

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

# AN AGE OF CONSENT

Press representations of endemic sexual abuse of  
young girls by Pitcairn Island men

A thesis presented in partial  
fulfilment of the requirements for the degree  
of

Master of Arts  
in  
Women's Studies

at Massey University, Palmerston North,  
New Zealand.

Vivien Ruth Robison

2004

## Abstract

This thesis is an analysis of press representations of Pitcairn Island women's complaints of child sexual abuse by the island's men. Press constructions of the case provide an opportunity to analyse how western society represents the alleged endemic sexual abuse of young Pitcairn girls by family and family friends. A database of 93 press reports draws on British, New Zealand and Australian newspapers and includes reports from the first mention of criminal charges in March 2001 until most of the charges had been laid against offenders in July 2003.

A dual research method combines a chronological content analysis of the whole database with a detailed discourse analysis of two reports to examine how discursive strategies categorised, minimised and normalised the Pitcairn crimes. Representations of familial/familiar sexual abuse in the Pitcairn case do not fit with stereotypical constructions of child sexual abuse as 'psychopathic' violence and 'paedophilic' stranger-danger.

This thesis shows that the press diffused the issue as one of cultural, rather than sexual, consent in order not to have to explain the contradiction-in-terms that is endemic familial/familiar sexual abuse of young girls in a respectable community. Cultural relativism undermines the credibility of the women complainants. The thesis argument is that the press finds the issue of familial/familiar sexual abuse of girls younger than 12 years of age, which is the most prevalent category of sexual abuse in society, difficult to represent.

## Acknowledgements

The completion of any goal is a function of complex intersecting factors. Many people and groups have contributed to this thesis.

I thank my supervisors, Avril Bell and Lesley Patterson, for their knowledge, skills and insights that were delivered thoughtfully and with patience during the conceptualisation, development and the fruition of this work. I am also grateful for the financial support and encouragement extended to me by Massey University in the form of a Masterate Scholarship and a School Research Grant. This thesis builds upon the hard-won discipline that is academic Women's Studies at Massey University. Thank you Cathy Bray and Jenny Coleman, in particular.

Motivation came from my children in countless ways. Thank you Kester and Shelley for what you have taught me, and for demonstrating what could be accomplished through academic channels.

I thank some special friends including: Averil Duff who went more than the extra mile; Lesley Findlay in Massey University's Extramural library; Gordon Hitch for his technical support; and Lindsay Olney for empathy, proofreading skills and longer-term perspectives.

However, this thesis would have been much more laborious without my partner of 34 years who proved to be an able amanuensis during this project.

To all of you, and especially Kit, please accept my gratitude and appreciation.

---

## Table of Contents

Abstract.....	ii
Acknowledgements.....	iii
Table of Contents.....	iv
List of Tables .....	vi
Chapter One: Representing the Pitcairn Case .....	1
1.1 Introduction.....	1
1.2 The Pitcairners .....	3
1.3 Defining the issue .....	5
1.4 Thesis overview .....	9
Chapter Two: Representations of Familial Sexual Abuse: A Literature Review.....	11
2.1 Introduction.....	11
2.2 Myths and theories of child sexual abuse .....	12
2.3 Legal categorisation and the prevalence of familial abuse .....	15
2.4 Media minimisation of familial abuse .....	21
2.5 The ‘experience’ versus the normative discourse of familial abuse .....	22
2.6 Conclusion .....	25
Chapter Three: Thesis Materials and Methods .....	27
3.1 Introduction.....	27
3.2 Beginning the research.....	29
3.3 Collecting the database .....	29
3.4 The ‘long soak’ .....	33
3.5 The content and discourse analyses .....	35
3.6 Conclusion .....	39

---

Chapter Four: Identifying Discourses of Blame and Consent: A Content Analysis ..	40
4.1 Introduction.....	40
4.2 What is the crime? Categorising blame and consent .....	41
4.3 Who is blamed? Minimising the offender blame.....	49
4.4 Normalising a local age of consent .....	55
4.5 Conclusion .....	63
Chapter Five: Distinguishing and Diffusing the Age of Consent: A Discourse Analysis .....	66
5.1 Introduction.....	66
5.2 How <i>The Times</i> constructed the Pitcairn case.....	67
5.3 How the <i>Weekend Herald</i> constructed the Pitcairn case.....	72
5.4 Conclusion .....	81
Chapter Six: Endemic Familial/Familiar Sexual Abuse of Young Girls .....	85
6.1 Introduction.....	85
6.2 What is missing from the press discourse?.....	86
6.32 Conclusion. An age of consent .....	93
Appendix One: Database of 93 press reports of the Pitcairn case .....	97
Appendix Two: D’Antal, Stephen (2001, May 9). ‘That’s what girls are for’. <i>The     Times</i> , pp. 2-3 (report 9).....	104
Appendix Three: Watkin, Tim, (2002, August 24-25). Lonely island weathering a storm. <i>Weekend Herald</i> , pp. B7-B8 (report 38) .....	109
References .....	114

---

## List of Tables

Table 2.1: Number of convictions for various sex offences, by age and gender of the victim, 2001 .....	18
Table 3.1: Summarising the changing representations in press reporting of the Pitcairn case. ....	32
Table 4.1(a): Coding the phrases used to categorise the Pitcairn crimes.....	43
Table 4.1(b): The phrase most frequently used in each report to describe child sexual abuse .....	46
Table 4.2(a): Who is blamed? Examples from the database of press reports.....	50
Table 4.2(b): Minimising offender blame by spreading the blame.....	53
Table 4.3(a): Press representations of consent and the ages of the victims. ....	56
Table 4.3(b): Was there consent? The local age of consent .....	59