# Black Truffle Production, Soils and Mediterranean Woods: Spanish Research Contributions (1962-2006)

L.G. Garcia-Montero , P. Diaz , I. Valverde , M.A. Grande and J. Velazquez

Department of Forestry Engineering, E.T.S.I. Montes, Technical University of Madrid (UPM), Ciudad Universitaria 28040 Madrid, Spain

Department of Industrial Chemistry and Polymers, E. U.I.T. Industrial, Technical University of Madrid (UPM), Madrid, Spain

Department of Soil Science, Facultad de Farmacia. University Complutense of Madrid, Madrid, Spain

Department of Applied Physics and Mechanics, E.T.S.I Montes, Technical University of Madrid (UPM), Madrid, Spain

Department of Projects and Rural Planning, E.T.S.I Montes, Technical University of Madrid (UPM), Madrid, Spain

Abstract: The production of mycorrhizal fungi provides higher economic returns than any other forest product in many Mediterranean woods. In these areas, truffles (*Tuber* spp.) and mushrooms of *Boletus* and *Lactarius* genus are the fungi that yield the highest economic benefits. However, there are still evident gaps in the understanding of the truffle's biological cycles, ecology and interactions with host plants and other fungi. In the last 12 years, Spanish research has begun to respond to the requirements of truffle research. Most of Spanish *Tuber* references deal with the areas of agronomy, forestry, ecology and soil science. In this respect, Spain is one of the main truffle-producing countries in the world and its varied climate, topography and lithology make it a useful geographic area for increasing knowledge on *Tuber* ecology and truffles.

### INTRODUCTION

Ectomycorrhizae are formed as a result of the association between fungi and roots of many plant species. Lian *et al.* and Poma *et al.* explain that ectomycorrhizae enhance uptake and utilization of nutrients by plant roots, strengthen self-defense ability of plants, facilitate development of plants, and improve soil quality. Ectomycorrhizal fungi are important in the forestation and rehabilitation of vegetative ecosystems, the remediation of soil and water loss, and the diversification of biological species. Moreover, Wang and Hall indicate that the most expensive and sought after of the edible mushrooms belong to the mycorrhizal group. The total market for these is measured in billions of US dollars.

In this regard, the production of mycorrhizal fungi provides higher economic returns than any other forest product in many Mediterranean woods. In these areas, truffles *[Tuber* Micheli ex Wiggers) and mushrooms of *Boletus pinophilus* Pilat and Dermek, *B. edulis* Bull.: Fr. and *Lactarius delicio*sus L.: Fr. are the fungi that yield the highest economic benefits. Among the *Tuber* species, the black truffle of Perigord *[T. melanosporum* Vittad.) is especially appreciated for its culinary value due to its intense aroma, its high yield and the prices it commands (more than 1000  $\notin$ kg'). *T. melanosporum* is of great ecological and forest value because it inhabits carbonated soils in impoverished mountain ecosystems within the Mediterranean continental climate Over the past 100 years, harvests of many mycorrhizal mushrooms have declined dramatically, which has prompted interest in the development of methods for their cultivation. Hall and Wang indicate that a few of the ectomycorrhizal fungi can now be cultivated using trees specially infected with the appropriate fungus. Those which command very high prices, like truffles, *Tuber melanosporum*, and matsutake, *Tricholoma matsutake* (S. Ito et Imai) Sing., warrant the expense of establishing plantations dedicated to their production. In fact, successful production of *Tuber melanosporum* is observed in different crops of Europe and other regions, but non controlled factors are still inducing strong heterogeneity in the production from year to year

The biology of *Tuber melanosporum* has been fully studied and described in extensive monographs. However, there are gaps in our knowledge of *T. melanosporum* biological cycle, such as its adaptive responses to the physical environment, factors inducing fruiting, soil influence in truffle development and interactions with host plants and other fungi, etc.

Bencivenga and Chevalier have confirmed that the ecology of *Tuber melanosporum* has not been thoroughly explained and that its study is of great importance to improve harvesting, cultivation and natural protection. Garcia-Montero indicate that the international research over the last 10 years has been very limited in regard to studies carried out in natural environments and on plantations; only 16% of the references deal with the areas of agronomy, forestry, ecology and soil science, while 69% deal with molecular biology and biochemistry. However these authors explain that in the last 12 years, Spanish research has begun to respond to the requirements of truffle research. Specifically, 69% of the Spanish references deal with the areas of agronomy, forestry, ecology and soil science, and 53% are based on studies done in natural areas and on truffle plantations. In this respect, Spain's varied climate, topography and lithology make it a useful geographic area for increasing knowledge on *Tuber* ecology and truffle production. In this regard, Spain's great variability gives rise to singular habitats with symbiotic plants whose western Mediterranean distribution has made their study more difficult in other countries.

Until 1993, the natural production and cultivation of *Tuber melanosporum* in Spain was relatively unknown, and there was little research being done on the subject; however, this activity has taken on greater importance in recent years. Actually, Spanish production of *T. melanosporum* accounts for between 30% and 50% of production worldwide Moreover, since 1994 to 2006, Spanish research has produced at least 200 scientific references

In view of the need to expand current knowledge of the ecology of *Tuber melanosporum*, and with the aim of increasing production of this valuable forest resource, we have carried out a synthesis of the last ecological studies on quantitative production of carpophores, soil properties and ecology in different Mediterranean woods situated in Spain. Moreover, we review the Spanish research contributions dealing with the biology, ecology and cultivation of *T. melanosporum* and its impact in the international truffle knowledge. This paper is the second part of a previous paper entitled "Historical summary and reference list of Spanish truffle *(Tuber spp.)* research (1962-2006)", to show the scientific contents of this Spanish reference list.

#### SOIL FACTORS THAT INFLUENCE TUBER MELA-NOSPORUM PRODUCTION IN CENTRAL SPAIN

Different studies have examined which soil properties have the greatest impact on *Tuber* biology; these include comparisons of the soil requirements of different species of truffles , analyses of soil variability and its relationship with climate , and studies relating soil parameters to production and development of *T. melanosporum* 

These authors indicate that Tuber melanosporum is strictly calcicolous and grows in calcareous soils with a C/N relationship of close to 10, in which the soil texture is balanced and tends to be simple and well constructed. However, Sourzat [39] indicates that the soil parameters that T. melanosporum tolerates are highly variable. Callot Lulli et al. [38], Castrignano and Ricard report that the development of T. melanosporum increases in deep, well-drained, aerated soils with a reservoir of available water during dry periods. Total organic carbon content must be low in order not to modify their pH, and they require considerable porosity, originated by biological activity (above all, by worms and ants). However, Callot , Ricard highlight the lack of and Garcia-Montero

knowledge as to how the physical-chemical properties of fine soil influence truffle development. Moreover, many authors fail also to supply quantitative data on the relationship between soil properties and truffle production.

