

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

**Caring Deception:  
Community art in the suburbs of Aotearoa (New Zealand)**

A thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements  
for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in  
Fine Arts  
at Massey University, Wellington,  
New Zealand.

By  
Tim Barlow  
2016



## Abstract

In Aotearoa (New Zealand), community art practice has a disadvantaged status and a poorly documented national history. This thesis reinvigorates the theory and practice of community art and cultural democracy using adaptable and context-specific analyses of the ways that aesthetics and ethics can usefully co-exist in practices of social change. The community art projects in this thesis were based in four suburbs lying on the economic and spatial fringes of Aotearoa. Over 4 years, I generated a comparative and iterative methodology challenging major binaries of the field, including: ameliorative vs. disruptive; coloniser vs. colonised; instrumental vs. instrumentalised; and long term vs. short term. This thesis asserts that these binaries create a series of *impasses* that drive the practice towards two new artistic categories, which I define as *caring deception* and *the facade*. All the projects I undertook were situated in contested space, where artists working with communities overlapped with local and national governments aiming for CBD and suburban re-vitalisation, creative city style initiatives, community development, grassroots creative projects, and curated public-art festivals. I worked within and around these structures, by practicing a methodology of *caring deception*. I applied a selection of artistic terms of engagement to vernacular structures such as public fountains, festival marquees, pop-up venues and community centres to negotiate deceit, resentment and care in the making of the art work. This thesis asserts that the methodology of *caring deception* creates a *social ethics in action* that can become embodied in the form of the art work.

## Acknowledgments

After 4 years of work and multiple community art projects there are many people to acknowledge. First, thanks must go to my PhD supervisors Distinguished Professor Sally Morgan, Associate Professor Heather Galbraith and Dr Martin Patrick for the intellectual challenge, rigour and creativity you have imparted. This thesis would have been a much different and significantly lesser project without the support of Mark Amery, Sophie Jerram and Helen Kirlew Smith of Letting Space, who commissioned and produced many of the projects, and have been inspirational, generous and critical colleagues. Thanks must also go to the many collaborators; Trish Morgan and the Rangatahi school, the Water Festival organising committee, Phil and Adele Tikao and the Positive Directions Trust workers, Rebecca and Renew New Brighton, Te Urutahi Waikerepuru, Kevin, Brian and Lox Lummis, Amanda Joe, Dave Brett, Moses Viliamu and Alicia Rich, and Dave Livingstone, for taking the action to another level. I wish to acknowledge my parents Jenny and Laughton Patrick and Peter and Susan Barlow, all of whom are my biggest fans, and my son Ben Barlow, for the work he is about to do. Thanks to Lynn Barlow and Andrew Nickless for their ongoing support of my plundering of the Upper Hutt factory. Thanks also to Jen MacArthur, Adam and Mel King, Don King and all the other artists and art supporters who helped: Barry Thomas, David Mealing, Professor Anne Noble, Dr Danny Butt, Dr Sharon MacGuiver, Benjamin Knight and Dr Polly Stupples. Lastly I must give a shout out and respect to all the other TEZA artists and to Massey University for supporting the PhD. Finally a thankyou to the many other people involved in all the thesis projects.

