

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

**ROADS INVESTMENT AND ECONOMIC GROWTH:
SIMILARITY OR DIVERGENCE BETWEEN DEVELOPED AND
DEVELOPING COUNTRIES**

**A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements
for the degree of**

Doctor of Philosophy

in

Planning

at Massey University, Manawatū,

New Zealand

Muhammad Babar Chohan

2016

Abstract

This research investigates how arguments for economic growth are perceived and advanced to promote road investment. In particular, it addresses the question of whether there is similarity or divergence between developed and developing countries given their different growth trajectories. In literature, the relationship between building roads and achieving economic growth is heavily reliant on quantitative tools while ignoring the socio-economic and political contextual details of developed and developing countries. Using the Aristotelian concept of *phronēsis*, the research undertakes a comparative case study involving New Zealand and Pakistan. *Phronēsis* is an intellectual virtue capable of incorporating practical problems and contextual issues in everyday life. The concept was operationalized for this thesis by devolving it into three main questions in which the roads policy direction, the associated processes and discursive pragmatism was explored. Detailed analysis of two major roading infrastructure projects, MacKays to Peka Peka (M2PP) in the Wellington region of New Zealand and a Ring Road in Lahore, Pakistan, shows that roads investment is promoted on the basis of national visions and policies without robust evidence of how economic growth will be achieved. The findings indicate that the national visions, related to case study projects, are not based on robust analyses and research but rather on strategic needs that advance the agenda of the powerful. The research found that the discourse of economic growth in each project was based on similar arguments about travel time saving, efficiency and employment growth regardless of public consultations. The research concludes that 'economic growth' is a niche created, advanced, and interpreted by power to achieve its strategic objectives in road development without contextual differences being considered in developed and developing countries.

Dedication

To my loving father Yaseen Chohan (late).

Acknowledgements

Associate Professor Imran Muhammad and Associate Professor Christine Cheyne from the School of People Environment and Planning, College of Humanities and Social Science, are the academic supervisors of this thesis. Their continuous guidance and assistance is deeply acknowledged. The guidance and supervision of Professor Paul Perry was very helpful and is equally acknowledged. Bent Flyvbjerg, Professor of the major programme Management at Oxford University's Saïd Business School, kept uploading his research on Facebook. These updates have provided deep theoretical insights for this thesis. His role is also acknowledged. The support of the Head of School Professor Glenn Banks in academic and administrative matters is also deeply acknowledged. The academic and administrative support of the former Head of School Dr Allanah Ryan is also equally acknowledged. I also acknowledge the support and help of my professors Dr Arjun Singh Bedi, Dr Mansoob Murshed and Dr Lorenzo Pellegrini who taught me various courses during my M.A at the International Institute of Social Studies, Erasmus University, The Netherlands.

The role of Government of Pakistan is acknowledged for providing me scholarship for this project. The administrative support of Dr Mukhtar Ahmad, Chairman, Higher Education Commission (HEC), and Mr Arshad Hayat, Special Assistant to Chairman, Federal Board of Revenue, Government of Pakistan, is acknowledged. I also acknowledge the role of all learning consultants and student advisors, particularly Dr Julia Rayner and Sonya Holm, for their proof reading, editing and other services. The support of non-academic staff of the school was equally inevitable. I acknowledge the support of the entire school staff particularly Mary Roberts, Kevin Butler, Amy Tootell and Rosie McLean. I also acknowledge the love and support of my friends and PhD fellows Jul, Axel, Dorcas, Yuanheng, Dora, Den, Andrew, Virginia, Abdurehman, Murad, Waheed, Hina, Shaan, Saba, Ainee, Amalia, Ross, Lee, Kashif, Akhtar, Tayyab, Weqas, Hashim and Razaqat. The role of Dr Zulfiqar Butt,

Pakistan Project Administrator at Massey University, is acknowledged for keeping liaison with HEC regarding my scholarship and six monthly progress reports. The role of IT services was vital. IT Assistants Aidan Wood and Yousuf Baig handled various issues of Microsoft word. Their services are acknowledged.

