

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

**Exploring The Relationship Between Development And
Disasters: Bir Hospital As A Microcosm Of This
Relationship**

**A thesis presented in partial fulfillment of the
requirements for the degree of**

**Masters of Philosophy
In
Development Studies**

**At Massey University, Palmerston North
New Zealand**

Robert Patton

2001

Acknowledgements

Completing a Masters Thesis while working full-time, changing employment and country of residence provides many challenges along the way. I could not have done it on my own. Over the two-year period during which this thesis was researched, fieldwork completed and the results documented many people assisted me. In particular I would like to acknowledge the following people:

First and foremost are my wife Carol and my two teenage children, Kathryn and James, who have not seen a lot of me at times as I have been hunched over a pile of books and a computer

My current employer, Adventist Development and Relief Agency, and in particular my colleagues in the Jakarta Country Office who have given study leave to assist with the final frantic moments to complete the thesis

Sharen Paine, my past Manager who gave support and guidance in the beginning stages of this thesis

The uncomplaining Librarians in the libraries at Tauranga and Whakatane Hospitals who processed my many requests for interloan books and copies of journal articles held in New Zealand and overseas libraries

Ben Thomas, colleague and friend, who I have been able to explore ideas with and who worked alongside me in Nepal as the fieldwork was completed

The Board of Directors at Bir Hospital, Kathmandu, who saw the potential value in the project for Bir Hospital and gave their approval for the fieldwork to be conducted at Bir Hospital

Dr. Ram Shresta, Director of Bir Hospital, who gave complete support and facilitated unrestricted access to Bir Hospital

Amod Dixit and Mahesh Nakarmi of National Society for Earthquake Technology (NSET) Nepal for their liaison and organization before, during and after my visit to Nepal to ensure that I was able to maximize my time

Rinu Basnet and Ramesh Guragain, NSET Nepal engineers who ably advised and assisted with the vulnerability assessment of the buildings which comprise Bir Hospital

Frank Begley, Kevin McEntee and Joan Taylor, colleagues at Tauranga Hospital who willingly gave of their time and resources to fund raise to assist me with the expenses of traveling to Nepal to conduct the vulnerability assessment at Bir Hospital

Willis Group, the Risk Management company for whom Ben Thomas works, who fully sponsored Ben's travel to Kathmandu

Barbara Nowak, Massey University who gave direction and guidance in the establishing stages and set the parameters for the final document

And last, but not least, my sister Lynn who has kept me 'fed and watered' during the last three months when many hours and days were spent in virtual isolation whilst working on the final document.

Contents

Chapter		Page No.
	Title page	i
	Abstract	ii
	Acknowledgements	iii
	Table of Contents	v
	List of Illustrations, tables, diagrams and photographs	viii
1	Introduction to the Project	1
	1.1 Identification of the problem	1
	1.2 Key disaster-related definitions	1
	1.3 The relationship between disaster and development	3
	1.4 The Kathmandu Valley Earthquake Risk Management (KVERM) Project	5
	1.5 The outcome of the KVERM project	6
	1.6 The Bir Hospital Project	7
2	Baseline Principles	10
	2.1 Overview of the chapter	10
	2.2 The Disaster Management Cycle	10
	2.3 Mitigation phase	10
	2.4 Preparedness phase	11
	2.5 Response and recovery	17
	2.6 The Risk Management Process	18
	2.7 The SMUG Risk Prioritisation Model	20
	2.8 Measuring the size of an earthquake	22
	2.9 The relationship of development to the disaster and risk management cycles	23
3	Lessons Learnt From Elsewhere	28
	3.1 Overview of the chapter	28
	3.2 The impact of disasters on hospitals reported in the literature	28
	3.3 Lessons learned and subsequent recommendations from Hurricanes Georges and Mitch	32
	3.4 Health related lessons from the Gujarat earthquake	39
4	Bir Hospital Project Design and Methodology	44
	4.1 Overview of the chapter	44
	4.2 Proposal and approval for the Bir Hospital Project	45
	4.3 Vulnerability Assessment Tool	46
	4.4 Building the capacity of local staff	48
	4.5 Data Collection	48
	4.6 Data Recording	49

