

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

The Epidemiology of Avian Influenza in the Mekong River Delta of Viet Nam

A dissertation presented
in partial fulfilment of the requirements
for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

at Massey University

Nguyen Van Long

Institute of Veterinary, Animal and Biomedical Sciences
Massey University
Palmerston North, New Zealand

2013

(Submitted 28 March 2013)

— Abstract —

Between December 2003 and December 2012 a total of 4,349 commune-level outbreaks of highly pathogenic avian influenza (HPAI) H5N1 were recorded in domestic poultry flocks throughout Viet Nam. Throughout the same period there were 123 cases of HPAI H5N1 virus infection in humans, 61 of which were fatal.

The studies presented in this thesis are largely based on data collected from a prospective cohort study of domestic poultry in 157 flocks in the Mekong River Delta of Viet Nam between December 2008 and April 2010. The first research chapter (Chapter 3) provides a description of the components and design features of an animal health decision support system for use in Viet Nam. While not explicitly used for the prospective cohort study, the motivation for development of this system was to provide a means for recording and storing animal health data so as to minimise duplication of data collection efforts. A feature of the system is the inclusion of a flexible reporting tool that provides system users with the capability of developing reports to deal with virtually any animal health issue, not just avian influenza. The intent of this system is that it will allow the Vietnamese Department of Animal Health to identify and respond to existing and emerging threats to animal health in a timely and cost-effective manner.

Our descriptive analyses (Chapter 4) show that the overall incidence rate of influenza Type A and H5 virus infection in village poultry was relatively high throughout the 17-month follow up period of the prospective cohort study. This implies that interventions such as vaccination, movement controls and biosecurity measures need to be carried out continuously throughout the year rather than focusing only on the established high risk periods. Broiler ducks had an incidence rate of influenza H5 virus infection that was approximately four times greater than that of layer ducks and in-contact species. This indicates that broiler ducks should be the focus of disease surveillance and control strategies.

Survival analyses, accounting for the intermittent sampling of birds throughout the follow-up period of the prospective cohort study (by interval censoring) and for the hierarchical structure of the data set were used to determine the duration of immunity to H5N1 following vaccination (Chapter 5). After adjusting for the effect of known confounders and unmeasured variation at the flock level the duration of immunity to H5N1 following vaccination was estimated to be in the order of 56 (95% CI 51 – 61) days, considerably shorter than the duration of immunity previously reported in laboratory-based studies. A multilevel logistic regression analysis carried out to identify risk factors for influenza Type A virus infection in the prospective cohort study poultry population found that the relative contribution of unmeasured flock- and bird-level factors on influenza Type A virus infection risk were approximately equal (Chapter 6). Most of the significant fixed-effects were flock-level exposures indicating that interventions to reduce the maintenance and transmission of influenza Type A virus in domestic poultry in this area of Viet Nam should be applied at the individual bird and individual flock level.

Chapter 7 presents the results of a study of poultry movement events that occurred in the south of Viet Nam between September 2009 and June 2010. Poultry were more likely to be moved between communes with provincial roads and between communes with more than 1,000 poultry-owning households. Assuming a causal relationship exists between a commune-to-commune poultry movement activity and HPAI H5N1 risk, a conclusion from this study was that communes more likely to be connected to others as a result of movement should be targeted for disease control and surveillance.

The findings presented in each of these chapters of this thesis have broadened our knowledge of the epidemiology of not only the HPAI H5N1 subtype, but influenza Type A viruses in poultry in general. It should be stressed that the methodological techniques that have been used in this thesis can be applied to a wide range of animal health issues, not just HPAI H5N1.

Acknowledgements

Doctorate study is a long journey for many students and I would not have this thesis to present to all of you without having Mark Stevenson as my chief supervisor. I heartily thank you very much Mark for your teaching, guidance and enthusiasm and for what you have taught me about science. I express my deep thanks and profound gratitude to Deb Prattley and Roger Morris for their co-supervision.

I offer my deep gratefulness to Pham Van Dong, Nguyen Thu Thuy, Hoang Van Nam, Tran Thi Thu Phuong, Phan Quang Minh, Truong Thi Kim Dung, Tran Dien Quy and Nguyen Ba Thanh from the Vietnamese Department of Animal Health. I wish to express my appreciation to Birgit Schauer, for her coordination and technical contributions to the field work carried out in Viet Nam. Special thanks to Tim Carpenter, Sarah Rosanowski, Jackie Benschop, Bryan O'Leary, Masood Sujau, Cord Heuer, Eric Neumann, Naomi Cogger, Christine Cunningham, Wendy Maharey and Simon Verschaffelt from the EpiCentre and Geoff Jones from the Institute of Fundamental Sciences at Massey University.