The most important, and above all, is the role of my family members. My mother always prays for my success which I acknowledge from the core of my heart. Her prayers for me are, indeed, my asset. My wife Nuzhat and lovely boys Pasha and Mahatir supported me through thick and thin during this long doctoral journey and kept me motivated. I whole-heartedly acknowledge their love and support. I would have not been unable to write this thesis without their love and support. I also acknowledge the support and love of my siblings Sabar, Humayun, Maham, Allaudin, and Khurram. Finally, I recall a memory from my childhood. I asked my father, “Dad what do you want me to be when I grow up”? “Be whatever you like but always follow excellence” – he replied. His reply remains a guiding principle to which I wish to always adhere.

Table of Contents

ABSTRACT	I
DEDICATION	II
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	III
TABLE OF CONTENTS.....	V
LIST OF FIGURES	IX
LIST OF TABLES	X
ABBREVIATIONS	XI
CHAPTER ONE INTRODUCTION	1
1.1. A little boy and the experts.....	1
1.2. Background	2
1.3. The key terms and conceptual framework	4
1.4. The research questions and aim	4
1.5. The structure of the thesis	5
CHAPTER TWO ROADS INVESTMENT AND ECONOMIC GROWTH.....	7
2.1. Introduction	7
2.2. The struggling experts.....	8
2.2.1. Roads investment and economic growth – the location theories’ perspective .	10
2.2.2. How do regional growth theories connect roads investment and economic growth?	13
2.2.3. How do local development theories explain the link between roads investment and economic growth?.....	14
2.2.4. Road investment and economic growth – an evaluation within the local growth theories framework.....	15
2.3. Externalities shape the economic, social, environmental and spatial aspects of road projects.....	17
2.3.1. Economic externalities	18
2.3.2. Social externalities	25

Table of Contents

2.3.3. Environmental externalities	29
2.3.4. Spatial externalities	31
2.4. Handling urban externalities by promoting dialogue and pragmatism in planning.....	35
2.4.1. Traditional measurability tools.....	36
2.4.2. Towards better solutions: can communication work?	39
2.4.3. Why economic discourse?	42
2.5. Conclusion	45
CHAPTER THREE PRACTICAL WISDOM – THE MASTER VIRTUE	47
3.1. Introduction.....	47
3.2. Phronēsis, urban planning and decision-making	47
3.2.1. Phronēsis in the context of urban planning	49
3.2.2. Power as an inseparable component of phronēsis and decision-making	51
3.3. Power, context and perception in a theoretical perspective	58
3.3.1. A critical analysis of relevant theories incorporating power, context and phronēsis	64
3.4. Choosing PPR framework	74
3.5. Conclusion	77
CHAPTER FOUR RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODS.....	79
4.1. Introduction.....	79
4.2. The methodological framework and implementation of fieldwork strategy .	80
4.3. Qualitative case study research	83
4.4. The M2PP and the LRR-SL as comparative case studies for developed and developing countries.....	86
4.5. Research integrity	90
4.5.1. Ethical considerations.....	91
4.6. Case study methods	92
4.6.1. Document analysis.....	92
4.6.2. Semi-structured interviews	94

Table of Contents

4.7. Handling the sources of qualitative data	99
4.8. Data analysis	101
4.9. Conclusion	101
CHAPTER FIVE MACKAYS TO PEKA PEKA EXPRESSWAY: A POLICY ANALYSIS.....	103
5.1. Introduction	103
5.2. Land transport policy and planning in New Zealand	104
5.2.1. Land transport policy and planning at national level.....	105
5.2.2. Land transport policy and planning at the regional level.....	113
5.2.3. Land transport policy and planning at the district level.....	116
5.3. MacKays to Peka Peka expressway – a policy and investment analysis.....	117
5.4. Conclusion	133
CHAPTER SIX PLANNING PROCESS AND PRAGMATISM IN MACKAYS TO PEKA PEKA ROAD OF NATIONAL SIGNIFICANCE	135
6.1. Introduction	135
6.2. Part 1: Stakeholder analysis	135
6.3. Part 2: Pragmatism in M2PP	144
6.4. Conclusion	161
CHAPTER SEVEN LAHORE RING ROAD – SOUTHERN LOOP: A POLICY ANALYSIS	163
7.1. Introduction	163
7.2. Land transport policy and planning in Pakistan	164
7.2.1. Transport policy and planning at the federal level	168
7.2.2. Transport policy and planning at the provincial level.....	177
7.2.3. Transport policy and planning at the district level: an analysis of Lahore Ring Road-Southern Loop	183
7.3. Conclusion	195
CHAPTER EIGHT PLANNING PROCESS AND PRAGMATISM IN LAHORE RING ROAD- SOUTHERN LOOP.....	196
8.1. Introduction	196

