

The Cupola

Scholarship at Gettysburg College



Student Publications

Student Scholarship

Summer 2015

The Bosnian Muslims and the Irish Perspective

Gabriel C. Kelly
Gettysburg College

Follow this and additional works at: https://cupola.gettysburg.edu/student_scholarship

 Part of the [European History Commons](#), [Islamic Studies Commons](#), [Peace and Conflict Studies Commons](#), [Political History Commons](#), and the [Social History Commons](#)

Share feedback about the accessibility of this item.

Kelly, Gabriel C., "The Bosnian Muslims and the Irish Perspective" (2015). *Student Publications*. 557.
https://cupola.gettysburg.edu/student_scholarship/557

This open access student research paper is brought to you by The Cupola: Scholarship at Gettysburg College. It has been accepted for inclusion by an authorized administrator of The Cupola. For more information, please contact cupola@gettysburg.edu.

The Bosnian Muslims and the Irish Perspective

Abstract

The conflict in Bosnia-Herzegovina can be understood in multiple ways, however, the focus of this paper is to examine the perspective of Ireland on the Bosnian Muslims at different levels of society--ranging from the population to international level--from June 01, 1992 to January 31, 1996. Through an analysis of letters to the editor in "The Irish Times," parliamentary debate transcripts, and the Barbara Sloan European Union Document Collection located at the University of Pittsburgh's Hillman Library, I have been able to reveal how complex perspectives within a state on a particular issue can be, and how they can vary between states.

Keywords

Ireland, Bosnia, Muslim, Perspective, Newspaper

Disciplines

European History | Islamic Studies | Peace and Conflict Studies | Political History | Social History

Comments

Produced during Summer 2015 as part of a Mellon Grant. Research overseen by Dr. William Bowman, with additional assistance provided by Dr. Nina Barzachka and Dr. Yasmin Akbaba. Presented at the "Middle East and Islamic World: Past, Present, and Future" undergraduate student research conference, October 3, 2015.

Creative Commons License

Creative

Commons

License.

This work is licensed under a [Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-No Derivative Works 4.0](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/)

The Bosnian Muslims and the Irish Perspective

By Gabriel Kelly

Summer 2015 MEIS Research

Dr. Bowman (Advisor)

Examining Conflict¹

Ethnic conflicts occur in different countries around the world; however, a lot of the focus for the study of ethnic conflict has been how large international actors or the parties themselves view the conflict. This raises the question of whether more marginal states in the international community hold the same views as major international actors regarding ethnic conflict? In order to address this research question, I will be examining the Irish perspective on the Bosnian Muslims in the Bosnian ethnic conflict. The conflict in Bosnia lasted from 1992 to 1995 and involved two ethno-nationalist groups—the Catholic Croats and the Serbian Orthodox Serbians—attempting to partition the multi-ethnic state of Bosnia, led by the late blooming, possibly ethno-nationalist Bosnian Muslims (Jesse and Williams 2011, 141).

Even though there are many differences between these two countries, the fact that Ireland is not a major power like France, Great Britain, or the United States makes it amenable to this analysis,² because it fulfills the criteria of the research question, which is whether a state that is marginal in the international community will have a different perspective towards a specific group involved in ethnic conflict, in this case the Bosnian Muslims. The Bosnian Muslims were chosen, because of the nature of the conference being about the Muslim world, as well as for the fact that this conflict was recent, familiar to me, and bounded in time, which helped me to

1. I would like to thank Dr. Bowman of the Gettysburg College History Department, for being my mentor this Summer and guiding me through the research process, Dr. Phil Wilkin for helping me to access the “Barbara Sloan European Union Document Collection” at the University of Pittsburgh, as well as Dr. Barzacka and Dr. Akbaba of the Gettysburg College Political Science Department for their assistance in providing me with feedback on how to improve this paper throughout the Fall leading up to this conference.

2. I chose Ireland originally, because it has had ethnic kin involved in a relatively dormant ethnic conflict with the United Kingdom over the possession of Northern Ireland (Jesse and Williams 2011, 124), which is another ethnic conflict in Europe; however, a comparison of this description with my latter research led me to conclude that Ireland did not really fit too strongly into the definition of a state whose population would be aggressively activated by the conflict in Bosnia (James and Carment 1996, 522). Furthermore, I don't believe that I was able to investigate the proper indicators to make the correlation as solid as it could be. In addition, the UK actually was the more applicable party from another source that studied the Irish Free State in the 20th Century (James and Carment 2000, 192), causing me to adjust my research question.

develop an analysis, which sets it apart from the more protracted Israel-Palestine conflict. The official position of Ireland towards the conflict in Bosnia can be found in the statements of Tánaiste and Minister of Foreign Affairs, Mr. Spring, in a response to questioning on March 23, 1993, which says:

“The principal elements of the government’s policy... [include] support for the International Conference on the former Yugoslavia chaired jointly by David Owen and Cyrus Vance; involvement in efforts in the region by the UN and the EC to establish the conditions necessary for a settlement; sustained international pressure, including sanctions, against Serbia and Montenegro; support for efforts to prevent a spill-over of the conflict; assistance to refugees and displaced persons, and assistance for the victims of rape and support for the efforts to bring those responsible to justice”(Oireachtas, March 23, 1993).³

I acknowledge that the choice of another state that has been involved in ethnic conflict could produce completely different results, and the results should be viewed as endemic, with the opportunity to refine case selection method open to future researchers.

The conflict in Bosnia-Herzegovina can be understood in multiple ways—from political science theories (Jesse and Williams 2011, 146), to history—; however, the focus of this paper is to examine the perspective of Ireland on the Bosnian Muslims. What sparked my interest in exploring the perspective of Ireland was an article which discussed the limited connection between the two cases in literature (Greaves 2014, 50). My hypothesis is that the Bosnian

3. Ireland. House of the Oireachtas. Dáil Éireann. March 23, 1993. Ceisteanna – Questions. Oral Answers. - Yugoslav Conflict. Mr. Spring. Debate 428, 1. Accessed Aug. 28, 2015. Search Debates – Full Text.

Muslims were perceived in Ireland in an increasingly equivocal way the higher up the social strata one went from June 01, 1992 to January 31, 1996. This research is important, because it provides an in depth analysis of the differences in rhetoric between different levels of a single society, it expands our knowledge of the European perspective on Bosnia and the Bosnian conflict, and it explores the perspective of a marginal actor in a world commanded by great power politics.

Conflict In Context

Before I begin my analysis, it is necessary for me to examine the literature surrounding the Bosnian Conflict. I will be focused on two sets of documents for my literature review: media analyses and the unity of international actor perspectives. These two kinds of articles will not only help me to define what the international perspective on the Bosnian Conflict was during that time, but also how unified actors were in their approaches to the conflict, which can ultimately be translated to my analysis of the differing perspectives towards the Bosnian Muslims in Irish society.

The Bosnian Conflict was largely depicted with a humanitarian (Wilzig-Lehman and Bloch-Elkon 2005, 23; Robinson 2004, 395; Auerbach and Bloch-Elkon 2005, 91; Kuusisto 1998, 616), or a holocaust lens in mind (Auerbach and Bloch-Elkon 2005, 92; Wilzig-Lehman and Bloch-Elkon 2005, 24; Von Oppen 2013, 207); however, there were certain limitations to the presence of these lenses in the literature as well. Indeed, the fact of “Bosnia Fatigue” in Dutch newspapers—which claims that, “Only when the gravity of human suffering reaches an unprecedented level... newspapers pay attention to this theme” (De Ridder, Ruigrok, and Scholten 2003, 23)—, and the fact that newspapers can individually focus on particular parts of the conflict more than others (Auerbach and Bloch-Elkon 2005, 96), represent two caveats that I

will have to take into consideration for my first level of analysis. In addition, it was revealed by a third analysis, that people who listen to media about localized wars may have different emotions than those which come from seeing war far away, which should be factored into my analyses as well (Ibrahim et al. 2014, 536). In addition to these two themes, there was a lot of confusion about what the Bosnian crisis actually was that permeated the media. There was a tendency to depict Bosnia as a dangerous “swamp” (Kuusisto 1998, 617). In addition, two articles cited the inability to completely accuse the Serbs of wrong doing, leading to the acceptance of the “irrational war” explanation by Benjamin Zohar (Kuusisto 1998, 611; 2012, 108).

In addition to media depictions, there were visible splits in society below the international level that could be grounds for differentiated perspectives in my analysis. Indeed, during the conflict, German media was split on its support of Croatia, but had to conform to some degree (Von Oppen 2013, 211-212), and the President of Turkey disputed over representation of the conflict with the rest of the government (Calis 2001, 142), which shows a split within the executive. While there were instances of international unity, they only served to wallpaper over the legitimate differences in perspective between various actors. For example, France specifically recognized the states of Croatia and Slovenia in order to preserve the integrity of the newly minted European Common Foreign and Security Policy (Bearce 2002, 484), when it historically supported Serbia (Dover 2013, 245).

The literature review reveals that the humanitarian issues and the holocaust were key components of the discourse on the Bosnian Conflict, although there were exceptions and deviations, which is something that I will have to watch out for at each level of analysis on these issues. In addition, the disunity of international actors demonstrates how this sub-national analysis of Irish society is founded in an existing literature about unity and disunity in actors

with regards to the Bosnian conflict.

Methods

I believe that my examination of an Irish newspaper's letters to the editor will capture the reader's responses to the media rhetoric found in the literature, which I am using as the standard international view of the Bosnian Muslims. Furthermore, I believe that an examination of multiple levels of society will breakdown the perceptions of the Bosnian Muslims in order to create a more in depth and complicated picture of the Irish perspective. In the end, the purpose of this paper is to examine whether Irish society had any different perspectives on the Bosnian Muslims than the international community, so it is important to look at every angle of society and not just one part.

The analysis will be a “content analysis,” which is defined as, “The use of the written record via systematic coding and classification of its contents...” (Johnson and Reynolds 2012, 292). I chose this particular model, because it offered a feasible and systematic method of analysis for me to complete in the time allotted; I lacked access to more refined methods, such as Stata, which would help to establish whether something is statistically significant; and a statistical analysis may not produce an orderly classification. For example, if in one article the Bosnian Muslims are described as the victims of genocide and the perpetrators of a crime, then the document would be counted twice leading to difficulties in establishing a stable sample size for a statistical regression. This “content analysis” will use three sets of primary sources which will represent four strata of the Irish perspective: the populace, the parliament, the parliamentary government, and the Irish government's reactions at the European Union level.

