

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

The Socio-demographic Determinants and Nutritional Consequences of Food Insecurity of a Group of New Zealand Children

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Masters of Science in Nutritional Science, at Massey University, Albany, New Zealand.

Marika Frana Louise Segedin 2003

"When there is not enough money to buy food - our children have to go without eating."

Response of a caregiver to a child participating in the pilot study for the New Zealand Children's Nutrition Survey, 2000.

Abstract

Food security among individuals exists when there is stable access to the kind of adequate, nutritious, safe, and culturally appropriate diet needed to maintain an active, healthy life (Campbell, 1991; Bickel et al., 2000). There is evidence that food insecurity – the lack of such an access - exists among some segments of the New Zealand population (Parnell, 1997; Russell et al., 1999; Parnell et al., 2001). There has been little research into the nutritional impact of food insecurity in New Zealand children.

The purpose of this study was to investigate the effects of socio-demographic and food security status on the nutrition and health of New Zealand children. The sample chosen for this study were a group of 183 children, aged one to 14 years, from Auckland's western suburbs, who participated in the Validation study; part of the pilot for the Children's Nutrition Survey conducted during 2000. Of the 183 children who participated in this study, 60 were Maori, 63 were Pacific and 60 were European.

Demographic, anthropometric and medical history data were obtained during interviews, and dietary data was based on 24-hour recalls and food frequency questionnaires. Statistical analysis, including two-sample t-tests, Kruskal-Wallis, ordinal and binary logistic regressions using the MINITAB 13.31 program (Minitab Inc., 2003), was performed on the data set. Any relationship was considered significant if the p-value was less than 0.05.

This study reported a high prevalence of food insecurity in the sample group, with 39% of all children living in households that sometimes or often did not have enough money to buy food. Household income, the educational status of the food preparer, the occupation of the main provider, the type of dwelling (rented versus owned) and ethnicity were significant predictors of food insecurity in the children in this study (p < 0.0005).

Children from food-insecure households and children from low-income households, or children whose main provider was of a low occupational status or receiving a government benefit, or children whose food preparer left school early, or children from large-sized households living in rented homes, all had significantly lower intakes of fruit, vegetables, milk products and protein-rich foods such as meat. Food-insecure preschool children were also significantly more likely not to meet the RDI for nutrients such as vitamin E, calcium and selenium than food-secure preschool children. Most food-insecure school-age children did not meet the recommended values for energy, fibre, riboflavin, vitamin B6, folate, vitamin A and zinc. Poor dietary habits were observed amongst the food insecure, with most eating takeaways on a frequent basis.

Food insecurity was not significantly associated with overweight or obesity, or other measures of health status, in the group of children in this study. However, significantly higher BMI values were reported among food-insecure children, and Maori and Pacific children had higher BMI values than European or Other children. A stronger association was found between BMI and socio-economic status. Children living in low-income households or in rented dwellings, or whose food preparer left school at an early age, had higher median BMI values than children from higher income households or living in households where the home was owned, or whose food preparer had stayed at school for longer or had an undergraduate degree.

An important finding of this study was the high prevalence of food insecurity amongst Pacific children or children whose food preparer was of Pacific ethnicity. However, caution needs to be applied when drawing conclusions from this study, as the sample in the study was not a true representation of the New Zealand population. Some ethnic groups were under-represented, while households from the higher end of the income spectrum were over-represented in the sample chosen for the study. The results of this study are also subjective to limitations associated with the measurement of food insecurity (Blumberg & Bialostosky, 1999; Tarasuk & Beaton, 1999) and dietary assessment methods (Briefel et al., 1997; Gibson, 2002). There are also currently no nation-specific cut-off values for classifying NZ children as obese or overweight. The proposed Children's National Nutrition Survey will determine the prevalence of food insecurity in a random population based sample.

This study provides evidence that food insecurity and low socio-economic status can have a negative impact on the nutritional and health status of NZ children. Its findings provide a strong case for an increased public focus on the nutritional status of Pacific children. Future research is needed to assess the impact of nutritional education programs on food-insecure households with children.