In this regard, in the last 10 years, we have developed several studies in Central Spain to explain more fully the impact of surface horizon soil properties on the productivity of *Tuber melanosporum* carpophores, moreover we analyzed the soil interactions with burn development and host truffle plants, particularly rockroses (*Cistus* L.), and we study the impact of soil on the interactions between truffle species inside the *Tuber melanosporum* burns, as *T. aestivum* Vittad., *T. rufum* Pico ex Fries and *T. mesentericum* Vittad. These studies were done in the Alto Tajo Nature Reserve (Peralejos de las Truchas, Guadalajara), a location with several areas of natural populations of *T. melanosporum* 

These studies describe that statistical analysis showed that the collective influence of the conventional soil features (granulometric texture, pH, calcareous fractions, organic carbon, total nitrogen, exchangeable cations) on truffle production is low, as PCA explains only 27% of the variance in *Tuber melanosporum* production. However, a high percentage of active limestone (calcium carbonate extractable with ammonium oxalate) accounts for up 43% of *T. melanosporum* carpophore production and 51% of the variance in the size of *T. melanosporum* burns.

Active carbonate is a finely-divided fraction of calcareous rock. It is smaller than 50 urn in size, very chemically active, and constitutes an important reserve of exchangeable  $Ca^{2+}$ . Active carbonate maintains high levels of exchangeable  $Ca^{2+}$  in the soil because it counterbalances losses from leaching and other processes. Active carbonate and exchangeable  $Ca^{2+}$  affects *Tuber melanosporum* in several ways . Ricard indicates that it is difficult to judge the impact of active carbonate on truffle culture because several factors must be considered; he also considers the lack of studies on active carbonate in truffle culture to be an oversight.

In this regard, active carbonate is associated with exchangeable  $Ca^{2+}$  content and stoniness abundance, most importantly, active carbonate regulates soil pH and participates in the organisation and maintenance of the soil structure, also,  $Ca^{2+}$  is indispensable in the growth of the mycelium of *Tuber melanosporum*, all of which affect the successful productivity of *T. melanosporum* carpophores. Garcia-Montero *et al.* [45] indicate that statistical analysis showed that active carbonate accounted for 42% of the variance in exchangeable  $Ca^{2+}$  concentration, and the exchangeable  $Ca^{2+}$  abundance explained 20% of the variance in carpophore production. In addition, a significant correlation was found between active carbonate concentration and surface stoniness.

The availability of active carbonate in the soil depends on complex pedologic, climatic and biological factors. The dissolution, transport and accumulation of carbonates in the soil depend on the relationship between water dissolution and gaseous  $C0_2$ , soluble  $H_2C0_3$  and  $HC0_3$ ", and solid  $CaC0_3$ phases. The solubilisation and leaching of carbonates increases with pluviosity, respiration and metabolism of roots and mycelia, and other factors that increase the partial pressure of  $C0_2$  (p $C0_2$ ) in the soil. Bicarbonate precipitates in the form of carbonate when it is concentrated in capillary water (evaporated or absorbed by the roots). This also occurs when the p $C0_2$  diminishes due to aeration caused by macro fauna and the disappearance of the biological respiration of the roots at depth, among other factors *Tuber melanosporum* inhabits Mediterranean dry soils, which the fungi dry up by eliminating plants from their burns. The soil water evaporation and the disappearance of roots in the burns therefore favour surface accumulation of secondary carbonate. This also occurs when the  $CO_2$  diminishes due to aeration. In this regard, *T. melanosporum* is closely related to the aeration of the soil

Our results indicate that the development of the *T. melanosporum* burn encourages the formation of a large amount of active carbonate and exchangeable  $Ca^{2+}$ . *T. melanosporum* fruition and burn size are simultaneously favoured by a high concentration of both factors, which suggests a feedback process. Finally, these authors indicate that this feedback process provides *T. melanosporum* an additional advantage over its competitors, *T. aestivum*, *T. rufum* and *T. mesentericum*, when active carbonate reaches high soil concentration in the *T. melanosporum* burns. Therefore, active carbonate is a major factor in the fruiting, burn development, and aggressiveness of *T. melanosporum versus* other truffle species.

For this reason, we propose the study of calcareous amendments with fine limestone to maintain the concentration of active limestone in practical truffle culture. However, these conclusions should be interpreted with caution. In fact many other biotic and abiotic factors play an important role in truffle productivity in cultures and natural burns. Ricard

also suggests calcareous amendments of fine limestone in practical truffle culture although he recommends that they should be used with care and in moderation. New studies are required into the effects of active limestone on the biology of *Tuber melanosporum*, *T. brumale* and other truffles into the role played by soil and biological processes in maintaining elevated concentrations of active limestone in *T. melanosporum* cultures and natural burns.

### FOREST ECOLOGY AND SYMBIOTIC PLANTS THAT INFLUENCE *TUBER MELANOSPORUM* PRO-DUCTION IN CENTRAL SPAIN

In truffle culture, the terms "burn", "quemado", "brule" or "pianello" are used to describe spots where truffles grow and refers to truffles' phytotoxic capacity and their ability to create clearings in the vegetation where their carpophores bear fruit. *Tuber melanosporum* burns generally present a circular shape around the symbiotic log, and the vegetationfree surface area spreads outwards at a speed of 10 to 15 cm per year, sometimes reaching areas several dozen metres in diameter . The environmental conditions created by the burns of *T. melanosporum* are very favourable for the development, mycorrhization and fruition of this truffle. However, Callot , Ricard [16] and Granetti

indicated that the biological and physical-chemical conditions related with burn development have yet to be clarified.

Most studies of *Tuber melanosporum* fail to supply statistical data on carpophore production and other quantitative data associated with its ecology. In view of the need to expand current knowledge of the ecology of *T. melanosporum*, and with the aim of increasing production of this valuable forest resource, we have carried out a study on the quantitative production of carpophores, the size of *T. melanosporum* burns and their soil properties in different woods situated close together in the Alto Tajo Nature Reserve, in the central region of Spain. This region is a suitable area for the study of T. melanosporum since it is a continental elevated region with particular substrates and plants whose relationships with T. melanosporum are unknown. This study area has a maximum total production of 500 kg of T. melanosporum carpophores.

