A Study on Nursing Articles
on Literature-Based
Education in Both the US and UK

Emiko Ubukawa[1], Yoko Miyazaki[1], Nobuko Hayashi[2]

1 ）Gunma Prefectural College of Health Sciences
2 ）Takasaki City University of Economics

Objectives: The primary aim of this study is to provide a chronological analysis of the use of literature in nursing education journals in both the US and UK.　The second aim is to clarify the main goals of using literature in nursing education.　This study has the potential to provide a helpful reference to EFL (English as a Foreign Language) teachers who are contemplating introducing literature to the classroom.

Methods: An online electronic search of the Cumulative Index to Nursing & Allied Health Literature (CINAHL) database was conducted to identify articles related to the use of literature in nursing education.　The collected articles were then sorted into three tables as follows : articles in the first table were arranged in chronological order by publication date, name of the primary researcher, article title, journal title, and title of the main literary works ; articles in the second table were arranged in chronological order based on the main goals of literature use ; and articles in the third table were arranged in descending order based on the frequency of articles that shared identical main goals.

Results: Our findings are as follows : 1 ）Literature was introduced into nursing education in the 1960s ; 2 ）An overwhelmingly large number of articles have been published in the US on the use of literature in nursing education ; 3 ）The main literary works that were actually used, or that researchers believed could be used, were able to be categorized into five groups related to literary form and four groups related to literary theme ; and 4 ）The main traits that researchers believed could be reinforced by the use of literature included "self-growth," "critical thinking," "compassion," "empathy," "insight," "cultural competence," and "sensitivity."

Conclusions: This study clearly reveals both historical changes and recent trends in the use of literature in nursing education in both the US and UK.　This type of study should play an important role in promoting the introduction of literature into the EFL classroom for Japanese nursing students.

Key words : nursing education, literature, review research

1 ．Introduction

Our previous study indicated that literature has been introduced into medical education in the US since 1972.　This was followed by the publication of 'Literature and Medicine' by Johns Hopkins University in 1982.　The title, 'Literature and Medicine' drew our attention to the idea that literature could also be connected to nursing education[1].　This

連絡先：〒371-0052 前橋市上沖町323— 1
　　　　　群馬県立県民健康科学大学
　　　　　鵜生川恵美子

study stems from our strong interest in nursing journals inclusion of literature in nursing education, which we believe may contribute to the improvement of teaching in the EFL classroom for nursing students.

The primary aim of this paper is to provide an overview of articles on using literature and literary works in nursing education in both the US and UK, which were obtained from the web-version of CINAHL. We have provided a table showing the chronological order of articles including the researchers, the titles of their studies, the titles of journals the studies appeared in and the main literary works which were actually used or researchers believed could be used in nursing education. This chronological analysis of the related articles will help us figure out the history of literature use in nursing education and what kind of literary works have been considered appropriate for nursing students in the classroom.

The second aim is to elucidate the main goals or what researchers believed could be reinforced by the use of literature besides technical knowledge and skills in nursing education, so that nursing students can become better and more sophisticated nurses.

We must keep in mind, however, that this paper is to provide a springboard to a better strategy of language education for Japanese nursing students in the EFL classroom. We strongly believe that, when appropriately applied, literature-based education will give meaningful suggestions for Japanese nursing students and even other in-training medical professionals to become more sophisticated

professionals. Looking over the many articles published in both the US and UK, we are convinced that literature in the EFL context in Japan can be a powerful tool for encouraging nursing students and other in-training professionals' personal growth as well as improving language skills.

2．Definition & Method

Definition: The term 'literature' used in this research means literary works or fictional writings such as novels, short stories, poems, plays and the like. We have to distinguish our target term 'literature' from the term 'literature' meaning an academic journal. Therefore, in this study, literature-based education means nursing education in which literary works are mainly used as the teaching materials.

The term 'main literary works' used in this study indicates the literary works which were actually used or researchers believed could be used in nursing education.

The term 'a main goal' used in this study indicates the goal that each researcher believed could be reinforced by the use of literature in nursing education.

Method: Firstly, articles on the use of literature or literary works in nursing education (n＝329) were collected from the web version of CINAHL by using the key words 'literature,' 'nursing,' and 'education.' However, while searching the related articles, we had to eliminate terms such as 'nursing literature,' 'the review of literature,' and 'literature review' from the key words because of the 'other' meaning of literature.

Furthermore, we had to ascertain whether each article collected from CINAHL pertained to literature-based nursing education by judging from its title and abstract. After closer scrutiny of such related articles, we found that there were also some articles on literature-based education without any of the key words 'literature,' 'education,' and 'nursing.' Finally, we found that 30 papers out of 329 articles were related. In order to collect as many articles on literature-based education as possible, the seemingly related ones were extracted from the references of each paper. In total we collected 41 articles. On the basis of the 41 articles published from 1968 to 2010, we made a chronological analysis of nursing articles on the utilization of literature although this population is not a complete collection of articles. Even if this is a limited collection of related articles, it should be able to give a rough idea of American and British literature-based education for nursing students.

3．Results

Table 1 deals with the transformation of nursing articles on literature-based education （n＝41） in both the US and UK; included are the publication year, the researchers, the titles of their articles, the title of the journal where each article was published, and at last, the main literary works which were actually used or researchers believed could be used in each study. Only main literary works are listed when a great number of literary works were used in each research.

Table 1 *Chronological Order of Nursing Articles on Literature-Based Nursing Education in both the US and UK*