The first primary source is a set of ninety-eight letters to the editor which I found in *The Irish Times* from June 1, 1992 to January 31, 1996. I chose the date June 01, 1992, because it

was the beginning of the newspaper's availability, and I chose the date January 31, 1996, in order to capture any immediate post-conflict readers' responses (Jesse and Williams 2011, 172), which did not appear when I initially limited the search to December 31, 1995. I chose to examine letters to the editor, because general articles are purchased from other newspapers or have writers who are not necessarily Irish, which would make a systematic analysis of a mélange of Irish and non-Irish newspaper articles that were republished spurious.⁴ I chose *The Irish Times* to examine, because it is described by the Lexis-Nexis Academic source information as, "...Ireland's leading journal of opinion and information" (Lexis-Nexis Academic), and it possessed letters to the editor which covered the period of my analysis.⁵ I derived the ninety-eight letters to the editor from *The Irish Times* using the Lexis-Nexis Academic database.⁶ In these letters, I am looking for how people in Ireland talked about the Bosnian Muslims; however, there was room for deviation and the word Muslim was not the sole indicator used in order to determine what was examined. While this is not an ideal sample, because not all people write letters to the editor, there was only one newspaper available to me in the time frame, some people write more letters than others, and letter writers may have stronger opinions, I acknowledge that any conclusions should be viewed as tentative. I plan to expand the method in order to cover a wider cross section of papers in any future research.

In addition to the first level of society, I will measure the second and third strata using the

4. Researching someone's name in order to determine whether or not they are an Irish national would take too much time for me to conduct an effective analysis, and librarian Clinton Baugess of Gettysburg College's Musselman Library description of the methods used for byline attribution made me less willing to pursue this option. Clinton Baugess, e-mail message to the author, June 23, 2015.

5. I subscribed to the internet newspaper database *Irish News Archive* in order to gain access to copies of *The Irish Independent*; however, I was not able to isolate letters to the editor for my analysis so I had to abandon the attempt at getting a second national newspaper.

6. At the Lexis-Nexis Academic Homepage, click advanced options and input the following data into the form that appears—form (06/01/1992 to 01/21/1996), Source (*The Irish Times*), unclick the box that says "Select All" under content type, and in the box inscribed "Build Your Own Segment Search" input (Bosnia AND Muslim AND "Letters to the Editor"). Then click apply. After you click apply, click search on the mainpage. It should reveal 99 items. Next, click the sort drop down menu and change from "Relevance" to "Oldest to Newest." Finally, read all letters individually. One article is repeated, so exclude that from the analysis to leave you with 98 articles total.

“House of the Oireachtas (Search Debates – Full Text)” database, which is an internet database of Irish parliamentary debates, as well as question and answer sessions that can be found on the Irish parliament's website (House of the Oireachtas). My examination will cover the same period as *The Irish Times*, and fifty items will be analyzed.⁷ I will focus on the use of the word Muslim, as was done in the first analysis; however, I will also examine the use of the words Middle East in relation to Bosnia.⁸ The main focus of this analysis will be on the parliament and the parliamentary government's way of talking about the Bosnian Muslims. I will create the separation between government and parliament based on the presence of a title next to the person's name. Therefore, people possessing the titles Tánaiste, Taoiseach, and Minister will be considered a part of the ruling government, and their responses will be examined as such. Issues with my analysis include the fact that this approach does not recognize changes in government, which limits any inferences that can be made on particular administrations; I have a limited understanding of the Irish parliamentary system; and solely searching the terms “Bosnia” and “Muslims” yields less than the fifty units required for a potential large-n statistical analysis that would be required to establish significance.⁹

I have made every attempt to adapt my methods for the project and to minimize my error.

7. Search in (all Documents). Change date options to Start Date: (01/06/1992) and End Date: (31/01/1996), with the search terms (Bosnia and Muslim), not in quotations. Once the search has been completed, there should be thirty two total documents. Command F search the month and the year (eg. 01/1992, 02/1992), and read in sequential order. Because the results do not meet the minimum number of sources for a large n-design (that is fifty), another set of searches was done to make up the difference. The search terms were changed to (Sarajevo and Muslim) and the one result that didn't appear in the previous search was examined. The next search used (Bosnia and Islam) and one result that didn't appear in the previous searches was examined. Finally, the final search was (Bosnia and Middle East) and the first sixteen were examined without sorting from the top to the bottom of the screen.

Every effort was made to perform an empirical analysis, and it should be noted that this introduces substantial bias into the analysis with changes of search terms as well as the selection of the first sixteen for the final search, and another method may have derived a more representative cross section. The total number of items from the database should now be at fifty, which is above the required minimum for a potential large-n design. Nina Barzachka, e-mail message to the author, August 17, 2015.

8. The words Middle East were chosen, because it was thought they would bring a more accurate representation of Bosnia than related searches that didn't necessarily focus on Muslims, such as Bosnia and Yugoslavia. It was also believed that the search would yield connections Parliamentarians made between the conflict and the Muslim world, even though the equation of these terms is not necessarily true.

9. Nina Barzachka, e-mail message to the author, August 17, 2015.

I decided what the search terms would be based on the fact that this conference was focused on the Muslim world, and I recognize that future researchers could examine different keywords and come up with different results.

The final set of primary sources that I will analyze will come from the 1992, 1993, 1994, and 1995 Yugoslavia files at the *The Barbara Sloan European Union Document Collection*, which is, "...a virtually complete collection of official European Community documents published since the early 1950s containing materials that are not available through Europa initiated in the 1990s," and can be found at the University of Pittsburgh's Hillman Library (European Union Center for Excellence¹⁰). I will conduct my analysis keeping in mind the question, what is the Irish government's perspective on the Bosnian Muslims at the international level? I will search through all the documents in the folders, and examine specific statements by the Irish government to international bodies, excluding newspapers, analyzing the rhetoric that Irish officials use to refer to the Bosnian Muslims. Biases that may be incurred from undertaking this analysis include not being able to definitively produce the minimum of fifty cases to support a potential "large-n design" statistical analysis to establish significance,¹¹ and not being able to predict what was put in the file folders and what was excluded. In spite of these sources of error, the unpredictability of the sources can also be a virtue in limiting my selection bias.

I will use these three sets of primary sources in order to examine four strata of the Irish perspective and their perspective on the Bosnian Muslims. The reason why I decided to select the keyword Muslim and not solely the word Bosnian, was because the word Bosnian has a bifurcated definition and could easily refer to a multinational state and identity, as is asserted by Bosnian President Alija Izetbegovic in Neal G. Jesse and Kristen P. Williams's book on ethnic

10. In reality, I examined the following set of file folders that I examined, because they weren't split into years as neatly as I assumed they would be: 1992, 1993, 1995, 1993-1999, and 1988-1991.

11. Nina Barzackha, e-mail message to the author, August 17, 2015.

conflict (2011, 156). By choosing the words Bosnian Muslim, I will be conducting a more accurate investigation as to how the Irish perspective views the Bosnian Muslims as a subgroup identity. After this analysis, I will compare and contrast the similarities and differences in the rhetoric used to refer to the Bosnian Muslims, and then detail my conclusions.

The Levels of Analysis

Level One: Population

The first level analysis of “Letters to the Editor” in *The Irish Times* examines how the general Irish population perceived the Bosnian Muslims, and the following statements will detail four important ideas that Irish people had about the Bosnian Muslims during this time period. These four common ideas are based around my finding of three frequencies ranging from twenty-three to twenty-five references for each one.

Firstly, and rather unsurprisingly, I found that the Irish people saw the Bosnian Muslims as being subject to some kind of systematic physical violence that was directed towards their ultimate destruction. References to this phenomena ranged from explicitly using the word holocaust to using relatively equivalent words to express lethal mass killings,¹² such as

12. John Doyle, “letter to the editor,” *The Irish Times*, December 21, 1992, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 23, 2015); John McCrory, “letter to the editor,” *The Irish Times*, March 26, 1993, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 23, 2015); Senator Paschal Mooney, MCC, “letter to the editor,” *The Irish Times*, May 28, 1993, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 23, 2015); Desmond Fennell, “letter to the editor,” *The Irish Times*, July 2, 1993, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 23, 2015); Sonia Zambakides, “letter to the editor,” *The Irish Times*, July 21, 1993, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 23, 2015); Dr. Colman O’Criodain, “letter to the editor,” *The Irish Times*, August 4, 1993, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 23, 2015); Timothy M. Flynn, letter to the editor, *The Irish Times*, August 11, 1993, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 23, 2015); M.H. Al-Sader, letter to the editor, *The Irish Times*, January 6, 1995, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 25, 2015); Michael McCormack, “letter to the editor,” *The Irish Times*, July 21, 1995, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 25, 2015); Brian Quinn, “letter to the editor,” July 22, 1995, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 25, 2015); David Rice, letter to the editor, *The Irish Times*, July 25, 1995, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 25, 2015); Timothy M. Flynn, letter to the editor, *The Irish Times*, July 28, 1995, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 25, 2015); Pat Hynes, letter to the editor, *The Irish Times*, August 17, 1995, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 15, 2015); Geraldine Collier, Letter to the Editor, *The Irish Times*, July 22, 1995, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 25, 2015); Dr. M.H. Al-Sader, Letter to the Editor, *The Irish Times*, August 17, 1992, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 23, 2015); Aodhan Madden, Letter to the Editor, *The Irish Times*, July 24, 1995, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 25, 2015). These articles refer to the use of the word holocaust.

“genocide,”¹³ “slaughter,”¹⁴ “obliterated,”¹⁵ “extermination,”¹⁶ “eradication,”¹⁷ and the indirect subject of ethnic cleansing.¹⁸ Regardless of the exact language in which this view was expressed, these references were found in approximately twenty-four percent of the total letters examined,¹⁹ which allows me to infer that they represented a part of the discussion going on in Ireland about the Bosnian Muslims,²⁰ and that the Irish people were concerned about the Bosnian Muslim's physical safety during this period.