## Table of Contents

|                                                                                        |          |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------|
| <b>List of images</b> .....                                                            | <b>7</b> |
| <b>Preface: The abundance of terms</b> .....                                           | <b>9</b> |
| <b>Chapter 1: Introduction</b>                                                         |          |
| 1.0: Caring deception.....                                                             | 14       |
| 1.1: Caring deception and community art.....                                           | 17       |
| 1.2: The ethics of care.....                                                           | 23       |
| 1.3: Methodology.....                                                                  | 26       |
| 1.4: The context: The suburb, development and community in Aotearoa (New Zealand)..... | 32       |
| <b>Chapter 2: The ethical impasse: The facade of the fountain</b>                      |          |
| 2.0: Art as disruption vs. art as ameliorative.....                                    | 37       |
| 2.1: <i>The Public Fountain</i> (Tāupo, 2012).....                                     | 38       |
| 2.2: <i>Local Time</i> and <i>For the Love of the People</i> .....                     | 43       |
| <b>Chapter 3: The Post-colonial impasse: The facade of the occupation</b>              |          |
| 3.0: The coloniser vs. the colonised.....                                              | 48       |
| 3.1: TEZA (Transitional Economic Zone of Aotearoa).....                                | 48       |
| 3.2: The <i>Palisade</i> of Ngāti Whātua Ōrākei.....                                   | 64       |
| 3.3: Socialism and community art of the 1930s.....                                     | 69       |
| 3.4: Cultural democracy and TEZA.....                                                  | 72       |
| <b>Chapter 4: The development impasse: the facade of the festival</b>                  |          |
| 4.0: Assets vs. deficits.....                                                          | 74       |
| 4.1: <i>Wainuiomata Water Festival</i> (2015).....                                     | 76       |
| 4.2: <i>Greasy Pole</i> and <i>a Vacant Lot of Cabbages</i> .....                      | 86       |
| 4.3: Co-option of community art.....                                                   | 89       |
| 4.4: <i>Elbe's Milkbar</i> .....                                                       | 91       |
| <b>Chapter 5: The impasse of instrumentalism: the facade of the community centre</b>   |          |
| 5.0: <i>Old McDonald's</i> .....                                                       | 100      |
| 5.1: Mementos and resentment.....                                                      | 104      |
| 5.2: Boatsheds and car assembly.....                                                   | 111      |

## **Chapter 6: Conclusion**

6.0: *Ministry for Vulnerable Suburbs*.....117

6.1: Conclusion.....120

**References**.....128

**Appendix 1: Māori words and terms**.....144

**Appendix 2: Documentation: *The Public Fountain***.....145

**Appendix 3: Documentation: *The TEZA site***.....147

**Appendix 4: Documentation: *Elbe's Milkbar***.....149

**Appendix 5: Documentation: *Just in Time Community Centre***.....150

**Appendix 6: Documentation: *Ministry for Vulnerable Suburbs***.....151

## List of images

|                                                                                                                                       |     |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| Fig. 1. <i>Blood the river of life</i> (1973). Video still courtesy of David Mealing.....                                             | 34  |
| Fig. 2. <i>The Public Fountain</i> (2012). The apparatus.....                                                                         | 38  |
| Fig. 3. <i>The Public Fountain</i> . At Turangi mall.....                                                                             | 39  |
| Fig. 4. <i>The Public Fountain</i> . Public forum “Geothermal power and development”.....                                             | 40  |
| Fig. 5. Paula Atatagi at the commercial cleaners picket. 1999. <i>For the love of the people</i> .<br>Photographer; Lynette Shum..... | 44  |
| Fig. 6. <i>Water Action 500m Law – Waitemata</i> , July 28 2013–1200-1600 (+1200).Local Time..                                        | 45  |
| Fig. 7. TEZA New Mexico. Site concept sketch. Tim Barlow.....                                                                         | 49  |
| Fig. 8. <i>The TEZA site</i> (2013). Built on the Creative Quarter site, Seaview road.....                                            | 51  |
| Fig. 9. <i>Te Ao Mārama</i> . The spiritual hub.....                                                                                  | 53  |
| Fig. 10. Construction work on <i>Te Ao Mārama</i> .....                                                                               | 57  |
| Fig. 11. PDT workers and Tim Barlow constructing the entranceway.....                                                                 | 59  |
| Fig. 12. <i>Te Ao Mārama</i> relocated to New Brighton community gardens in 2014.....                                                 | 61  |
| Fig.13. <i>Palisade</i> , Fiona Jack, Ngarimu Blair. 2008.....                                                                        | 65  |
| Fig. 14. <i>Te Ao Mārama</i> . Lit by Te Urutahi Waikerepuru, Stuart Foster and Kura Puke. ....                                       | 66  |
| Fig. 15. <i>Flauntiousness</i> , Wayne Youle, 2013 © SCAPE Public Art & Wayne Youle.....                                              | 68  |
| Fig. 16. The TEZA pavilion with painted murals.....                                                                                   | 70  |
| Fig.17. Video still youth video production. Wainuiomata. 2013.....                                                                    | 75  |
| Fig.18. <i>Wainuiomata Water Festival 2015</i> .....                                                                                  | 76  |
| Fig. 19. <i>Wainuiomata Water Festival</i> . View to main-stage.....                                                                  | 80  |
| Fig. 20. Gavin Wallace and the Bush Fire Force lift <i>Rocketwoman</i> using water pressure.....                                      | 83  |
| Fig. 21. Jenny MacArthur of street performers <i>The Life Guards</i> . ....                                                           | 85  |
| Fig. 22. <i>Vacant lot of cabbages</i> . 1978. Barry Thomas. Wellington. ....                                                         | 87  |
| Fig. 23. <i>Elbe’s Milkbar</i> 2015 . Exterior nostalgia evening. ....                                                                | 91  |
| Fig. 24. <i>Elbe’s milkbar</i> . Classic British bikes arrive.....                                                                    | 93  |
| Fig. 25. Construction of the milkbar booths.....                                                                                      | 94  |
| Fig. 26. Interior of the milkbar.....                                                                                                 | 96  |
| Fig. 27. The vacant Trash Palace. 2015.....                                                                                           | 101 |
| Fig. 28. Milkbar booths set up in the <i>Old McDonald’s</i> café.....                                                                 | 102 |
| Fig. 29. <i>Travails of the bomb-aimer’s daughter (Chp.3)</i> . Sally J. Morgan.....                                                  | 105 |
| Fig. 30. <i>The Titahi Bay Boatshed Festival</i> . Porirua. New Zealand. 2015.....                                                    | 108 |



