

**A PROVISIONAL ASSESSMENT OF RISK ASSOCIATED
WITH HEAVY METAL ACCUMULATION IN NEW
ZEALAND AGRICULTURAL SOIL**

*Effects of landfarming and fertiliser use on the heavy metal
concentration in plants*

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

Masters of Environmental Management (without major) at Massey
University, Manawatu, New Zealand

CHIOMA MARYANN OKAFOR

2016



MASSEY UNIVERSITY

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

Abstract

This study investigated heavy metal accumulation in New Zealand agricultural soil (horticultural soil and landfarm-impacted soil), factors influencing their concentration in leafy vegetables and pasture, and the potential implications to food safety, animal welfare and human welfare. The study also sought to verify the hypothesis that “landfarming poses no threat to pasture and animal welfare” with respect to heavy metal accumulation. In addition, hemp phytoremediation potential was also explored for landfarm-impacted soil.

This study is a synthesis of two glasshouse trials that have, as a common denominator, heavy metal accumulation in New Zealand agricultural soil. The first project assessed cadmium accumulation in leafy vegetables (spinach, silverbeet and lettuce) grown on two New Zealand commercial horticultural soils while the second project focused on heavy metal accumulation in pasture (ryegrass) and a cash crop (hemp) grown on agricultural soil that had been amended with drilling waste. Bulk composite soil samples used for this glasshouse trial were collected from commercial horticultural farms in two locations (Pukekohe and Gisborne), while a landfarm-impacted soil and drilling waste from oil exploration and production sites was collected from the Taranaki region. Soil samples were crushed and potted into replicate pots containing (4kg). Lettuce, spinach and silverbeet were seeded in horticultural soils while ryegrass and hemp were seeded in impacted soils. All soil and plant samples were harvested and taken to the Soil and Earth Science laboratory, Massey University Palmerston North for analysis of heavy metal concentration (Cd, Zn, Cu and Ni) and dehydrogenase activity. Descriptive statistics and ANOVA of means was conducted using Minitab 17.

The total Cd concentration in the Pukekohe soil was 0.26 mg Cd/kg soil and that in the Gisborne soil 0.11 mg Cd/kg. The Cd, Cu, Ni and Zn concentration in the landfarm-impacted soil was 0.1 mg Cd/kg; 12.57 mg Cu/kg; below detection limit (BDL) for Ni and 29.99 mg Zn/kg respectively. These values were not significantly different to concentrations in an adjacent control soil collected at the same time for the pot experiment (0.1 mg Cd/kg, 11.5 mg Cu/kg, 29.14 mg Zn/kg, and Ni (BDL)). The Cd concentration in all leafy vegetables grown on the horticultural soil and sampled at two time points (spinach, silverbeet and lettuce) exceeded tolerable limits for Cd in agronomic crops (0.05 - 0.5 mg Cd/kg) with the exception of lettuce (in Pukekohe and Gisborne soil at final stage) and silverbeet (in Pukekohe soil at final stage). Spinach showed elevated Cd accumulation (0.27 mg/kg FW) above CODEX (2010) and FSANZ (2011) limits for the Gisborne soil. The heavy metal concentration (Cd, Zn, Ni and Cu) in hemp and ryegrass grown on the landfarm-impacted soil and control were not significantly different but within tolerable limits in agronomic crops (Cu: 5 – 20 mg/kg; Zn: 50 – 100 mg/kg; Ni: 1- 10 mg/kg). Soil pH is the dominant factor influencing metal bioavailability while organic matter content, and oxalate extractable Al and Fe oxide content (sesquioxides) also affects cadmium bioavailability in agricultural soils.

There was no evidence of a heavy metal (Zn, Ni, Cu and Cd) concentration above soil limits defined for the safe application of biosolids in horticultural and landfarm-impacted soils. This suggests that animal wellbeing (via soil ingestion) and food safety will not be affected as a result of land application of drilling waste and long history of P fertiliser use. However, cadmium and heavy metal management is necessary to prevent elevated accumulation over time. Elevated Cd concentration in spinach does not pose direct threat to human consumers but has the potential to limit the accessibility of this product in export markets.

A soil heavy metal concentration below biosolids guidelines in the landfarm-impacted soil implies that remediation of this land is not necessary. This observation was supported by data on soil microbial activity in the landfarm-impacted soil which showed no difference from the control soil. The data does not support the public perception and industry concerns that heavy metal accumulation in landfarm-impacted soil poses a health risk. In case of a continued halt in milk collection from landfarm-impacted sites by the dairy industries, a cash crop (hemp) with no exposure pathway and high biomass quality (under landfarm-impacted soil) that potentially has high economic value could replace the traditionally ryegrass system, changing the agricultural land use from a food one to a non-food one.

