

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

PLANNING AND STATE HOUSING

A Thesis Presented in Partial Fulfilment of the Requirements
for the Degree of Master of Arts in Geography
at Massey University

By

LAWRENCE ROBERT McCALLUM

Massey University

1975

ABSTRACT

Within the framework of the comparison of planning theory and practice, the thesis explores the implications of the statement that the planning process of the Housing Division, Ministry of Works (now part of the Housing Corporation) for its residential subdivisions, is not one based on a theoretically rational model but on a series of ad hoc decisions, framed by current government policy or lack of policy and derived from the accumulated experience of the personnel involved.

Chapter One investigates the theoretical models of the planning process including comprehensive, structure, advocacy and systems-approach planning and theories which are more closely related to the actual practice of organisations and personnel involved in planning and decision-making.

The planning and subdivision development operations of the Housing Division are described in Chapter Two where it is identified that within the planning role there are no formal steps corresponding to a comprehensive-rational model, nor, if the advocacy approach is followed is there evidence of a comprehensive understanding of the wants and desires of the underprivileged populace the Division is housing. Housing Division staff were administered an informal questionnaire on the planning of State house subdivisions which confirmed that a development process aimed at constructing a number of houses within an annual programme is adhered to, rather than a planning process.

The planning and development by the Housing Division of the Sherriff Block, Gisborne, is used as a case study, showing a lack of goal and objective formation and feedback of information and a similarity with an incremental decision-making process.

Chapter Three makes a tentative assessment of a State house

subdivision, namely, the Sherriff Block, Gisborne. Based on a questionnaire of the residents, comparison of the characteristics of the Sherriff Block is made with other research on State housing and some of the factors affecting satisfaction with living in the Block are presented. Housing, shopping, educational and recreational facilities are examined and the process of residential development is outlined.

The conclusion further defines problem areas in State housing, notes recent developments and suggests greater use of structured planning units and the adoption of a comprehensive-rational planning process.

PREFACE

Planning is one of the newer affiliations with geography and recent years have seen a strong movement of people trained in geography, into the planning profession and into educational institutions teaching planning. The study of urban and rural planning is a logical progression from the analysis of geographic relationships, (i.e. after studying the inter-related past and present functioning of natural and cultural phenomena within an areal framework the matter of the control and improved functioning of land uses and activities is a logical step). The geography of an area forms a basis of its planning and geographic factors of importance to the theme, have been included in this thesis.

This thesis commenced with the intention of comparing the activities of the Housing Division, Ministry of Works, with the theoretical planning process. As initial investigation work proceeded, the difficulties involved in such a comparison became apparent with the main problems being:

1. the diversity of conceptions of the planning process;
2. the fact that the Housing Division had a development process rather than a planning process.

Despite these difficulties, the comparison of theory and practice is regarded as a worthy one in that the review of planning operations against some standard is an integral part of most modern planning theory.

Since writing the greater part of this thesis, the Housing Division has been made part of the recently formed Housing Corporation, however, the present tense is still used when referring to the Housing Division.

Within the framework of the comparison of planning theory and practice, this thesis then explores the implications of the

statement that the planning process of the Housing Division, Ministry of Works for its residential subdivision, is not one based on a theoretically rational model but on a series of ad hoc decisions, framed by current government policy or lack of policy and derived from the accumulated experience of the personnel involved.

This study falls into four parts:

1. An investigation of the theoretical models of the planning process;
2. A comparison of appropriate models of the planning process with the planning operations of the Housing Division, using the planning and development of the Sherriff Block, Gisborne, as a detailed example;
3. A tentative assessment of the planning of the Sherriff Block with reference to the wider operations of the Housing Division and local authority planning where applicable;
4. Conclusion.

