

EXAMINATION OF MOBBING BEHAVIORS EXPERIENCED BY THE PERSONNEL WORKING AT YOUTH SERVICES AND PROVINCIAL DIRECTORATES OF SPORTS

Serkan Hacicaferoglu^{1*}, Dr. Cemal Gundogdu², Ali Serdar Yucel², Dr. Mehmet Acet³

¹Inonu University, Physical Education and Sports Colleges, Malatya,

²Firat University, Physical Education and Sports Colleges, Elazig

³Dumlupinar University, Physical Education and Sports Colleges, Kutahya (TURKEY)

*Corresponding author: serkanhacicaferoglu@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

The purpose of this research is to examine mobbing behaviors experienced by the personnel working at Youth Services and Provincial Directorates of Sports according to their sex, age, marital status, occupational seniority and graduated school.

The research is such made by using general scanning model. The personnel working at the district and provincial offices of Youth Services and General Directorate of Sports constitute the population of the research and 325 personnel working at Youth Services and Provincial Directorates of Sports selected randomly from the population in 25 provinces constitute the sample of the research. The data regarding mobbing actions experienced by the personnel was collected by using "Negative Acts Questionnaire" (NAQ). "Negative Acts Questionnaire" (NAQ) was developed by Einarsen and Raknes (1) and adapted to Turkish by Cemaloglu (2). Cronbach Alpha reliability coefficient of the subjected scale was re-calculated and determined to be 0,89. During the analysis of data frequency (f), percentage distribution (%), arithmetic average (x), -t and F tests were used and data were analyzed by means of SPSS 15,00 packaged software. Significance level was accepted as 0.5 in order to determine whether a difference exists between the variants applied in the questionnaire.

As a result of our research it was determined that 44% of the personnel working in GHSİM (Youth Services and General Directorate of Sports) suffered mobbing behaviors. When the questionnaire results are analyzed it is seen that women exposed more mobbing behaviors comparing to men, those between 21-30 age group exposed more mobbing behaviors comparing to other age groups, those married exposed more mobbing behaviors comparing to single and divorced, those having 1-10 years of seniority exposed more mobbing behaviors comparing to those having other seniorities, those having bachelor's degree and associate degree exposed to more mobbing behaviors comparing to other graduates.

It was determined that there is a significant difference between mobbing experiencing levels according to sex, age, occupational seniority and graduated school of the GHSİM personnel and no significant difference according to marital status variant.

Key words: Mobbing, Psychological Violence, Youth Services and Provincial Directorate of Sports

1. INTRODUCTION

It is a known fact that the concept of mobbing researched in a rising interest by those working in the field of organizational psychology was exposed either directly or indirectly by almost everyone in the business life and highly influences the business life and work efficiency negatively (3).

Field (4) defines the mobbing as "negative behaviors made as a continuous and cruel assault to the self reliance and self esteem of a person or persons". Leymann (5) defines the concept of mobbing as "psychological violence and psycho-terror that appear with hostile and immoral practices consulted by one or several persons systematically to the other persons".

Mobbing can be evaluated together with many concepts in literature. In Turkish, concepts chosen for use in place of mobbing are such concepts as psychological terror, emotional lynching, psychological abuse, emotional assault and mobbing. It is also emphasized that these concepts do not meet the exact equivalence of mobbing.

The concept of mobbing used first time in 1960s by the scientist Kontrans Lorenz who studied animal behaviors (6). Lorenz defined the contra attacks coming from the smaller animal groups against bigger animal threats with this word (7). Lorenz used the concept of "mobbing" in order to emphasize the seriousness of these behaviors which isolates the victim and bring it almost to suicide due to desperation. Later Swedish scientist Peter Paul Heinemann studied this concept among children and it was seen that he defined tyranny and bullying type of behaviors applied by a group of strong children against the other weak children as mobbing (8).

When it comes to 1980s Heinz Leymann used the concept of mobbing to define the violence, pressure and mobbing actions in business life. As a result of the researches of Leyman executed in Sweden and Germany it was determined that the abuse and mobbing actions also widely take place in business life. In 1984 Leymann published his research findings in one of his work and after his study the concept of "mobbing" was started to be used covering the emotional abuse and assault in work places (9).

When looking at the personal features of those exposed to mobbing behaviors it was observed that most of the victims were mature in their professions and that they were creative, honest and successful. As losing their job

deeply influences these people, the individuals had rough days as they cannot cope with stress and have health problems due to their highly emotional, skeptic, angry and lower self esteem (10, 11).