Year	Researcher	Article title	Journal title	Title of the main literary works
1968	Williams, C. and George, J. (US)	Lay Literature As an Adjunctive Teaching Tool	Journal of Psychosocial Nursing and Mental Health Services	*In Cold Blood* (1966) by T. Capote *I Never Promised You a Rose Garden* (1964) by J. Greenberg *Who's Afraid of Virginia Woolf?* (1962) by E. Albee
1968	Holdsworh, J.N. (US)	Vicarious Experience of Reading a Book in Changing Nursing Students' Attitudes	Nursing Research	*Johnny Got His Gun* (1939) by D. Trumbo
1974	Wilson, H.S. (US)	A Case for Humanities in Professional Nursing Education	Nursing Forum	*One Flew Over the Cuckoo's Nest* (1962) by K. Kesey *Glass Menagerie* (1944) by T. Williams
1975	Ruffing, M.A. (US)	Literature by consumers for nursing	Nursing Forum	*The World of Nigel Hunt* (1967) by N. Hunt *My Left Foot* (1955) by C. Brown *A Grief Observed* (1961) by C.S. Lewis
1981	Swanwick, M. (UK)	A novel approach	Nursing Mirror	*A Way to Die* (1980) by Rosemary and Victor Zorza *Memento Mori* (1959) by M. Spark *The Bell Jar* (1976) by S. Plath *A Grief Observed* (1961) by C.S. Lewis
1986	Bartol, G.M. (US)	Using The Humanities in Nursing Education	Nurse Educator (N.E.)	*Hospital Sketches* (1960) by L.M. Alcott *Lady Chatterlay's Lover* (1959) by D.H. Lawrence *Herman Melville four short stories* (1971) by H. Melville

Year	Researcher	Article title	Journal title	Title of the main literary works
1986	German, C.P.(US)	Using Literature to Teach Nursing	Journal of Nursing Education (J.N.E.)	*The Color Purple* (1982) by A. Walker *The Cancer Ward* (1968) by A. Solzhenitsyn
1986	Treistman, J.M. (US)	Teaching Nursing Care Through Poetry	Nursing Outlook	*"Edge" from The Collected Poems* (1960) by S. Plath *"The Invisible Woman" in Monster Poems* (1970) by Robin Morgan
1988	Peterson, L.C., Booth, C. (US)	Literature and Music: An Educational Strategy in Psychiatric Mental Health Nursing	J.N.E.	*Cat's in the Cradle* (1974) by H. Chapin *Miss Brill* (1920) by K. Mansfield *Paul's Case* (1905) by W. Cather
1988	Young-Mason, J. (US)	Literature as a Mirror to Compassion	Journal of Professional Nursing	Sophocles' *Philoctetes* (1874) trans. by L. Campbell
1989	Bartol, G.M. (US)	Creative Literature: An Aid to Nursing Practice	Nursing & Health Care	*Hospital Sketches* (1960) by L.M. Alcott *The Death of Ivan Ilyich* (1886) by L. Tolstoy
1990	Younger, J.B.(US)	Literary Works as a Mode of Knowing	IMAGE: Journal of Nursing Scholarship (J.N.S.)	*Charlotte's Web* (1952) by E.B. White *The Blood of the Lamb* (1961) by R. Dreistadt *A Grief Observed* (1961) by C.S. Lewis *The Death of Ivan Ilych and Other Stories* (1886) by L. Tolstoy
1992	Burnard, P. (UK)	A novel approach	Nursing	*The Outsider* (1942) by A. Camus *Catcher in the Rye* (1951) by J.D. Salinger *On the Road* (1957) by J. Kerouac
1993	Holaday, B. (US)	Adolescent Literature as a Means of Studying Growth and Development	J.N.E.	*Lord of the Flies* (1955) by W. Golding *Jacob Have I Loved* (1980) by K. Peterson *The Pigman* (1968) by P. Zindel
1994	Darbyshire, P. (UK)	Understanding caring through arts and humanities: a medical/nursing humanities approach to promoting alternative experiences of thinking and learning	Journal of Advanced Nursing (J.A.N.)	*Darkness Visible* (1991) by W. Styron *The Trick is to Keep Breathing* (1989) by J. Galloway
1995	Darbyshire, P. (UK)	Lessons From Literature: Caring, Interpretation, and Dialogue	J.N.E.	*Darkness Visible* (1991) by W. Styron *Animal Farm* (1945) by G. Orwell
1995	Mohr, W.K. (US)	Integrating Esthetics Into Nursing: Literature as a Suggested Modality	Archives of Psychiatric Nursing	*Darkness Visible* (1991) by W. Styron *The Bell Jar* (1976) by S. Plath
1996	Cassidy, V.R.(US)	Literary Works as Case Studies for Teaching Human Experimentation Ethics	J.N.E.	*Pygmalion* (1944) by G.B. Shaw *Flowers for Algernon* (1966) by D. Keyes
1996	Smith, M.A. (US)	The Use of Poetry to Test Nursing Knowledge	N.E.	*I'm Fine* (poem) by Charlotte Sinclair
1996	Stowe, A.C., Igo, L.C. (US)	Learning from Literature Novels, Plays, Short Stories, and Poems in Nursing Education	N.E.	*The Man who Mistook His Wife for a Hat* (1987) by O. Sacks *Curious George Goes to the Hospital* (1966) by H.A. Rey
1996	Winland-Brown, J. E. (US)	Can Caring for Critically Ill Patients Be Taught by Reading a Novel?	N.E.	*Bed Number Ten* (1985) by S. Baier, M. Schomaker

