing water quality with aquatic macrophytes. Rev Environ Sci Biotechnol 7:255–266
- Tatar SY, Obek E (2014) Potential of *Lemna gibba* and *Lemna minor* for accumulation of boron from secondary effluents. Ecol Eng 70:332–336
- USEPA (2001) A citizens guide to phytoremediation. Technical report. Environmental Protection Agency, Washington
- USEPA (2002) EPA facts about thorium. United States Environmental Protection Agency, Washington
- Wang J, Hu X, Wang J, Bao Z, Xie S, Yang J (2010) The tolerance of *Rhizopus arrihizus* to U(VI) and biosorption behavior of U(VI) on to *R. arrihizus*. Biochem Eng J 51:19–23
- Wang D, Zhou S, Liu L, Du L, Wang J, Huang Z, Ma L, Ding S, Zhang D, Wang R, Jin Y, Xia C (2015) The influence of different hydroponic conditions on thorium uptake by *Brassica juncea var. Foli*osa. Environ Sci Pollut Res 22 (9):6941–6949
- WHO (2001) Depleted uranium, sources, exposure and health effects. WHO, Geneva
- WHO (2005) Uranium in drinking-water. Background document for development of WHO guidelines for drinking-water quality. Elsevier, Amsterdam, p 18