Acknowledgement

Words cannot express how grateful I am to God almighty for blessing me with this great opportunity to study in a prestigious University of New Zealand, Massey. I am deeply thankful to New Zealand Agency for International Development (NZ Aid) scholarship for this special award to study for my Master's degree and their immeasurable support throughout the process. I am also grateful to Palmerston North City Council for awarding me the best cultural contribution in student city art and cultural award 2015.

I am very appreciative and with great respect for my supervisor Associate Professor Christopher W.N Anderson for his support, patience, guidance and source of great intellectual ability that supported the successful completion of two-industry project that informed this thesis. I am ever grateful to him for believing in me and for providing a great learning platform. And to my co-supervisor Associate Professor Bob Stewart, for his scientific input and support. I would also wish to thank my co-supervisor Dr. Paramsothy Jeyakumar (Jeya) for his support, critical eye and encouragement throughout this research.

It is indeed my pleasure to express my heartfelt gratitude to my Head of Department, Professor John Holland, for encouraging my research choice and recommending me to a well suited supervisor. To my lecturer, Dr. Karen Hytten for your excellent support, guidance, advice and patience throughout my study and in course selection.

I am thankful to all staff of soil and earth science group, ecology and environmental management group for their unconditional support and assistance through every step of my study and research.

I am grateful to my ever loving fiancé, Igwenagu Sochukwuma Lawrence for his support and ensuring my psychological balance throughout my study. I love you my darling.

I am also grateful to my parents Mr and Mrs Peter Okafor, my twin sister (Okafor Chibuzo M) and siblings for always checking up on me and ensuring I maintain a balance throughout my study.

Words are not enough to express my deepest appreciation to International student support office team; Jamie Hooper, Sylvia Hooker, Dave Broderick and others for your unconditional support system throughout my study at Massey. I am also grateful to Accommodation service team and managers: Koli Sewabu, Gerald Lologa, Amy Lavini, Brooke Hopkins, Rebecca Price and other team members for their assistance. I greatly appreciate you all.

I am indeed thankful to African Students Club, my friends; Jonathan Iduh, Kevin Enongene, Grace Ehoche, Obianwuna Uche, Geneva, Chibuike Grace and Dr (Mrs) Doris F. Adeyinka, Mr and Mrs Romuald Rudzki, Mrs Anne Odogwu and others from St Peters Catholic Church (Cathedral of the Holy spirit) for making New Zealand a home away from home.

My gratitude also goes to my mentors, Prof Victor Chude, Mrs Ifeyinwa Okpara, Surveyor David Odegbare and Mrs Comfort Asokoro-Ogaji for setting a standard and guiding me through a successful career path.

Table of contents

Table of Contents

Abstract	ii
Acknowledgement.....	v
Table of contents	vii
List of illustrations	xiii
Chapter 1 : Introduction	1
1.1. Problem Statement	4
1.2. Research aim	7
1.3. Objectives	8
1.4. Importance of this research	9
1.5. Report Outline	9
Chapter 2 : Literature Review	11
2.1. Introduction	11
2.2. Metals of concern in New Zealand agricultural soil	11
2.2.1. Cadmium.....	11
2.2.2. Other metals of concern.....	13
2.3. Risk of heavy metals accumulation in agricultural soil	16
2.3.1. Risk of heavy metals on food safety standards, trade and human health	17
2.3.2. Risk of heavy metals on ecological receptors.....	22
2.4. Heavy metal sources of concern in New Zealand	27

2.4.1. Heavy metal associated with phosphate fertiliser use	27
2.4.2. Heavy metals associated with landfarming activities	28
2.4.3. Heavy metals associated with the use of agrichemicals on horticultural soil	35
2.4.4. Heavy metals associated with land application of biosolids	36
2.5. Factors influencing heavy metal accumulation in soil	36
2.5.1. Heavy metal characteristics	36
2.5.2. Soil characteristics	37
2.5.3. Plant characteristics	39
2.5.4. Rate of phosphate fertiliser application	40
2.5.5. Tillage effects	40
2.6. Heavy metal management in New Zealand.....	41
2.6.1. New Zealand soil quality and food safety guidelines	43
2.6.2. Cadmium regulation in New Zealand.....	44
Chapter 3 : Methodology	51
3.1. Introduction	51
3.2. Study area and sample description	51
3.2.1. Soil sample description.....	51
3.2.2. Plant description	52
3.2.3. Experimental design and glasshouse trial.....	53
3.2.4. Plant harvest and soil sampling	54
3.3. Laboratory analysis	59
3.3.1. Sample preparation	59

