

1 **Ecological selection of siderophore-producing microbial taxa in response**  
2 **to heavy metal contamination**

3

4 Elze Hesse<sup>1§\*</sup>, Siobhán O'Brien<sup>1,2\*</sup>, Nicolas Tromas<sup>3</sup>, Florian Bayer<sup>1¶</sup>, Adela Lujan<sup>1,4</sup>, Eleanor van  
5 Veen<sup>5</sup>, Dave J. Hodgson<sup>6</sup>, Angus Buckling<sup>1‡</sup>

6

7 <sup>1</sup> ESI & CEC, Biosciences, University of Exeter, Penryn Campus, Cornwall, TR10 9FE, UK. E-  
8 mail: F.Bayer@exeter.ac.uk<sup>¶</sup>, A.J.Buckling@exeter.ac.uk<sup>‡</sup>

9 <sup>2</sup> Institut für Integrative Biologie, ETH Zürich, Universitätstrasse 16, Zürich, 8092, Switzerland. E-  
10 mail: siobhan.obrien@env.ethz.ch

11 <sup>3</sup> Département de sciences biologiques, Université de Montréal, 90 Vincent-d'Indy, Montréal, QC  
12 H2V 2S9, Canada. E-mail: tromas.nicolas@gmail.com

13 <sup>4</sup> CIQUIBIC, Departamento de Química Biológica, Facultad de Ciencias Químicas, CONICET,  
14 Universidad Nacional de Córdoba, Córdoba, Argentina. E-mail: adem.lujan@gmail.com

15 <sup>5</sup> Camborne School of Mines, CEMPS, University of Exeter, Penryn Campus, Cornwall TR10 9FE,  
16 UK. E-mail: E.M.Van-Veen@exeter.ac.uk

17 <sup>6</sup> CEC, University of Exeter, Penryn Campus, Cornwall, TR10 9FE, UK. E-mail:  
18 D.J.Hodgson@exeter.ac.uk

19

20 \* These authors contributed equally to this work

21

22 <sup>§</sup> Correspondence: E-mail: elzehesse@gmail.com; Tel: +44 (0) 1326 259470; Fax: +44 (0) 1392  
23 263434

24

25 Conflict of Interest: We declare no conflict of interest

26

27 Authorship: EH, SOB, AL, DJH, EvV, AB conceived and designed the experiment. DJH provided  
28 new perspectives. EH, SOB, FB, AL collected the data. EH, FB, NT, DJH carried out the data  
29 analyses. EH & AB wrote the first draft of the manuscript, and all authors contributed substantially  
30 to revisions.

31  
32 Data accessibility: Upon acceptance, data presented in the manuscript will be made available on  
33 Dryad.

34  
35 Running title: Metals select for siderophore production

36  
37 Type of Article: Letter

38  
39 Key words: Adaptation, Detoxification, Ecological species sorting, Evolution, Metal tolerance,  
40 Public good dynamics, Remediation, Selection

41  
42 Word count: Abstract (145), Main text (4994)

43  
44 Number of: references (82), Figures (5), Tables (0), Text boxes (0)

45 **Abstract**

46 Some microbial public goods can provide both individual and community-wide benefits, and are  
47 open to exploitation by non-producing species. One such example is the production of metal-  
48 detoxifying siderophores. Here, we investigate whether the conflicting selection pressures on  
49 siderophore production by heavy metals – a detoxifying effect of siderophores, and exploitation of  
50 this detoxifying effect - results in a net increase or decrease. We show that the proportion of  
51 siderophore-producing taxa increases along a natural heavy metal gradient. A causal link between  
52 metal contamination and siderophore production was subsequently demonstrated in a microcosm  
53 experiment in compost, in which we observed changes in community composition towards taxa that  
54 produce relatively more siderophores following copper contamination. We confirmed the selective  
55 benefit of siderophores by showing that taxa producing large amount of siderophores suffered less  
56 growth inhibition in toxic copper. Our results suggest that ecological selection will favour  
57 siderophore-mediated decontamination, with important consequences for potential remediation  
58 strategies.