During 7 years, we studied 208 burns associated with *Quercus ilex* subsp. *ballota, Q. faginea, Corylus avellana* and *Tilia platyphyllos* in the centre of the Iberian Peninsula

. The results showed that burn size is a very significant factor as it accounts for 38% of the variance in carpophore production. However, no significant difference in the size of burns was observed between five types of wood, although significant variability in carpophore production existed between these wood types. Furthermore, statistical analysis shows that a high concentration of active carbonate in the soil accounts for up to 51% of the variance in *T. melanosporum* burn size. The ecological conditions of burns cause elevated concentrations of active carbonate and exchangeable Ca<sup>2+</sup>, and *T. melanosporum* activity and burn size are simultaneously favoured by a high concentration of both factors, which suggests a feedback process. These results may indicate a possible application for the use of calcareous amendments in natural burns and truffle cultivation.

We also determined the considerable truffle-producing ability and mycorrhizing capacity of Quercus faginea. Although Q. faginea is a very little-known species in truffle culture, the results provide support for its implementation. Moreover, in these studies we conclude that at present Pinus sylvestris L., P. nigra Arnold subsp. salzmannii (Dunal) Franco, Tilia platyphyllos Scop, and T. x vulgaris Hayne (= T. x europaea auct, p.p.) are of little interest to Tuber melanosporum culture, as they hinder carpophore production. However, these studies have also confirmed that pines and lime trees mycorrhize easily with T. melanosporum, both in the laboratory and in natural environments. On this basis, we propose that pines and lime trees mycorrhize may act as transmitters of T. melanosporum, although they do not induce fruiting. As a result, the commercial cultivation of Pinus nigra salzmannii, P. sylvestris, Tilia platyphyllos and T. x vulgaris seedlings mycorrhized with Tuber melanosporum is not recommended in truffle culture at the present time [47, 58].

At the moment, there are very few studies on *Tuber* melanosporum associated with Cistus L. (rockroses) populations. In Central Spain, we confirm that C. laurifolius L. shows carpophore production of *Tuber melanosporum* 

|. We demonstrate a correlation between *T. melanosporum* production and the size of 41 burns, with burn size explaining 26% of the variability in carpophore production. However, statistical analysis of the results indicates that average production of 21 burns with *Cistus laurifolius* is 73 % lower than the production of 20 burns associated with *Quercus/Corylus* without *Cistus laurifolius* in this zone, respectively. *C. laurifolius* develops small burns, which has an impact on their carpophore production, and their soils have 92 % less active carbonate than the burns associated with *Quercus/Corylus* in this zone, respectively. The low levels of active carbonate allow *Cistus laurifolius* to grow, but impair *Tuber melanosporum* production. Moreover, it has also been statistically verified that many *Cistus laurifolius* die in *Tuber* melanosporum burns, whereas in old burns with minimum carpophore production, a new colonization of young *Cistus* has been observed. We thus provide a mechanism, based on the inability of *C. laurifolius* to grow in highly carbonated soils, which contradicts the well-known fact that *C. laurifolius* might act as a transmitter of *Tuber melanosporum* mycorrhizae. Consequently, the commercial cultivation of *Cistus laurifolius* mycorrhized with *Tuber melanosporum* for production is not recommended in truffle culture. Moreover, we reported negative observations of carpophore production in cultivations of *T. melanosporum* with other *Cistus species*.

### CURRENT LINES AND IMPACT OF SPANISH RE-SEARCH IN INTERNATIONAL TRUFFLE KNOWL-EDGE

It can be seen from the bibliography how the effects of the European Union's Common Agriculture Policy and reforestation policies in EU have led to a revival of interest in mycorrhizal plants and truffle cultivation since the 1990s. In Spain, this in turn has meant an increase in the number of nurseries which mycorrhize commercial plants. The Spanish Forestry Strategy , on which the Spanish Forestry Plan is based, underlines the importance of promoting research and development into the exploitation of Tuber melanosporum, T. aestivum Vittad. and other truffles in Spanish forests. However, these activities have given rise to new technical and economic problems in UE related to the mycorrhization of commercial plants, the appearance of contaminating fungi, the certification of commercial plants, the importation of Asian truffles, management of truffleproducing forests, and the need to optimise cultivation sites and repopulation efforts, among other aspects.

In addition, the yield of naturally-occurring truffles in Spain and other European forests appears to have decreased significantly in the last decade, making it necessary to study this trend in production more closely. Reyna call attention to this problem and Garcia-Montero describe how certain areas in central Spain shown a 35% decrease in their maximum annual production of Tuber melanosporum between 1960 and 2002. The decrease in production in this region appears to be associated with the depletion of various truffle-producing areas (due to over-harvesting), an increase in vegetation cover owing to changes in the use of the land (decrease in cattle-farming), and the fact that the average yearly rainfall fell by 35% between 1960 and 2000. The climatic effect appears to have been worsening in recent years.

Several lines of investigation have been opened in Spain in order to address these problems. The TESEO database [64], which contains a list of the doctoral theses written in Spain, describes six theses associated to the keyword "*Tuber melanosporum*", since 1994 to 2008. Moreover, a seventh doctoral thesis on truffle aroma is currently in the final stages; the first phase was completed by Diaz

The doctoral thesis by Reyna (directed by J. A. Rodriguez) proposes a set of models for use in forestry and the management of forest stands with *Tuber melanosporum* production. These models are developed taking into account social, economic and historical aspects, and are designed to integrate truffle ecology, the state of tree stands and an improvement in forest yields by means of forestry techniques.

The doctoral thesis by Dominguez (directed by J. A. Rodriguez) described in the TESEO data base follows the same line of research, and is designed to increase the presence of Tuber melanosporum in forestry. This author studies the procedures for improving the mycorrhization of T. melanosporum and the use of this truffle in the recuperation of deteriorated ecosystems. To this end, studies have been done on how to improve the quality of the forest profile, the ecology of T. melanosporum, and the dynamic of its mycorrhizas. This author conducted tests with Pinus halepensis Mill., P. nigra, Quercus ilex L., Q. faginea Lam., and Q. petraea (Matt) Liebl. mycorrhized with Tuber melanosporum, and studied the effect of different substrates, inoculate and water stress on the efficiency of the mycorrhization and the quality of the plant.