Year	Researcher	Article title	Journal title	Title of the main literary works
1997	Hoffman, A.L. (US)	Ways of Knowing in Gerontology: Learning From Narrative Literature	J.N.E.	*The Stone Angel* (1964) by M. Lawrence *A Time on Earth* (1963) by V. Moberg
1997	Giarratano, G.P. (US)	Story as Text for Undergraduate Curriculum	J.N.E.	*Birth Stories* (1992) by J. Dwinell
1998	Bartol, G.M. (US)	Using Literature to Create Cultural Competence	J.N.S	*The Color Purple* (1982) by A. Walker *The Bluest Eyes* (1970) by T. Morrison *On the Real Side* (1994) by M. Watkins
2001	Harrison, E. (US)	Advancing Nursing Scholarship through the Interpretation of Imaginative Literature: Ancestral Connectedness and the Survival of the Sufferer	Advances in Nursing Science	*The Bluest Eyes* (1994) by T. Morrison *The Salt Eaters* (1992) by T.C. Bambara *The Death of Ivan Ilyich* (1886) by L. Tolstoy
2001	McKie, A., Gass, J.P. (UK)	Understanding mental health through reading selected literature sources: an evaluation	Nurse Education Today	*The Colossus* (1960) by S. Plath *The Man who Mistook His Wife for a Hat* (1985) by O. Sacks *Darkness Visible* (1991) by W. Styron
2004	Anderson, K.L. (US)	Teaching Cultural Competence Using an Exemplar from Literary Journalism	J.N.E.	*The Spirit Catches You and You Fall Down* (1997) by A. Fadiman
2004	Butell, S.S., O'Donovan, P., Taylor, J.D. (US)	Instilling the Value of Reading Literature Through Student-Led Book Discussion Groups	J.N.E.	*The Spirit Catches You and You Fall Down* (1997) by A. Fadiman
2004	Kidd, L.I., Tusaie, K.R. (US)	Disconfirming Beliefs: The Use of Poetry to Know the Lived Experience of Student Nurses in Mental Health Clinicals	Issues in Mental Health Nursing	Original poems by students
2004	Leffers, J., Martins, D.C. (US)	Journey to Compassion: Meeting Vulnerable Populations in Community Health Nursing Through Literature	International Journal for Human Caring	*To Kill a Mockingbird* (1960) by H. Lee *Amazing Grace* (1995) by J. Kozol
2006	Cagle, C.S., Walker, C.A., Newcomb, P. (US)	Using Imaginative Literature in Clinical Courses to Improve Student Outcomes	The Journal of Theory Construction & Testing	*The House on Mango Street* (1988) by S. Cisneros, *The Bluest Eye* (1970) by T. Morrison
2006	Dolores J.W. (US)	The Art of Nursing Expressed in Poetry	J.N.E.	Students' original poems
2006	Harrison, E. (US)	Teaching Compassion Multiple Sclerosis and the Poetry of Molly Holden	N.E.	*Selected Poems* (1987) by M. Holden *To Make Me Grieve* (1968) by M. Holden *Air and Chill Earth* (1971) by M. Holden
2006	Newcomb, P., Cagle, C., Walker, C. (US)	Using Imaginative Literature to Foster Cultural Sensitivity	International Journal of Nursing Education Scholarship (I.J.N.E.S.)	*The House on Mango Street* (1988) by S. Cisneros, *The Bluest Eye* (1970) by T. Morrison
2007	Engstrom, J.L., Hunter, R.G. (US)	Teaching Reproductive Options Through the Use of Fiction: The Cider House Rules Project	Journal of Obstetric, Gynecologic & Neonatal Nursing	*The Cider House Rules* (1985) by J. Arving

Year	Researcher	Article title	Journal title	Title of the main literary works
2008	Hegge, M. (US)	Literature and Arts as a Prologue for Moral Energy	Nursing Science Quarterly	*Night* (1985) by E. Wiesel *The Plague* (1975) by A. Camus
2008	Jensen, A., Curtis, M. (US)	A Descriptive Qualitative Study of Student Learning in a Psychosocial Nursing Class Infused with Art, Literature, Music, and Film	I.J.N.E.S.	*The Yellow Wall Paper* (1980) by B. Glaser *Patriotism* (1967) by M. Yukio trans. by G.W. Sargent
2009	Crawley, J.M. (US)	"Once Upon a Time": A Discussion of Children's Picture Books as a Narrative Educational Tool for Nursing Students	J.N.E.	*We're Going on a Bear Hunt* (1989) by Rosen & Oxenbury *Mummy Laid an Egg* (1993) by B. Cole *Old Henry* (1987) by J.W. Blos & S. Gammell
2009	DeBrew, J.K., Rankin, C. (US)	A Liberal Education Making the Essentials Practical	N.E.	*Tuesdays with Morrie* (1997) by M. Albom
2009	Halloran, L. (US)	Teaching Transcultural Nursing Through Literature	J.N.E.	*The Bluest Eye* (1972) by T. Morrison *The Color Purple* (1992) by A. Walker *The Joy Luck Club* (1991) by A. Tan
2010	Brown, D.L. (US)	Using Art and Literature in the Clinical Setting: An Innovative Assignment	N.E.	*Poems by Emily Dickinson* (1890) ed. by M. Todd & T.W. Higginson

Table 2 shows the chronological trend of the main goals of using literature in nursing education. The main goals indicated on the Table 2 are the words each researcher showed as his or her main goals in nursing education in his or her paper.

Table 2 *Researchers and Their Main Goals from* 1968 *to* 2010

Year	Researchers	Main goals
1968	C. Williams, J. George	emotional responses
1968	J.N. Holdsworth	vicarious experience
1974	H.S. Wilson	self-knowledge, critical distance
1975	M.A. Ruffing	insight, empathy, self-awareness
1981	M. Swanwick	understanding of patients, empathy, insight
1986	G.M. Bartol	insight, sensitivity
1986	C.P. German	insight, sensitivity, ethical knowledge, personal knowledge, vicarious experience
1986	J.M. Treistman	compassion, respect for others, self-learning
1988	L.C. Peterson, C. Booth	insight, personal development, awareness
1988	J. Young-Mason	moral and ethical knowledge, compassion, understanding of patients
1989	G.M. Bartol	ways of knowing, compassion, esthetic objectivity
1990	J.B. Younger	vicarious experience, intuition, compassion
1992	P. Burnard	critical reading, insight
1993	B. Holaday	enriching the study of adolescent development
1994	P. Darbyshire	different ways of knowing, insight
1995	P. Darbyshire	understanding of patients, critical thinking
1995	W.K. Mohr	understanding of patients, vicarious experience
1996	V.R. Cassidy	ethical knowledge
1996	M.A. Smith	critical thinking, divergent thinking

Year	Researchers	Main goals
1996	A.C. Stowe, L.C. Igo	compassion and empathy, students' perception of self and the world
1996	J.E. Winland-Brown	compassion
1997	A.L. Hoffman	sensitivity, awareness
1997	G.P. Giarratano	students' awareness of ethics, critical thinking
1998	G.M. Bartol	cultural competence
2001	E. Harrison	speculative thinking
2001	A. McKie, J.P. Gass	understanding of patients
2004	K.L. Anderson	cultural competence, self-awareness, empathy
2004	S.S. Butell, P. O'Donovan, J.D. Taylor	personal development, professional growth
2004	L.I. Kidd, K.R. Tusaie	learning tool (mental health), aesthetic knowledge, empathy
2004	J. Leffers, D.C. Martins	compassion, emotional responses, understanding of patients, cultural diversity, aesthetic knowledge
2006	C.S. Cagle, C.A. Walker, P. Newcomb	cultural competence
2006	E. Harrison	compassion
2006	P. Newcomb, C. Cagle, C. Walker	cultural competence, sensitivity
2006	D.J. Wright	students' growth
2007	J.L. Engstorm, R.G. Hunter	critical thinking, emotional intelligence, cultural sensitivity, insight, understanding of patients
2008	M. Hegge	critical judgment, creative thinking, ethical knowledge, empathy
2008	A. Jensen, M. Curtis	self-understanding, cultural awareness, empathy
2009	J.M. Crawley	self-understanding, understanding of patients
2009	J.K. DeBrew, C. Rankin	critical thinking
2009	L. Halloran	cultural sensitivity, understanding clinical experiences, insight
2010	D.L. Brown	thought provoking

Table 3 shows the main goals of using literary works in nursing education. In most cases, each study has not just one but multiple goals in using literature in nursing education.

