

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

# **CO-CONSTRUCTING EARLY ADOLESCENT EDUCATION THROUGH IMAGE-BASED RESEARCH**

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements  
for the degree of Master of Education at Massey University,  
Palmerston North

Emily Jane Nelson

2006

## **ABSTRACT**

Professional literature reporting the needs and characteristics, both educational and developmental of early adolescents presents a compelling case that students of this age group are distinct and require the development of a unique educational approach to best support their needs as learners and young people. Although much has been written about these students, little has been written with them, and even fewer studies have involved students themselves as co-researchers to investigate their own experience and understandings. The research reported in the thesis describes the implementation into practice of an image-based research methodology with early adolescent students themselves constructing and articulating their voice as the core focus of the research. The research was predicated on the belief that ‘student voice’ is the element vital in an educational approach developmentally responsive to students of this age group, and an element all too often missing.

Extended Visual Dialogue, the methodological approach devised to implement the research, was employed to conduct exploratory voice research with 38 early adolescent students in Years 7 and 8, across three participating schools in 2004. The approach combined elements from the research genres of voice research, participatory action research and image-based research and the students used a combination of auto-photography (participant-generated photography) and photo elicitation interviews to investigate how they perceive school and learning, perceive their identity as young persons and learners, and perceive the world in which they live. Through the processes of the research progressively, the students shared their perspectives with the adult researcher and brought themselves, and the researcher, to a deeper understanding of their unique point of view as learners in our schools, and as young persons in their own right. The findings of the research revealed the sound understanding the students have about their educational and personal needs, preferences, and agendas, and organised these into a framework representing the perspective of the students, accessible to their teachers as key stimulus for their development as distinctly middle level practitioners and their schools as authentic middle level education providers.

## **ACKNOWLEDGMENTS**

I acknowledge with gratitude the people who have assisted me in many ways with the preparation of this thesis and the research it reports.

Firstly I acknowledge the support and critique of my supervisor Associate Professor Pat Nolan, who coaxed me out from behind the work of others and taught me to speak with my own voice. I thank him also for introducing me to the unique world of the middle years, and for re-igniting my commitment to progressive education.

I thank John Schollum, Principal of Havelock Intermediate School for his support of the research in practice, his unerring enthusiasm for turning ideas into exciting realities, and his commitment to creating developmentally respectful education for the early adolescent students of his school.

The thesis would not have been possible without the boundless support of my family. I thank Andrew my husband for keeping me grounded and on track, and the grandparents who looked after my boys so I could write, and my two boys Finn and Rowan for their many cuddles, and unconditional acceptance even when the going was tough.

I would like to acknowledge and thank the teachers who volunteered to participate in the research. Each teacher brought a unique perspective to the research commensurate with their teaching interests, and all were excited to hear and take seriously the voice of their students as a valuable opportunity in their development as authentic middle level practitioners.

Most importantly I acknowledge the 38 students who participated voluntarily in the project and who taught me so much about being young, and about the experience of schooling and the world through adolescent eyes. The dignity, wisdom, and earnest reflection that the students brought to the research will stay with me forever.

This project has been reviewed, judged to be low risk, and approved by the researcher and supervisor under delegated responsibility from the Massey University Human Ethics Committee.

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT		i
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS		ii
INTRODUCTION		1
CHAPTER ONE: RESEARCH CONCEPT AND DESIGN		3
1.0	Introduction	3
1.1	Conceptual Framework	4
1.2	Origins	7
1.3	Student Participation as Co-researchers	8
1.4	Image-based Methodology	10
1.5	Extended Visual Dialogue – A Research Conversation Over Time	12
1.6	Making Sense of the Data Generated	14
1.7	Interpretive Conceptual Framework of the Researcher	15
1.8	Constant Comparative Analysis	17
1.9	Establishing Trustworthiness	19
1.10	Ecological Approach to Reporting Results	20
1.11	Extended Visual Dialogue Design Strategy	22
CHAPTER TWO: RESEARCH DESIGN APPLIED		25
2.0	Introduction	25
2.1	Developing the Research Plan (Jan. – Feb. 2004)	28
2.2	Establishing the Research (Nov. 2003-Feb. 2004)	29
2.2.1	Selecting Schools, Students and (Liaison) Teachers	29
2.3	Data Generation (March – May 2004)	32
2.3.1	The Research Questions	32
2.3.2	The Photo Focus Guide	33
2.3.3	Auto-photography	35
2.3.4	Photo Elicitation Interviews	37
2.4	Data Analysis (June-Dec. 2004)	39