He also analyses the influence of mycorrhizas on the biometry of the plant, nitrogen and phosphorous assimilation, gaseous exchange and water relations. He then locates potential areas for *Tuber melanosporum* in eastern Spain and uses cultivation plots to study the mycorrhizas and their contribution to the growth and physiology of *Quercus ilex* and *Q*. *faginea*. The author concludes that *Tuber melanosporum* improves biometry, survival, water availability in situations of stress, and nitrogen and phosphorous assimilation in plants; and he asserts that the host plant and the terrain are the two main factors determining the implantation of mycorrhizas, while the controlled presence of contaminating fungi from the nursery does not represent any significant competition for *T. melanosporum* in the short term. The first results of this thesis have been published in Dominguez

Another line of research concerning the ecology of *Tuber* melanosporum can be found in the doctoral thesis by Garcia-Montero [41] (directed by J.L. Manjon) conducted in the Alto Tajo Nature Reserve (Guadalajara). This author propose new ecological data, such as the aforementioned importance of burn sizes, active carbonate in soils inhabited by *T. mela*nosporum, the capacity of *Quercus faginea* and *Q. ilex* L. subsp. ballota (Desf) Samp, in truffle production and the difficulty some symbiont plants have in producing *Tuber* melanosporum sporocarps.

Another problem in Spanish truffle culture is the existence of mycorrhizas and fungi which are harmful to truffles in natural areas and in nurseries with mycorrhized plants. An example is the mycorrhiza known as "form 2" and the discomycete *Sphaerosporella brunnea* (Alb. and Schwein. ex Fr.) Svrcek and Kubicka, which have been studied at the Universities of Alcala and Navarra and the Technical University of Madrid (UPM), together with other competing fungi. Regarding *S. brunnea*, Garcia-Montero confirm that no appreciable damage has occurred in nurseries in central Spain which produce plants mycorrhized with *Tuber melanosporum*, in spite of the fact that it can clearly be seen to be fruiting in the containers of these plants.

A study of new *Tuber* mycorrhizas can be found in the doctoral thesis by Garcia-Montero and Garcia-Montero *et al.* [70], that describe that the mycorrhizas of *T. pseudoex-cavatum* Wang, G. Moreno, L. G. Riousset, J. L. Manjon and G. Riousset, sp. nov., *T. indicum* Cooke and Massee and *T.* 

*malengonii* Don., Riouss. and Chev. . These results agree with the observations of Amicucci , Zambonelli and Comandini and Pacioni . At the present time the authors of this article detect an increase in the presence (both legal and fraudulent) of Asian truffles in Spanish markets, and there is also a rumour (unconfirmed) circulating among European truffle farmers that plantations of plants mycorrhized with Asian *Tuber* spp. have already been introduced (either accidentally or deliberately), which could spread to the natural environment.

Also on the subject of mycorrhizas which are harmful to truffle culture is a doctoral thesis by Etayo (directed by A. M. De Miguel) described in TESEO . This author monitored a Tuber melanosporum plantation in northeast Spain in order to verify the permanence of its mycorrhizas and their interaction with other competing fungi. This author compares the behaviour of Corylus aveliana L., Quercus faginea and Q. ilex subsp. ballota, and analyses the effect of mulching the ground with straw and plastic. This author identifies 14 morphotypes of mycorrhizas inside the cultivated area and 21 morphotypes in the area outside. Etayo demonstrates that the factor most influencing the mycorrhiza community is the tree species, while the type of mulch has less effect. This author also concludes that the symbiont plant which most favours the permanence of the mycorrhizas of Tuber melanosporum is Quercus ilex subsp. ballota.

A doctoral thesis by Roman (directed by A. M. De Miguel), described in TESEO , also deals with the subject of mycorrhizas and truffle culture. This author studied a mycorrhiza community associated with *Quercus ilex* subsp. *ballota* in a forest in the north-east of Spain for 3 years, in a potential area for *Tuber melanosporum* which had suffered a low-intensity forest fire four years earlier. This author describes and classifies 36 morphotypes of ectomycorrhizas and indicates that the mycorrhiza community is dominated by *Cenococcum geophilum* Fr. and by a specific group of morphotypes.

also explains that the fire caused significant Roman changes in the relative abundance of specific morphotypes and a decrease in the quantity of existing mycorrhized apexes, but it did not alter either the diversity or the specific composition of the mycorrhiza community. This author confirms that in the area affected by the fire, the mycorrhiza community is now in the process of recovery, although with a seasonal variation in mycorrhiza diversity which is highest in autumn and lowest in summer, while the quantity of mycorrhized apexes is highest in winter and lowest in autumn. The author asserts that 3 years after the introduction in the burn area of plants mycorrhized with Tuber melanosporum, it has been observed that the mycorrhizas of this truffle persist, although they have to compete with other mycorrhizal fungi. In conclusion, Roman proposes T. melanosporum as a suitable mycorrhiza for reforesting areas damaged by fire.

Finally, a doctoral thesis by Martinez de Aragon (directed by C. Colinas), described in TESEO , also deals with the subject of edible mushroom production, mycorrhizas ecology and truffle culture. This author studied the relationship among climate, forest management and productivity of edible mushrooms in 23 plots located in pine woods during 5 years. Moreover, this author analysed the fire effects in the mycorrhizal communities and he devoted particular attention to *Tuber melanosporum* cultivation in the burned areas.

Although there has been intense activity in Spanish truffle research over the last years, its influence on international truffle knowledge has just begun. Since 1994 to 2006, Spanish research has produced 200 references on truffles developed in 13 centres (6 doctoral theses, 67 papers in international scientific congresses, 49 papers in Spanish scientific congresses, 7 documents on websites, 63 published articles, and at least 8 papers submitted)

At 2007, as result of the research until 2006, the Spanish bibliography contains at least 15 papers published in international journals listed in the JCR: Moreno *et al.* [4] and Wang

propose 2 new Asian species of *Tuber* (however, one of these be regarded as a synonym of *T. indicum*); Moreno-Arroyo provide new information on *T. oligospermum* (Tul. and C. Tul.) Trappe; Diaz have developed a rapid and objective methodology for differentiating truffles by means of the analysis of their aroma;

and Garcia-Montero

articles have been described above; and Suz propose a method using molecular biology to detect *Tuber* mycelium in the ground. A brief description is given below of the contributions and the international impact of these Spanish papers.