Table of Contents

8.2. Part 1: Stakeholder analysis	196
8.2.1. Planning process at the strategic level	197
8.2.2. Planning process at the implementation level	203
8.3. Part 2: Pragmatism in LRR-SL	213
8.4. Conclusion	226
CHAPTER NINE DISCUSSION	229
9.1. Introduction.....	229
9.2. Understanding the policy approach towards achieving economic growth through urban roads investment	230
9.3. Delineating power and interest in the transport policy processes.....	236
9.4. Undermining the dubious practices through problematization	239
9.5. Implications for developed and developing countries.....	241
9.6. Conclusion	250
CHAPTER TEN CONCLUSION.....	252
10.1. Introduction.....	252
10.2. Roads investment and economic growth: what is the contribution of this thesis?.....	253
10.3. Limitations and future research	255
REFERENCES	258
APPENDIX ONE	302
APPENDIX TWO	303
APPENDIX THREE.....	307

List of Figures

Serial Number	Title	Page Number
Figure 1	A typical Kuznets' Curve	35
Figure 2	Do you see a duck or a rabbit, or both?	60
Figure 3	The Delbeouf's illusion in which subjects were required to rank the disks, in white and black colours, as a function of size	62
Figure 4	The problem of perception	64
Figure 5	A methodological framework of the thesis	81
Figure 6	The land transport policy framework at national, regional and district levels	104
Figure 7	The relation between national and regional land transport documents	114
Figure 8	Seven initial Roads of National Significance	117
Figure 9	The proposed M2PP route	119
Figure 10	The IRS roads investment assessment profile form	129
Figure 11	The steps involved in the consenting process for RONS under the Resource Management Act requirements Source	136
Figure 12	The pre-construction decision-making process in M2PP	137
Figure 13	The weak and strong phases of stakeholders' involvement in the M2PP project	141
Figure 14	A billboard created by some Kapiti residents	146
Figure 15	The land transport policy framework at federal, provincial and district levels	165
Figure 16	Punjab transport policy documents and their comparative relevance	177
Figure 17	Lahore District level transport policy documents and their comparative relevance	185
Figure 18	Various changes in the LRR-SL routes	188
Figure 19	The steps involved in the LRR decision-making process	197
Figure 20	The pre-construction land acquisition process	211
Figure 21	The weak involvement of stakeholders in all four phases of the LRR project	213

List of Tables

Serial Number	Title	Page Number
Table 1	Links between urban roads investment and economic development	33
Table 2	Interview groups in the M2PP	96
Table 3	Interview groups in the LRR-SL	96
Table 4	Research participants interviewed for the M2PP project	97
Table 5	Research participants interviewed for the LRR-SL project	97

Abbreviations

ACF	Advocacy Coalition Framework
ADP	Annual Development Programme
AMP	Asset Management Plan
ANT	Actor-Network Theory
AP	Assistant Professor
BCR	Benefit-Cost Ratio
BGA	Business Growth Agenda
BIM	Briefing to Incoming Minister
BOI	Board of Inquiry
BOT	Build, Operate, Transfer
BRT	Bus Rapid Transit
C&C	Command and Control
C&W	Communications and Works
CBA	Cost-Benefits Analysis
CBD	Central Business District
CE	Chief Engineer
CEO	Chief Executive Officer
CGE	Computable General Equilibrium
CM	Chief Minister
CMS	Critical Management Studies
CNZ	Connecting New Zealand
CPEC	China-Pakistan Economic Corridor
CRP	City and Regional Planning
CSTSL	Comprehensive Study on Transportation System of Lahore
DD	Deputy Director
DETR	Department of the Environment, Transport and the Regions
DHA	Defence Housing Authority
DIDR	Development-induced Displacement and Resettlement
EAD	Economic Affairs Division
EEM	Economic Evaluation Manual
EIA	Environmental Impact Assessment
EIC	Evidence-in-Chief
EIRR	Economic Internal Rate of Return
EPA	Environmental Protection Authority
EPD	Environment Protection Department
ESP	Economic Survey of Pakistan
FEF	Framework for Economic Growth
FWO	Frontier Works Organisation
GHG	Green House Gases
GM	General Manager
GOPB	Government of the Punjab
GPS	Government Policy Statement on Land Transport
GWRC	Greater Wellington Regional Council
HDI	Human Development Index
HEC	Higher Education Commission
H+T	Housing and Transportation
IBP	Incentive-based policies
IMPL	Integrated Master Plan for Lahore
IPENZ	Institution of Professional Engineers New Zealand
IRS	Investment and Revenue Strategy
ISDP	Integrated Strategic Development Plan (for Lahore Region)
ITP	Integrated Transport Planning
ITS	Intelligent Transport Systems
JHB	Jobs-housing balance
JHI	Jobs-housing imbalance
JICA	Japan International Cooperation Agency