	4.7	Change to the design of the project	50
5		The Results of the Bir Hospital Project	52
	5.1	Overview of the chapter	52
	5.2	Description of Bir Hospital	52
	5.3	Electricity supply system assessment	54
	5.4	Water supply assessment	57
	5.5	Sewerage system assessment	58
	5.6	Steam supply assessment	58
	5.7	Communication system assessment	59
	5.8	Medical gases assessment	60
	5.9	Energy gas assessment	61
	5.10	Air-conditioning assessment	61
	5.11	Lift assessment	62
	5.12	Equipment and plant assessment	62
	5.13	Building structure assessment	62
	5.14	Departmental assessment	64
	5.15	Visit to outside agencies	65
	5.16	Proposed Trauma Centre	67
	5.17	Review of mass casualty disaster response plan	68
6		Implications of the Bir Hospital Project Results and Subsequent Recommendations	75
	6.1	Overview of the chapter	75
	6.2	Recommendations for electricity supply system	76
	6.3	Recommendations for water supply	77
	6.4	Recommendations for sewerage system	79
	6.5	Recommendations for steam supply	79
	6.6	Recommendations for communication system	80
	6.7	Recommendations for medical gases	80
	6.8	Recommendations for energy gas	81
	6.9	Recommendations for air-conditioning units	81
	6.10	Recommendations for lifts	82
	6.11	Recommendations for equipment and plant	82
	6.12	Building structure recommendations	83
	6.13	Departmental recommendations	84
	6.14	Outside Agency recommendations	85
	6.15	Recommendations for the new Trauma Centre	85
	6.16	Recommendations for the Mass Casualty Disaster Response Plan	87
7		Needs Assessment Model Presented	92
	7.1	Overview of the chapter	92
	7.2	Situation and needs assessment	92
	7.3	Needs assessment model explained	95
	7.4	Needs, demands and supplies model	97
8		Conclusion and Evaluation	100
	8.1	Overview of the chapter	100
	8.2	Summary of the relationship between development and	

	disasters	100
8.3	Bir Hospital as a Microcosm of the Relationship Between Development and Disaster	102
8.4	Evaluation of the Bir Hospital Project	108
Appendices		
Appendix A	Bir Hospital Project Proposal	111
Appendix B	Framework for Vulnerability Assessment of Bir Hospital	119
Appendix C	Departmental Questionnaire	120
Appendix D	Departmental Dependency Grid	121
Appendix E	Situation and Needs Assessment Guide	122
Appendix F	Action Plan for Bir Hospital	130
Appendix G	Photos	134
References and Bibliography		140

List of Illustrations, Tables, Diagrams and Photographs,

	Description	Page No.
Figures		
Fig. 1	Modified Mercalli Intensity Scale adapted for the Nepali environment	27
Fig 2	Needs Assessment Model	94
Fig. 3	The domains of needs, demands and supplies	98
Fig. 4	The relationships between the domains of needs, demands and supplies	98
Tables		
Table 1	Definitions for terms used in the SMUG Prioritisation Model	20
Table 2	Score for each criteria used in the SMUG Prioritisation Model	21
Table 3	Modified Mercalli Scale	24
Table 4	Key departments dependency grid	66
Photographs		
Photo 1	The outside of Rapar Civil Hospital	134
Photo 2	The entrance foyer of Rapar Civil Hospital	134
Photo 3	Rapar Civil Hospital was evacuated to a nearby children's playground	135
Photo 4	Bir Hospital Central Block Transformer with failure of cable insulation	135
Photo 5	Accumulations of dirt impede the ability of the transformer and cable to lose heat and poses a fire hazard	136
Photo 6	The outside of the New Building, Bir Hospital	136
Photo 7	Severe spalling on the outside of the Surgical (Old) Building, Bir Hospital	137
Photo 8	A service duct is examined. Evidence of major water leaks in the service duct	137
Photo 9	Seismic joint at Tribhuvan University Teaching Hospital, Kathmandu	138
Photo 10	Unrestrained equipment in the laboratory, Bir Hospital	138
Photo 11	Unrestrained shelving with supplies on open shelves, Bir Hospital	139
Photo 12	Electrical wiring and switch board in a patient-care area, Bir Hospital	139