Secondly, the Irish public referred to the Bosnian Muslims when they referenced issues facing the Muslim world. These references appeared in approximately twenty-five of the ninety-

13. Doyle, “Letter to the Editor,” December 21, 1992; Fergus Galvin, Ann Neff, Kenneth Nicholls, Valerie Hughes, “letter to the editor,” *The Irish Times* December 9, 1994, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 25, 2015); Simon Kelleher, letter to the editor, *The Irish Times*, July 22, 1995, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 25, 2015); Michael Cullen, “Letter to the Editor,” *The Irish Times*, August 8, 1995, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 25, 2015).

14. Bernard Le Cesne Byrne, “Letter to the Editor,” *The Irish Times*, April 17, 1993, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 23, 2015); Barnard Le Cesne Byrne, Letter to the Editor, *The Irish Times*, May 26, 1993, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 23, 2015); Timothy M. Flynn, “letter to the editor,” August 11, 1993; M.J. Connolly, “Letter to the Editor,” *The Irish Times*, May 23, 1994, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 25, 2015).

15. O’Criodain, Letter to the Editor, August 4, 1993.

16. Jim Mac Loughlin, Letter to the editor, *The Irish Times*, June 17, 1993, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 23, 2015).

17. Roland O’Tormaigh, Letter to the Editor, *The Irish Times*, November 1, 1995, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 25, 2015).

18. Tajma Kapic, letter to the editor, *The Irish Times*, May 20, 1994, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 23, 2015).

19. Doyle, “Letter to the Editor,” December 21, 1992; Galvin, Nicholls, and Hughes, “letter to the editor,” Dec. 9, 1994; Kelleher, “letter to the editor,” July 22, 1995; Cullen, “letter to the editor,” August 8, 1995; Byrne, “letter to the editor,” April 17, 1993; Byrne, “letter to the editor,” May 26, 1993; Flynn, “letter to the editor,” August 11, 1993; Connolly, “letter to the editor,” May 23, 1994; McCrory, “letter to the editor,” March 26, 1993; Mooney, “letter to the editor,” May 28, 1993; Fennell, “letter to the editor,” July 2, 1993; Zambakides, “letter to the editor,” July 21, 1993; O’Criodain, “letter to the editor,” August 4, 1993; MacLoughlin, “letter to the editor,” June 17, 1993; O’Tormaigh, “letter to the editor,” November 1, 1995; Al-Sader, “letter to the editor,” January 6, 1995; McCormack, “letter to the editor,” July 21, 1995; Quinn, “letter to the editor,” July 22, 1995; Rice, “letter to the editor,” July 25, 1995; Flynn, “letter to the editor,” July 28, 1995; Hynes, “letter to the editor,” August 17, 1995; Collier, “letter to the editor,” July 22, 1995; Al-Sader, “letter to the editor,” August 17, 1992; Madden, “letter to the editor,” July 24, 1995.

20. The ideal method for this analysis would be a statistical regression; however, since the student lacks ready access to stata it could be a method for future research in order to increase overall predictability.

eight letters, and reflected a diverse array of issues, including Ottoman history,²¹ oil,²² references to the Gulf War (including Iraq and Kuwait),²³ Muslim victimization,²⁴ references to Muslim world solidarity with Bosnia,²⁵ as well as more minor references that occurred three times or less.²⁶ These included references to the Albanians,²⁷ as well as the bad things Muslims are doing to Christians in other countries.²⁸ The fact that this discussion of the Muslim identity covered a vast array of topics, and was not solely focused on the issue of Muslim world solidarity is important to note, because it shows how people in Ireland thought about Bosnian Muslims in a more complicated way during the conflict.

21. John A. Kelly, "Letter to the Editor," *The Irish Times*, May 6, 1994, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 23, 2015); B. Orlic, "Letter to the Editor," *The Irish Times*, May 16, 1994, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 23, 2015); Zivko Jaksic, "Letter to the Editor," *The Irish Times*, July 8, 1994, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 25, 2015); Brendan F. Dempsey, "Letter to the Editor," *The Irish Times*, July 22, 1994, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 25, 2015); Michael Pravica, "Letter to the Editor," *The Irish Times*, January 18, 1995, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 25, 2015).

22. D.E. MacMillan, "Letter to the Editor," *The Irish Times*, June 25, 1992, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 23, 2015); Flynn, "Letter to the Editor," August 11, 1993; Quinn, "Letter to the Editor," July 22, 1995; Flynn, "Letter to the Editor," July 28, 1995.

23. A. Atanackovic, "Letter to the Editor," *The Irish Times*, September 1, 1992, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 23, 2015); Tom Ahearne, "letter to the editor," *The Irish Times*, November 4, 1992, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 23, 2015); Flynn, Letter to the Editor, August 11, 1993; Kelleher, Letter to the Editor, July 22, 1995.

24. Al-Sader, "letter to the editor," August 17, 1992; Zivko Jaksic, "letter to the editor," November 14, 1992, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 23, 2015); Vincent MacDowell, "letter to the editor," *The Irish Times*, January 6, 1995, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 25, 2015); M.H. Al-Sader, "letter to the editor," *The Irish Times*, January 6, 1995, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 25, 2015).

25. Patrick Farrell, "letter to the editor," *The Irish Times*, October 8, 1992, Lexis-Nexis Academic; Adrian Cosby, "letter to the editor," *The Irish Times*, December 24, 1992, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 23, 2015); Conor Keogh, Terence O'Brien, and Colin Lee, "letter to the editor," *The Irish Times*, March 16, 1993, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 23, 2015); Heather Greer, letter to the editor, *The Irish Times*, June 12, 1995, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 25, 2015). Adrian Cosby referred to the Bosnian Muslims and the Muslim world expressing singular opinions. Adrian Cosby, letter to the editor, December 24, 1992.

26. This was opposed to roughly four for the previous references, excluding Ottoman history which appeared nine times.

27. Betty Nunan, "letter to the editor," *The Irish Times*, June 2, 1992, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 23, 2015); Peter Walsh et al., "letter to the editor," *The Irish Times*, January 19, 1996, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 25, 2015); Michael McKiernan, "Letter to the Editor," *The Irish Times*, September 28, 1992, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 23, 2015). In the first two letters the Albanians are described with a Muslim characteristic, whereas in the second letter they are cited as simply an ethnicity. This could be a topic for future research as to how the Irish perceived the Albanians, as an ethnicity or as part of a larger Islamic community. Walsh et al., "letter to the editor," January 19, 1996; Nunan, "letter to the editor," June 2, 1992; McKiernan, "letter to the editor," September 28, 1992.

28. A.W. Polden MCRVS, "letter to the editor," *The Irish Times*, March 22, 1993, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 23, 2015); Abid Habib, "letter to the editor," *The Irish Times*, February 1, 1994, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 23, 2015).

The Irish population also discussed the idea, almost as frequently, of Bosnia being a predominantly Muslim state. The population split their argument into blaming then Muslim President Alija Izetbegovic for being a fundamentalist leading the Muslim population to war,²⁹ and a more general characterization of Bosnia as a quasi-Muslim, nation-state.³⁰ It should be noted; however, that there is substantive bias present in the blaming of Izetbegovic, because one of the primary authors of this batch of letters was identified as being part of the “Serbian Information Bureau,”³¹ and he published six out of the eight letters included.³²

Secondly, the Bosnian Muslims were referred to in situations where their human security was in danger. While the number of statements concerning Muslim solidarity with Bosnia occurred at a lesser frequency than the individual frequencies of aid and utility deprivation,³³

29. Zivko Jaksic, “letter to the editor,” *The Irish Times*, July 21, 1992, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 23, 2015); A. Antanackovic, “letter to the editor,” *The Irish Times*, September 1, 1992; Zivko Jaksic, “letter to the editor,” *The Irish Times*, September 29, 1992, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 23, 2015); Zivko Jaksic, “letter to the editor,” *The Irish Times*, July 12, 1993, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 23, 2015); Zivko Jaksic, “letter to the editor,” *The Irish Times*, October 1, 1993, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 23, 2015); B. Orlic, “letter to the editor,” May 16, 1994; Zivko Jaksic, “letter to the editor,” *The Irish Times*, September 9, 1994, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 25, 2015); Zivko Jaksic, “letter to the editor,” *The Irish Times*, January 17, 1996, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 25, 2015).

30. Anthony Coughlan, “letter to the editor,” *The Irish Times*, September 22, 1992, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 23, 2015); Doyle, letter to the editor, December 21, 1992; B. Orlic, “letter to the editor,” *The Irish Times*, April 16, 1994, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 23, 2015); Zivko Jaksic, “letter to the editor,” *The Irish Times*, May 23, 1994, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 23, 2015); John Kelly, “letter to the editor,” *The Irish Times*, October 17, 1994, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 25, 2015); Zivko Jaksic, “letter to the editor,” *The Irish Times*, October 21, 1994, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 25, 2015); Conor MacCarthy, “letter to the editor,” *The Irish Times*, January 17, 1995, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 25, 2015); Pravica, “letter to the editor,” January 18, 1995; Zivko Jaksic, “letter to the editor,” July 3, 1995, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 25, 2015); Kevin Wingfield, “letter to the editor,” *The Irish Times*, September 7, 1995, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 25, 2015). One article actually rejects the idea of Bosnia as a particularly fundamentalist Muslim state, which is interesting to note. Farrell, “letter to the editor,” October 8, 1992.

31. Zivko Jaksic, “letter to the editor,” *The Irish Times*, September 9, 1994, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 25, 2015). This is the first instance when it was formally revealed in a letter that he was part of this organization. Jaksic, letter to the editor, September 9, 1994.

32. See note 62. One person presented a counterfactual stating that Izetbegovic can't be the only person to blame. Sonia Zambakides, letter to the editor, *The Irish Times*, July 21, 1993, accessed June 23, 2015, Lexis-Nexis Academic.