Dominguez

Moreno and Wang describe *Tuber pseudohimalayense* sp. nov. (recently be regarded as a synonym of *T. indicum*) and *T. pseudoexcavatum* sp. nov. These authors note the importation of Asian truffles which have been flooding the European markets. This is an opportunity to study species of Tuber which are practically unknown here, and although it has brought to light some taxonomic novelties, it has also caused serious damage to the quality of commercial truffles.

*Tuber oligospermum* is a poorly known species that has several synonyms. Moreno-Arroyo *et al.* [80] report on the taxonomy, habitat and biogeography of *T. oligospermum*, and they discuss its most important macroscopic and microscopic features. *T. oligospermum* is an edible truffle found only in the Mediterranean region; it is a circum-Mediterranean species, with an economic and ecological potential in developing regions (e.g. reforestation with mycorrhizal plants).

Several studies have been done in various countries on the subject of truffle aroma, and specifically on the aroma of Tuber melanosporum, T. magnatum Pico, T. aestivum, T. borchii Vittad. and other truffles of lower quality, when fresh, frozen and tinned . The techniques used for the extraction of the volatile compounds include both static and dynamic headspace analysis, headspace solid-phase microextraction (HS-SPME) , and extraction with organic solvents, among other techniques. The volatiles extracted are subsequently analysed by means of gas chromatography (GC) and/or gas chromatography coupled with mass spectrometry (GC-MS). These studies describe the key compounds in the aroma of T. melanosporum and T. magnatum. Τ. magnatum presents a characteristic compound. , while the aroma of T. melanobis(methylthio) methane sporum presents various compounds of interest which contribute to their total aroma . New developments inelude an "electronic nose" with various sensors which has been applied to *T. magnatum* and a patent portable truffle detector , however the "electronic nose" is still in the field of the research.

The bibliography and the various databases show that the studies on truffle aroma so far have used sporocarps from truffles of French and Italian origin. For this reason, Diaz

have applied experimental design and optimization techniques (response surface methodology) to develop an objective method for analysing Spanish truffle aroma, and they are studying the influence of several environmental and population factors of the truffles (intra and interspecific) on the aroma of Tuber melanosporum and other central European truffles. Finally, work has begun on the relationship between the volatile compounds of truffles and several flies of the genus Suillia and beetles of the genus Leiodes present . Some publications have already anain central Spain lysed the relationship between dimethyl sulfide and Suillia , and between S. univittata (the garlic fly) gigantea and the aroma of *Tuber magnatum* , although nothing has yet been published on the compounds involved in these interactions.

Suz have developed a molecular method to detect mycelia of *Tuber melanosporum* in soil, and tested the mycelial distribution around 2 truffle-bearing *Quercus ilex* trees in a truffle orchard. Isolation of total DNA from soil was performed, followed by PCR amplification with *Tuber melanosporum* specific primers and restriction analysis. To address the detection sensitivity level, soil samples were inoculated with known amounts of gleba of *T. melanosporum*. Mycelium was detected primarily within the areaa defined by the truffle burn and within the top 35 cm of the soil in all directions from the trees.

Moreover, other important Spanish references are Bonet and Reyna [98]. Bonet have tested a method for quantifying irrigation needs for truffle plantations in the establishment phase based on water deficits. They proposed the use of calculating water needs as a function of water deficit in order to promote a rational method that can be adjusted to different sites and conditions. Reyna's [98] books are important on the popularization of the truficulture in Spain, and are essential on the development of the truffle knowledge and research in Spain.

Therefore, Spain is one of the main truffle-producing countries in the world, and is of significant interest to international truffle culture due to its wide diversity of habitats for truffle study and cultivation. For these reasons, at least 13 research centers in Spain have been involved in investigation into truffle culture since 1994, and they have produced more that 217 references until 2007. This activity has shown how truffle research in Spain is now at the same level that other countries such as France . This documentation is intended to encourage scientific collaboration between Spain and other countries involved in truffle harvest and cultivation, such as Australia, New Zealand and USA.

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

We thank Margarita, Luis, Pablo and Miriam for their support and collaboration. We would also like to express our gratitude to M<sup>a</sup> Cruz Gomez-Llano and Faustino Correas of the University Library of E.T.S.I. Montes (UPM) for their

help with the bibliography research, and to Prudence Brooke-Turner for her linguistic assistance. We are grateful to the Alto Tajo Nature Reserve Institution and Department of Soil Science of the University Complutense of Madrid.

#### REFERENCES

Lian B, Dong YR, Hou WG, Tong LH, Yuan S. Ectomycorrhizal Fungi in Jiangsu Province, China. Pedosphere 2007; 17: 30-5.

Poma A, Limongi T, Pacioni G. Current state and perspectives of truffle genetics and sustainable biotechnology. Appl Microbiol Biotechnol 2006; 72: 437-41.

Wang Y, Hall IR. Edible ectomycorrhizal mushrooms: challenges and achievements. Can J Bot 2004; 82: 1063-73.

Moreno G, Manjon JL, Diez J, Garcia-Montero LG, Di Massimo G. *Tuber pseudohimalayense* sp. nov. An Asiatic species commercialised in Spain, similar to Perigord truffle. Mycotaxon 1997; 63: 217-24.

Oria JA. Silvicultura y ordenacion de montes productores de hongos micorrizogenos comestibles. Boletin de la Sociedad Micologicade Madrid 1989; 13: 175-88.

Oria JA. Bases para la selvicultura y evaluacion de montes productores de hongos micorrizogenos comestibles. Montes 1991; 26: 48-55.

Montecchi A, Sarasini M. Atlante fotografico di funghi ipogei. Vicenza: Associazione Micologica Bresadola; 2000.

Riousset L, Riousset G, Chevalier G, Bardet ME. Truffes dEurope et de Chine. Paris: INRA; 2001.

Garcia-Montero LG, Manjon JL, Pascual C, Garcia-Abril A. Ecological patterns of *Tuber melanosporum* and different Quercus Mediterranean forests: quantitative production of truffles, burn sizes and soil studies. For Ecol Manage 2007; 242: 288-96.

Hall IR, Wang Y. Edible mushrooms as secondary crops in forests. Quarterly Journal of Forestry 2000; 94: 299-304.

Lefevre CK, Hall IR. Status of truffle cultivation: a global perspective. ActaHortic 2001; 556: 513-20.