2.4.1	Image Inventory	40
2.4.2	Collaborative Analysis of Data	40
2.4.3	Meta-analysis	45
2.4.4	Participation in and Experience of the Image-based Process	45
2.5	Validating the Research Analysis (June-Aug. 2004)	45
2.6	Reporting Research Findings (Oct. 2004-Dec.2005)	47
CHAPTER THREE: STUDENT ENGAGEMENT WITH THE RESEARCH PROCESS		49
3.0	Introduction	49
3.1	Patterns of Student Engagement with the Image-Based Methodology	50
3.2	Student Perceptions of the Research Process	53
3.3	The Research Process: Positive Aspects Identified	54
3.3.1	Intellectual challenge: Thinking outside the square	55
3.3.2	Alternate Mode of Expression	55
3.3.3	I Could So What I Wanted: Autonomy and Self-direction	56
3.3.4	No Possibility of Failure	57
3.3.5	Learning About What Matters to Me	57
3.4	The Research Process: Negative Aspects Identified	58
3.4.1	Technical issues: I lost my photos	58
3.4.2	Missing Out	59
3.4.3	To Plan or Not to Plan	60
3.4.4	Not Enough Time	60
3.4.5	Social Dynamics: Individual Preferences	61
3.4.6	Nothing: I liked It All	61
3.5	The Research Process: Improvements Identified	62
3.5.1	Access to Cameras	62
3.5.2	Interpreting Focus Statements: Talking at Cross Purposes	62
3.5.3	Time Pressure	64
CHAPTER FOUR: RESEARCH RESULTS		65
4.0	Introduction	65
4.1	Microsystem Influences: School, Learning and Learners	66
4.1.1	Pathway to Opportunity	69
4.1.2	Foundation for Career Success	72
4.2	How Learning Works	74

4.2.1	Conceptions of learning	74
4.3	Learning Preferences and Conditions Necessary to Optimise Learning	78
4.4	Learning Preferences: ‘I Prefer’	79
4.5	Learning Processes	81
4.5.1	Ways of Working – Collaborating with Peers	81
4.5.2	Teacher Disposition and Competence	84
4.5.3	Learning Style	88
4.6	Self-Assessment: ‘I Am’	89
4.7	Need More of: ‘I Need’	89
4.7.1	Personal Autonomy	90
4.7.2	Metacognitive Opportunity	90
4.8	Aspects of School that Impede Student Learning	90
4.8.1	The Effects of Bullying	91
4.9	Mesosystem: Influence of Family, Peers and School Community on the Learning and Wellbeing of the Students	93
4.9.1	The Effects of Bullying	94
4.9.2	The Importance of Having Friends	96
4.9.3	Advice and Guidance of Parents	97
4.9.4	Parental Knowledge	99
4.9.5	Personal Safety	99
4.10	Exosystem Events, Opportunities and Practices that Impact on the Lives of the Students	100
4.10.1	Worry: Health of Family and Extended Family Members	102
4.10.2	Being Heard in a World of Adults	103
4.10.3	Consequences of Taking Drugs	105
4.10.4	Others	106
4.10.5	Worry About the Future	107
4.10.6	Access to Experience: Infrastructure and Opportunities for Youth	108
4.11	Macrosystem: Influence of Macro-level Events, Practices and Societal Values on the Lives of Students	110
4.11.1	Pollution: Powerlessness, Apathy, and Solutions	112
4.11.2	War and Terrorism	117
4.11.3	Misplaced Social Emphasis	118
4.11.4	Racism	119

CHAPTER FIVE:	DISCUSSION, CONCLUSIONS, AND	
	IMPLICATIONS	121
5.0	Introduction	121
5.1	Discussion of the Findings of the Research	121
	5.1.1 The Perspectives of the Students	122
	5.1.2 The Methodology	126
5.2	Conclusions	133
5.3	Implications of the Research Findings	134
	5.3.1 Future Research with Early Adolescent Students	135
	5.3.2 Pedagogy and Curriculum Design	136
5.4	A Final Note	136
	REFERENCES	138
	APPENDICES	142



# Appendices

<b>Appendix One:</b>	Information Pack	142
<b>Appendix Two:</b>	Liaison Teacher Confidentiality Agreement	152
<b>Appendix Three:</b>	Liaison Teacher Consent Form	153
<b>Appendix Four:</b>	Transcriber’s Confidentiality Agreement	154
<b>Appendix Five:</b>	Image Inventory	155

## List of Tables

<b>Table 1:</b>	Characteristics of the Research Sample	31
<b>Table 2:</b>	Rationale for Research Sub-questions	33
<b>Table 3:</b>	Topics and Categories of the Emergent Conceptual Framework	41
<b>Table 4:</b>	Summary and Coding Categories Developed for Focus Area Two – Miss Brooker (false name)	44
<b>Table 5:</b>	Participation across Focus Areas	51
<b>Table 6:</b>	Focus Areas Ranked According to Number of Photos Taken	52
<b>Table 7:</b>	Microsystem Influences: Topics and Perspectives	67
<b>Table 8:</b>	Domains of Influence on Student Decision-making	72
<b>Table 9:</b>	Domains of Teacher Competence	87
<b>Table 10:</b>	Mesosystem Influences: Topics and Perspectives	93
<b>Table 11:</b>	Exosystem Influences: Topics and Perspectives	101
<b>Table 12:</b>	Macrosystem Influences: Topics and Perspectives	111
<b>Table 13:</b>	Types of Pollution and their Effects on the Environment	112