|                                                                                                     |     |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| Fig. 31. <i>Just In Time Community Centre (JIT)</i> . Cannons Creek. New Zealand. 2015.....         | 109 |
| Fig. 32. <i>JIT Community Centre</i> . Te Rito Gardens. Old Porirua Hospital grounds.....           | 111 |
| Fig. 33. <i>JIT Community Centre</i> as the main stage at <i>Titahi Bay Boatshed Festival</i> ..... | 114 |
| Fig.34. Exterior view, <i>Ministry for Vulnerable Suburbs</i> . 2016.....                           | 117 |
| Fig.35. Interior view, <i>Ministry for Vulnerable Suburbs. Meeting room</i> . 2016.....             | 120 |
| Fig.34. Promotion at the Big Day Art. (early 2012).....                                             | 145 |
| Fig.35. Construction at farm engineering company.....                                               | 145 |
| Fig.36. Close-up of the pressure cylinder.....                                                      | 145 |
| Fig.37. Bathers in the warm geothermal waters.....                                                  | 146 |
| Fig.38. <i>Vapours of the Oracle (2012)</i> . Hot geothermal face towel refreshment street stall... | 146 |
| Fig.39. The Creative Quarter site. Early 2013 pre TEZA.....                                         | 147 |
| Fig.40. <i>Te Ao Mārama</i> lit at night.....                                                       | 147 |
| Fig.41. The TEZA entranceway.....                                                                   | 147 |
| Fig.42. Barbecue for New Brighton volunteer crew post TEZA.....                                     | 148 |
| Fig.43. TEZA noticeboard displaying “What does occupation look like” theme of the day...            | 148 |
| Fig.44. TEZA entranceway travelling to become santa’s grotto for xmas.....                          | 148 |
| Fig. 45. Radio interview while training students to prepare classic Elbe’s sundaes.....             | 149 |
| Fig.46. Nostalgia evening.....                                                                      | 149 |
| Fig.47. <i>Elbe’s Milkbar</i> . Teen electronic dance music (EDM) night.....                        | 149 |
| Fig.48. Tim Barlow showing lime render technique in <i>JIT</i> . ....                               | 150 |
| Fig.49. Set-up of <i>JIT</i> with hell-mouth in Cannons Creek.....                                  | 150 |
| Fig. 50. Amanda Joe uses <i>JIT</i> to promote a new community centre.....                          | 150 |
| Fig. 51. MVS view to the library and WWF presentation.....                                          | 151 |
| Fig. 52. MVS view to milkbar and Elbe’s Milkbar presentation.....                                   | 151 |
| Fig. 53. MVS view to the Community Artists Office.....                                              | 151 |