33. Farrell, “letter to the editor,” October 8, 1992; Keogh, O'Brien and Lee, “letter to the editor,” March 16, 1993; Greer, “letter to the editor,” June 12, 1995 (Solidarity Citations End); Byrne, “letter to the editor,” March 3, 1993; Ciara Cronin, “letter to the editor,” *The Irish Times*, May 13, 1993, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 23, 2015); Zambakides, “letter to the editor,” July 21, 1993; Flynn, “letter to the editor,” August 11, 1993; Galvin, Neff, Nicholls and Hughes, “letter to the editor,” January 9, 1994. Its important to note that people are also arguing against citations of aid being deprived to undetermined groups, which may indicate that this was a wider held belief. Kay Barry, “letter to the editor,” *The Irish Times*, February 11, 1993, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 23, 2015);

Muslims being helpless victims,³⁴ the inability to defend safety zones and the failure of safety zones,³⁵ of Muslims being the primary targets of rape,³⁶ and the citation that Bosnian Muslims were victims of World War II atrocities,³⁷ the latter subjects represented approximately twenty-four of all the articles examined, thereby demonstrating how issues of human security were just as significant as discussions of mass violence against the Muslims.

The final way in which the Irish public referred to the Bosnian Muslims was as

Jadiza Kaminska, "letter to the editor," *The Irish Times*, August 16, 1993, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 23, 2015); Kay Barry, "letter to the editor," *The Irish Times*, March 7, 1995, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 25, 2015).

34. Jaksic, "letter to the editor," July 21, 1992; Tom Ahearne, "letter to the editor," November 4, 1992; Henry Bacik, "letter to the editor," *The Irish Times*, December 22, 1992, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 23, 2015); Cronin, "letter to the editor," May 13, 1993; Zambakides, "letter to the editor," July 21, 1993; Dominic Loughran, "letter to the editor," *The Irish Times*, September 7, 1993, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 23, 2015); Jaksic, "letter to the editor," October 1, 1993; John McCrory, "letter to the editor," *The Irish Times*, February 10, 1994, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 23, 2015); Laurence Power, "letter to the editor," *The Irish Times*, April 27, 1994, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 23, 2015); Gerard Neff, "letter to the editor," *The Irish Times*, September 2, 1994, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 25, 2015); McCormack, "letter to the editor," July 21, 1995; Flynn, "letter to the editor," July 28, 1995.

35. Peter Walsh, "letter to the editor," *The Irish Times*, April 24, 1993, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 23, 2015); Jason O'Mahoney, "letter to the editor," *The Irish Times*, July 6, 1993, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 23, 2015); Flynn, "letter to the editor," August 11, 1993; Connolly, "letter to the editor," May 23, 1994; Galvin, Neff, Nicholls, Hughes, "letter to the editor," December 9, 1994; McCormack, "letter to the editor," July 21, 1995; Pol O Gradaigh, "letter to the editor," July 22, 1995, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 25, 2015); Flynn, "letter to the editor," July 28, 1995; Hynes, "letter to the editor," August 17, 1995; O'Gradaigh, "letter to the editor," July 22, 1995.

36. Al-Sader, "letter to the editor," August 17, 1992; Catherine Bourke, "letter to the editor," *The Irish Times*, December 23, 1992, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 23, 2015); Vera Hughes, "letter to the editor," *The Irish Times*, December 24, 1992, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 23, 2015); Dr. P. Linden, "letter to the editor," *The Irish Times*, January 7, 1993, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 23, 2015); Polden, "letter to the editor," March 22, 1993; Fennell, "letter to the editor," July 2, 1993; Zambakides, "letter to the editor," July 21, 1993; O'Criodain, "letter to the editor," August 4, 1993; Flynn, "letter to the editor," August 11, 1993; Al-Sader, "letter to the editor," January 6, 1995; Kelleher, "letter to the editor," July 22, 1995; Flynn, "letter to the editor," July 28, 1995. There were also references to other groups being the subject of rape, but their number was limited to below three, with two referring to the Bosnian population at large, and one referring to the Serbs, the latter of which received an acerbic rebuttle. Geraldine Canavan, "letter to the editor," *The Irish Times*, December 23, 1992, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 23, 2015); Kapic, "letter to the editor," May 20, 1994; John Kelly, "letter to the editor," *The Irish Times*, August 24, 1994, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 25, 2015); Neff, "letter to the editor," September 2, 1994.

37. Neff, "letter to the editor," September 2, 1994.

independent actors capable of militaristic operations—³⁸such as cutting power,³⁹ fighting the Croats,⁴⁰ fighting for their ideals,⁴¹ or mobilizing troops⁴²—for better or worse. One article even referred to the idea that, “...[the UN] has scandalously suggested that the Bosnians [Muslims] had concocted atrocities... .”⁴³

Fourth, explicit dual references to Muslims and Croats—⁴⁴ as in the Muslims and Croats worked together or fought—⁴⁵ occurred at a relatively high although slightly lesser frequency of seventeen. These two trends are important to note, because it shows that the Bosnian Muslims were not being spoken about in isolation, and it shows that there was discussion about the Croat-Muslim relationship during this period as well.

38. Jaksic, “letter to the editor,” July 22, 1992; Antanackovic, “letter to the editor,” September 1, 1992; Unknown, “letter to the editor,” *The Irish Times*, May 1, 1993, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 23, 2015); Fennell, “letter to the editor,” July 2, 1993; William Hanafin, “letter to the editor,” *The Irish Times*, July 3, 1993, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 23, 2015); O’Mahoney, “letter to the editor,” July 6, 1993; Jaksic, “letter to the editor,” July 12, 1993; J. Waldron, “letter to the editor,” *The Irish Times*, July 14, 1993, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 23, 2015); Zambakides, “letter to the editor,” July 21, 1993; O’Criodain, “letter to the editor,” August 4, 1993; Zivko Jaksic, “letter to the editor,” *The Irish Times*, February 26, 1994, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 23, 2015); Orlic, “letter to the editor,” April 16, 1994; Michael Scott, “letter to the editor,” *The Irish Times*, April 27, 1994, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 23, 2015); Jaksic, “letter to the editor,” July 8, 1994; Valerie Hughes, “letter to the editor,” *The Irish Times*, July 25, 1994, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 25, 2015); Jaksic, “letter to the editor,” September 9, 1994; Kelly, “letter to the editor,” October 17, 1994; Kenneth Nicholls, “letter to the editor,” *The Irish Times*, October 21, 1994, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 25, 2015); Jaksic, “letter to the editor,” October 21, 1994; Zivko Jaksic, “letter to the editor,” November 30, 1994, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 25, 2015); Galvin, Neff, Nicholls, and Hughes, “letter to the editor,” December 9, 1994; Wingfield, “letter to the editor,” September 7, 1995; Zivko Jaksic, “letter to the editor,” October 13, 1995, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 25, 2015).

39. Waldron, “letter to the editor,” July 14, 1993.

40. Unknown, “letter to the editor,” May 1, 1993.

41. Antanackovic, “letter to the editor,” September 1, 1992.

42. Jaksic, “letter to the editor,” November 30, 1994.

43. Hughes, “letter to the editor,” July 25, 1994.

44. MacMillan, “letter to the editor,” June 25, 1992; McKiernan, “letter to the editor,” September 28, 1992; Farrell, “letter to the editor,” October 8, 1992; Ahearne, “letter to the editor,” November 4, 1992; Desmond McMahon, “letter to the editor,” *The Irish Times*, April 22, 1993, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 23, 2015); Unknown, “letter to the editor,” May 1, 1993; Jaksic, “letter to the editor,” October 1, 1993; McCrory, “letter to the editor,” February 10, 1994; Power, “letter to the editor,” April 27, 1994; Jaksic, “letter to the editor,” May 23, 1994; Kenneth Nicholls, “letter to the editor,” *The Irish Times*, May 26, 1994, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 25, 2015); Bogodan Orlic, “letter to the editor,” *The Irish Times*, July 29, 1994, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 25, 2015); Jaksic, “letter to the editor,” September 9, 1994; Kelly, “letter to the editor,” August 24, 1994; Nicholls, “letter to the editor,” October 21, 1994; Jaksic, “letter to the editor,” July 3, 1995; Jaksic, “letter to the editor,” *The Irish Times*, August 10, 1995, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 25, 2015); Cosby, “letter to the editor,” December 24, 1992.

45. Orlic, “letter to the editor,” July 29, 1994.

In addition to these four main references to the Bosnian Muslims, there were miscellaneous references that I could not place into the other classifications, such as John D. Stewart's mournings over the Sarajevo Bread Line with no explicitly identified Muslim or Croat target,⁴⁶ blaming, "Ancient Slav society consist[ing] of familial groups that made up tribes, each of which had its own military organisation and common religious cult,"⁴⁷ that Sarajevo is non-ethnic,⁴⁸ that Zivko Jaksic is using improper historical contexts to explain his points,⁴⁹ that the same multiple ethnicity attacks by the Yugoslav army happened in Albania,⁵⁰ an ambiguous stance on how to end the conflict,⁵¹ and a reference to how there are multiple ethnicities in mass graves.⁵²

My analysis of *The Irish Times* newspaper has revealed that there was a general tendency to talk about the Bosnian Muslims in the context of genocide, the Muslim world, their human security, as well as their relationship with the Croatians, although to a slightly lesser extent. In order to improve the analysis in the future, I would have to remove the errors that resulted from including people who were not Irish, expand the number of newspapers, and run a statistical regression to establish significance, thus taking a more quantitative rather than qualitative approach.

Level Two – Parliament

In addition to observing the population's perspective on the Bosnian Muslims, I examined the Irish Parliament's approach to talking about the Bosnian Muslims and their place in the

46. John D. Stewart, letter to the editor, *The Irish Times*, June 2, 1992, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 23, 2015).

47. Kelly, "letter to the editor," May 6, 1994.

48. Zlato Dizdarevic in Rev. Peadar O'Callaghan, "letter to the editor," May 24, 1994, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 25, 2015).

49. Dempsey, "letter to the editor," July 22, 1994.

50. Betty Nunan, "letter to the editor," June 2, 1992.

51. Howard M. Cowell, "letter to the editor," *The Irish Times*, June 2, 1992, Lexis-Nexis Academic (accessed June 23, 2015).