Not an exact conclusion has been reached regarding the personal features of those applying mobbing. Hoel et al. (1999) puts the idea that not a single personality can be talked about those who apply mobbing. Those applying to mobbing are defined mostly as aggressive persons having weak personalities who try to compensate his/her missing parts, fear and doubts for humiliating another person (12, 13). It is seen that those who applies to mobbing are intolerant to differences and are those who think himself/herself superior or try to be superior, over controlling and jealous persons. Furthermore these are kind of people having fun with the difficult situations of the person/s they targeted and trying to cover their own insufficiencies by doing so (10).

It is seen that mobbing behaviors also cause negative results on organizations too. Researches made concerning the negative results on the individuals are found through the measurement of the psychological and psychosomatic findings left over victims by the actions. These researches determined that there is an important relationship between experiencing mobbing in organizations and rise of psychological and psychosomatic health complaints (14).

Baltaş ve Baltaş (1998) made a research in order to determine the relationships between experiencing mobbing actions and psychological and psychosomatic health complaints and determined that 27% of those experiencing mobbing had psychological complaints and 10% of them had psychosomatic complaints (15). It was seen that such diseases as coronary heart diseases, digestive system diseases, hypertension, stress and depression result from the work environment and working conditions of the person. Scientists and psychologists stress that such mobbing actions drag those who are exposed to intense mobbing actions to even suicide (8).

Experiencing stress among the workers shows that the relationships between the personnel in the organizations have corrupted (5, 16, 17). According to Namie (18) 82% of persons resorting mobbing and those facing mobbing leave the organization, 34% of the persons leaving the organization leave due to the resulting health reasons, 44% of them leave due to the fact that performance assessment system of the organization easily label them as "insufficient" or they leave due to the decision of the administration of the organization. This state increases the personnel cycle costs.

Davenport et.al (8) and Einarsen and Raknes (1) determined in their research that mobbing cause psychological disorder, disability, seclusion, separation pain, loss of vocational identity and friendships, stress, unemployment, looking for job, moving, unemployment cost, working under capacity, therapy costs, experiencing family problems, income loss and disturbance on workers. Furthermore in other studies it was reached that mobbing has also other effects such as treatment and accident costs, conflict, diseased organization culture, limited creativity, increase of sick leaves, low efficiency, loss of specialty, paying compensation to the workers and legal fees (8).

In legal terms looking at the negative impacts rose over the individual and organization it is seen that there are different approaches universally on the subject of mobbing. It was determined that mobbing is seen as a crime with various legal articles in many countries abroad. In Turkey the feeling of mobbing entered to our regulation as a "Concept of Mobbing" with a change prepared by the 417th article of the Code of Obligations (19).

Even though new arrangements are made legally concerning the mobbing no special arrangement has been made yet regarding the subject. However, the mobbing concept has been interpreted by the business law and by certain provisions of other laws and it was subjected to the cases and slowly started to be defined by the legal decisions.

2. MATERIAL AND METHOD

2.1. Purpose of the Research

The purpose of this research is to examine mobbing behaviors experienced by the personnel working at Youth Services and Provincial Directorates of Sports in working environments according to their sex, age, marital status, occupational seniority and graduated school and to bring solution suggestions.

2.2. Population of the Research

All personnel working at Youth Services and Provincial Directorates of Sports constitute the population of the research. 325 personnel working at Youth Services and Provincial Directorates of Sports selected randomly from the population in 25 provinces constitute the sample of the research.

In the research "general scanning model" which is one of the descriptive scanning methods has been used in the research. The questionnaire used in the research is made up of three sections. Demographical variants in the first section of the questionnaire, "negative acts questionnaire" in the second section of the questionnaire in order to determine personnel's mobbing action exposure state and closed ended questions were asked to the participants in order to determine generally by whom the negative behaviors are resorted. Negative Acts Questionnaire used in this study was developed by Einarsen and Raknes (1) and adjusted to Turkish by Cemaloglu (2). The questionnaire aims to determine the level of experiencing various negative behaviors and the frequency level of mobbing action through the five point likert scale. It was also tried to be determine how often the participants exposed to mobbing actions in last six months. 21 articles of the scale used by Cemaloglu (2) were collected under one factor and determined that the total variant was 0,71, Cronbach's Alpha coefficient of the articles were 9,94 and their factor loads were between 0,59 and 0,87 (9). In this study Cronbach's Alpha coefficient of the scale was re-calculated and determined to be 0,89.