- Angus Buckling 6/10/17 13:45  
**Deleted:** imposed by heavy metals increases siderophore production in natural microbial communities
- Angus Buckling 6/10/17 13:46  
**Deleted:** or whether
- Angus Buckling 6/10/17 13:46  
**Deleted:** reduces siderophore production

## 64 INTRODUCTION

65 It is becoming increasingly apparent that many public goods benefit not only conspecifics but also  
66 other species. For example, many bacterial proteases show extracellular activity, providing potential  
67 nutritional benefits to neighbouring bacteria independent of taxonomy (Suleman 2016); and  
68 immune-repressing molecules produced by parasitic nematodes provide a potential benefit to all co-  
69 infecting parasites (Maizels *et al.* 2001). Regardless of whether public goods are solely conspecific  
70 or also have interspecific benefits, there is potential for non-producers to outcompete producers  
71 assuming public good production carries some metabolic cost (Hamilton 1964; Hamilton & Axelrod  
72 1981; Frank 1994). Hence, the evolution of costly public goods is crucially dependent on the extent  
73 to which benefits are reaped by producers, other individuals carrying the public good gene or non-  
74 producers. While the evolution of public goods has been studied extensively within species, we  
75 know very little about how ecological sorting influences interspecific public good production within  
76 natural communities. Here we combine surveys and experiments to determine how ecological  
77 selection acts on a microbial interspecific public good: siderophore-mediated heavy metal  
78 decontamination.

79 Heavy metals are ubiquitous components of the Earth's crust, and large amounts have been  
80 released into the environment as a result of human activities (Nriagu & Pacyna 1988). Heavy metals  
81 are toxic to microbes to varying degrees (Giller *et al.* 1998) and their presence can greatly impact  
82 natural communities (Gans *et al.* 2005). In the face of long-term selection, microbes have evolved  
83 mechanisms to cope with metal toxicity, including metal reduction, reduced cell permeability and  
84 extracellular sequestration (Nies 1999; Bruins *et al.* 2000; Valls & De Lorenzo 2002). One such  
85 detoxification mechanism is the production of siderophores. While the canonical function of  
86 siderophores is to scavenge insoluble iron (Ratledge & Dover 2000), bacteria also use these  
87 secreted molecules to detoxify metals (Braud *et al.* 2010). Siderophore production can be induced  
88 by the presence of non-iron metals (Hofte *et al.* 1993; Teitzel *et al.* 2006), which they bind with  
89 various affinities (Braud *et al.* 2009). These siderophore-metal complexes are unable to enter

90 bacterial cells, thereby reducing free toxic metal concentrations in the environment (Schalk *et al.*  
91 2011). This has led to the suggestion of adding siderophores or siderophore-producing microbes to  
92 remediate metal-contaminated environments (Rajkumar *et al.* 2010; O'Brien & Buckling 2015).  
93 However, to understand how siderophores may both contribute to natural decontamination and  
94 long-term remediation efficacy, it is crucial to determine how metal toxicity affects selection for  
95 siderophore production in natural communities.