Table 3 *Main Goals of Using Literary Works in Nursing Education*

Main goals (number)	Researchers (year)
1. self-understanding, self-growth, self-awareness, personal-growth (11)	H.S. Wilson (1974) M.A. Ruffing (1975) C.P. German (1986) J.M. Treistman (1986) L. Peterson, C. Booth (1988) A.C. Stowe, L.C. Igo (1996) A.L. Hoffman (1997) S.S. Butell, P. O'Donovan, J.D. Taylor (2004) K.L. Anderson (2004) J.W. Dolores (2006) J.M. Crawley (2009)
2. critical thinking, divergent thinking, speculative thinking (11)	H.S. Wilson (1974) G.M. Bartol (1989) P. Burnard (1992) P. Darbyshire (1994) P. Darbyshire (1995) M.A. Smith (1996) G.P. Giarratano (1997) J.L. Engstorm, R.G. Hunter (2007) M. Hegge (2008) J. DeBrew, C. Rankin (2009) D.L. Brown (2010)
3. understanding of patients (9)	M. Swanwick (1981) J. Young-Mason (1988) J.M. Treistman (1986) P. Darbyshire (1995) W.K. Mohr (1995) A. McKie, J.P. Gass (2001) J. Leffers, D.C. Martins (2004) J. Engstorm, R. Hunter (2007) J.M. Crawley (2009)
4. compassion (8)	J.M. Treistman (1986) J. Young-Mason (1988) J.B. Younger (1990) G.M. Bartol (1989) A.C. Stowe, L.C. Igo (1996) J. Winland-Brown (1996) J. Leffers, D.C. Martins (2004) E. Harrison (2006)
5. insight (8)	M.A. Ruffing (1975) G.M. Bartol (1986) C.P. German (1988) L. Peterson, C. Booth (1988) P. Burnard (1992) P. Darbyshire (1994) J.L. Engstorm, R.G. Hunter (2007) L. Halloran (2009)

Main goals (number)	Researchers (year)
6．cultural competence（8）	G.M. Bartol（1998）K. Anderson（2004）J. Leffers, D.C. Martins（2004）P. Newcomb, C. Cagle, C. Walker（2006）C.S. Cagle, C.A. Walker, P. Newcomb（2006）J.L. Engstorm, R.G. Hunter（2007）A. Jensen, M. Curtis（2008）L. Halloran（2009）
7．empathy（7）	M. Ruffing（1975）M. Swanwick（1981）A.C. Stowe, L.C. Igo（1996）K.L. Anderson（2004）A. Jensen, M. Curtis（2008）M. Hegge（2008）L. Kidd, K. Tusaie（2004）
8．ethical knowledge（5）	C.P. German（1986）J. Young-Mason（1988）V.R. Cassidy（1996）G.P. Giarratano（1997）M. Hegge（2008）
9．sensitivity（4）	G.M. Bartol（1986）C.P. German（1986）A.L. Hoffman（1997）P. Newcomb, C. Cagle, C. Walker（2006）
10．vicarious experiences（4）	J. Holdsworth（1968）J.B. Younger（1990）C.P. German（1986）W.K. Mohr（1995）
11．learning tools（3）	B. Holaday（1993）L.I. Kidd, K.R. Tusaie（2004）L. Halloran（2009）
12．aesthetic knowledge（3）	G.M. Bartol（1989）L. I. Kidd, K.R. Tusaie（2004）J. Leffers, D. Martins（2004）
13．emotional responses（3）	C. Williams, J. George（1968）J. Leffers, D.C. Martins（2004）J.L. Engstorm, R.G. Hunter（2007）
14．intuition（1）	J.B. Younger（1990）

The main goals of using literature are categorized into the following fourteen key words. The goals that researchers targeted in their research are rearranged in descending order of frequency. 11 articles concerned 'self-understanding,' 'self-growth,' and the like. Also, there were 11 for 'critical thinking.' The number of 'understanding of the patient' was 9. The number of each of 'compassion,' 'insight,' and 'cultural competence' was 8. The number of 'empathy' was 7. The number of 'ethical knowledge' was 5. The number of each of 'sensitivity' and 'vicarious experience' was 4. The number of each of 'learning tools,' 'aesthetical knowledge,' and 'emotional responses' was 3, and the number of 'intuition' was 1.

4．Discussion

4-1 Since when has literature been used in nursing education?

As our previous paper pointed out, P. Darbyshire* claimed, in his paper published about 20 years ago, that there had been no comparable movement within the nursing field[2]. Moreover he was apprehensive that the humanistic and artistic elements of nursing had been overshadowed due to the education focusing solely on the physical and social sciences and neglecting the arts and humanities[3].

However, this overview of nursing research articles concerning the use of literary works in nursing education indicates that literature-based nursing education began around the late 1960s. So far, the articles, *Lay Literature As an Adjunctive Teaching Tool* by C. Williams & J. George and *Vicarious Experience of Reading: A Book in Changing Nursing Students' Attitudes* by J.N. Holdsworth, both published in 1968, were the oldest ones we found.

According to A.H. Hawkins and M.C. McEntyre, who provided a detailed overview of how literature education was immersed in medical education, literature and medicine first

emerged in its present form as an academic discipline in 1972[4]. As J.A. Sakalys pointed out that the use of literary works appeared as early as the mid-1960s in anecdotal sources[5], it may be said that the use of literature was introduced into nursing education almost at the same time as medical education.

A closer look at the chronological table of nursing articles on literature-based education (Table 1) indicates that there has been an increasing number of nursing articles on such themes, especially, since the 2000s, partially because the number of nursing journals itself has been increasing due to the dramatic development of research in the nursing field. It may be natural that the articles on literature-based education also proportionally increased.