The questionnaire questions whose validity and reliability are in acceptable quality were analyzed with the help of SPSS packaged program. -t and F test was used as statistical method. In order to find the distribution of

the participants of the questionnaire it was benefited from (f), percentage (%) distribution and arithmetic averages (\bar{x}). In order to determine whether a significant difference exists between the variants or not, significance level was taken as 0.05.

The grading used in order to determine psychological mobbing experiencing levels according to different variants (sex, age, marital status, occupational seniority and graduated school type) was given in Table 1.

Table 1. Grading for Experiencing Psychological Mobbing Level

	Points	Mobbing Level
Each Month	4.21 - 5.00	High
Each Week	3.41 - 4.20	Upper Intermediate
Each Day	2.61 - 3.40	Intermediate
Occasionally	1.81 - 2.60	Lower Intermediate
Never	1.00 - 1.80	Low

3. FINDINGS

In this section the data taken from the personnel of Youth Services and Provincial Directorate of Sports and the statistical findings concerning this data have been given.

Table 2. Working personnel's exposure ratio to the mobbing

Have you experienced mobbing actions in last six months?	n	f	%	\bar{x}
No		182	56,0	
Rarely		60	18,5	
Sometimes	325	69	21,2	1,75
Often		10	3,1	
Always		4	1,2	

In Table 2, 56% (f=182) of the personnel working in Youth Services and Provincial Directorate of Sports stated that they didn't experience mobbing actions in last six months but 21,2% (f=69) of them stated that they sometimes experienced mobbing actions, 18,5% (f=60) of them stated that they rarely experienced mobbing actions, 3,1% (f=10) of them stated that they often experienced mobbing actions and 1,2% of them stated that they always experienced mobbing actions (f=4).

Table 3. t test analysis of the mobbing exposure levels of the personnel according to their sex

Variants	n	f	%	\bar{x}	t	p
Sex	Male	223	68,6	1,73	4,39	,000
	Female	325	102	31,4		
p<0,05						

It is seen on Table 3 that the mobbing actions show a significant difference (p<0,05) according to the sex. It was determined that the women ($\bar{x} = 2,00$) were exposed to more mobbing actions comparing to men ($\bar{x} = 1,73$).

Table 4. F test analysis of the mobbing exposure levels of the personnel according to their age

Variants	n	f	%	\bar{x}	F	p	Significant difference
21-30 years old		139	42,8	2,06	27,259	,000	1-2, 1-3 1-4
31-40 years old		87	26,8	1,76			
41- 50 years old	325	75	23,1	1,55			
51 years old and above		24	7,4	1,46			
p<0,05							

It was determined that statistically there is a significant difference at the exposure levels of the personnel working in Youth Services and Provincial Directorate of Sports participated in the questionnaire according to their age variant [F = 27,259, p<0.05]. As a result of Scheffe test made to find the source of the difference it was determined that 21-30 years old ($\bar{x} = 2,06$) group exposed to more mobbing behaviors comparing to 31-40 years old ($\bar{x} = 1,76$) group, 41-50 years old ($\bar{x} = 1,55$) group and 51 years old and above ($\bar{x} = 1,46$) age groups.

Table 5. F test analysis of the mobbing exposure levels of the personnel according to their marital status

Variants	n	f	%	\bar{X}	F	p	Significant difference
Marital Status	Married	227	69,8	1,80	1,825	,162	(p>0.05)
	Single	91	28	1,88			
	Divorced	7	2,2	1,54			

It was determined on Table 5 that statistically there is not a significant difference at the exposure levels of the personnel working in Youth Services and Provincial Directorate of Sports participated in the questionnaire according to their marital status variant [F = 1,828, p>.05].

Table 6. F test analysis of the mobbing exposure levels of the personnel according to their seniority status

Variants	n	f	%	\bar{X}	F	p	Significant difference
Occupational Seniority	1-10 years	217	66,8	1,92	10,434	,000	1-3
	11-20 years	48	14,8	1,70			
	21-30 years	55	16,9	1,52			
	31 years and above	5	1,5	1,73			

It is seen on Table 6 that statistically there is a significant difference at the exposure levels of the personnel working in Youth Services and Provincial Directorate of Sports participated in the questionnaire according to their age variant [F = 10,434, p<.05]. As a result of Scheffe test made to find the source of the difference it was determined that the workers having 1-10 years (\bar{X} = 1,92) seniority exposed to more mobbing behaviors comparing to those having 21-30 years (\bar{X} = 1,52) seniority.