## List of Figures

<b>Figure 1:</b>	Conceptualising Student Voice: Traditions and Elements	5
<b>Figure 2:</b>	Ladder of Participation	9
<b>Figure 3:</b>	Extended Visual Dialogue: Interdependence of Three Research Genres	12
<b>Figure 4:</b>	The Interpretive Conceptual Framework of the Researcher	16
<b>Figure 5:</b>	The Ecological Model of Development	21
<b>Figure 6:</b>	Design Strategy of the Research	23
<b>Figure 7:</b>	Extended Visual Dialogue Design Framework	26
<b>Figure 8:</b>	The Photo Focus Guide	34
<b>Figure 9:</b>	Organisation for Auto-photography	35
<b>Figure 10:</b>	Photo Elicitation Interview Organisation	37
<b>Figure 11:</b>	Photo Elicitation Interview Guide	38
<b>Figure 12:</b>	Interview Transcript Extract – Miss Brooker (False Name)	43
<b>Figure 13:</b>	Microsystem of School	67
<b>Figure 14:</b>	“[School’s] like a path to new beginning because you’ve got to make your own choices when there’s a path to choose. Like there are so many different paths that you can choose (Popeye)”	69
<b>Figure 15:</b>	Generative Concept of Learning	75
<b>Figure 16:</b>	The Mind as a Construction Site	76
<b>Figure 17:</b>	The Co-constructive Nature of Learning - Bark, Twigs and Dirt	77
<b>Figure 18:</b>	Mind Map: How the Students See Themselves as Learners	79
<b>Figure 19:</b>	Being Told Off	83
<b>Figure 20:</b>	Mesosystem Influences on the Students at School	93
<b>Figure 21:</b>	Bullying	95
<b>Figure 22:</b>	Being ‘Lonered’	97
<b>Figure 23:</b>	Photo Elicitation Interview Transcript – Frank and Megaman	98
<b>Figure 24:</b>	Exosystem Influences Identified by the Students	100
<b>Figure 25:</b>	Macrosystem Influences Identified by the Students	110
<b>Figure 26:</b>	Pollution: Concerns, Effects and Prognosis	114
<b>Figure 27:</b>	Solutions: Beliefs, Actions, Consequences and a Healthy Prognosis	116

## **Introduction**

The research reported in this thesis carried out an exploratory study using a methodological approach combining elements from voice research, action research and image-based research genres. The purpose of the research was to investigate how early adolescent students perceive school and learning, perceive aspects of their identity as young persons and learners, and perceive the world in which they live. The findings produced from this investigation in turn, were intended to inform the design and development within the participating schools of pedagogy, curricula, and learning environments developmentally responsive (Stewart and Nolan, 1992) to the needs, characteristics, interests, agendas and preferences of the students of their early adolescent students.

The research involved working with 38 early adolescent students selected from Year Seven and Year 8 classrooms across three participating Intermediate and one newly established middle school in Hawke's Bay in 2004. The students worked as co-researchers (Atweh, Christensen, and Dornan, 1998) in the project alongside a university researcher. The teachers of the students participated also primarily as liaison teachers, whose role was to support the students as the key participants in the study. As co-researchers the students used image-based research methods of auto-photography (participant-generated photography) (Taylor, 2002) to explore their perceptions and experience in relation to the research focus outlined above. The photographs the students generated formed the stimulus for photo elicitation interviews (Clark, 1999) with the researcher that involved the students explaining their perspectives, and how these were represented in the images they constructed. The students participated in every phase of the research playing an advisory role to the researcher during the data analysis phase and verifying the authenticity of the analysis as reflective of their understandings and perspective at regular intervals.

The results generated revealed ways of working with, and studying, the perceptions of young people in ways that are different from most research conducted with students. Most often students are scripted roles as the subjects or objects of research (Graue and Walsh, 1998). The methodological approach devised for this research enabled the students to be positioned centrally as co-researchers investigating and exploring their own experiences and as partners in the research.

The findings of the research suggest new ways of understanding the perspectives of the students, theorising education for early adolescents and the role students should play ideally within the educative process, and suggest new ways of carrying out research with young people developmentally responsive to their needs and preferences and respectful of their voice.

The thesis report is structured in five chapters to address the five main components of the research as follows:

- **Chapter One: Concept and Design** describes how the research was conceptualised and how this conceptualisation led to the design of the methodological approach and overall design strategy used to implement the research.
- **Chapter Two: Research Design Applied** describes how the research was executed in practice using the image-based research methods to generate the perspectives of the students in relation to the focus of the research, reporting the research process chronologically through six main phases.
- **Chapter Three: Student Engagement with the Research Process** presents the results generated by the research relating to how the students participated within and across the focus areas of the research and how they perceived the efficacy of research process they participated in.
- **Chapter Four: Research Results** presents the perspectives expressed by the students using the image-based research methods as the results of the research. Bronfenbrenner's Ecological Model of Development (1979, 2005) was employed as the organising framework for the results.
- **Chapter Five: Discussion, Conclusions, and Implications** highlights key findings from the perspectives expressed by the students in Chapter Four as well as key findings from the trial of the methodological approach devised for the research reported in Chapter Three. The implications of the findings for future research with early adolescent students, and for pedagogy and curriculum design in the context of middle schooling are identified.