I sincerely thank the New Zealand Aid Programme in Viet Nam for their financial support of this work. I am truly indebted to John Egan, Margie Lowe, Kathryn Beckett and Nguyen Thanh Thuy for their encouragement and support throughout my period of study. I am indebted to staff of the New Zealand Aid Programme in Wellington and the New Zealand Embassy in Ha Noi, Viet Nam. I am grateful to Olive Pimentel, Hooper Jamie and the International Student Officers at Massey University who provided an immense amount of help to me during my stay in New Zealand. For my fellow PhD students, Tran Cong An, Vo The Truyen, Nguyen Buu Huan and Vu Ngoc Chau I appreciate your support during my time in New Zealand.

This thesis would not have been possible without the assistance provided by colleagues from the Vietnamese Department of Animal Health, the National Centre for Veterinary Diagnostics and the Regional Office of Animal Health Number 7.

Lastly, thank you to my parents who have taught me with love to be an independent, successful, and good person. My wonderful wife, Nguyen Thi Diep and my lovely son, Nguyen Quang Huy have given me great love and materials of life. I express my deep gratitude to you both. I could never be what I am today without you. Your contribution will be always in my heart.

Nomenclature

AAHL	Australian Animal Health Laboratory
AFT	accelerated failure time
AI	avian influenza
ARAHIS	ASEAN Region Animal Health Information System
BSE	bovine spongiform encephalopathy
CI	confidence interval
Ct	(RRT-PCR) cycle threshold
CSF	classical swine fever
CSS	cascading style sheets
DAH	Department of Animal Health, Viet Nam
DEFRA	Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs, UK
DMS	database management system
DSS	decision support system
DVS	district veterinary station
EDR	estimated dissemination ratio
FAO	Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations
FMD	foot-and-mouth disease
FRD	field running duck
GIS	geographic information system
GUI	graphic user interface

HA	haemagglutinin
HPAI	highly pathogenic avian influenza
HI	haemagglutination inhibition
HTML	hyperText markup language
KML	keyhole markup language
LPAI	low pathogenic avian influenza
MARD	Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development, Viet Nam
MRD	Mekong River Delta, Viet Nam
NA	neuraminidase
NLIS	National Livestock Identification System, Australia
NVDC	National Veterinary Diagnostic Centre, Viet Nam
NVSL	National Veterinary Services Laboratories
OIE	Office International des Epizooties
OR	odds ratio
RADAR	Rapid Analysis and Detection of Animal-Related Risks, UK
RAHO	Regional Animal Health Office, Viet Nam
ROC	receiver operating characteristic (curve)
RRD	Red River Delta, Viet Nam
PCR	polymerase chain reaction
RRT-PCR	real time reverse transcriptase polymerase chain reaction
SARS	severe acute respiratory syndrome
SDAH	Sub-department of Animal Health
SE	standard error
SISBOV	Serviço de Rastreabilidade da Cadeia Produtiva de Bovinos e Bubalinos, Brazil

SNA	social network analysis
TADinfo	Transboundary Animal Disease Information System
USDA	United States Department of Agriculture
WAHID	World Animal Health Information Database
WHO	World Health Organization

List of Publications

Long, N.V., Stevenson, M. and O’Leary, B. (2011) Decision Support Systems in Animal Health. Efficient Decision Support Systems — Practice and Challenges in Biomedical Related Domain. Edited by C.S. Jao. InTech, Rijeka, Croatia. ISBN: 978-953-307-258-6.

Long, N.V., Stevenson, M., Schauer, B., Diep, N.T., Quy, T.D., Tien, T.N., Phuong, T.T.T., Prattley, D. and Morris, R. (2013) Descriptive results of a prospective cohort study of avian influenza in the Mekong River Delta of Viet Nam. *Transboundary and Emerging Diseases*. doi: 10.1111/tbed.12055.

Long, N.V., Stevenson, M., Schauer, B. and Thuy, N.T. (2013) Risk factors for highly pathogenic avian influenza H5N1 vaccination failure in poultry in the Mekong River Delta of Viet Nam, 2008-2010. Presentation at the 13th International Symposium on Veterinary Epidemiology and Economics, 20 – 24 August 2012, Maastricht, The Netherlands.