Table 7. F test analysis of the mobbing exposure levels of the personnel according to graduated school

Variants	n	f	%	\bar{X}	F	p	Significant difference
Graduated School Type	Secondary Education(High School)	46	14,2	1,49	14,374	,000	2-1 2,4 3-1 3-4
	Associate Degree	49	15,1	1,89			
	Bachelor's Degree	213	65,5	1,90			
	Master Degree/Doctoral (Postgraduate)	17	5,2	1,37			

It is seen on Table 7 that statistically there is a significant difference at the exposure levels of the personnel working in Youth Services and Provincial Directorate of Sports participated in the questionnaire according to the graduated school variant [F = 14,,374, p<.05]. As a result of Scheffe test made to find the source of the difference it was determined that the personnel having associate degree (\bar{X} = 1,89) exposed to more mobbing behaviors comparing to those having secondary education (\bar{X} = 1,49) and post graduate (\bar{X} = 1,37); and those having bachelor's degree (\bar{X} = 1,90) exposed to more mobbing behaviors comparing to those having secondary education (\bar{X} = 1,49) and post graduate (\bar{X} = 1,37).

4. DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION

In the research it was reached that Youth Services and Provincial Directorate of Sports personnel's exposure level to mobbing behaviors in last six months was at "low level". I one of his research Tüzel (20) determined that mobbing behaviors applied to academic members were at "low level".

As a result of the researches on this field it can be said that similar values are seen in terms of mobbing feeling (21-26). *This condition shows that the majority of the personnel working at work places exposed to mobbing actions either aware or not aware of this condition.*

There is a significant difference at the exposure level to mobbing behaviors of Youth Services and Provincial Directorate of Sports personnel according to their sex. This difference is kind of female workers are exposed to

mobbing behaviors comparing to men. In his research Dilman (25) reached to the conclusion that females are exposed to more mobbing behaviors comparing to men in terms of exposure levels.

The fact that number of women working in institutions is low can be assumed to be an indicator showing that men maintain an aggressive attitude against the weakness of the women in a male dominant working environment. In his study Leyman (27) reached to the conclusion that the women are exposed to mobbing actions in a male dominant profession and vice versa in a female dominant profession.

According to the age variant of Youth Services and Provincial Directorate of Sports personnel participated in the questionnaire, there is a significant difference at the mobbing behavior exposure levels. According to this, it was reached to the conclusion that the exposure levels to the mobbing actions of the workers who were around 21-30 ($\bar{x}=2,06$) years old were more than that of other (31-40), (41-50) and (51-above) age groups. The fact that individuals who are at 21-30 age group are new and inexperienced in their profession might have effect on their experience against mobbing behaviors. Skills of the workers at 21-30 years old age group in following the current issues, their idealistic personalities and their compliance to the new technology might draw the reaction of those personnel who are among elder managing group. In studies of Kok (3), Bahce (23) and Dilman (25) on various profession groups they reached to the conclusion that mobbing according to age variant is higher between the ages 21 and 30.

According to the marital status variant of Youth Services and Provincial Directorate of Sports personnel participated in the questionnaire, it was reached to the conclusion that there is not a significant difference at the mobbing behavior exposure levels. It was determined that exposure levels of the single persons to the mobbing behaviors at "lower intermediate" ($\bar{x}=1,88$) level. Among the reasons why single persons experience mobbing behaviors it can be said that married workers have responsibilities at work places and they don't care about the burden they have and their responsibilities at home and the troubles they have occupy a more important place in their lives. Considering the age range (21-30) of the single persons, younger and idealist single workers take the burden they have at work places more seriously. Married individuals ($\bar{x}=1,80$) also experience mobbing actions as much as single persons. However it was determined that this issue evolves into a problem in a longer process. Tüzel (2009) and Kok (2006) reached to the conclusion in their research that married workers are exposed to mobbing behaviors in a higher level comparing to that of single workers (3, 20).

It was determined that there is a significant difference at mobbing exposure levels of the Youth Services and Provincial Directorate of Sports personnel according to occupational seniority variant. It was determined that the exposure levels to the mobbing actions of workers of 1-10 years at "lower intermediate" ($\bar{x}=1,92$) level. In one of his research Tüzel (20) stated that the exposure levels to the mobbing actions of the individuals working between 7-10 years are at "lower intermediate" level. It can be said that the workers in 1-10 years group promise hope regarding the future and for this reason they are exposed mobbing behaviors by those whose work years in the first years of their occupational lives are higher. Due to the assumption of experienced managers which is that so called promising workers can quickly rise and become chief, director or manager and they can jeopardize their positions; it was determined that mobbing feeling is practiced against the workers having 1-10 years seniority.