96 Given their detoxifying effect, increasing metal toxicity might be expected to result in  
97 ecological species sorting in favour of species with greater siderophore production. However, the  
98 production of detoxifying siderophores not only benefits the producer (or its close relatives), but  
99 potentially also neighbouring cells, both con- and hetero-specific, in the community. Siderophore  
100 production – which is up-regulated in response to heavy metals (Hofte *et al.* 1993; Teitzel *et al.*  
101 2006) – is often associated with a fitness cost, hence selection may favour cells that produce fewer  
102 siderophores, but still receive the same detoxifying benefits of siderophore production from  
103 neighbours (West *et al.* 2007; O'Brien *et al.* 2014). This can result in a 'tragedy of the commons',  
104 whereby mean siderophore production levels are actually reduced in the presence of toxic metals,  
105 despite the benefits that siderophores provide to the group as a whole (O'Brien *et al.* 2014).  
106 moreover, the (almost) complete loss of public goods production, and the resultant decline in group  
107 productivity, has been observed in various experimental set ups, including siderophore production  
108 under iron-limited conditions (Griffin *et al.* 2004). Limited diffusion of public goods (Kummerli *et*  
109 *al.* 2009; Kummerli *et al.* 2014) and positive assortment of producing cells resulting from spatial  
110 structure (Hamilton 1964; West *et al.* 2007; Mitri & Foster 2013; Ghoul & Mitri 2016; Pande *et al.*  
111 2016) may, however, limit community-wide benefits and prevent overexploitation of siderophores  
112 by non-producing cells (Oliveira *et al.* 2014), potentially resulting in stable coexistence of  
113 producing and non-producing taxa (Cordero *et al.* 2012; Morris *et al.* 2012; Morris 2015; Estrela *et*  
114 *al.* 2016). The situation is further complicated by the iron-scavenging function of siderophores,  
115 which is also open to exploitation within (Griffin *et al.* 2004; Buckling *et al.* 2007; Lujan *et al.*

Angus Buckling 6/10/17 14:20

Deleted: may then

Angus Buckling 6/10/17 14:20

Deleted: would

Angus Buckling 6/10/17 14:21

Deleted: .

Angus Buckling 6/10/17 12:26

Moved (insertion) [1]

Angus Buckling 6/10/17 12:27

Deleted: **T**

Angus Buckling 6/10/17 12:27

Deleted: **is**

Angus Buckling 6/10/17 12:28

Deleted: **in the context of**

Angus Buckling 6/10/17 12:26

Moved up [1]: This has been observed in various experimental set ups, including in the context of siderophore production (Griffin *et al.* 2004).

126 2015) and between species (Barber & Elde 2015; Galet *et al.* 2015). Given that siderophores  
127 provide direct benefits (and indirect benefits through helping kin), but may also benefit non-kin and  
128 other species, it is unclear if net siderophore production will increase or decrease in natural  
129 communities as a function of metal toxicity.

130 To investigate how metal contamination affects ecological selection for siderophore  
131 production, we first confirmed that siderophores act as interspecific public goods in an *in vitro*  
132 siderophore-addition experiment. We then conducted a survey along a natural contamination  
133 gradient. We correlated total metal content and soil acidity with species composition and estimates  
134 of siderophore production determined from the proportion of bacteria that show detectable  
135 extracellular iron-chelation *in vitro*. Soil acidity is an important environmental factor determining  
136 metal solubility and thereby toxicity. We then conducted an experimental study in compost  
137 communities to determine causal links between metal contamination and siderophore production.  
138 Note that we do not simultaneously address within species selection alongside ecological selection,  
139 largely because the genetic resolution of our sequencing methods is only at the genus level.

140

## 141 **METHODS**

### 142 **Siderophores as interspecific public goods**

143 To test whether siderophores can act as interspecific public goods we quantified whether the  
144 presence of heterospecific siderophores – produced by taxonomically diverse soil-dwelling  
145 microbes – ameliorates growth of non-producing *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* in copper-contaminated  
146 broth. We inoculated  $\sim 10^4$  colony forming units (CFUs) of a producing *P. aeruginosa* strain (PA01)  
147 and an isogenic non-producing mutant (PA01 $\Delta$ pvdD $\Delta$ pchEF) in isolation into 3-4 replicate micro-  
148 centrifuge tubes, containing 900  $\mu$ l of copper-contaminated KB broth (final morality 0.6 mM  
149 CuSO<sub>4</sub>), which reduces relative non-producer fitness (O'Brien *et al.* 2014). In addition,  $\sim 10^4$  CFUs  
150 of either strain were inoculated in copper broth containing 0.6 mM of yersiniabactin (*P. stutzeri*),  
151 ornibactin (*Burkholderia vietnamiensis*), ferrioxamine E (*Streptomyces olivaceus*) or schizokinen