Acknowledgements

There are people whom without their help and support the completion of this thesis would not have been possible. I am most grateful for the valuable assistance I received from:

Dr Barry McDonald	Senior Lecturer, Institute of Information and Mathematical Sciences, Massey University, Albany Campus.
Dr Clare Wall	Senior Lecturer, Institute of Food, Nutrition and Human Health, Massey University, Albany Campus.
Marie Segedin	My mother and my friend. Thank you for your tolerance and understanding.
Stefano Canestri	My partner and motivator. Thank you for your ongoing support.

Table of Contents

1	Introduction	1
2	Literature Review	3
	2.1 Definitions	5
	2.1.1 Hunger	5
	2.1.2 Food security	5
	2.1.3 Food insecurity	7
	2.1.4 Food sufficiency and food insufficiency	7
	2.2 Measuring food insecurity and hunger	7
	2.2.1 Community Childhood Hunger Identification Project	8
	2.2.2 Radimer/Cornell measure	8
	2.2.3 Third National Health and Nutrition Examination Survey	11
	2.2.4 Food security supplement	12
	2.2.5 Household food security scale	12
	2.3 Validation of measures of food insecurity and hunger	14
	2.4 Measuring nutritional status in food-insecure populations	16
	2.4.1 Assessment of socio-economic status	16
	2.4.2 Assessment of dietary intake in food-insecure populations	17
	2.4.2.1 The 24-hour diet recall	18
	2.4.2.2 Food records	19
	2.4.2.3 Dietary history	20
	2.4.2.4 Food frequency questionnaire (FFQ)	20
	2.4.2.5 Validation of measures of dietary assessment	21
	2.4.2.6 Assessment of adequacy of nutrient intake	22
	2.4.3 Anthropometric assessment	25
	2.4.3.1 Measuring obesity and overweight in children	25
	2.4.4 Laboratory assessment	26
	2.4.5 Clinical assessment	26
	2.5 Socio-demographic determinants of nutritional status	27
	2.5.1 Nutritional consequences of age, gender, ethnicity and culture	28
	2.5.2 Nutritional consequences of housing arrangements	33
	2.5.3 Nutritional consequences of poverty and low-income	34

2.5.3.1 Poverty and health status	37
2.5.4 Nutritional consequences of household food expenditure	40
2.5.5 Nutritional consequences of education status	42
2.5.6 Nutritional consequences of employment or occupation status	43
2.6 Prevalence of food insecurity	45
2.6.1 Food insecurity in the United States of America	45
2.6.2 Food insecurity in Australia	46
2.6.3 Food insecurity in New Zealand	46
2.6.4 Food insecurity in the United Kingdom	48
2.6.5 Food insecurity in Finland	48
2.7 Socio-economic status of food-insecure households	49
2.7.1 Age, gender, ethnicity and food security status	53
2.7.2 Housing arrangement and food security status	54
2.7.3 Poverty, household income and food security status	55
2.7.4 Household food expenditure and food insecurity	57
2.7.5 Education and food security status	58
2.7.6 Employment and food security status	59
2.8 Nutritional status of food-insecure households	59
2.8.1 Poor diet and nutrient intake	60
2.9 Health consequences of food insecurity	65
2.9.1 Poor health status	65
2.9.2 Impaired growth	67
2.9.3 Poor cognitive, academic and psychosocial development	68
2.9.4 Obesity	70
2.10 Summary	73
Aims of the Study	74
Methodology	76
4.1 Pilot of the Children's Nutrition Survey (CNS)	76
4.1.1 Validation study	76
4.1.2 Pre-testing study	77
4.1.3 Chosen data set for this study: the Validation study	77
4.1.3.1 Subjects in the Validation study	77