It was reached to the conclusion that there is a significant difference at the exposure levels of the personnel to the mobbing behaviors according to the education level variant in the institution. It was determined that the exposure levels of the persons having bachelor's degree ($\bar{x}=1,90$) and associate degree ($\bar{x}=1,89$) are at "lower intermediate" level. Researches of Davenport et al. (8), Demircivi (28) and Bulut (21) put forward that the workers exposed to mobbing actions are mostly having bachelor's degree and associate degree.

SUGGESTIONS

Certain measures should be taken previously, workers should be informed about the mobbing behavior and further in-company trainings should be given to the company workers by the specialists about this issue in order to get rid of negative conditions and effects that might happen due to mobbing behaviors in work places and to prevent this type of negative behaviors. Thus mobbing behaviors should be prevented from harming the institution and its workers.

The researches made to raise the awareness of workers concerning the mobbing feeling should be supported and applied to all fields and the resulting conclusions should be shared by all organizations by benefiting from mass communication tools and technological opportunities.

The persons exposed to mobbing behaviors are influenced from the social pressures not only just in their working environment but also in their private lives and they get psychological harm. Mobbing behaviors should be perceived as a negative behavior type made against the human honor and targeting human rights.

The number of scientists or academic members in Turkey specialized in mobbing behaviors is still below the desired level. Scientists, academic members and psychologists concerned with mobbing feeling in Turkey should be readily prepared and be experienced in order to be helpful to the individuals and to show them way regarding the mobbing behaviors.

Since the mobbing feeling follows hierarchically a path from the upper ranks to the lower ranks in the conducted researches, the persons (managers) who shall take part in the management should be selected carefully and meticulously. It should be paid attention for the selection of persons who shall be brought to a managing position among self educated, fair, tolerable to the differences, open to communication and who are at peace with himself/herself.

As a country, Turkey should make new and special arrangements in her constitution concerning the mobbing feeling. It should also be paid attention to the clear understanding of the articles by everyone who reads it and it should be expressed with these articles which behaviors are the mobbing and sought for the total prevention of these mobbing behaviors.