Bencivenga M, Granetti B. Indagine preliminare sull contenuto in macro e microelementi del terreno e di carpofori di *Tuber melano-sporum* Vitt. Micologia Italiana 1989; 3: 25-30.

Pacioni G, Marra L, Eds. Convegno internazionale sul tartufo. Universita degli studi L'Aquila, L'Aquila; 1993.

CallotG. Latruffe, laterre, la vie. Versailles: INRA; 1999.

Courvoisier M, Olivier JM, Chevalier G, Eds. Federation Francaise des trufficulteurs: 2001: Actes du V Congres International Science et Culture de la Truffe; Aix-en-Provence, France; 1999.

Ricard JM, Ed. La truffe. Guide technique de trufficulture. Paris: Centre Technique Interprofessionnel des Fruits et Legumes CTIFL; 2003.

Bencivenga M. La tartuficoltura in Italia: problematiche e prospettive. In: Corvoisier M, Olivier JM, Chevalier G, Eds. Actes du V Congres International Science et Culture de la Truffe; 1999: Aixen-Provence, France: Federation Francaise des trufficulteurs; 2001; 27-9.

Chevalier G. Du Congres de Spoleto a celudi d'Aix-en-Provence: les avancees en matiere de recherches sur la truffe et la truffle culture en France. In: Corvoisier D, Olivier JM, Chevalier G, Eds. Actes du V Congres International Science et Culture de la Truffe; 1999: Aix-en-Provence, France; Federation Francaise des trufficulteurs; 2001; pp. 11-14.

Garcia-Montero LG, Pascual C, Garcia-Canete J, Grande MA, Diaz P. Historical summary and reference list of Spanish truffle (*Tuber* spp.) research (1962-2006) N Z J Crop Hortic Sci 2007; 35: 129-38.

Reyna S, De Miguel AM, Palazon C. Truffle cultivation in Spain: state of the art and future prospects. ITEA (Informacion Tecnica Economica Agraria) Produccion Vegetal 2004; 100: 187-99.

Reyna S, Garcia-Barreda S. La truficultura y la selvicultura trufera como apoyo a los sistemas de defensa contra incendios. Revista Forestal Espanola 2005; 37: 11-8.

Delmas J, Brian C, Delpech P, Soyer JP. Application del'analyse en composantes principales a une tentative de caracterisation physicochimique des sols trufficoles francais. Mushroom Science 1981; 11:855-67.

Raglione M, Lorenzoni P, Simone C, Monaco R, Angius A. Osservazioni sulle caratteristiche pedologiche di alcuni siti di tartufo nero pregiato *Tuber melanosporum* in provincia di Rieti. Micologia e Vegetazione Mediterranea 1992; 7: 211-24.

Mamoun M, Olivier JM. Competition between *Tuber melanosporum* and other ectomycorrhizal fungi, under two irrigation regimes. Comparison of soils artificially infested with *T. melanosporum* and *T. brumale*. Plant Soil 1993; 149: 219-25.

Mamoun M, Olivier JM. Competition between *Tuber melano-sporum* and other ectomycorrhizal fungi, under two irrigation regimes. Competition with *Tuber brumale*. Plant Soil 1993; 149: 211-8.

Zanini E, Giovannetti G, Franchini M, Patetta A. Soil-carpophore interface in some Italian truffle pedo-environments. Agricoltura Mediterranea 1995; 125: 205-14.

Bencivenga M, Calandra R, Giovagnotti E, Russi L. Soil and geobotanical characterization of *Tuber mesentericum - T. aestivum* and *T. aestivum* var. uncinatum truffle-beds. Annali-della-Facolta-di-Agraria della Universita degli Studi di Perugia 1998; 50: 7-45.

Raglione M, Spadoni M, Cavelli S, Lorenzoni P, Simone C. Les sols des truffieres naturelles de *Tuber melanosporum* Vitt. dans l'Apennin central Italie. In: Corvoisier M., Olivier J.M. and Chevalier G., Eds. Actes du V Congres International Science et Culture de la Truffe; 1999: Aix-en-Provence, France: Federation Francaise des trufficulteurs; 1999; 276-5.

Bencivenga M, Venturi F, Ranfa A. Indagine preliminare sull'andamento stagionale dell'unmidita'e della temperatura del terreno delle cave di *Tuber melanosporum* e *Tuber magnatum*. Micologia e Vegetazione Mediterranea 1988; 3: 37-45.

Bencivenga M, Di Massimo G, Donnini D. Analisi delle micorrize in una tartufaia coltivata di *Tuber melanosporum* Vitt. undici anni dopo l'impianto. Micologia e Vegetazione Mediterranea 1992; 7: 159-71.

Delmas J, Chevalier G, Villenave P, Bardet MC. Mechanical properties of soil and *Tuber melanosporum* mycorrhizae. Colloques del INRA 1982; 13:329-35.

Letacon F, Delmas J, Gleyze R. Effect of soil-water regime and fertilization on fructification of the black truffle of perigord *Tuber melanosporum* Vitt. in South East of France. Acta Oecol 1982; 3: 291-306.

Verlhac A, Giraud M, Pallier R. Truffles. Application of organic fertilizer to yielding, irrigated truffle beds. Infos Paris 1989; 56: 22-6.

Callot G, Jaillard B. Effect of structural character ristics of subsoil on the fruiting of *Tuber melanosporum* and other mycorrhizal fungi. Agronomie 1996; 16: 405-19.

Bragato G. Modifications to soil texture and soil organic matter induced by black truffle *Tuber melanosporum*. Monti e Boschi 1997; 48: 23-7.

Bragato G, Lulli L, Castrignano A, Bencivenga M. Regionalization analysis of some soil factors related to *Tuber melanosporum* production in an experimental truffle bed. In: Corvoisier D, Olivier JM, Chevalier G, Eds.. 1999. Actes du V Congres International Science et Culture de la Truffe. 1999: Aix-en-Provence, France; Federation Francaise des trufficulteurs; 2001; 253-6.

Callot G, Daignieres Y, Fernandez D, Raymond M, Salducci X.. Incidences du sol sur la production de truffe noire du Perigord *Tuber melanosporum*. In: Corvoisier D, Olivier JM, Chevalier G, Eds. Actes du V Congres International Science et Culture de la Truffe; 1999; Aix-en-Provence, France; Federation Francaise des trufficulteurs; 1999; 257-9.

Lulli L, Bragato G, Gardin L. Occurrence of *Tuber melanosporum* in relation to soil surface layer properties and soil differentiation. Plant Soil 1999; 214: 85-92.