52. Jaksic, "letter to the editor," January 17, 1996.

conflict. In contrast to the Letters to the Editor, I found that there were considerably fewer citations of issues concerning the Bosnian Muslim identity and a greater sympathy towards the global Muslim population.

Firstly, I saw fewer citations of radicalism in the Bosnian government than in the Letters to the Editor if one were to still be considering the “Serbian Information Bureau” affiliated letters. Of these articles, two out of three cited how deprivation similar to the Israeli-Palestinian conflict,⁵³ and UN actions,⁵⁴ were leading to the radicalization of Yugoslavia and the Bosnian Muslims, respectively, while the third stated how the Iranian Revolution's path to radicalism was being repeated globally.⁵⁵ While there is no consistent, explicit reference to the Bosnian Muslims in all of these examples, I considered the threat of radicalism in my analysis, because it shows how the upper levels of society have become more oblique in who they decided to implicate as a radical. If I excluded the blaming of Izetbegovic, which was biased by the presence of the “Serbian Information Bureau” in the previous analysis, the citation of concern over Muslim world solidarity with Bosnia is roughly the same: it differs by only one article and the percentage accounts for roughly three versus four percent of all documents analyzed in the former analysis. In spite of this close percentage, there were fewer units examined in this level of analysis, and whether or not to extract the “Serbian Information Bureau” letters is a question that adds error to my analysis.

I also found that the Irish parliament had strong sympathies towards the Muslim world. While the parliamentary documents don't explicitly refer to the Bosnian Muslims, the documents

53. Ireland, House of the Oireachtas, Seanad Éireann, “Foreign Affairs: Statements,” Mr. Lanigan, Debate 243, 6, May 11, 1995, accessed July 17, 2015, Search Debates – Full Text.

54. Mr. Robert Fisk, used by Ms. Cahill, quoted in Ireland, House of the Oireachtas, Seanad Éireann, “Situation in Bosnia: Statements,” Mr. Mooney, Debate 144, 11, July 14, 1995, accessed June 31, 2015, Search Debates – Full Text.

55. Ireland, House of the Oireachtas, Seanad Éireann, “Joint Committee on Foreign Affairs,” Mr. Lanigan, Debate 136, 4, May 13, 1993, accessed July 17, 2015, Search Debates – Full Text.

reveal the parliament's perspective on the Muslim world, which can help us to better understand how the parliament viewed the Bosnian Muslims. The Irish parliament referred positively to a plethora of Middle East issues in isolation—including supporting eventual Turkish membership in the EU,⁵⁶ supporting Palestine,⁵⁷ which is also asserted by Deputy Shatter as a form of bias,⁵⁸ and linking Muslims and Catholics through the issues of the independence of East Timor, Indonesia and global population control.⁵⁹ I believe that this positive outlook on the Muslim world may also have translated into a positive image of the Bosnian Muslims; however, a more accurate analysis would have to be done to establish whether or not this connection exists.

In addition, I found that the Irish parliament spoke about the Bosnian Muslims in a complicated way, discussing the conflict in Bosnia alongside general international problems,⁶⁰ and the joint positions of international organizations, such as the Western European Union and the European Union.⁶¹ The parliament's complex way of talking about the Bosnian conflict is personified in a statement by Deputy Deasy on Ambassador Muhamed Filipovic's of Bosnia's

56. Ireland, House of the Oireachtas, Seanad Éireann, “Reflection Group for the Intergovernmental Conference: Statements,” Mr. O’Toole, Debate 145, 9, November 30, 1995, accessed June 31, 2015, Search Debates – Full Text.

57. Ireland, House of the Oireachtas, Select Committee on Foreign Affairs, “Vote 38 – Foreign Affairs (Revised Estimate).” June 7, 1995, Debate, accessed July 17, 2015, Search Debates – Full Text; Ireland, House of the Oireachtas, Dáil Éireann, “European Council Meetings: Statements,” Mr. J. Burton, Debate 437, 4, December 16, 1993, accessed July 17, 2015, Search Debates – Full Text.

58. Ireland, House of the Oireachtas, Select Committee on Foreign Affairs, “Vote 38 – Foreign Affairs (Revised Estimate).” Mr. Shatter, Debate, June 7, 1995, accessed July 17, 2015, Search Debates – Full Text.

59. Ireland, House of the Oireachtas, Seanad Éireann, “Foreign Policy: Motion,” Mr. Lanigan, Debate 140, 20, July 6, 1994, accessed June 31, 2015, Search Debates – Full Text; Ireland, House of the Oireachtas, Seanad Éireann, “East Timor Motion,” Mr. Neville, Debate 143, 17, June 14, 1995, accessed June 31, 2015, Search Debates – Full Text. It was classified in a statement by Mr. Lyndon, that, “Catholicism has also become a very important component of Timorese nationalism and of resistance to Indonesian occupation,” which leads me to infer that Mr. Neville's, “...advocates for independence for East Timor...,” are in some way synonymous with Catholicism. Mr. Neville, “East Timor Motion,” June 14, 1995; Mr. Lyndon, “East Timor Motion,” June 14, 1995.

60. Ireland, House of of the Oireachtas, Select Committee on Legislation and Security, “Vote 36 – Defence (Revised Estimate).” Mr. Clohessy, Debate, May 16, 1995, accessed July 17, 2015, Search Debates – Full Text; Ireland, House of of the Oireachtas, Select Committee on Foreign Affairs, “Vote 38 – Foreign Affairs (Revised Estimate).” Mr. Bree, Debate, June 7, 1995, accessed July 17, 2015, Search Debates – Full Text; Ireland, House of of the Oireachtas, Dáil Éireann, “Defence Forces UN Service: Motion,” Mr. Clohessy, Debate 457, 3, October 19, 1995, accessed July 17, 2015, Search Debates – Full Text; Ireland, House of of the Oireachtas, Seanad Éireann, “Order of Business.” Mr. D. Kiely, Debate 140, 16, June 22, 1994, accessed July 17, 2015, Search Debates – Full Text.

61. Ireland, House of the Oireachtas, Dáil Éireann, “EC Summit: Statements.” Mr. Rabbitte and Ms. Harney, Debate 435, 5, November 4, 1993, accessed July 17, 2015, Search Debates – Full Text.

visit to the Irish Parliament. In his recounting of the meeting, he stated:

“He is Muslim but, as he pointed out, the conflict is not just Muslims against Serbs or Serbs against Croats but a very complicated dispute. The fact that he is a Bosnian Muslim does not mean he does not represent Bosnian Serbs or Bosnian Croats. People do not align themselves simply according to their nationality, it is a more complex situation.”⁶²

This lack of a clear statement on a connection between the Bosnian Muslims and the Muslim world, the positive outlook on the Middle East in general, and the parliament's discussion of the Bosnian conflict in the context of international organizations, shows how parliamentarians focused more on the complicated nature of the conflict than its Muslim character. This leads me to conclude that the Parliament didn't know what to think about the Bosnian Muslims and instead focused on other international issues.

The next most numerous view the Irish Parliament had towards the Bosnian Muslims was that of Bosnian Muslims being the subject of both seven lethal genocide-like actions,⁶³ and one non-lethal action.⁶⁴ In addition, there was considerable focus on mostly human issues explicitly

62. Ireland, House of the Oireachtas, Dáil Éireann, “Defence Forces UN Service: Motion,” Mr. Deasy, Debate 457, 3, October 19, 1995, accessed July 17, 2015, Search Debates – Full Text.

63. Ireland, House of the Oireachtas, Dáil Éireann, “Ceisteanna—Questions. Oral Answers. - Conflict in Former Yugoslavia,” Mrs. Owen, Debate 445, 9, October 18, 1994, accessed June 31, 2015, Search Debates – Full Text; Ireland, House of the Oireachtas, Dáil Éireann, “Ceisteanna – Questions. Oral Answers. - Yugoslav Conflict,” Mr. Clohessy, Debate 428, 1, March 23, 1993, accessed June 30, 2015, Search Debates – Full Text; Ireland, House of the Oireachtas, Dáil Éireann, “Adjournment Debate. - Bosnian Serb Attack on Gorazde,” Mrs. Owen, Debate 441, 7, April 21, 1994, accessed June 30, 2015, Search Debates – Full Text; Ireland, House of the Oireachtas, Dáil Éireann, “Private Notice Questions. - Bosnian Serb Attack on Gorazde,” Mr. J. Higgins, Debate 441, 5, April 19, 1994, accessed June 30, 2015, Search Debates – Full Text; Ireland, House of the Oireachtas, Seanad Éireann, “Situation in Bosnia: Statements,” Mr. Mooney and Mr. O’Kennedy, Debate 144, 11, July 14, 1995, accessed June 31, 2015, Search Debates – Full Text; Ireland, House of the Oireachtas, Select Committee on Foreign Affairs, “Vote 38 – Foreign Affairs,” Mr. M. McDowell, Debate, June 18, 1993, accessed July 2, 2015, Search Debates – Full Text.

64. Ireland, House of the Oireachtas, Dáil Éireann, “Ceisteanna – Questions. Oral Answers. - Yugoslav Conflict,” Mr. M. McDowell, Debate 428, 1, March 23, 1993, accessed June 30, 2015, Search Debates – Full Text.

related to the Bosnian Muslims, including safe areas,⁶⁵ rape victims,⁶⁶ the blockade of Bosnian Muslims,⁶⁷ the right to arms/defense,⁶⁸ Bosnian Muslim territory,⁶⁹ the right of return,⁷⁰ and the donation of a Muslim library collection.⁷¹ All of these human issues received decreased attention in the order that they were listed, starting from a low value of only three citations; however, if they are considered in combination—specifically safe areas, rape victims, blockade of Bosnian Muslims, the right to arms and self-defense, as well as the right of return—under the umbrella category of human security issues, the frequency is nine original documents, which places it higher on the list than references to genocide like actions and Muslim world sympathy.

There were some similarities between the second and first levels of analysis in my study, including numerous citations of genocidal activities against the Muslims, a high frequency of human security issues being discussed if the human security issues are considered together, as well as a high number of references to the Muslim world, although not as piercing in rhetoric. Furthermore, I would assert that the Bosnian Muslims connections to the Muslim world and fundamentalism were muddled at this level, especially with the question of whether or not to include or exclude the “Serbian Information Bureau” affiliated letters. I would recommend a closer examination be conducted to draw any definitive conclusions.