In these articles, nurse educators started to warn against the trend of too much emphasis on cutting-edge technology and against underestimating the soft power of nursing[6−9]. They have also considered what nursing students should learn as necessary skills in the clinical field where they deal with patients by using literature or literary works in nursing education.

4-2   Journals dealing with articles on the use of literature

As Table 1 shows, there has been a larger number of articles on literature-based education in the US (n＝36) than that in the UK (n＝5). Overwhelmingly the number of American articles is larger than that of the British articles, indicating the popularization of the use of literature in nursing as well as in

the medical education field in the US. According to K.S. Hanson's dissertation, which encompassed beliefs about liberal education, profession and higher education found in nursing journals from 1893 to 1952[10], nurse educators in the US had already insisted on, before the 1960s, the significance of liberal education including the humanities by showing that during the World War II era, 'nurses educators advocated a liberal education that included more humanities'[11].

As for the nursing journals dealing with articles on the use of literature, Table 1 shows that most of the journals related to nursing education such as *Journal of Nursing Education* (n＝13), *Nurse Educator* (n＝7) and *Nursing Education Today* (n＝1) tend to cover the use of literature in nursing education. Furthermore, we also find that literature or literary works have been used to teach nursing students studying about mental health, obstetrics, and oncology, in which students need to learn the importance of alleviating the patients' mental problems. That indicates that literature can provide students with opportunities to better understand the mental status or feelings of patients.

4-3   Literary works in nursing education

In terms of literary form, literary works in nursing education can be categorized into the following five groups.

1) American and British popular novels: ex.) *The Color Purple* (1982) by A. Walker, *House on Mango Street* (1988) by S. Cisneros, *In Cold Blood* (1966) by T. Capote, *Tuesdays with Morrie* (1997) by M. Albom

2) Poems: ex.) *The Bell Jar* (1976) by S. Plath, Emily Dickinson's Poems,

3) Picture books: ex.) *Mummy laid an egg* (1993) by B. Cole, *Curious George Goes to the Hospital* (1966) by H.A. Rey.

4) Children's and Young adult literature: ex.) *Charlotte's Web* (1952) by E.B. White, *Lord of the Flies* (1955) by W. Golding,

5) Foreign novels (Russian and French novels): ex.) a French novel, *The Plague* (1947) by A. Camus, Russian novels, *The Death of Ivan Ilyich* (1886) by L. Tolstoy, *The Cancer Ward* (1968) by A. Solzhenitsyn.

In terms of the themes, literary works can be sorted into the following four categories.

1) Literary works inspiring students to think of the meaning of life and death, and ethical problems: ex.) *Charlotte's Web* (1952) by E. B. White, *Flowers for Algernon* (1966) by D. Keyes

2) Literary works describing sick people and inducing students to understand their feelings by vicariously living others' lives: ex.) *The Plague* (1947) by A. Camus, *The Death of Ivan Ilyich* (1886) by L. Tolstoy, *The Cancer Ward* (1968) by A. Solzhenitsyn, *Tuesdays with Morrie* (1997) by M. Albom

3) Literary works coping with the theme of culturally divergent people such as minorities or ethnicities: ex.) *House on Mango Street* (1988) by S. Cisneros, *The Color Purple* (1992) by A. Walker, *The Joy Luck Club* (1991) by A. Tan

4) Literary works inspiring students to obtain more information about their nursing practice in obstetrics, gerontology and so on:

ex.) *In Cold Blood* (1966) by T. Capote, *I Never Promised You a Rose Garden* (1964) by J. Greenberg, *The Stone Angel* (1964) by M. Lawrence, *The Cider House Rules* (1985) by J. Arving

The above-mentioned literary works have been chosen according to the main goals set by each researcher.

4-4 Main goals of using literature in nursing education (Tables 2 & 3)

Table 2 shows, in chronological order, what the main goals of using literature in nursing education are or what researchers believed could be reinforced by the use of literature in nursing education.

In the 1960s, the studies of using literature in nursing education showed that students were helped to become emotionally enriched and that they were provided with opportunities to vicariously experience others' lives.

Since the 1970s, most researchers have been likely to consider 'compassion' and 'empathy' as the most important contributions to literature in nursing education. H. Wilson, A.C. Stowe, and L.C. Igo regarded 'compassion' and 'empathy' as the parallel words[12,13], while other researchers use either 'compassion' or 'empathy' as one of the main goals. Here we'd like to refer to the disparity between 'compassion' and 'empathy.'

Among the definitions of compassion and empathy, the following definitions and explanations on such terms seem more persuasive than the others.

The word compassion comes from Latin and means "to bear with" or "to suffer with." Compassion and empathy are essential human qualities that allow one to feel, understand, and respond to the sufferings of others. They enable individuals to enter into and maintain relationships of caring. … Compassion is an active choice to want with others and to want for others the alleviation of their suffering. In acting compassionately we acknowledge that we all share the same conditions of mortality; we all suffer and we all die. Empathy derives from a Greek root word meaning, "in feeling" or "feeling into." A component of compassion, empathy is the recognition and understanding of the others' suffering[14].

As J.B. Younger put it, 'compassion' is one of the feelings with which we can put ourselves in others' shoes or vicariously experience 'without the personal experience of suffering, through linking ourselves in the timeless experience of others'[15].

In order to have a feeling of compassion, a vicarious experience is necessary. Without being empathetic to others, we cannot show compassion for them because the feeling of compassion is a strong desire to help sufferers to get out of their difficulties.

Moreover, K.S. Hanson's dissertation tells us that 'compassion' was listed as one of the main goals of using literature relatively earlier than any other goal.

Compassion was viewed as a trait natural to womanhood. Education might, if anything, decrease this natural trait. By 1952 liberal education coursework was viewed as a method for developing moral character and compassion. An exposure to the humanities, in particular, contributed to the development of these qualities. Nursing was viewed as an activity that required a "well-rounded" individual[16].

While the terms 'compassion' and 'empathy' were still used as the main goals in the 1980s, new key words such as 'sensitivity' and 'insight' were often raised as the main goals of using literature in nursing education. G.M. Bartol added an explanation about 'sensitivity' as follows:

Creative literature has a humanizing effect. It helps develop sensitivity to the complex psychological and physical components of human behavior in health and illness[17].