4.1.3.2 The data collection interviews	78
4.1.3.3 Food list database	79
4.1.3.4 Validation results	80
4.1.3.5 The questionnaires	81
4.2 Data analyses	81
4.2.1 Analysis of demographic data	81
4.2.1.1 Categorisation of data on ethnicity	83
4.2.1.2 Classification of household income	83
4.2.1.3 Classification of occupation status	84
4.2.2 Analysis of nutritional status data	85
4.2.3 Analysis of anthropometric data	86
4.2.4 Analysis of medical history data	86
4.2.5 Analysis of food security data	87
4.3 Statistical analysis	87
4.3.1 Statistical analysis of socio-demographic data	87
4.3.2 Socio-demographic determinants of dietary Intake	87
4.3.3 Socio-demographic determinants of nutrient Intake	88
4.3.4 Socio-demographic determinants of dietary eating patterns	89
4.3.5 Socio-demographic determinants of food insecurity	89
4.3.6 Nutritional status of food-insecure children	89
4.3.7 Health and physical status of the children	89
Results	90
5.1 Socio-demographic and physical characteristics of the children	91
5.1.1 The health status of the children	93
5.2 Characteristics of the household	93
5.2.1 Sex and ethnicity	93
5.2.2 Education status	94
5.2.3 Occupation status	95
5.2.4 Housing arrangements and household size	97
5.2.5 Household income	99
5.2.6 Household food expenditure	99
5.3 Socio-demographic determinants of nutritional status	100
5.3.1 Socio-demographic determinants of dietary intake	100

5

5.3.1.1 Fruit consumption	100
5.3.1.1.1 Age	100
5.3.1.1.2 Gender	103
5.3.1.1.3 Ethnicity of child	103
5.3.1.1.4 Ethnicity of the food preparer	103
5.3.1.1.5 Housing arrangement and household size	e 104
5.3.1.1.6 Household income	104
5.3.1.1.7 Food expenditure	105
5.3.1.1.7.1 Food expenditure and ethnicity	y 106
5.3.1.1.8 Educational status of the food preparer	106
5.3.1.1.9 Occupation status of the household	106
5.3.1.2 Vegetable consumption	106
5.3.1.2.1 Age	106
5.3.1.2.2 Gender	107
5.3.1.2.3 Ethnicity of the child	107
5.3.1.2.4 Ethnicity of the food preparer	107
5.3.1.2.5 Housing arrangement	108
5.3.1.2.6 Household size	108
5.3.1.2.7 Household income	108
5.3.1.2.8 Food expenditure	109
5.3.1.2.9 Education status of the food preparer	109
5.3.1.2.10 Occupation status of household	109
5.3.1.3 Consumption of foods rich in protein	109
5.3.1.3.1 Age and gender	110
5.3.1.3.2 Ethnicity of the child	110
5.3.1.3.3 Ethnicity of the food preparer	110
5.3.1.3.4 Household income	110
5.3.1.3.5 Household food expenditure	111
5.3.1.3.6 Education status of the food preparer	111
5.3.1.3.7 Occupation Status of the household	111
5.3.1.4 Cereal (Complex Carbohydrate) consumption	112
5.3.1.4.1 Age and gender	112
5.3.1.4.2 Ethnicity of the child	112
5.3.1.4.3 Ethnicity of the food preparer	112

5.3.1.4.4 Household income	112
5.3.1.4.5 Education status of the food preparer	112
5.3.1.4.6 Occupation status of the household	113
5.3.1.5 Breakfast cereal consumption	113
5.3.1.5.1 Age and gender of child	113
5.3.1.5.2 Ethnicity of child	113
5.3.1.5.3 Ethnicity of the food preparer	113
5.3.1.5.4 Housing arrangement	114
5.3.1.5.5 Household income	114
5.3.1.5.6 Education status	115
5.3.1.6 Bread Consumption	115
5.3.1.6.1 Household food expenditure	115
5.3.1.6.2 Education and occupation status	115
5.3.1.7 Milk products consumption	115
5.3.1.7.1 Age and gender	116
5.3.1.7.2 Ethnicity of the child	116
5.3.1.7.3 Household size	116
5.3.1.7.4 Household income and food expenditure	117
5.3.1.7.5 Education and occupation status	117
5.3.2 Socio-demographic determinants of nutrient intake in children	118
5.3.2.1 Socio-demographic determinants of macronutrient intake	118
5.3.2.1.1 Energy intake	118
5.3.2.1.2 Protein intake	118
5.3.2.1.3 Total fat intake	119
5.3.2.1.4 Carbohydrate intake	119
5.3.2.1.5 Sugar intake	119
5.3.2.1.6 Fibre Intake	120
5.3.2.2 Socio-demographic determinants of micronutrient intake	127
5.3.2.2.1 Iron	127
5.3.2.2.2 Calcium	127
5.3.2.2.3 Folate	127
5.3.2.2.4 Vitamin B12	129
5.3.2.2.5 Vitamin B6	129
5.3.2.2.6 Riboflavin	129