152 (*Bacillus megaterium*). Copper is a common heavy metal (Nriagu & Pacyna 1988), including at our  
153 field site (Fig. 2A); hence, we used CuSO<sub>4</sub> in all *in vitro* assays. Bacterial cultures were horizontally  
154 shaken at 37°C for 24 hours (h), after which culture was plated onto agar to obtain cell densities and  
155 calculate Malthusian growth rate:  $m = \ln(N_f/N_0)/\Delta t$ , where N<sub>0</sub> and N<sub>f</sub> are initial and final bacterial  
156 densities, and  $\Delta t = 24\text{h}$ .

157 To confirm that non-producer growth was lower in toxic copper compared to the siderophore-  
158 producing strain, we used a one-way ANOVA. We tested whether heterospecific siderophores can  
159 ameliorate non-producer growth using a one-tailed t-test comparing mean growth differences  
160 between strains in control and siderophore-supplemented copper broth.

161

## 162 **Natural microbial communities**

### 163 *Soil collection and characterization*

164 Soil samples were collected in a former poly-metallic mining area situated in the Poldice Valley (N:  
165 50°14.56; W: 5°10.10) in Cornwall (UK). The valley is rich in heavy metals, as apparent from the  
166 significant production of heavy metals during the 18-19<sup>th</sup> centuries (Burt 1998). The area is no  
167 longer worked leaving a legacy of untreated mining waste. 94 samples were collected by pushing  
168 sterile bulb planters into the ground near chimneys, slag heaps and regenerated areas, representing a  
169 wide contamination range. The upper part of the soil core was discarded to rule out possible ground  
170 surface contamination. Samples were then transferred to sterile 50 millilitre (ml) falcon tubes and  
171 stored at 4°C until further processing. Prior to DNA extraction and soil characterization, samples  
172 were sieved using individual plastic sterile sieves with 1 millimetre mesh size.

173 Quantification of heavy metals and metalloids (e.g., Fe, Cd, Cr, Cu, Mn, Hg, Ni, Ti, V, Zn,  
174 Pb, Sn, As) was carried out by ALS global (Loughrea, Ireland), using an aqua regia digest (EPA  
175 3050b). To assess the total content of these determinants, samples were analysed using emission  
176 spectroscopy (ICP-OES). For each sample, we quantified pH by suspending 1 gram (g) of soil in 5

177 ml of 0.01M CaCl<sub>2</sub> (Hendershot & Lalande 2008), which was shaken for 30 minutes (min) and left  
178 to stand for 1h, after which pH was measured using a Jenway 3510 pH meter (Stone, UK).

179

#### 180 *Siderophore production*

181 The relationship between siderophore production, soil acidity and metal contamination was tested  
182 by screening a subset of clones for siderophore production. Siderophore production was necessarily  
183 measured under common garden conditions to avoid confounding effects of environmental variation  
184 if conducted *in situ*, causing both differential siderophore induction and soil metal-chelating  
185 activities, which could directly affect the siderophore assay. For each sample, 1 g of soil was  
186 transferred to 6 ml of M9 solution in 30 ml glass vials, which were shaken for 2h at 28°C and 180  
187 rpm, after which supernatant was plated onto LB agar. Thirty colonies per sample were randomly  
188 selected and grown for 48h independently in 200 microliter (µl) KB broth at 28°C. A 2 µl sample  
189 from each colony was then spotted on blue-tinted iron-limited CAS agar plates (Schwyn & Neilands  
190 1987) using a pin replicator. Plates were incubated at 28°C for 48h, after which we scored the  
191 presence of orange halos, a qualitative indicator of siderophore secretion, to obtain an estimate of  
192 the proportion of siderophore-producing clones in each community.