Abbreviations

JV	Joint Venture
KCDC	Kapiti Coast District Council
LCCI	Lahore Chamber of Commerce and Industry
LDA	Lahore Development Authority
LGA	Local Government Act
LRN	Low Risk Notification
LRRRA	Lahore Ring Road Authority
LRR-NL	Lahore Ring Road – Northern Loop
LRR	Lahore Ring Road
LRR-SL	Lahore Ring Road – Southern Loop
LTDP	Long Term District Plan
LTMA	Land Transport Management Act
LUTMP	Lahore Urban Transport Master Plan
M2PP	MacKays to Peka Peka
M&A	Merger and Acquisition
MOT	Ministry of Transport
MP	Member of Parliament
MPA	Member of Provincial Assembly
MSSM	Making Social Science Matter
MTDF	Medium Term Development Framework
NDP	National Development Programme
NEC	National Economic Council
NESPAK	National Engineering Service Pakistan
NIP	National Infrastructure Plan
NLC	National Logistic Cell
NLTP	National Land Transport Plan
NOC	No Objection Certificate
NPV	Net Present Value
NTRC	National Transport Research Centre
NZCID	New Zealand Council for Infrastructure Development
NZEECS	New Zealand Energy, Efficiency and Conservation Strategy
NZG	New Zealand Government
NZRTF or RTF	New Zealand Road Transport Forum
NZTA	New Zealand Transport Agency
NZTS	New Zealand Transport Strategy
ONRC	One Network Road Classification
PAC	Public Accounts Committee
P&D	Planning and Development
PADT	Path Dependence Theory
PDWP	Provincial Development Working Party
PGS	Punjab Growth Strategy
PIAF	Pakistan Industrial and Traders Association
PML (N)	Pakistan Muslim League (Nawaz)
PML (Q)	Pakistan Muslim League (Quaid-e-Azam)
PMU	Project Management Unit
PODT	Power Dependence Theory
PPP	Pakistan People’s Party
PPP	Public-Private Partnership
PPR	Phronetic Planning Research
PSC	Project Steering Committee
PSDP	Public Sector Development Programme
PSS	Phronetic Social Science
PTI	Pakistan Movement for Justice Party (Pakistan Tahreek-e-Insaaf)
PTOM	Public Transport Operating Model
PTPS	Pakistan Transport Plan Study
PV	Present Value
QE	Queen Elizabeth
RDT	Resource Dependence Theory
RGNDI	Real Gross National Disposable Income
RLTP	Regional Land Transport Plan

Abbreviations

RLTS	Regional Land Transport Strategy
RMA	Resource Management Act
RONs	Roads of National Significance
RPC	Richard Paling Consulting
RPS	Regional Policy Statement
RPTP	Regional Public Transport Plan
RTC	Regional Transport Committee
RTF	Road Transport Forum
SACTRA	Standing Advisory Committee on Trunk Road Appraisal
SAHA	Saha International (Infrastructure Advisors)
SCMP	Stakeholder and Communication Management Plan
SET	Social Exchange Theory
SH1	State Highway 1
SID	Similarity, Identity and Difference
SJS	Safer Journeys Strategy
SOI	Statement of Intent
TR	Transport Representative
UET	University of Engineering and Technology, Lahore
UGS	Urban Green Space
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UOS	Urban Open Space
VFM	Value for Money
VOC	Vehicle Operating Cost
VTT	Value of Travel Time
WEB	Wider Economic Benefit
WLR	Western Link Road
WNC	Wellington Northern Corridor
WRS	Wellington Regional Strategy