REFERENCES

1. Einarsen S., Raknes B. L. (1997). Harrasment in the Workplace and the Victimization of Men. *Violence and Victims*. Vol:12; Page: 247-263.
2. Cemaloglu N. (2007). Okul Yöneticilerinin Liderlik Stilleri İle Yildirma Arasındaki İlişki. *Hacettepe Üniversitesi Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi*, Sayı: 33; s.77–87, Ankara.
3. Kok S. (2006). İş Yaşamında Psiko-Şiddet Sarmali Olarak Yildirma. 14. Yönetim Organizasyon Kongresi Bildiriler Kitabı. Atatürk Üniversitesi. Erzurum. s. 161-170.
4. Field T. (2004). Bullying in a Public Sector Organisation Being Privatised. <http://www.bullyonline.org/personal.htm>. Erişim tarihi: 20.04.2009
5. Zapf D. Knorz C. ve Kulla M. (1996). On The Relationship Between Mobbing_Factors, And Job Content. *Social work environment and health outcomes*. *European Journal of Work and Organizational Psychology*, Vol: 5; s. 215-237.
6. Konrad L. (1963). Here Am I - Where Are You? The Behaviour of the Greylag Goose. (www.librarything.com/work/234744) Erişim tarihi: 15.09.2009.
7. Yüçetürk E. (2002). Bilgi Çağında Örgütlerin Görünmeyen Yüzü: Mobbing. (<http://www.bilgiyonetimorg/cm/paper/yaz.ark.php>) Erişim Tarihi: 26.02.2008.
8. Davenport N., Schwartz R.D., Eliot G.P. (2003) Mobbing: İş Yerinde Duygusal İncinme. (Cev: Osman Cem Omertoy). Sistem Yayıncılık. İstanbul.
9. Cobanoğlu Ş. (2005). Mobbing ve Başa Çıkma Yöntemleri. Timaş Yayıncılık: İstanbul.
10. Baltas A. (2003). Adı Yeni Konmuş Bir Olgu: İşyerinde Yildirma. (http://www.acarbaltas.com/makaleler_detay.php?id=36) Erişim Tarihi: 15.01.2012.
11. Wornhamm, D. (2003). Descriptive Investigation of Morality and Victimization at Work. *Journal of Business Ethics*, Netherlands. Vol: 45; Page: 29-40.
12. Cemaloglu N. (2007). Mobbing. (www.sbeotk.hacettepe.edu.tr/duyuru/mob_pps.ppt). Erişim tarihi: 10.08.2010.
13. Hoel H., Rayner C., Cooper C. L. (1999). Workplacebullying, *International Review of Industrial and Organizational Psychology*.
14. Cemaloglu N., Ertürk A. (2007). Öğretmenlerin Maruz Kaldıkları Yildirma Eylemlerinin Cinsiyet Yönünden İncelenmesi. *Türk Eğitim Bilimleri Dergisi*. Sayı: 5; (2); s. 345-362.
15. Baltas, A., ve Baltas, Z. (1998). Stres ve Başa Çıkma Yolları. Remzi Yayınları, İstanbul.
16. Brodsky C. (1976). *The Harassed Worker*, Toronto: Lexington Books DC Heathand Company.
17. Einarsen S., Matthiesen S. B. ve Skogstad A. (1998). Bullying, burnout and wellbeing among assistant nurses. *Journal of Occupational Health and Safety -Australia and New Zealand*. Vol: 14; Page: 563-568.
18. Namie G. (1999). *The Workplace Mobbing*. <http://www.bullyonline.org/personal.htm>. Erişim tarihi: 20.04.2009
19. Anonim (2011). (<http://www.turkhukuksitesi.com/mevzuat.php?mid=10409>) Erişim Tarihi: 15.12.2012.
20. Tüzel E. (2009). Araştırma Görevlilerinin Maruz Kaldıkları Yildirma (Mobbing) Davranışlarının Araştırma Görevlilerinin Sahip Oldukları Cesitli Değişkenlere Göre İncelenmesi (Gazi Eğitim Fakültesi Örneği). 1. Uluslar arası Türkiye Eğitim Arastirmaları Kongresi. Canakkale.
21. Bulut U.H. (2007). Ortaöğretim Öğretmelerinde Psikolojik Şiddet Düzeyi (Mobbing). (Yayımlanmamış Yüksek Lisans Tezi), Niğde Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü. Niğde.
22. Asunakutlu T, Safran B. (2005). Örgütlerdeki Yildirma Uygulamaları ve Catisma Arasındaki İlişki. *Selçuk Üniversitesi İİBF Sosyal ve Ekonomik Arastirmalar Dergisi*. Sayı: 6 (11); s. 111-129.
23. Bahce C. (2007). Mobbing Olusumunda Örgüt Kültürünün Rolü. (Yayımlanmamış Yüksek Lisans Tezi), Gazi Üniversitesi, Sosyal Bilim. Enstitüsü. Ankara.
24. Cengiz R. (2008). Profesyonel Futbol Kulubu Yöneticilerinin Donusumsal Liderlik Stilleri İle Kulüplerinin Örgüt Sağlığı ve Futbolcuların Yildirma (Mobbing) Yasamaları Arasındaki İlişki. (Yayımlanmamış Doktora Tezi), Gazi Üniversitesi, Sağlık Bilimleri Enstitüsü, Beden Eğitimi ve Spor Anabilim Dalı. Ankara.
25. Dilman T. (2007). Özel Hastanelerde Çalışan Hemsirelerin Duygusal Tacize Maruz Kalma Durumlarının Belirlenmesi. (Yayımlanmamış Yüksek Lisans Tezi), Marmara Üniversitesi, Sağlık Bilimleri Enstitüsü. İstanbul.
26. Leymann H. (1996). The Content and Development of Bullying at Work. Retrieved on 20 August 2009. <http://www.healthyworkplacebill.org/pdf/Leymann96.pdf> Erisim Tarihi: 20.08.2009.
27. Leymann H. (1993) Atiologie und häufigkeit von Mobbing am arbeitsplatz-eine ubersicht uber die bisherige forschung. *Zeitschrift fur Personalforschung*. Vol: 7; (2); Page: 271-283
28. Demirci B.M. (2008). Otel İşletmelerinde Yildirma Eylemlerinin İş Gören Verimliliğine Etkisi Ve İnsan Kaynakları Yönetimi Açısından Değerlendirilmesi. (Yayımlanmamış Yüksek Lisans Tezi), Gazi Üniversitesi, Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü. Ankara.