3.3.2. Acid digestion	60
3.3.3. Soil extraction	60
3.3.4. Elemental analysis	60
3.3.5. Dehydrogenase activity.....	61
3.3.6. Quality control	62
3.3.7. Soil fertility parameters	62
3.4. Statistical analysis	62
Chapter 4 : Results	64
4.1. Introduction	64
4.2. Physical and Chemical properties of all soil samples	64
4.2.1. Horticultural soils	64
4.2.2. Impacted soil treatments	65
4.3. Heavy metal accumulation in horticultural soils.....	68
4.3.1. Total cadmium concentration in Pukekohe and Gisborne soil	68
4.3.2. Comparison of total cadmium concentration in Pukekohe and Gisborne soil	68
4.3.3. Extractable Soil Cadmium in Horticultural soils.....	69
4.3.4. Soil reactions influencing Cd Concentration	70
4.4. Heavy metal concentration in impacted agricultural soil	72
4.4.1. Heavy metal concentration in landfarm-impacted soil	72
4.4.2. Heavy metal concentration in control soil	73
4.4.3. Heavy metal concentration in 100% drilling waste	73

4.4.4. Heavy metal accumulation in 50:50 mix of drilling waste/control soil.....	73
4.4.5. Comparison of heavy metal concentration across all soil treatments.....	75
4.4.6. Soil reaction influencing heavy metal behaviour in impacted soil.....	76
4.5. Heavy metal concentration in leafy vegetables in horticultural soil at different growth stages.....	77
4.5.1. Cadmium concentration in leafy vegetables in Pukekohe soil	77
4.5.2. Cadmium concentration in leafy vegetables in Gisborne soil	78
4.5.3. Comparison of cadmium uptake in Pukekohe and Gisborne soil.....	79
4.5.4. Plant Zinc concentration in Pukekohe and Gisborne soil.....	81
4.6. Heavy metal concentration in hemp and ryegrass (pasture) in impacted agricultural soil.....	84
4.6.1. Heavy metal concentration in hemp and ryegrass in 50:50mix of drilling waste/control soil.....	84
4.6.2. Heavy metal concentration in hemp and ryegrass in 100% drilling waste....	84
4.6.3. Heavy metal concentration in hemp and ryegrass in landfarm-impacted soil	84
4.6.4. Heavy metal concentration in hemp and ryegrass in control soil.....	85
4.6.5. Comparison of heavy metal concentration in hemp in landfarm-impacted soil and control soil	87
4.6.6. Comparison of heavy metal concentration in ryegrass on landfarm-impacted soil and control soil.....	87
4.7. Microbial activity in impacted agricultural soil	88

4.7.1. Comparison of microbial activity across all soil samples.....	89
Chapter 5 : Discussion	91
5.1. Introduction	91
5.2. Heavy metal concentration in plants and agricultural soils relative to risk-based guidelines.....	91
5.2.1. Horticultural.....	91
5.2.2. Impacted soil.....	93
5.3. Influence of soil reaction on heavy metal concentration in plants	94
5.3.1. Cd/Zn effects.....	94
5.3.2. Oxalate extractable Al and Fe.....	95
5.4. Soil properties influencing heavy metal concentration in soil and plant in New Zealand	96
5.4.1. Soil pH and Organic matter	96
5.4.2. CEC, Extractable cations & Base Saturation.....	97
5.4.3. Soil Olsen P level.....	99
5.5. Potential of hemp for phytoremediation.....	99
5.5.1. Influence of land application of drilling waste to soil microbial activity	103
Chapter 6 : Conclusion and Recommendations	104
6.1. Context	104
6.2. Conclusion and Future research	104
References	109
Appendix 1: Cadmium concentration of phosphate rocks	122

Appendix 2: Cadmium Management Strategy..... 124

Appendix 3: Trace elements in New Zealand soils..... 126

Appendix 4: Minimum levels of contaminants in food 128

Appendix 5: Hierarchy of soil guideline documents used in TFSM trigger value
formulation..... 129