193

#### 194 *DNA extractions and real time PCR*

195 To determine how community abundance and composition varied across soils we extracted genomic  
196 DNA from 250 milligram (mg) soil per sample, using MoBio Powerlyzer PowerSoil© DNA  
197 isolation kits (Carlsbad, CA, USA), following the manufacturer's protocol with the bead beating  
198 parameter set to 4500 rpm for 45 seconds (s). The integrity of DNA was confirmed using 1% TAE  
199 agarose gels stained with 1x Redsafe DNA Stain (20 000X); 5 samples were subsequently  
200 discarded, yielding 89 DNA samples in total.

201 Community density was quantified using real-time PCR (StepOnePlus Real-Time PCR,  
202 Applied Biosystems, Foster City, CA, USA) on 1:10 and 1:100 diluted samples with primers 16S



203 rRNA 338f (ACT CCT ACG GGA GGC AGC AG) and 518r (ATT ACC GCG GCT GCT GG)  
204 (Øvreås & Torsvik 1998). Triplicates of each sample were run along gDNA standards ( $5 \times 10^{2-6}$  16S  
205 rRNA genes of *Pseudomonas fluorescens*) and non-template controls. All assays were based on 15  
206  $\mu\text{L}$  reactions, using 1x Brilliant III Ultra-Fast SYBR® Green QPCR Master Mix (Agilent  
207 technologies, Santa Clara, CA, USA), 150nM 338f and 300nM 518r primers, 300nM ROX and  
208 100ng/ $\mu\text{L}$  BSA. Thermal conditions were set to 3 min at 95°C for initial denaturation, followed by  
209 40 cycles of 5s at 95°C and 10s at 60°C (collection of fluorescent data), followed by a melting curve  
210 at 95°C for 15s, 60°C for 1 min ramping up to 95°C in steps of +0.3°C for 15s. Melting curves and  
211 confirmation of non-template controls was analysed using StepOne Software 2.3 (Applied  
212 Biosystems). Baseline corrections, Cq values and efficiencies ( $1.89 \pm 0.07$  and  $1.89 \pm 0.08$  for  
213 standards and samples) were determined using LinRegPCR version 2016.0 (Ruijter *et al.* 2009).  
214 16S rRNA gene quantities were calculated using the one point calibration method (Brankatschk *et*  
215 *al.* 2012), corrected for variation in dry weight. Bacterial cell counts were estimated using  
216 ‘CopyRighter’ (Angly *et al.* 2014), which corrects for variation in lineage-specific 16S gene copy  
217 numbers across samples. Note that this method does not account for unassigned OTUs.

218

#### 219 *Statistical analyses*

220 Because of strong collinearity among heavy metals, we carried out a principal component analysis  
221 (PCA) on centred and scaled data. Most metals loaded positively on the first principal component  
222 (PC1; Fig. 2A), which was subsequently used as proxy for total contamination. To test how PC1  
223 and pH affect siderophore production we used individual generalized linear models (GLMs) with a  
224 quasi-binomial error structure. The effect of these environmental variables on bacterial densities  
225 was tested using individual GLMs on  $\log_{10}$ -transformed data.

226

#### 227 *Sequencing, OTU picking and diversity analyses*

228 Library preparation and sequencing was performed by the Center for Genomic Research (University

229 of Liverpool, Supplementary Methods).

230 Base-calling and de-multiplexing of indexed reads was performed using CASAVA (Illumina,  
231 San Diego, CA, USA) to produce 89 samples from the 1st lane of sequence data, which were  
232 trimmed to remove Illumina adapter sequences using Cutadapt (Martin 2011) and to remove low  
233 quality bases, using Sickle 1.200 with a minimum quality score of 20. After trimming, reads <10 bp  
234 were removed. If both reads from a pair passed this filter, each was included in the R1 (forward  
235 reads) or R2 (reverse reads) file. If only one of a read pair passed this filter, it was included in the  
236 R0 (unpaired reads) file.