65. Ireland, House of the Oireachtas, Dáil Éireann, “Ceisteanna—Questions. Oral Answers. - Conflict in Former Yugoslavia.” Mr. Cullen and Ms. Harney, Debate 432, 2, June 10, 1993, accessed June 30, 2015, Search Debates – Full Text; Ireland, House of the Oireachtas, Dáil Éireann, “Private Notice Questions. - Bosnian Serb Attack on Gorazde.” Mr. J. Higgins, Debate 441, 5, April 19, 1994, accessed June 30, 2015, Search Debates – Full Text; Mr. M. McDowell, “Vote 38 – Foreign Affairs,” June 18, 1993.

66. Ireland, House of the Oireachtas, Seanad Éireann, “Situation in Bosnia: Statements.” Mr. O’Kennedy, Debate 144, no. 11, July 14, 1995, accessed June 31, 2015, Search Debates – Full Text; Mr. M. McDowell, “Vote 38 – Foreign Affairs,” June 18, 1993; Ireland, House of the Oireachtas, Dáil Éireann, “Edinburgh Summit Statements,” Mr. J. O’Keeffe, Debate 425, 3, December 16, 1992, accessed June 30, 2015, Search Debates – Full Text.

67. Ms. Harney, “Ceisteanna – Questions. Oral Answers. - Yugoslav Conflict.” March 23, 1993; Mr. Mooney, “Situation in Bosnia: Statements.” July 14, 1995.

68. Mr. Clohessy, “Ceisteanna – Questions. Oral Answers. - Yugoslav Conflict.” March 23, 1993; Mr. M. McDowell, “Vote 38 – Foreign Affairs,” June 18, 1993.

69. Ireland, House of the Oireachtas, Dáil Éireann, “Ceisteanna – Questions. Oral Answers. - Bosnian Conflict.” Mr. M. McDowell, Debate 437, 7, January 27, 1994, accessed June 30, 2015, Search Debates – Full Text.

70. Owen, “Ceisteanna—Questions. Oral Answers. - Conflict in Former Yugoslavia.” October 18, 1994.

71. Ireland, House of the Oireachtas, Dáil Éireann, “Written Answers. - Chester Beatty Library Collection.” Mr. Sargent, Debate 442, 5, May 10, 1994, accessed July 17, 2015, Search Debates – Full Text.

Level Three – Government

It became even more difficult to discern the perspective of the Irish on the Bosnian Muslims at the third level of government; however, the trend of referencing human security issues almost as frequently as the top two issues is found in this section as well.

Firstly, the two primary trends I saw in this section was references to the Muslim-Croat Federation ending their civil war,⁷² and the eventual territorial split of Bosnia-Herzegovina and the Serb Republic.⁷³ These two recurrences may mark a trend to seeing the Bosnian Muslims in the context of the wider war rather than simply victims. Furthermore, I found only two identical statements where a government official cited a non-lethal attack against the Muslims,⁷⁴ and thus supports my assertion that the Bosnian Muslims were seen as part of the larger conflict rather

72. Ireland, House of the Oireachtas, Dáil Éireann, “Written Answers. - Bosnian Peace.,” Mr. Spring, Debate 447, 11, January 24, 1995, accessed June 31, 2015, Search Debates – Full Text; Ireland, House of the Oireachtas, Dáil Éireann, “Ceisteanna—Questions. Oral Answers. - Conflict in Former Yugoslavia.,” Mr. Spring, Debate 445, 9, October 18, 1994, accessed June 31, 2015, Search Debates – Full Text; Ireland, House of the Oireachtas, Seanad Éireann, “Adjournment Matters. - Massacre in (Gorazde) Bosnia.,” Mr. Spring, Debate 140, 1, April 20, 1994, accessed June 30, 2015, Search Debates – Full Text; Ireland, House of the Oireachtas, Dáil Éireann, “Written Answers. - Bosnian Conflict.,” Mr. Spring, Debate 441, 6, April 20, 1994, accessed June 30, 2015, Search Debates – Full Text; Ireland, House of the Oireachtas, Dáil Éireann, “Adjournment Debate. - Bosnian Serb Attack on Gorazde.,” Mr. O’Shea, Debate 441, 7, April 21, 1994, accessed June 30, 2015, Search Debates – Full Text; Ireland, House of the Oireachtas, Dáil Éireann, “Private Notice Questions. - Bosnian Serb Attack on Gorazde.,” Mr. Spring, Debate 441, 5, April 19, 1994, accessed June 30, 2015, Search Debates – Full Text; Ireland, House of the Oireachtas, Dáil Éireann, “European Summit: Statements.,” Mr. Spring, Debate 455, 3, June 29, 1995, accessed June 31, 2015, Search Debates – Full Text. One of the eight citations must have come from before the ceasefire was signed, because the government stated that they were, “...concerned...,” and that the EC collectively told them to stop fighting. What this can tell us about Irish resolve at the governmental level may help to add clarity to the analysis of the ambiguous governmental level. Ireland, House of the Oireachtas, Dáil Éireann, “Written Answers. - UN Sanctions on Croatia.,” Mr. Spring, Debate 430, 4, May 6, 1993, accessed July 2, 2015, Search Debates – Full Text.

73. Mr. Spring, “Written Answers. - Bosnian Peace.,” January 24, 1995; Mr. Spring, “Ceisteanna—Questions. Oral Answers. - Conflict in Former Yugoslavia.,” October 18, 1994; Mr. Spring, “Adjournment Matters. - Massacre in (Gorazde) Bosnia.,” April 20, 1994; Mr. Spring, “Written Answers. - Bosnian Conflict.,” April 20, 1994; Ireland, House of the Oireachtas, Dáil Éireann, “Adjournment Debate. - Bosnian Conflict.,” Ms. Burton, Debate 455, 7, July 26, 1995, accessed June 31, 2015, Search Debates – Full Text; Ireland, House of the Oireachtas, Dáil Éireann, “Ceisteanna—Questions. Oral Answers. - Bosnia-Herzegovina Conflict.,” Mr. Spring, Debate 443, 5, June 1, 1994, accessed June 31, 2015, Search Debates – Full Text; Mr. Spring, “Ceisteanna – Questions. Oral Answers. - Bosnian Conflict.,” January 27, 1994; Ireland, House of the Oireachtas, Dáil Éireann, “Ceisteanna—Questions. Oral Answers. - Former Yugoslavia Conflict.,” Mr. Spring, Debate 453, 3, May 23, 1995, accessed June 31, 2015, Search Debates – Full Text.

74. Mr. Spring, “Ceisteanna – Questions. Oral Answers. - Yugoslav Conflict.,” March 23, 1993; Ireland, House of the Oireachtas, Dáil Éireann, “European Community Affairs: Statements.,” Mr. T. Kitt, Debate 429, 2, April 2, 1993, accessed June 30, 2015, Search Debates – Full Text. The section in question is identical in both cases.

than simply victims of genocide.

References to human security issues have also made a resurgence at this level. If I was to consider the issues of safe areas,⁷⁵ rape victims,⁷⁶ and two identical citations of how the Muslims were being deprived of food,⁷⁷ as part of the human security umbrella, they account for nine of the total articles, which places them either on par or even slightly above references to the Muslim-Croat Federation as well as the territorial split.

In addition, there were references to the European Union's joint actions about the Middle East Peace Process, which refers to the Israel-Palestine conflict, and the conflict in Bosnia,⁷⁸ which occurs roughly seven times, and I saw the citation of the Muslims need to, or participation in peace negotiations twice,⁷⁹ which shows how references to larger issues overtook those related to specifically Bosnian Muslims at this level. In addition, I found other issues that were covered

75. Mr. Spring, "Adjournment Matters. - Massacre in (Gorazde) Bosnia.," April 20, 1994; Mr. O'Shea, "Adjournment Debate. - Bosnian Serb Attack on Gorazde.," April 21, 1994; Mr. Spring, "Ceisteanna—Questions. Oral Answers. - Conflict in Former Yugoslavia.," June 10, 1993; Mr. Spring, "Private Notice Questions. - Bosnian Serb Attack on Gorazde.," April 19, 1994; Mr. Spring, "Written Answers., - UN Sanctions on Croatia.," May 6, 1993.

76. Mr. Spring, "Written Answers., - UN Sanctions on Croatia.," May 6, 1993; Mr. Spring, "Written Answers. - Conflict in Former Yugoslavia.," February 10, 1993, Dáil Éireann Debate 425, 7, House of the Oireachtas, Search Debate – Full Text, accessed June 30, 2015, Search Debates – Full Text; Mr. Spring, "Written Answers. - Treatment of Bosnian Women.," February 10, 1993, Dáil Éireann Debate 425, 7, House of the Oireachtas, Search Debate – Full Text, accessed June 30, 2015, Search Debates – Full Text; Mr. Spring, "Ceisteanna—Questions. Oral Answers. - Bosnia-Herzegovina Conflict.," June 1, 1994; The Taoiseach, "Edinburgh Summit Statements.," December 16, 1992.

77. Mr. Spring, "Ceisteanna – Questions. Oral Answers. - Yugoslav Conflict.," March 23, 1993; Mr. T. Kitt, "European Community Affairs: Statements.," April 2, 1993.

78. Ireland, House of the Oireachtas, Dáil Éireann, "Written Answers. - EU Foreign and Security Policy.," Mr. Spring, Debate 439, 6, March 2, 1994, accessed July 17, 2015, Search Debates – Full Text; Ireland, House of the Oireachtas, Dáil Éireann, "Ceisteanna—Questions. Oral Answers. - Financing of EU CFSP.," Mr. Spring, Debate 453, 3, May 23, 1995, accessed July 17, 2015, Search Debates – Full Text; Ireland, House of the Oireachtas, Dáil Éireann, "Ceisteanna – Questions. Oral Answers. - Common Foreign and Security Policy.," Mr. Spring, Debate 437, 7, January 27, 1994, accessed July 17, 2015, Search Debates – Full Text; Ireland, House of the Oireachtas, Dáil Éireann, "Reports on Developments in the European Union: Statements.," Mr. Spring, Debate 457, 2, accessed July 17, 2015, October 18, 1995, Search Debates – Full Text; Ireland, House of the Oireachtas, Dáil Éireann, "Ceisteanna—Questions. Oral Answers. - Common Foreign and Security Policy Financing.," Mr. Spring, Debate 443, 5, June 1, 1994, accessed July 17, 2015, Search Debates – Full Text; Ireland, House of the Oireachtas, Dáil Éireann, "EC Summit: Statements.," The Taoiseach, Debate 435, 5, November 4, 1993, accessed July 17, 2015, Search Debates – Full Text.