5.3.2.2.7 Thiamin	130
5.3.2.2.8 Niacin	130
5.3.2.2.9 Magnesium	130
5.3.2.2.10 Vitamin E	131
5.3.2.2.11 Vitamin C	131
5.3.2.2.12 Vitamin A	131
5.3.2.2.13 Zinc	132
5.3.2.2.14 Selenium	132
5.3.2.2.15 Phosphorus	132
5.3.3 Socio-demographic determinants of dietary eating patterns	137
5.3.3.1 Takeaways consumption	137
5.3.3.1.1 Ethnicity of the child and their food prepare	r 137
5.3.3.1.2 Household size	138
5.3.3.1.3 Household income and food expenditure	138
5.3.3.1.4 Education and occupation status	139
5.3.3.2 Consumption of food from the school canteen	139
5.3.3.2.1 Ethnicity of the child and food preparer	139
5.3.3.2.2 Household income	140
5.3.3.2.3 Education status of the food preparer	140
5.3.3.3 Purchasing food from the local shops	140
5.3.3.4 Consumption of certain types of foods	140
5.3.3.4.1 Full-fat versus reduced-fat milk	140
5.3.3.4.2 White bread versus wholemeal bread	141
5.4 Socio-demographic determinants of the physical status of children	142
5.4.1 Preschool children	144
5.4.2 School-age children	145
5.5 Socio-demographic determinants of the health status of children	147
5.6 Main findings of the socio-demographic determinants of nutritional	
and health status of children participating in this study	149
5.6.1 Socio-demographic status	149
5.6.2 Dietary intake	149
5.6.2.1 Fruit and vegetable intake	149
5.6.2.2 Protein-rich foods (meat, chicken, beans and lentils)	150
5.6.2.3 Cereals, breads and breakfast cereals	150

5.6.2.4 Milk products (milk, yoghurt and cheese)	151
5.6.3 Nutrient intake	151
5.6.3.1 Energy and protein intake	151
5.6.3.2 Total sugars and fibre intake	151
5.6.3.3 Iron and calcium	151
5.6.3.4 B vitamins Intake	152
5.6.3.5 Vitamin E intake	152
5.6.3.6 Zinc and selenium intake	152
5.6.4 Specific dietary eating patterns	153
5.6.5 Physical and health status	153
5.7 Prevalence of food insecurity	155
5.7.1 Relationship between hunger and insufficient money to buy food	d 155
5.8 Socio-demographic status of food-insecure children	155
5.8.1 Age and gender	156
5.8.2 Ethnicity of the child and their food preparer	156
5.8.3 Housing details	156
5.8.4 Household income	157
5.8.5 Household food expenditure	157
5.8.6 Education and occupation status	157
5.9 Nutritional status of food-insecure children	159
5.9.1 Dietary intake of food-insecure children	159
5.9.1.1 Fruit consumption	159
5.9.1.2 Vegetable consumption	159
5.9.1.3 Consumption of foods rich in protein	160
5.9.1.4 Cereal consumption	160
5.9.1.5 Breakfast cereal consumption	161
5.9.1.6 Bread consumption	162
5.9.1.7 Milk products consumption	162
5.9.2 Nutrient intake of food-insecure children	163
5.9.2.1 Preschool children	163
5.9.2.2 School-age children	163
5.9.2.3 Nutritional adequacy of the diets	167
5.9.3 Dietary habits and eating patterns of food-insecure children	171
5.9.3.1 Consumption of takeaways	171