In the meantime, M. Swanwick claimed that literary works could provide nursing students with more 'insight' into the situations they may be confronted with[18].

From these points of view, we find that heightening students' 'sensitivity' and 'insight' is also inevitable for nurses who must vicariously respond to patients and give appropriate suggestions in clinical settings. It is literature that induces students to enhance these two elements by vicariously experiencing

others' lives or entering into the world of others.

The new key goals targeted in literature-based nursing education in the 1990s were 'critical reading,' 'critical thinking,' 'divergent thinking,' and 'critical dialogue.' P. Burnard explained about the need of a perspective way of thinking on complicated human lives as follows:

> Reading literature can be both a humbling and human experience. It can remind us that we do not have the answers — that all of us are always searching for solutions to the human conundrum. It can help us to put into perspective and to question the whole canon of nursing and social science literature[19].

In the late 1990s, G.M. Bartol raised an issue on the bias or prejudice against minorities, adding 'Literature helps to dispel the false notion of one single monolithic culture. Reflecting literature can help nurses to hear the stories of those they hope to help and heal'[20]. His idea led to 'cultural competence' which was listed as one of the main goals of the use of literature by some researchers, who used literary works on colored people in nursing education. According to K.L. Anderson, 'cultural competence' is an essential constituent of nursing education in the 21st century[21]. Understanding the situation of culturally divergent people, even if they are not sick, makes us become more open-minded to and

more emotionally involved with others in different situation.

Furthermore, C.S. Cagle, C.A. Walker, and P. Newcomb provided a profound comment on the significance of literature on the minorities as follows:

> Novels written by and about minority women can stimulate the psychological, cultural, and sociopolitical contexts influencing health choices among a diverse population.... Through an applied humanities approach, students who read and refer upon selected imaginative literature can gain awareness of common experiences, which they share with members of diverse populations[22].

In the 2000s, the key words indicating personal development such as 'self-growth,' 'self-awareness,' 'self-understanding,' and the like were listed as the main goals of using literature in nursing. Naturally enough, literature, which usually describes complicated human relationships, can offer students opportunities to grow mentally and spiritually.

Tables 2 and 3 can make it clearer that, even in nursing education, the role of literature is varied chronologically. At first, the role of literature in nursing education is to offer students opportunities to vicariously feel the sorrows and sufferings of others by entering into others' experiences. Gradually literature has been exploited in nursing education in order for student nurses to improve their 'compassion,' 'empathy,' 'sensitivity,' and

'insight,' as crucial requisites nurses can acquire by putting themselves in others' shoes through reading literature.

Literature is not merely a description of the outer world we can see, but that of complicated human feelings or the inner world. Therefore we need to use our imagination so that we can understand others' feelings. The act of imagining encourages us to understand others from a perspective point of view, which leads to internalization of ourselves.

The following suggestion by R.Carter and M.N. Long indicates that the key words we have seen as main goals of using literature in nursing education are corresponding to the key roles of using literature in the EFL classroom.

> Literature can be a special source for personal development and growth, an aim being to encourage greater sensitivity and self-awareness and greater understanding of the world around us[23].

Students need to be sensitive to others and to understand the world around them with insight to think critically or perceptively. Then, students need to learn the feelings of empathy and compassion to learn to have sensitivity and insight. Further, they need to have as many vicarious experiences as possible to acquire such feelings. Thus, the process in which nursing students acquire the necessary elements for their own self growth seems to be almost identical to the chronological transition of the main goals which researchers believed could be enhanced by the use of literature.

4-5 Limitation of this study and implications

In our study, we must admit some limitations. Firstly, there was not a complete amount of nursing articles on the use of literary works in nursing education collected from CINAHL. Therefore, we may not generalize the trend of the use of literary works in nursing education. Secondly, we can only provide a rough picture of the chronological order of nursing articles on literature-based education and the main goals that each researcher believed could be reinforced by the use of literary works in nursing education. Therefore we need to continue more elaborate research in order to make the above three tables more complete.

Collecting nursing articles on literature-based education in both the US and UK, we have found that few articles have been published by nurse educators in Japan so far. This implies that less attention has been drawn to humanity in nursing education in Japan than in both the US and UK. Now, our society is exposed to the rapid changes caused by globalization and the graying of society, which directly affects medical professionals. They have to cope with various new issues under a great pressure such as informed consent, terminal care, and other ethical problems, keeping up with the pace of the advancement of medicine and technology. Naturally, they are expected to understand patients better and to acquire good communication skills with patients and their family members. Well-balanced curricula with science and humanity are needed. We hope that nursing educators take more interest in humanity in

nursing education in Japan.

As shown in the previous study we have explored, literature-use in nursing education played many important roles such as enhancing empathy towards patients, encouraging self-awareness and critical thinking, and understanding cultural or social differences among us. This could be one of the most significant tools in integrating science and humanity in nurse education. E.O. Bevis said, "Science gives us the tool for curing, but it is the humanities which give us the tools for caring"[24]. And Akemi Shimizu also said, in *Kangokyouiku*, a Japanese nursing journal, "Good literature is a treasure for nurses (translated by authors)"[25]. Literature or literary text is a colorful texture interwoven by many complicated events and feelings which we cannot understand without our imagination. Literature, therefore, gives us a good insight into human nature. Using literature in nursing education can provide students with opportunities to share their own ideas and thoughts with other in-training nurses through reading and discussing literary works.

5．Conclusion

This study shows the historical changes and the recent trend of literature-based education in nursing in both the US and UK. The three tables produced by the chronological analysis of the articles will be a good reference source available to the teachers or the researchers who are interested in this field.

Our future research will be to explore how we could use literature effectively, what kinds of works are appropriate to use and so on.

Note

＊Philip Darbyshire conducted a course titled 'Understanding Caring Through Arts and Humanities' for the first year nursing students at Glasgow Caledonian University in Scotland for 6 years prior to his move to University of South Australia and Flinders University in Australia. One of his research interests is the development of Arts & Humanities approaches in health care education[26].