The main research techniques used are the informal and formal questionnaire, the computer tabulation of the results of the formal questionnaire and the review of literature on the theory of planning, State housing, the Housing Division and government involvement in housing, residential development and planning and the social geography of new urban areas. Time spent after the field work in the Sherriff Block as the Assistant Town Planning Officer with the Gisborne City Council has proved invaluable in clarifying many issues and in placing State housing and the Sherriff Block within the wider perspective of urban planning.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I would like to acknowledge the assistance and encouragement of my Supervisor, Mr B.G.R. Saunders and the guidance with the Sherriff Block questionnaire and the related computer work of my temporary Supervisor Mr P. Morrison (while Mr Saunders was overseas). I would also like to acknowledge the following people and organisations for their helpful co-operation: the Housing Division, Ministry of Works, for access to and use of files and plans; those staff of the Housing Division, Ministry of Works, State Advances Corporation and Maori and Island Affairs who participated in the informal interviews and discussions, in particular Mr F. Robinson and Mr C. Bonnington, Housing Division, Ministry of Works, Palmerston North; the residents of the Sherriff Block; Mr F. Williams, Headmaster, Waikirikiri Primary School; Mr W. S. Ballantyne, Town Planning Officer, Gisborne City Council; the Gisborne City Council; Kandid Kamera Kraft Ltd., Gisborne for Plate I; New Zealand Aerial Mapping for Plate II; Aerial Surveys Ltd for Plate III; Mr P. Trask for Plates IV to VII and for mounting the photographs in this thesis; Mrs E. Kirton for typing and Mrs B. McCallum for duplicating this thesis.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
ABSTRACT	ii
PREFACE	iv
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	vi
CHAPTER ONE: The Planning Process - Theory and Counter Theory	1
Comprehensive Planning	3
Structure Planning	4
Advocacy Planning	7
Systems Approach Planning	8
Descriptive Theories	14
CHAPTER TWO: Planning and State Housing	16
The Operations of the Housing Division	16
Internal View of the Housing Division's Activities	21
Case Study: Sherriff Block, Gisborne	28
The Setting	28
The Planning and Development	31
The Housing Division and the Planning Process	42
CHAPTER THREE: Assessment of the Planning of a State House Subdivision	48
Comparison of Sherriff Block with Research on State Housing	48
Some Factors Affecting Satisfaction with Living in the Sherriff Block	52
Housing	54
Shopping	58
Education, Community and Recreation Facilities	59
Residential Development	63
CHAPTER FOUR: Conclusion	66
Recent Developments in State Housing	66
Structured Planning Units	68
Implications	71
APPENDIX A: Questionnaire on State Housing Subdivision Planning Administered to Ministry of Works, Housing Division Staff	73
APPENDIX B: Housing Division Planning Principles	75
APPENDIX C: Housing Division Land Planning and Engineering Report Forms	77
APPENDIX D: Questionnaire of Sherriff Block Residents	81
APPENDIX E: Demographic, Social and Economic Background Data on Residents of the Sherriff Block	90
BIBLIOGRAPHY	102

LIST OF TABLES

Page

TABLE

I	House Construction	29
II	Residents Attitudes towards the Sherriff Block and Takaro	52
III	Characteristics of Heads of Households with Greater Than Total Proportions, Disliking or Liking Living in the Sherriff Block	53
IV	Residents Opinions of House and Section Size	55
V	Residents Attitudes on Education, Community and Recreation Facilities Serving the Sherriff Block	60
VI	Response to Sherriff Block Questionnaire	81
VII	Comparison of Housing Administrative Breakdown	90
VIII	Marital Status of Household Heads	93
IX	Sex of Household Heads	93
X	Length of Time Married	94
XI	Ethnic Group of Household Heads and Wives	94
XII	Secondary School Education of Household Heads and Wives	94
XIII	Further Education of Household Heads	95
XIV	Numbers Living in Households	95
XV	Numbers of Children Living in Households	96
XVI	Households Lacking Appliances and Motor Vehicles	96
XVII	Turnover of Households	97
XVIII	Length of Residence	97
XIX	Location of Residence Before Moving to the Sherriff Block	98
XX	Type of Accommodation Before Moving to the Sherriff Block	98
XXI	Previous Accommodation Shared with Other Families	99
XXII	Comparison Between Past and Present Accommodation	99
XXIII	Plans by Households to Leave the Sherriff Block	99
XXIV	Employment of Household Heads	100
XXV	Location of Work of Household Heads	100
XXVI	Socio-Economic Indexing of Occupations	101
XXVII	Employment of Wives	101

LIST OF FIGURES

Page

FIGURE

1	Auckland Regional Authority Planning Process	2
2	Structure Planning, A Sub-Regional Plan Making Process Example	6
3	An Early Systems Approach to Planning	9
4	A Rational Model of Systemic Planning derived from Scientific Method	13
5	Sherriff Block, Pattern of Subdivision and Ownership before Ministry of Works Development	32
6	Sherriff Block, Scheme Plans A, B and C.	35
7	Sherriff Block, Scheme Plans D and E	36
8	Sherriff Block, Occupation of Housing	38
9	Outer Kaiti Suburb, Gisborne 1972	43
10	Age/Sex Structures	50
11	Sherriff Block Housing Administration	91

LIST OF PLATES

PLATE

I	Outer Kaiti, Gisborne 1972	30
II	Sherriff Block area, November 1958	33
III	Sherriff Block area, May 1967	41
IV	Two-storey semi-detached housing overlooking triangular recreation reserve.	57
V	Specimen trees retained through judicious cul-de-sac design	57
VI	Temporary recreation area for Sherriff Block	62
VII	Detached State Houses	62