5.9.3.2 Consumption of food from the school canteen	171
5.9.3.3 Consumption of certain types of foods	172
5.9.3.4 Purchasing of food from local shops	172
5.9.3.5 Consumption of food on the way home from school	173
5.9.3.6 The influence of children on food purchases	173
5.10 Physical and health status of food-insecure children	175
5.11 Main findings of the nutritional status of food-insecure children	
participating in this study	177
5.11.1 Prevalence & socio-demographic determinants of food insecurity	177
5.11.2 Dietary intake of food-insecure	178
5.11.3 Nutrient intake of food-insecure	178
5.11.4 Specific dietary eating patterns of food-insecure	178
5.11.5 Physical and health status of food-insecure	179
Discussion	180
6.1 Socio-demographic status of children	180
6.2 Socio-demographic determinants of nutritional status of children	183
6.2.1 Dietary intake	183
6.2.2 Nutrient intake	186
6.2.3 Specific eating patterns	191
6.3 Socio-demographic determinants of physical and health status	191
6.4 Prevalence of food insecurity	193
6.5 Socio-demographic status of food-insecure children	194
6.6 Nutritional status of food-insecure children	196
6.6.1 Dietary intake	197
6.6.2 Nutrient intake	197
6.6.3 Specific dietary eating patterns	199
6.7 Physical and health status of food-insecure children	200
6.8 Limitations of the study	202
6.9 Recommendations for future research in New Zealand	204
	205
6.10 Successful food security programs	

7 Conclusions

6

210

8	R	eferences	213
9	A	opendices	227
	1	Socio-demographic questionnaire	228
	2	Food group consumption questionnaire	233
	3a	Australian Recommended Dietary Intakes	238
	3b	United Kingdom Dietary Reference Values for Energy and Protein	239
	4	Dietary habits and eating patterns questionnaire	240
	5	Food purchasing decision questionnaire	244
	6	International cut-off points for Body Mass Index	245
	7	Medical history questionnaire	246
	8	Food security questionnaire	247
	9a	a Sugar intake as a percent of energy intake for preschool-children	251
	9b	Sugar intake as a percent of energy intake in school-age children	252
	10) Fibre intake in children	253
	11	Vitamin B12	255
	12	2 Vitamin B6	256
	13	B Riboflavin	257
	14	Thiamin	258
	15	5 Niacin	259
	16	6 Magnesium	260
	17	' Vitamin E	261
	18	3 Vitamin C	262
	19	Vitamin A	263
	20) Zinc	264
	21	Selenium	265
	22	2 Phosphorus	266
	23	Nutrient intake of food-secure and food-insecure preschool	267
	24	Nutrient Intake of food-secure and food-insecure school-age	268

List of Tables

2.1	Hunger items selected for the Radimer/Cornell scale of	
	measuring the severity of hunger and food insecurity	10
2.2	Food insufficiency question	11
2.3	Questions in the Food Security Scale	13
2.4	Percentage of NZ adults considered overweight or obese	31
2.5	Statements 1-8 and corresponding results	52
4.1	Order of interviews and collection of data in the Validation study	79
4.2	Total annual household income (from all sources)	84
4.3	Allocated coding of occupation status of main providers in the	
	Validation study	84
5.1	Numbers of children recruited by ethnic group, age and gender	91
5.2	Percent of children having Maori or Pacific heritage	92
5.3	Physical characteristics of children in the Validation study	92
5.4	The health status of the children	93
5.5	Ethnicity of the food preparer	94
5.6	Educational background of the food preparer and main provider	95
5.7	Employment status of the household	96
5.8	Occupational classification of the household	96
5.9	Main occupation group of the household	96
5.10	Accommodation and household details of the children	98
5.11	Total annual household income from all sources	99
5.12	Ethnicity and income bracket of the food preparer	99
5.13	Household weekly expenditure on food and groceries	100
5.14	Ethnicity of child and fruit consumption	103
5.15	Ethnicity of the food preparer and fruit consumption	103
5.16	The effect of socio-demographic variables on energy intake	121
5.17	The effect of socio-demographic variables on protein intake	122
5.18a	The effect of socio-demographic variables on fat intake as a	
	percent of energy intake in preschoolers	123
5.18b	The effect of socio-demographic variables on fat as a percent	
	of energy intake in school-age children	124
5.19a	The effect of socio-demographic variables on carbohydrate as	
	a percent of energy intake in preschool children	125