List of illustrations

List of Tables

1:	Ranges of Heavy metals in New Zealand farmed (pastoral) and non-farmed soils at 0 – 100mm.	15
2:	Impact of heavy metals on human health	18
3:	CODEX guideline for consumer food protection	21
4:	Tolerable limits of contaminants in consumer food for the protection of public health, safety and trade	22
5:	Soil guideline values developed for the protection of ecological receptors from cadmium contamination in New Zealand	23
6:	Comparing natural background level of dehydrogenase activity in different land use types.....	25
7:	Dehydrogenase activity (DHA) in landfarming and control pots over time.....	26
8:	Implemented MPC of Cadmium in P fertilizer in New Zealand	28
9:	Elemental composition of water based fluid (WBF) and oil based fluid (OBF) of a drilling mud waste from two oil exploration sites in Nigeria.....	30
10:	Some heavy metal concentration of WBF (drilling mud).	31
11:	Heavy metal concentrations in mixed-pasture from three sites in Taranaki collected on 5th August 2013.....	33
12:	Metal accumulation in ryegrass cultivated in clean and land applied with drilling mud waste soil after 12months of landfarming.....	34
13:	Comparison of heavy metal concentration (mg/kg) in a typical New Zealand pastoral soil and non-farmed soils (0 - 100mm) and the soils	

(0-75mm)	of	three	Taranaki	
sites.....				35
14:	Soil factors influencing cadmium bioavailability and plant uptake			38
15:	Suggested soil quality guidelines for safe application of oil and gas waste to land.....			44
16:	Tiered Fertilizer Management System and Trigger values			48
17:	TFMS Implementation process			49
18:	Drilling waste origin and description			52
19:	Physical and chemical Characteristics of horticultural and drilling waste impacted soil samples from different locations in New Zealand.....			67
20:	Mean (and standard deviation) cadmium and zinc concentration in two different New Zealand commercial horticultural soils.....			68
21:	Heavy metal concentration on landfarm-impacted agricultural soil			74
22:	Mean cadmium and zinc concentration in leafy vegetables in two New Zealand horticultural soils (at different stages)			83
23:	Heavy metal concentration in Hemp and Ryegrass plants grown on all treatments applied.....			86
24:	Microbial activity (DHA) in impacted agricultural soil			88
25:	Heavy metal uptake by hemp and hemp biomass in all impacted agricultural soil samples.....			10

A 1: Cadmium concentration in different P fertiliser sources used in New Zealand.....	122
A 2 : Core areas of Cadmium Management Strategy in New Zealand	124
A 3: Trace elements (mg/kg) in (a) Auckland soil, (b) Waikato soil and (c) Tasman Soil	126
A 4: Criteria to be considered in determining minimum levels of contaminants in food.....	128
A 5: Hierarchy of documents containing soil guideline values ^a	129

List of Figures

1: Major exposure pathways of heavy metals in agricultural soil	17
2: Different plant response at stage one.....	55
3: Plant response image at final stage.....	56
4: Hemp (right end column), ryegrass (middle column) and control (without plant - left end column) response on control soil.....	57
5: Hemp (right end column), ryegrass (middle column) and control (without plant – left end column) on landfarm-impacted soil.....	58
6: Hemp (right end column), ryegrass (middle column) and control (without plant – left end column) on the 100% drilling waste.....	58
7: Hemp (right end column), ryegrass (middle column) and control (without plant – left end column) on the 50:50mix of drilling waste and control soil.....	59
8: Cadmium concentration (mg Cd/kg soil) in horticultural soils.....	69

9:	Concentration of extractable Cd	69
10:	Zinc concentration (mg Zn/kg soil) in soils at the final harvest.....	70
11:	Relationship between Zn and Cd concentration in Pukekohe soil (A) and Gisborne soil (B).....	71
12:	Comparison of oxalate extractable Al/Fe concentration in the two horticultural soils.	72
13:	Comparison of heavy metal concentration in all soil treatments.....	75
14:	Relationship between Cd and Zn concentration in landfarm-impacted soil (A) and a control soil (B)	77
15:	Cadmium concentration (mg/kg DM) in plants at first stage.	79
16:	Cadmium concentration (mg/kg DM) in plants at final stage.	80
17:	Cadmium concentration (mg/kg FW) in plants at final stage.....	81
18:	Zinc concentration (mg/kg DW) in plants at final stage.	82
19:	Comparison of heavy metal concentration in hemp in landfarm-impacted soil and control soil.	87
20:	Comparison of heavy metal concentration in ryegrass in landfarm-impacted soil and control soil.	88
21:	Dehydrogenase activity (ug/g) in landfarm-impacted soil.	89
22:	Dehydrogenase activity (ug/g) in control soil.	89
23:	Comparison of dehydrogenase activity (ug/g) in all soil samples.....	90