79. Mr. Spring, "Private Notice Questions. - Bosnian Serb Attack on Gorazde.," April 19, 1994; Mr. T. Kitt, "European Community Affairs: Statements.," April 2, 1993.

only one time, including the Malaysian perspective on the Bosnian conflict,⁸⁰ and what to do with the Chester Beatty Muslim Library collection.⁸¹

The continuing references to human security issues alongside the top issues of Muslim-Croat cooperation demonstrate a continuation of a trend of seeing the Bosnian Muslims social problems; however, decreased references to genocide like violence and a broader reference to EU joint actions towards Bosnia and the Middle East Peace Process signal a shift from previous levels of the society.

Level Four – European Union/Community

By the time I reached the European level, almost all independent expressions of the Irish state on the Bosnian Muslims evaporated. Inputs by the Irish state at the European level were limited and covered a diverse range of issues. Questions by the Irish government to the European Community were vocalized through the European Parliament Representative for Ireland, John Walls Cushnahan (European Union).⁸² I determined that Cushnahan's method for contributing to EC level discussion consisted of asking a seemingly innocuous question about the EC's actions, and following it up with an acerbic question.⁸³ In the two instances when I read him asking these caustic questions, he questioned ways to improve refugee admissions and criticizes some country's refusal to accept refugees,⁸⁴ and also took a thinly veiled swipe at Germany for

80. Ireland, House of the Oireachtas, Dáil Éireann, “Ceisteanna—Questions. Oral Answers. - Malaysian Visit.,” The Taoiseach, Debate 431, 7, June 2, 1993, accessed July 5, 2015, Search Debates – Full Text.

81. Mr. Higgins, “Written Answers. - Chester Beatty Library Collection.,” May 10, 1994.

82. There is backstop on his speeches and other statements at Parliament around the year 1999, which limits the usability of this specific page for analysis (European Union).

83. European Foreign Policy Database, “Question No H-852/92 by Mr. Cushnahan on Refugees from the States of the Former Yugoslavia,” Doc. 5 of 49 (Strasbourg, Fr: European Foreign Policy Database, Sept. 16, 1992), print-out, in Yugoslavia 1992 [441.2(70)], Barbara Sloan European Union Document Collection, University of Pittsburgh, Hillman Library; European Foreign Policy Database, “Question No. H-613/92 by Mr Cushnahan on the situation in Yugoslavia,” Doc. 4 of 49, printed April 8, 2002, (Strasbourg, Fr: European Foreign Policy Database, July 8, 1992) print-out, in Yugoslavia 1992 [441.2(70)], Barbara Sloan European Union Document Collection, University of Pittsburgh, Hillman Library.

84. European Foreign Policy Database, “Question No H-852/92 by Mr. Cushnahan,” 1.

recognizing the independence of Croatia and Slovenia prematurely.⁸⁵ Needless to say, the European Community's representative did not take too kindly to his second question in July, stating:

“I am grateful to the honourable Member for his opening remarks. Perhaps he is less than kind to the Community, however. We all have to bear in mind that the problems that are being faced in Yugoslavia are deep-rooted, historical problems and they are extremely difficult.”⁸⁶

While neither of these points specifically referred to the Bosnian Muslims, I believe that it shows how the Irish government was being critical towards the European Union's efforts in Bosnia with their limited input at the European level, which can help us to understand how they may have sympathized with the Bosnian Muslims or have been focused on larger issues related to the conflict.

In other areas, I found Ireland's participation was restricted to references to its humanitarian work. Ireland donated 200,000 USD to support Former Yugoslav Republic refugees; however, this donation only amounted to 0.13 percent of the European total in at the end of July 1992.⁸⁷ Furthermore, Ireland assisted with the Warburton Report on Muslim female rape victims in a European Commission Press Release.⁸⁸ The press release states that Ireland was

85. European Foreign Policy Database, “Question No. H-613/92 by Mr. Cushman,” 2-3, in Barbara Sloan European Union Document Collection; Dragnich, “The West's Mismanagement,” 65.

86. European Foreign Policy Database, “Question No. H-613/92 by Mr. Cushman,” 3.

87. “Reunion Du G-24 Sur L'Aide Humanitaire A l'Ex-Yougoslavie (P. Figueiredo Laissy),” Soft Copy of Message No: 027039, Duplicata, Brussels, Belgium, July 28, 1992, 3, table “The G-24,” in Yugoslavia 1992 [441.2(70)], Barbara Sloan European Union Document Collection, University of Pittsburgh, Hillman Library.

88. Dame Anne Warburton et al., “Annex 1: Mission Participants,” in “Subject: EC Investigative Mission into the Treatment of Muslim Women in the Former Yugoslavia. Final Report,” 1993, 8 of 8, in Yugoslavia 1993 [441.2(70)], Barbara Sloan European Union Document Collection, University of Pittsburgh, Hillman Library. Minister David Andrews is an Irish MP, and thus the Irish official representative. Ireland, House of the Oireachtas,

identified for “Follow-Up” on, “Training via seminar, conferences, reading material. For that purpose, to identify health professionals in EC countries specialized in working with traumatised persons,”⁸⁹ in relation to this report. I believe that Ireland's humanitarian aid was limited partly because of the country's size, but also because the EC may not have recognized some forms of Irish input. For example, one document that cataloged asylum seekers in other countries from 1995 did not recognize that Ireland was accepting refugees prior to this moment,⁹⁰ as is found in Minister of State at the Department of Foreign Affairs Ms. Burton's statement during the “Adjournment Debate [on the] Bosnian Conflict.”⁹¹ In spite of this error, the discrepancy may be the fault of the European Community's measurements, which was an issue it self-reported.⁹² One issue that I considered was pressing, was the disappearance of one Irish border monitor, along with four others, on the Serbo-Bosnian border. This was treated as a missing persons case in spite of Bosnian Serb citations that they were dead, and the Spanish government dealt with resolving the issue, because they were the designated leaders.⁹³ The only

Dáil Éireann, “Appointment of Taoiseach and Nomination of Members of Government.,” The Taoiseach, Debate 425, 6, January 12, 1993, accessed Aug. 28, 2015, Search Debates – Full Text.

89. European Communities, European Commission, Spokesman's Service, *Warburton Report*, in *Emergency Humanitarian Aid for Displaced Women in Bosnia*, Commission of the European Communities, Spokesman's Service, Press-Release, (Brussels, BE: Commission of the European Communities, April 20, 1993), 2, Annex, in Yugoslavia 1993[441.2(70)], Barbara Sloan European Union Document Collection, University of Pittsburgh, Hillman Library.

90. “Communication from the Commission: Humanitarian Aid to the Former Yugoslavia Prospects and Guidelines,” Commission of the European Communities, COM(95) 564 final, Brussels, Belgium, November 17, 1995, Yugoslavia 1995[441.2(70)], Barbara Sloan European Union Document Collection, University of Pittsburgh, Hillman Library.

91. Ms. Burton, “Adjournment Debate. - Bosnian Conflict.,” July 26, 1995, Dáil Éireann Debate 455, 7, accessed June 31, 2015, <http://oireachtasdebates.oireachtas.ie/Debates>

%20Authoring/DebatesWebPack.nsf/takes/dail1995072600015?opendocument&highlight=Bosnia%20and%20Muslim; Ms. F. Fitzgerald, “European Community Affairs: Statements.,” April 2, 1993.

92. “Communication from the Commission: Humanitarian Aid to the Former Yugoslavia: Prospects and Guidelines,” Commission of the European Communities, November 11, 1995, COM(95) 564 Final, p. 6 of 17, in Yugoslavia 1993-1999 [441.2(70)], Barbara Sloan European Union Document Collection, University of Pittsburgh, Hillman Library.

93. Commission of the European Communities, Directorate General, Audiovisual, Information, Communication, culture, information, “Rendez-Vous De Midi,” ECCO, ECCO Fax from Linda Cain to Heads of Offices, August 31, 1995, p. 1 of 4, in Yugoslavia 1993-1999 [441.2(70)], Barbara Sloan European Union Document Collection, University of Pittsburgh, Hillman Library.

other identifiable Irish representative that I found was Maeve O'Beirne, who worked as part of the EU's Delegation to the United States and was a press contact (European Union Center for Excellence2).⁹⁴ From my analysis of the European Union documents, I can conclude that Ireland participated in the larger EU actions, including human security issues found in advocating for Muslim female rape victims as part of the Warburton Report,⁹⁵ and the donation of money,⁹⁶ while they also lobbied some criticisms of EU policy; however, I would maintain that Ireland was confined to cooperation with other actors and lacked a substantial voice at this particular level.

Compare and Contrast

The analysis I conducted on three sets of primary sources revealed some interesting trends in how the Irish perspective viewed the Bosnian Muslims at various levels of their society. I saw trends being confined to roughly two levels, with the Bosnian Muslims being the primary victims of genocide at the population and parliamentary level, the Muslims and Croats referred to in conjunction at the population and government level, and references to European joint actions and positions referred to at the parliament and government level; however, references to the human security issues facing the Bosnian Muslims remained consistently important throughout all levels, particularly references to Muslim female rape victims.

These trends could be reflective of a general decrease in the number of documents

94. European Community News, "Review of G-24 Aid to Yugoslavia," No. 28/92, Jul 29, 1992, in Yugoslavia 1988-1991 [441.2(70)], Barbara Sloan European Union Document Collection, University of Pittsburgh, Hillman Library.

95. European Communities, European Commission, Spokesman's Service, *Warburton Report*, in *Emergency Humanitarian Aid for Displaced Women in Bosnia*, Commission of the European Communities, Spokesman's Service, Press-Release, (Brussels, BE: Commission of the European Communities, April 20, 1993), 2, Annex, in Yugoslavia 1993[441.2(70)], Barbara Sloan European Union Document Collection, University of Pittsburgh, Hillman Library.