5.19b	The effect of socio-demographic variables on carbohydrate as	
	a percent of energy intake in school-age children	126
5.20	The effect of socio-demographic variables on iron intake	134
5.21	The effect of socio-demographic variables on calcium intake	135
5.22	The effect of socio-demographic variables on folate intake	136
5.23	Percentage of overweight and obese preschool and school-age	
	children	142
5.24	Percent of all children considered overweight or obese in each	
	ethnic and gender category	143
5.25	Socio-demographic determinants of body mass index in	
	preschoolers	145
5.26	Socio-demographic determinants of Body Mass Index in	
	school-age children	147
5.27	Occupation status and children taking medication	148
5.28	Ways by which food was obtained by households who did not	
	have enough money to buy food	155
5.29	Food insecurity in the children in this study	156
5.30	Socio-demographic status of food-insecure and food-secure	
	children	158
5.31	The Food Security status of the household and cereal	
	consumption	161
5.32	Selected nutrient intake of food-secure versus food-insecure	
	preschool children	164
5.33	Selected nutrient intake of food-secure versus food-insecure	
	school-age children	165
5.34	Mean contribution of nutrients to daily energy intake and	
	food security status	166
5.35a	Macronutrient and vitamin Intakes as a percent of the Recommen	ded
	Dietary Intakes for food-insecure and food-secure children	169
5.35b	Mineral intakes as a percent of the Recommended Dietary Intakes	S
	for food-insecure and food-secure children	170
5.36	Adult perception of influence of children when buying groceries	175
5.37	Physical and health status of food-insecure and food-secure	
	children	176

List of Figures

5.1	Relationship between fruit helpings and age of child	102
5.2	Number of children in each fruit helping group by age of child	102
5.3	Relationship between fruit helpings and income	104
5.4	Relationship between fruit helpings and amount spent on food per week	
	after controlling for household size	105
5.5	Number of children in each vegetable consumption group by age	107
5.6	Relationship between household income and vegetable helpings	108
5.7	Relationship between household income and consumption of protein	111
5.8	Relationship between household income and helpings of breakfast	
	cereals per day	114
5.9	Number of children in each milk product category	116
5.10	Number of children in each milk product category against number	
	in household	117
5.11	Relationship between calcium intake and education status of the	
	food preparer	128
5.12	Frequency of takeaway consumption by children of different ethnicity	138
5.13	Frequency of eating at school canteen by children of different ethnicity	139
5.14	Relationship between BMI and age for each ethnic group - showing	
	lowess smoother for each ethnic group	143
5.15	Relationship between household income and BMI for preschool children	144
5.16	Relationship between household income and BMI for school-age children	146
5.17	Relationship between income and whether there is not enough money	
	to buy food	157
5.18	Protein foods consumption and food security status	160
5.19	Breakfast cereal consumption and food security status	161
5.20	Milk product consumption and food security status	162
5.21	Frequency of consumption of takeaways with respect to	
	food security status	171
5.22	Frequency of consumption of food from the school canteen with respect to)
	food security status	172
5.23	Percentage of children eating food bought from local shops with respect	
	to food security	173

List of Abbreviations Used

Abbreviation	Full word (s)
ABS	Australian Bureau of Statistics
ADA	American Dietetic Association
AI	Adequate Intake
BMI	Body Mass Index
CDS-PSID	Child Development Supplement of the Panel Study of Income
	Dynamics
CFSM	Core Food Security Measure
CNS	Children's Nutrition Survey
CPS	Census Bureau's Current Population Survey
CSFII	Continuing Survey of Food Intakes by Individuals
CWHS	California Women's Health Survey
DRI	Dietary Reference Intakes
EAR	Estimated Average Requirement
ECLS	Early Childhood Longitudinal Study
FFQ	Food Frequency Questionnaire
FNB	Food and Nutrition Board
LINZ89	1989 Life in New Zealand National Survey
MRC	Medical Research Council
МОН	Ministry of Health
NFCS	Nationwide Food Consumption Survey
NH	National Health
NHANES I, II, III	First, Second and Third National Health and Nutrition
	Examination Survey
NNS95	1995 Australian National Nutrition Survey
NNS97	1997 New Zealand National Nutrition Survey
NZ	New Zealand
NZDep96	NZ Deprivation Index 1996
NZSEI-96	NZ Socio-economic Index 1996
PSC	Pediatric Symptom Checklist
%	percent
RDA	Recommended Dietary Allowance
RDI	Recommended Dietary Intake
RNI	Recommended Nutrient Intake
SES	socio-economic status

Abbreviation	Full word (s)
UK	United Kingdom
UL	Tolerable Upper Intake Level
USA	United States of America
USDA	United States Department of Agriculture