References

1) Ubukawa, E., Ishida, M.Y. (2012): Significance of Literature-Based Education in the EFL Classroom for Nursing Students, *Bulletin of Gunma Prefectural College of Health Sciences*, Vol. 7, 4

2) Darbyshire, P. (1994): "Understanding caring through arts and humanities: a medical/nursing humanities approach to promoting alternative experiences of thinking and learning," *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, 19: 856

3) Ibid., 856

4) Hawkins, A.H. and McEntyre, M.C. ed.

（2006）: *Teaching Literature and Medicine*, New York: The Modern Language Association of America, 4

5 ） Sakalys, J.A.（2002）: Literary Pedagogy in Nursing: A Theory Based Perspective, *Journal of Nursing Education*, 41（9）: 386

6 ） Bartol, G.M.（1986）: Using the Humanities in Nursing Education, *Nurse Educator*, 11（1）: 21

7 ） Darbyshire（1994）op. cit., 856

8 ） Darbyshire, P.（1995）: Lessons from Literature: Caring, Interpretation, and Dialogue, *Journal of Nursing Education*, 34（5）: 211

9 ） McKie, A., Gass, J.P.（2001）: Understanding mental health through reading selected literature sources: an evaluation, *Nurse Education Today*, 21（3）: 201

10） Hanson, K.S.（1988）: A Historical Analysis of the Liberal Education Theme in Nursing Education: 1893-1952. Diss. The University of Iowa, 200

11） Ibid., 195

12） Wilson, H.S.（1974）: A Case for Humanities in Professional Nursing Education, *Nursing Forum*, 8（4）: 410

13） Stowe, A.C., Igo, L.C.（1996）: Learning from Literature Novels, Plays, Short Stories, and Poems in Nursing Education, *Nurse Educator*, 21（5）: 16

14） West, T.B. Encyclopedia of Death and Dying. Web. 3 Sept. 2012. 〈http://www.deathreference.com〉

15） Younger, J.B.（1990）: Literary Works as a Mode of Knowing, *IMAGE*: Journal of *Nursing Scholarship*, 22（1）: 42

16） Hanson op. cit., 194

17） Bartol, G.M.（1986）: Using the Humanities in Nursing Education, *Nurse Educator*, 11（1）: 23

18） Swanwick, M.（1981）: A novel approach, *Nursing Mirror*, July 8: 39

19） Burnard, P.（1992）: A novel approach, *Nursing*, 5（2）: 22

20） Bartol, G.M.（1998）: Using Literature to Create Cultural Competence, *IMAGE*: *Journal of Nursing Scholarship*, 30: 78

21） Anderson, K.L.（2004）: Teaching Cultural Competence Using an Exemplar from Literary Journalism, *Journal of Nursing Educatio*n, 43: 253

22） Cagle, C.S., Walker, C.A., Newcomb, P.（2006）: Using Imaginative Literature in Clinical Courses to Improve Student Outcomes, *Journal of Theory Construction & Testing*, 10（1）: 9

23） Carter, R. and Long, M.N.（1991）: *Teaching Literature*, London: Longman, 3

24） Bevis, E.O.（1989）: "The Curriculum Consequences: Aftermath of Revolution," New York: National League for nursing, 127

25） 清水昭美（1976）： エゴイズムと愛の間に　夏目漱石著 "こころ" 看護教育　17（3）： 187

26） Midwifery Conference Professor Philip Darbyshire. Web. 26 Mar. 2012. 〈http://www.wsahs.nsw.gov.au/conferences/midwifery/darbyshire.htm〉

Bibliography

Anderson, K.L.（2004）: Teaching Cultural Competence Using an Exemplar from Literary Journalism, *Journal of Nursing Education*, 43（6）: 253-259

Bartol, G.M.（1986）: Using the Humanities in Nursing Education, *Nurse Educator*, 11（1）:

21–23

Bartol, G.M. (1989): Creative Literature: An Aid to Nursing Practice, *Nursing & Health Care*, 10(8): 453–457

Bartol, G.M. (1998): Using Literature to Create Cultural Competence, *IMAGE: Journal of Nursing Scholarship*, 30(1): 75–79

Bevis, E.O. (1989): "The Curriculum Consequences: Aftermath of Revolution," New York: National League for nursing, 115–134

Brown, D.L. (2010): Using Art and Literature in the Clinical Setting: An Innovative Assignment, *Nurse Educator*, 35(2): 52–53

Burnard, P. (1992): A novel approach, *Nursing*, 5(2): 21–22

Butell, S.S., O'Donovan, P., Taylor, J.D. (2004): Instilling the Value of Reading Literature Through Student-Led Book Discussion Groups, *Journal of Nursing Education*, 43(1): 40–44

Cagle, C.S., Walker, C.A., Newcomb, P. (2006): Using Imaginative Literature in Clinical Courses to Improve Student Outcomes, *Journal of Theory Construction & Testing*, 10(1): 6-10

Carter, R. and Long, M.N. (1991): *Teaching Literature*, London: Longman

Cassidy, V.R. (1996): Literary Works as Case Studies for Teaching Human Experimentation Ethics, *Journal of Nursing Education*, 35(3): 142–144

Crawley, J.M. (2009): "Once Upon a Time": A Discussion of Children's Picture Books as a Narrative Educational Tool for Nursing Students, *Journal of Nursing Education*, 48(1): 36–39

Darbyshire, P. (1994): "Understanding caring through arts and humanities: a medical/nursing humanities approach to promoting alternative experiences of thinking and learning," *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, 19: 856–863

Darbyshire, P. (1995): Lessons from Literature: Caring, Interpretation, and Dialogue, *Journal of Nursing Education*, 34(5): 211–216

DeBrew, J.K., Rankin, C. (2009): A Liberal Education: Making the Essentials Practical, *Nurse Educator*, 34(3): 103–104

Dolores, J.W. (2006): The Art of Nursing Expressed in Poetry, *Journal of Nursing Education*, 45(11): 458–461

Engstrom, J.L., Hunter, R.G. (2007): Teaching Reproductive Options Through the Use of Fiction: The Cider House Rules Project, *Journal of Obstetric, Gynecologic & Neonatal Nursing*, 36(5): 464–470

German, C.P. (1986): Using Literature to Teach Nursing, *Journal of Nursing Education*, 25(2): 84–86

Giarratano, G.P. (1997): Story as Text for Undergraduate Curriculum, *Journal of Nursing Education*, 36(3): 128–134

Harrison, E. (2001): Advancing Nursing Scholarship through the Interpretation of Imaginative Literature: Ancestral Connectedness and the Survival of the Sufferer, *Advances in Nursing Science*, 24(2): 65-80

Harrison, E. (2006): Teaching Compassion: Multiple Sclerosis and the Poetry of Molley Holden, *Nurse Educator*, 31(3): 103–106

Halloran, L. (2009): Teaching Transcultural Nursing Through Literature, *Journal of Nursing Education*, 48(9): 523–528

Hanson, K.S. (1988): A Historical Analysis of

the Liberal Education Theme in Nursing Education: 1893-1952. Diss. The University of Iowa

Hawkins, A.H. and McEntyre, M.C. ed. (2006): *Teaching Literature and Medicine*, New York: The Modern Language Association of America.