96. "Reunion Du G-24 Sur L'Aide Humanitaire A l'Ex-Yougoslavie (P. Figueiredo Laissy)," Soft Copy of Message No: 027039, Duplicata, Brussels, Belgium, July 28, 1992, 3, table "The G-24," in Yugoslavia 1992 [441.2(70)], Barbara Sloan European Union Document Collection, University of Pittsburgh, Hillman Library.

examined over the analysis—dropping from ninety-eight in level one, to fifty in levels two and three, and finally to less than fifty by level four—; however, it may also reflect a general leveling out of the conversation on the Bosnian Muslims, and a greater willingness to look at multiple dimensions of the Bosnian conflict as social status increases. I would have to reject my original thesis that the Bosnian Muslims were spoken about more equivocatory as the level of society increased, and state that they were spoken about in a broader context the higher one went in the society and in the context of human security at all levels of the society. Opportunities for future research include examining how Irish perspective viewed other subsets of the society—such as the Croatians or the Serbs—applying this analysis to another state, or expanding this analysis to include more newspapers and more direct government speeches and texts, in order to see if the same kinds of results are obtained.

Conclusion

The results of my paper show that humanitarian issues surrounding the Bosnian Muslims were a strong thread throughout all levels of society in accordance with the literature's emphasis on humanitarian responses (Wilzig-Lehman and Bloch-Elkon 2005, 23; Robinson 2004, 395; Auerbach and Bloch-Elkon 2005, 91; Kuusisto 1998, 616); however, explicit accusations of holocaust genocide found in the literature may have limits the further up one goes in the society (Auerbach and Bloch-Elkon 2005, 92; Wilzig-Lehman and Bloch-Elkon 2005, 24; Von Oppen 2013, 207). This shows how international trends in conflict perception may be greatly similar, but not exactly the same as those found in other states. Furthermore, the spurratic depiction of Bosnian Muslims in conjunction with Croatians at the first and third levels, along with the references to multiple other issues related to the Muslim world, and the recurrence of joint actions/positions at the second and third levels may show how people perceiving conflicts may

be more able to develop complex ideas about the conflict in accordance with Ibrahim et al.'s assertions about emotional complexity for nearby conflicts (Ibrahim et al. 2014, 536). In addition, the unity and disunity of actors was shown through the recurrence of references to joint actions/positions in levels two and three, and and the collaborative Warbuton Commission in level 4 on one hand,⁹⁷ as well as Cushnahan's criticism at level four and the Serbian Information Bureau's letters to the editor in level one on the other hand (Von Oppen 2013, 211-212; Calis 2001, 142; Bearce 2002, 484). In conclusion, have been able to reveal through my analysis of Irish Perspectives on the Bosnian Muslims, how complex perspectives within a state on a particular issue can be, and how they can vary between states.

97. European Communities, European Commission, Spokesman's Service, *Warburton Report*, in *Emergency Humanitarian Aid for Displaced Women in Bosnia*, Commission of the European Communities, Spokesman's Service, Press-Release, (Brussels, BE: Commission of the European Communities, April 20, 1993), 2, Annex, in Yugoslavia 1993[441.2(70)], Barbara Sloan European Union Document Collection, University of Pittsburgh, Hillman Library.

Bibliography (APSA)⁹⁸

Primary Sources

- The Irish Times*. Letters to the Editor. Lexis-Nexis Academic.
<http://ezpro.cc.gettysburg.edu:2052/hottopics/lnacademic/> (June 23 and 25, 2015).
- House of the Oireachtas. "Search Debates – Full Text." *Oireachtas Business, Current Debates*.
<http://oireachtasdebates.oireachtas.ie/debates%20authoring/debateswebpack.nsf/fulltextsearch?readform> (July, 2015).
- Yugoslavia 1992-1995. Barbara Sloan European Union Document Collection, University of Pittsburgh, Hillman Library.

Secondary Sources

- Auerbach, Yehudith and Yaeli Bloch-Elkon. 2005. "Media Framing and Foreign Policy: The Elite Press vis-à-vis US Policy in Bosnia, 1992-95." *Journal of Peace Research* 42 (1) (Jan.): 83-99. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/30042244> (Accessed September 19, 2015).
- Bearce, David H. 2002. "Institutional Breakdown and International Cooperation: The European Agreement to Recognize Croatia and Slovenia." *European Journal of International Relations* 8 (4): 471-497. <http://ezpro.cc.gettysburg.edu:2885/content/8/4/471.full.pdf> (Accessed June 2, 2015).
- Calis, Saban. 2001. "Turkey's Balkan Policy in the Early 1990s." *Turkish Studies* 2 (1) (Spring): 135-146. <http://ezpro.cc.gettysburg.edu:2048/login?url=http://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=aph&AN=7163642&site=eds-live> (Accessed June 6, 2015).
- De Ridder, J., Nel Ruigrok, and Otto Scholten. 2003. "News Coverage About the Bosnian War in Dutch Newspapers." Presented at the Annual Meeting of the International Communication Association, San Diego, CA (May 23).
<http://ezpro.cc.gettysburg.edu:2048/login?url=http://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=ufh&AN=16028694&site=eds-live> (Accessed June 17, 2015).
- Dover, Robert. 2013. "The European Union's Foreign, Security, and Defense Policies." In *European Union Politics*, 4th ed., eds. Michelle Cini and Nieves Pérez-Solérzano Borragán. Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press: 240-253.
- Dragnich, Alex N. 1993. "The West's Mismanagement of the Yugoslav Crisis." *World Affairs* 156 (2) (September): 63-71. <http://ezpro.cc.gettysburg.edu:2048/login?url=http://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=edsjsr&AN=edsjsr.20672378&site=eds-live> (Accessed June 1, 2015).

98. References to individual Government Documents, letters to the editor, and EU documents have been included in the footnotes, because they would take up too much space in the bibliography. I have chosen to cite the databases and document collections as a whole in the bibliography.

- European Union. "MEPs: Johns Walls Cushnahan." European Parliament. http://www.europarl.europa.eu/meps/en/1288/JOHN+WALLS_CUSHNAHAN_home.html (July 14, 2015).
- European Union Center for Excellence1. "Barbara Sloan European Union Document Collection." University of Pittsburgh. <http://www.ucis.pitt.edu/esc/librarycollection> (July 27, 2015).
- European Union Center for Excellence2. 2010. "1st Round of the Local Miami-Dade Euro Challenge Competition 2010, Judges Biographical Notes," Florida International University, March 23. http://casgroup.fiu.edu/events/docs/72/1269457800_judges_bio.pdf (July 24, 2015).
- Greaves, Margaret. 2014. "Vistas of Simultaneity': Northern Irish Elegies for Yugoslavia." *New Hibernia Review* 18 (3) (Fall). http://ezpro.cc.gettysburg.edu:2156/journals/new_hibernia_review/v018/18.3.greaves.html (Accessed June 9, 2015).
- Ibrahim, Faridah et al. 2014. "News on Foreign War Versus Local 'War': Perception of Malaysian Audience." *Procedia – Social and Behavioral Sciences* 155 (Nov. 6): 533-538. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2014.10.335> (Accessed September 16, 2015).
- James, Patrick and David Carment. 1996. "Two-Level Games and Third-Party Intervention: Evidence from Ethnic Conflict in the Balkans and South Asia." *Canadian Journal of Political Science* 29 (3) (Sept.): 521-554. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3232428> (Accessed Sept. 14, 2014).
- James, Patrick and David Carment. 2000. "Explaining Third-Party Intervention in Ethnic Conflict: Theory and Evidence." *Nations and Nationalism* (April) 6 (2): 173-202. <http://ezpro.cc.gettysburg.edu:2048/login?url=http://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=edb&AN=65029741&site=eds-live> (Accessed September 15, 2015).
- Jesse, Neal G., and Kristen P. Williams. 2011. *Ethnic Conflict: A Systematic Approach*. Washington, DC: CQ Press.
- Johnson, Janet Buttolph and H.T. Reynolds. 2012. *Political Science Research Methods*, 7th ed., Thousand Oaks, CA: CQ Press.
- Kuusisto, Riikka. 1998. "Framing the Wars in the Gulf and in Bosnia: The Rhetorical Definition of the Western Power Leaders in Action." *Journal of Peace Research* 35 (5) (July): 603-620. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/425701> (Accessed June 9, 2015).
- Lexis-Nexis Academic. ND. "Source Information: The Irish Times," *Lexis-Nexis Academic*, <http://ezpro.cc.gettysburg.edu:2052/hottopics/lnacademic/> (June 23, and 25, 2015).

- Robinson, Bridget. 2004. "Putting Bosnia in its Place: Critical Geopolitics and the Representation of Bosnia in the British Print Media." *Geopolitics* 9 (2) (Summer): 378-401. <http://ezpro.cc.gettysburg.edu:2048/login?url=http://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=ich&AN=ICHA324741&site=eds-live> (Accessed September 16, 2015).
- Von Oppen, Karoline. 2013. "Killing off Multiculturalism: German News Reporting from Bosnia 1991-1995." *German Life and Letters* 66 (2) (April): 199-212. <http://ezpro.cc.gettysburg.edu:2048/login?url=http://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=edb&AN=86170584&site=eds-live> (Accessed June 9, 2015).
- Wilzig-Lehman, Sam, and Yaeli Bloch-Elkon. 2005. "Media, Public Opinion and Foreign Policy in International Crises: An Exploratory Model." Presented at the ICA conference, New York, NY. (27-31 May). <http://ezpro.cc.gettysburg.edu:2048/login?url=http://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=ufh&AN=18655484&site=eds-live> (Accessed June 1, 2015).
- Zohar, Benjamin. 2012. "Misrepresentation of the Bosnian War by Western Media." *Journal of Comparative Research in Anthropology and Sociology* 3 (2) (Winter): 97-110. <http://ezpro.cc.gettysburg.edu:2048/login?url=http://search.proquest.com/docview/1327167607?accountid=2694> (Accessed September 16, 2015).