237 Sequences were processed using default parameters of the SmileTrain pipeline  
238 (<https://github.com/almlab/SmileTrain/wiki/>), including reads quality and chimera filtering, paired-  
239 end joining, de-replication and *de novo* distribution-based clustering using USEARCH (Edgar 2010;  
240 <http://www.drive5.com/usearch>), Mothur (Schloss *et al.* 2009), Biopython, dbOTUcaller  
241 algorithms (Preheim *et al.* 2013; <https://github.com/spacocha/dbOTUcaller>) and custom scripts. We  
242 generated an OTU table that was filtered to minimize false OTUs using QIIME (Caporaso *et al.*  
243 2010; <http://qiime.org/>) by removing OTUs observed <10. We assigned taxonomy, post-clustering,  
244 using the 97% reference OTU collection of the GreenGenes database (<http://greengenes.lbl.gov>).  
245 Taxonomy information was added to the OTU table using biom add-metadata scripts (<http://biom->  
246 [format.org/](http://format.org/)). A total of 8 604 074 sequences were obtained, ranging from 39 253 to 192 455 reads  
247 per sample, with a median of 91 646. This dataset was clustered into 45 891 OTUs.

248 Diversity calculations were based on non-rarefied OTU tables.  $\beta$ -diversity was calculated  
249 using Jensen-Shannon Divergence (JSD) metrics (Fuglede & Topsoe 2004; Preheim *et al.* 2013),  
250 which are robust to sequencing depth variation. The R ‘phyloseq’ package (McMurdie & Holmes  
251 2013) was used to transform the OTU table into relative abundances, which were square-root-  
252 transformed into Euclidean metrics (Legendre & Gallagher 2001). Finally, we used Nonmetric  
253 Multidimensional Scaling (NMDS) plots (Shepard 1962; Kruskal 1964) to order bacterial  
254 community composition. Differences in community structure were tested using PERMANOVA

255 (Anderson 2001), implemented using *adonis()* from the R ‘vegan’ package with 999 permutations.

256 To confirm that pH and PC1 shape community structure, we used K-means partitioning  
257 algorithms (MacQueen 1967) implemented with *cascadaKM()* from the ‘vegan’ package with 999  
258 permutations. K-means is a completely independent way of binning samples. We Hellinger-  
259 transformed (Rao 1995) the OTUs table using *decostand(x, method="hellinger")* and tested whether  
260 our samples naturally clustered into 2-10 groups based on their composition using the Calinski-  
261 Harabasz index (Caliński & Harabasz 1974).

262 To investigate how environmental variables contributed towards explaining variation in  
263 community composition, we used a multivariate regression tree analysis (MRT; Breiman *et al.*  
264 1984; De'Ath 2002) for pH and PC1 separately, using the R ‘mvpart’ package (De'Ath 2007;  
265 Therneau *et al.* 2015). The OTU table was first Hellinger-transformed (Rao 1995) before carrying  
266 out the analyses (Ouellette *et al.* 2012). After 200 cross-validations (Breiman *et al.* 1984), we  
267 plotted and pruned the tree using the 1-SE rule (Legendre & Legendre 2012) to select the least  
268 complex model. We used *rpart.pca()* from the ‘mvpart’ package to plot a PCA of the MRT.

269  $\alpha$ -diversity was estimated using Shannon (Oksanen *et al.* 2010; ‘vegan’ package) and Chao1  
270 (Vavrek & Larsson 2010; ‘fossil’ package) indices. We used *resample\_estimate()* from the R  
271 ‘breakaway’ package (Willis & Bungle 2014) to account for sample size variability, setting the  
272 number of bootstraps to 500 with replacement. The relationship between  $\alpha$ -diversity and  
273 environmental variables was tested using *betta()* from the ‘breakaway’ package, which accounts for  
274 statistical errors associated with estimating these indices.