Sourzat P. Les limites des criteries agronomiques dans l'analyse de terre en truffle culture. In: Corvoisier M., Olivier JM. and Chevalier G, Eds. Actes du V Congres International Science et Culture de la Truffe; 1999: Aix-en-Provence, France: Federation Francaise des trufficulteurs 2001; 281-8.

Castrignano A, Goovaerts P, Lulli L, Bragato G. A geostatistical approach to estimate probability of occurrence of *Tuber melanosporum* in relation to some soil properties. Geoderma 2000; 98: 95-113.

Garcia-Montero LG. Estudio sobre la trufa negra *Tuber melanos-porum* Vitt. en el centro de Espana: patrones ecologicos, analisis edaficos e interacciones de micorrizas en la truficultura. Universidad de Alcala, Ph Degree, Alcala de Henares; 2000.

Granetti B, De Angelis A, Materozzi G, Eds. Umbria terra di tartufi. Terni: Regione Umbria; 2005.

Garcia-Montero LG, Casermeiro MA, Hernando J, Hernando I. Soil factors that influence the fruiting of *Tuber melanosporum* (black truffle). Aus J Soil Res 2006; 44: 1-8.

Garcia-Montero LG, Casermeiro MA, Hernando I, Hernando J. Effect of active carbonate, exchangeable calcium, and stoniness of soil on *Tuber melanosporum* carpophore production. N Z J Crop HorticSci2007;35: 139-46.

Garcia-Montero LG, Casermeiro MA, Manjon JL, Hernando I. Impact of active soil carbonate and burn size on the capacity of the rockrose *Cistus laurifolius* to produce *Tuber melanosporum* carpophores in truffle culture. Mycol Res 2007; 111: 734-9.

Garcia-Montero LG, Manjon JL, Martin-Fernandez S, Di Massimo G. Problems of using pines in *Tuber melanosporum* culture: soils and truffle harvest associated with *Pinus nigra* and P. sylvestris. Agrofor Sys 2007; 70: 243-9.

Garcia-Montero LG, Diaz P, Martin-Fernandez S, Casermeiro MA. Soil factors that favour the production of *Tuber melanosporum* carpophores over other truffle species: a multivariate statistical approach. Acta Agriculturae Scandinavica Section B-Soil and Plant Science 2008; in press.

Poitou N. Cas particulier des sols truffieres. Bulletin FNPT-CTIFL 1988; 10: 11-6.

Coli R, Maurizi A, Granetti B, Damiani P. Composizione chimica e valore nutritivo del tartufo nero *Tuber melanosporum* Vitt. e del tartufo bianco *Tuber magnatum* Pico raccolti in Umbria. In: Bencivenga M, Granetti B, Eds. Atti del Secondo congresso internazionale sul tartufo; 1988: Spoleto, Italy: Comunita Montana dei Monti Martani e del Serano; 1990; 511-6.

Lopez J, Lopez J. El diagnostico de suelos y plantas. Madrid: Mundi-Prensa; 1990.

Wild A. Condiciones del suelo y desarrollo de las plantas segiin Russel. Madrid: Mundi-prensa; 1992.

Breemen NV, Buurman P. Soil formation. Dordrecht: Kluwer Academic Publishers; 1998.

Maranes A, Sanchez JA, Haro S, Sanchez ST, Lozano FJ, Eds. Analisis de Suelos, metodologia e Interpretacion. Almeria: Universidad de Almeria; 1994.

Ourzik A. Les sols argilocalcaires a potentiel truffier de la Vienne. In: Corvoisier D, Olivier JM, Chevalier G, Eds. Actes du V Congres International Science et Culture de la Truffe; 1999: Aixen-Provence, France; Federation Francaise des trufficulteurs 2001; 273-4.

Montacchini F, Fasolo-Bonfante P, Fontana A. Inibitori naturali della germinazione. Un esempio: *Tuber melanosporum* Vittad. Informatore Botanico Italiano 1972; 4: 156-9.

Papa G. Componenti di *Tuber melanosporum* con attivita fitotossica. Micologia e Vegetazione Mediterranea 1992; 7: 109-10.

Plattner I, Hall IR. Parasitism of non-host plants by the mycorrhizal fungus *Tuber melanosporum*. Mycol Res 1995; 99: 1367-70.

Garcia-Montero LG, Di Massimo G, Garcia-Abril A, Grande MA. Suitability of lime trees for *Tuber melanosporum* culture: soil studies and truffle harvest associated with *Tilia platyphyllos* and *T. x vulgaris.* Sydowia2007; 59: 46-56.

Garcia-Montero LG, Pascual C, Garcia-Abril A, Garcia-Canete J. Problems of using rockroses in *Tuber melanosporum* culture: soil and truffle harvest associated with *Cistus laurifolius*. Agrofor Sys 2007;70:251-8.

Environmental-Department. Spanish Forestry Strategy. Madrid: Environmental Department of Spain; 1999.

Environmental-Department. Spanish Forestry Plan. Madrid: Environmental Department of Spain; 2002.

Reyna S, De Miguel AM, Hernandez A. Situacion y perspectivas de la truficultura en Espana. In: Sociedad Espanola de Ciencias Forestales, Ed. III Congreso Forestal Espanol. Sociedad Espanola de Ciencias Forestales, Granada, Spain; 2001; 723-30.

Garcia-Montero LG, Moreno A, Pascual C, Manjon JL. Evaluacion del clima en la produccion trufera (trufa negra: *Tuber melanosporum* Vitt.) del Alto Tajo (Guadalajara y Cuenca). Revista Forestal Espanola 2002; 31: 23-9.

TESEO database. Available from: <u>http://teseo.mec.es/teseo/jsp/</u> teseo.jsp.

Diaz P. Optimizacion del aroma de trufa *Tuber aestivum* mediante microextraccion en fase solida del espacio de cabeza (HS-SPME).

Unpublished first phase of thesis, University Autonoma of Madrid, Madrid; 2002.

Reyna S. Aproximacion a una selvicultura trufera. Ph Degree, Technical University of Madrid, Madrid; 1999.

Dominguez JA. Aportaciones de la micorrizacion artificial con trufa negra en planta forestal. Ph Degree, Technical University of Madrid, Madrid; 2002.

Dominguez JA, Selva J, Rodriguez JA, Saiz de Omenaca JA. The influence of mycorrhization with *Tuber melanosporum* in the afforestation of a Mediterranean site with *Quercus ilex* and *Quercus faginea*. For Ecol Manag 2006; 231: 226-33.