Hegge, M. (2008): Literature and Arts as a Prologue for Moral Energy, *Nursing Science Quarterly*, 21(4): 306-309

Hoffman, A.L. (1997): Ways of Knowing in Gerontology: Learning From Narrative Literature, *Journal of Nursing Education*, 36(6): 284-288

Holaday, B. (1993): Adolescent Literature as a Means of Studying Growth and Development, *Journal of Nursing Education*, 32(2): 93-95

Holdsworth, J.N. (1968): Vicarious Experience of Reading a Book in Changing Students' Attitudes, *Nursing Research*, 17(2): 135-139

Jensen, A., Curtis, M. (2008): A Descriptive Qualitative Study of Student Learning in a Psychosocial Nursing Class Infused with Art, Literature, Music, and Film, *International Journal of Nursing Education Scholarship*, 5(1): 1-9

Kidd, L.I., Tusaie, K.R. (2004): Disconfirming Beliefs: The Use of Poetry to Know the Lived Experience of Student Nurses in Mental Health Clinicals, *Issues in Mental Health Nursing*, 25: 403-414

Leffers, J., Martins, D.C. (2004): Journey to Compassion: Meeting Vulnerable Populations in Community Health Nursing Through Literature, *International Journal for Human Caring*, 8(1): 20-28

McKie, A., Gass, J.P. (2001): Understanding mental health through reading selected literature sources: an evaluation, *Nurse Education Today*, 21(3): 201-208

Midwifery Conference Professor Philip Darbyshire. Web. 26 Mar. 2012. ⟨http://www.wsahs.nsw.gov.au/conferences/midwifery/darbyshire.htm⟩

Mohr, W.K. (1995): Integrating Esthetics Into Nursing: Literature as a Suggested Modality, *Archives of Psychiatric Nursing*, 9(6): 365-372

Newcomb, P., Cagle, C., Walker, C. (2006): Using Imaginative Literature to Foster Cultural Sensitivity, *International Journal of Nursing Education Scholarship*, 3(1) Article 4 N. pag.

Peterson, L.C., Booth, C. (1988): Literature and Music: An Educational Strategy in Psychiatric Mental Health Nursing, *Journal of Nursing Education*, 27(8): 374-377

Ruffing, M.A. (1975): Literature by consumers for nursing, *Nursing Forum*, 14 (1): 87-94

Sakalys, J.A. (2002): Literary Pedagogy in Nursing: A Theory Based Perspective, Journal of *Nursing Education*, 41(9): 386-392

Stowe, A.C., Igo, L.C. (1996): Learning from Literature Novels, Plays, Short Stories, and Poems in Nursing Education, *Nurse Educator*, 21(5): 16-19

Smith, M.A. (1996): The Use of Poetry to Test Nursing Knowledge, *Nurse Educator*, 21(5): 20-22

Swanwick, M. (1981): A novel approach, *Nursing Mirror*, July 8: 38-39

Treistman, J.M. (1986): Teaching Nursing Care Through Poetry, *Nursing Outlook*,

62

34(2): 83-87

West, T.B. Encyclopedia of Death and Dying. Web. 3 Sept. 2012. ⟨http://www.deathreference. com⟩

Williams, C. and George, J. (1968): Lay Literature As an Adjunctive Teaching Tool, *Journal of Psychosocial Nursing and Mental Health Services*, July-August: 226–229

Wilson, H.S. (1974): A Case for Humanities in Professional Nursing Education, *Nursing Forum*, 8(4): 406–417

Winland-Brown, J.E. (1996): Can Caring for Critically Ill Patients Be Taught by Reading a Novel?, *Nurse Educator*, 21(5): 23-27

Young-Mason, J. (1988): Literature as a Mirror to Compassion, *Journal of Professional Nursing*, 4(4): 299-301

Younger, J.B. (1990): Literary Works as a Mode of Knowing, *IMAGE*: *Journal of Nursing Scholarship*, 22(1): 39-43

Ubukawa, E., Ishida, M.Y. (2012): Significance of Literature-Based Education in the EFL Classroom for Nursing Students, *Bulletin of Gunma Prefectural College of Health Sciences*, Vol. 7, 1–13

清水昭美(1976)：エゴイズムと愛の間に　夏目漱石著“こころ”看護教育　17(3): 182–187

英米における文学を教材とする看護教育に関する文献研究

鵜生川恵美子[1]・宮崎洋子[1]・林ノブ子[2]
１）群馬県立県民健康科学大学
２）高崎経済大学

目的：本研究が日本の看護教育において文学を教材とした EFL（English as a Foreign Language）の授業への有益な指針となるように，英米における文学を教材とする看護教育に関する文献を時系列に分析し，研究者が文学によって高められると考えた目標を明確にする．

方法：CINAHL（Cumulative Index to Nursing & Allied Health Literature）から literature, nursing, education をキーワードとして得られた41件の文献を時系列に分析した．

結果：１）看護教育における文学導入は，1960年代からである．２）圧倒的に合衆国における研究が多い．３）実際に扱われた，および可能とされた作品は形式別では５グループ，テーマ別では４グループに分類される．４）研究者が文学によって高められると考えた目標は主に，self-growth, critical thinking, understanding of patients, compassion, insight, cultural competence, empathy, ethical knowledge, sensitivity, vicarious experiences などである．

結論：本研究により，英米における文学を教材とする看護教育についての歴史的変遷や傾向が明確になった．今後，日本の看護学生を対象とした EFL の授業へ文学を導入するための有益な指針としての役割を果たすことが期待される．

キーワード：看護教育，文学，文献研究