Contents

Acknowledgements	v
Nomenclature	vii
List of Publications	xi
1 Introduction	1
2 Literature review	5
2.1 Introduction	5
2.2 Animal health decision support systems currently in use	7
2.3 Animal health decision support systems in developing countries	12
2.4 The future	15
2.5 Conclusions	16
3 A decision support system for animal health management in Viet Nam	19
3.1 Introduction	20
3.2 System design	21
3.2.1 Database structure	21
3.2.2 Graphic user interface	23
3.2.3 Reporting tools	25
3.3 Discussion	33
3.4 Conclusions	34

4	Descriptive results of a prospective cohort study of AI in the MRD, Viet Nam	35
4.1	Introduction	36
4.2	Materials and methods	38
4.2.1	Study areas and study population	38
4.2.2	Study period	40
4.2.3	Collection of samples	41
4.2.4	Laboratory procedures	41
4.2.5	Data management	43
4.2.6	Statistical analyses	43
4.3	Results	44
4.3.1	Detection of influenza Type A viruses	44
4.3.2	Detection of H5 viruses	45
4.3.3	Evaluation of immune response of poultry against H5 viruses	46
4.3.4	Expression of clinical signs consistent with H5N1	46
4.4	Discussion	54
4.5	Conclusions	58
5	Factors influencing the duration of immunity in HPAI vaccinated poultry	59
5.1	Introduction	60
5.2	Materials and methods	61
5.2.1	Study area and study population	61
5.2.2	Data management	62
5.2.3	Statistical analyses	63
5.3	Results	66
5.4	Discussion	75
5.5	Conclusions	78

6	Risk factors for AI virus infection in poultry in the MRD, Viet Nam	79
6.1	Introduction	80
6.2	Materials and methods	82
6.2.1	Study area and study population	82
6.2.2	Laboratory procedures	82
6.2.3	Data management	82
6.2.4	Statistical analyses	83
6.3	Results	85
6.3.1	Descriptive analyses	85
6.3.2	Univariate analyses	86
6.3.3	Multilevel analyses	86
6.4	Discussion	96
6.5	Conclusions	97
7	Patterns of poultry movement in the south of Viet Nam, 2009 – 2010	99
7.1	Introduction	100
7.2	Materials and methods	102
7.2.1	Movement data	102
7.2.2	Demographic and geographic data	104
7.2.3	Statistical analyses	104
7.3	Results	106
7.4	Discussion	114
7.5	Conclusions	116
8	General discussion	119
8.1	Epidemiological research studies	122
8.2	Data collection and management	124
8.3	Conclusions	126

Bibliography	129
A Appendix A	A-1
B Appendix B	B-1
C Appendix C	C-1
D Appendix D	D-1

List of Figures

2.1	Schematic diagram showing how various data can be integrated within an active surveillance data network.	8
2.2	Map of Great Britain showing the density of poultry premises	10
2.3	Map of Thailand showing the incidence of chicken and duck farms confirmed with HPAI H5N1	13
3.1	Diagram showing the structure of the Vietnamese animal health DSS.	27
3.2	System diagram representing the conceptual design of the data warehouse.	29
3.3	The graphic user interface of the Vietnamese animal health DSS.	30
3.4	Example graphical report produced by the Vietnamese animal health DSS.	31
3.5	Map showing the incidence risk of HPAI H5N1 in Viet Nam over the period 1 January to 31 December 2004.	32
4.1	Map of Viet Nam showing the study areas of the prospective cohort study.	47
4.2	Flow chart of sample testing and data analysis.	51
4.3	Scatter plots showing Ct value of individual samples.	52
4.4	Frequency histogram showing the H5 HI antibody titres of serum samples.	53
5.1	Map of Viet Nam showing the study areas of the prospective cohort study.	71
5.2	Flow chart of sample testing and data analysis.	72
5.3	Lexis diagram showing the age of individual vaccinated birds.	73
5.4	Kaplan-Meier survival curves showing the cumulative proportion of seropositive birds.	74

6.1	Map of Viet Nam showing the study areas of the prospective cohort study.	92
6.2	Flow chart showing the sample testing procedures.	93
6.3	Comparison of odds ratios for the explanatory variables included in the fixed-effects and mixed-effects models.	94
6.4	Caterpillar plot showing the flock-level log odds of being influenza Type A positive.	95
7.1	Image plot of the 19 study provinces included in the study area in the south of Viet Nam.	111
7.2	Frequency histograms showing the total number of movement events per month as a function of calendar date, stratified by species and study area.	112
7.3	Maps showing the commune-to-commune connections arising from movements of chicken and ducks	113

List of Tables

3.1	Ten services of the Vietnamese animal health DSS data warehouse. . . .	26
3.2	Example tabular report produced from the Vietnamese animal health DSS.	28
4.1	Results of Influenza Type A virus infection.	48
4.2	Results of HPAI H5N1 virus infection.	49
4.3	Results of H5 serology.	50
5.1	Bivariate analysis.	68
5.2	Weibull AFT model.	70
6.1	The hierarchical structure of the data.	88
6.2	The explanatory variables that were selected to be included in the fixed-effects and mixed-effects models.	89
6.3	Regression coefficients and their standard errors for the final mixed-effects logistic regression model.	91
7.1	Descriptive statistics of the commune-to-commune poultry movements.	108
7.2	Descriptive statistics of the commune-to-commune poultry movement network.	109
7.3	Estimated regression coefficients and their standard errors from the ERGM model.	110