Garcia-Montero LG, Di Massimo G, Manjon JL, Garcia-Canete J. The effect of *Sphaerosporella brunnea* mycorrhizas on mycorrhization of *Quercus ilex* x *Tuber melanosporum*. Submitted 2008.

Garcia-Montero LG, Di Massimo G, Manjon JL, Garcia-Abril A. International research on the taxonomy, ecology, soils and mycorrhizae of Chinese *Tuber*, and their impact on truffle culture. Submitted 2008.

Garcia-Montero LG, Di Massimo G, Manjon JL, Velazquez J. Description of *Tuber malengonii* mycorrhizae and a comparison with mycorrhizae of *T. aestivum* and *T. mesentericum*. Submitted 2008.

Garcia-Montero LG, Di Massimo G, Manjon JL, Garcia-Abril A. New data on ectomycorrhizae, taxonomy and soil tolerance of the Chinese truffles *Tuber pseudoexcavatum* and *T. indicum*. Submitted 2008.

Amicucci A, Rossi I, Potenza L, *et al.* Identification of ectomycorrhizae from *Tuber* species by RFLP analysis of its region. Biotechnol Lett 1996; 18:821-6.

Zambonelli A, Tibiletti E, Pisi A. Caratterizzazione anatomomorfologica delle micorrize di *Tuber indicum* Cooke and Massee su *Pinus pinea* L. e *Quercus cerris* L. Micologia Italiana 1997; 1: 29-36.

Comandini O, Pacioni G. Mycorrhizae of Asian black truffles, *Tuber himalayense* and *T. indicum*. Mycotaxon 1997; 63: 77-86.

Etayo ML. Seguimiento del estado de micorrizacion de una parcela de cultivo de trufa negra. Valoracion del simbionte arboreo y efecto del tratamiento de alcochado. Estudio preliminar de las micorrizas de un area trufera colindante. Ph Degree, University of Navarra, Pamplona; 2001.

Roman M. Las ectomicorrizas de *Quercus ilex* subsp. *ballota* y su dinamica post-incendio en una zona potencialmente trufera. Ph Degree, University of Navarra, Pamplona; 2002.

Martinez de Aragon J. Produccion de esporocarpos de hongos ectomicorricicos y valoracion socioeconomica. Respuesta de estas comunidades a incendios forestales. Ph Degree. University of Lleida; 2005.

Wang Y, Moreno G, Riousset LJ, *et al. Tuber pseudoexcavatum* sp. nov. A new species from China commercialised in Spain, France and Italy with additional comments on Chinese truffles. Cryptogamie Mycologie 1998; 19: 113-20.

Moreno-Arroyo B, Infante F, Pulido E, Gomez J. The biogeography and taxonomy of *Tuber oligospermum* (Tul. and C. Tul.) Trappe (Ascomycota). Cryptogamie Mycologie 2000; 21: 147-52.

Diaz P, Ibanez E, Senorans FJ, Reglero G. Truffle aroma characterization by headspace solid-phase microextraction. J Chromatogr A 2003; A 1017: 207-14.

Diaz P, Senorans FJ, Reglero G, Ibanez E. Truffle aroma analysis by headspace solid phase microextraction. J Agric Food Chem 2002; 50: 6468-72.

Suz LM, Martin MP, Colinas C. Detection of *Tuber melanosporum* DNA in soil. FEMS Microbiol Lett 2006; 254: 251-7.

Bellesia A, Pinetti A, Tirillini B, Bianchi A. Temperaturedependent evolution of volatile organic compounds in *Tuber borchii* from Italy. Flavour Fragance J 2001; 16: 1-6.

Piloni M, Tat L, Tonizzo A, Battistutta F. Aroma characterisation of white truffle by GC-MS and GC-O. Ital J Food Sci 2005; 17: 463-8.

Saltron F, Fayet B, Guerere M. Contribution to the characterization of truffle juices from *Tuber melanosporum*, *T. brumale*, *T. aestivum* and *T. indicum*. Sci Aliments 1997; 17: 497-505.

Talou T, Delmas M, Gaset A. The volatile components of tinned Black Perigord Truffles *Tuber melanosporum* Vittad. Flavour Fragance J 1989; 4: 109-12.

Bianco L, Marucchi M, Cossa P. Aromi naturali ed artificiali nei tartufi e negli alimenti. Industrie Alimentari 1988; 27: 518-24.

Pacioni G, Bellina-Agostinone C, D'Antonio M. Odour composition of the *Tuber melanosporum* complex. Mycol Res 1990; 94: 201-04.

Talou T, Delmas M, Gaset A. Principal Constituents of Black Truffle (*Tuber melanosporum*) Aroma. J Agric Food Chem 1987; 35: 774-7.

Zeppa G, Gerbi V. Using an "electronic nose" to discriminate white truffle (*Tuber magnatum* Pico) quality. Sciences des Aliments 2001;21:683-95.

Persaud C, Gaset A, Talou T. Procede et dispositif pour la localisation des truffes par la detection des composes volatils emis par ces dernieres. France; 1994.

Diaz P, Garcia-Montero LG, Ibanez E, Senorans FJ, Perez-Andueza G. Caracterizacion de compuestos atrayentes de insectos en trufas espanolas mediante microextraccion en fase solida. In: Diaz P, Diaz-Moral D, Lucini C, Perez-Andueza G, Santamaria T, Eds. III Congreso Nacional de Entomologia Aplicada. 2003: Avila, Spain: Catholic University de Avila; 2003.

Pacioni G, Bologna MA, Laurenzi M. Insect atraction by *Tuber*, a chemical explanation. Mycol Res 1991; 95: 1359-63.

Talou T, Gaset A, Delmas M, Kulifaj JM Montant C. Dimethyl sulphide: the secret for black truffle hunting by animals. Mycol Res 1990; 94: 277-8.

Ciampolini M, Suss L. New findings on garlic fly, *Suillia univittata* (von Roser) (Diptera Heleomyzidae). Bollettino di Zoologia Agraria e di Bachicoltura 1984; 17: 19-38.

Bonet JA, Fischer CR, Colinas C. Cultivation of black truffle to promote reforestation and land-use stability. Agron Sustain Dev 2006; 26: 69-76.

Reyna S, Ed. Truficultura. Fundamentos y tecnicas. Madrid. Mundi-Prensa; 2007.