275

## 276 **Copper-addition experiment**

### 277 *Experimental design*

278 To infer a causal relationship between toxic metals and siderophore production, we set up  
279 experimental compost communities. We isolated the community from fresh compost (Verve John  
280 Innes No. 1) by adding 40g to 200 ml of M9 solution and incubating at 150 rpm at 28°C for 24h.

281 Two ml ( $\sim 5 \times 10^7$  CFUs) of supernatant was subsequently used to seed twelve microbial  
282 communities in 90 millimetre Petri dishes containing 30g of twice-autoclaved compost. Hence, all  
283 treatments started off with the same community and level of siderophore production.

284 Microcosms were incubated at 26°C and 75% humidity for 24h, after which we supplemented  
285 six microcosms with 2 ml of filter-sterilised 0.25M CuSO<sub>4</sub> or ddH<sub>2</sub>O. This concentration of CuSO<sub>4</sub>  
286 hindered bacterial growth. Microcosms were incubated for 6 weeks. After three weeks, another 2 ml  
287 dose of CuSO<sub>4</sub> or ddH<sub>2</sub>O was added where appropriate. Samples of the community were taken prior  
288 to copper amendment and 3-6 weeks post-inoculation by transferring 1g compost to 6 ml of M9  
289 solution in 30 ml glass vials. Vials were shaken for 2h at 28°C at 180 rpm, after which supernatants  
290 were frozen at -80° C in 25% glycerol.

291

#### 292 *Siderophore and copper resistance assays*

293 To quantify siderophore production, 24 individual clones per treatment-time combination were  
294 isolated by incubating supernatant on LB plates at 28°C for 48h. Individual colonies were then  
295 transferred to 2 ml of KB broth and grown for 48h at 28°C, after which the supernatant was assayed  
296 for the extent of iron chelation. Siderophore production was quantified using the liquid CAS assay  
297 described by Schwyn and Neilands (1987), with the modification that one volume of ddH<sub>2</sub>O was  
298 added to the assay solution (Harrison & Buckling 2005). We used the following quantitative  
299 measure to obtain an estimate of siderophore production per clone:  $[1 - (A_i/A_{ref})] / [OD_i]$ , where  
300  $OD_i$  = optical density at 600 nanometre (nm) and  $A_i$  = absorbance at 630 nm of the assay mixture  $i$   
301 or reference mixture (KB+CAS;  $A_{ref}$ ). Note that CAS assays performed in iron-limited KB  
302 (supplemented with 20 mM NaHCO<sub>3</sub> and 100  $\mu\text{g ml}^{-1}$  human apotransferrin) provided qualitatively  
303 similar results (data not shown).

304 All final time-point clones were grown at 28°C for 24h, after which  $\sim 10^4$  CFUs were  
305 inoculated into 96-well plate wells containing 200  $\mu\text{l}$  of KB broth supplemented with or without a  
306 toxic dose of CuSO<sub>4</sub> (6.17 mM). Clones were incubated statically at 28°C for 48h, and their OD was

307 measured at 600 nm every 8-12h to quantify growth (Varioskan Flash plate reader, Thermo  
308 Scientific, Waltham, MA, USA).

309

#### 310 *Sanger sequencing of 16S rRNA*

311 The 16S rRNA gene of all assayed final-time point clones was sequenced to confirm genus-level  
312 identity: PCRs were performed in 25µL reactions containing 1x DreamTaq Green PCR Master Mix  
313 (2X) (Thermo Scientific), 200 nM of the 27F and 1492R primers and 3 µL of 1:100 diluted culture  
314 that had undergone 3 freeze-thaw cycles. The thermal cycling parameters were set to 94°C for 4  
315 min, followed by 35 cycles of 1 min at 94°C, 30s at 48°C and 2 min at 72°C, and a final extension of  
316 8 min at 72°C. Following Exo-AP clean-up, high quality samples were Sanger sequenced using the  
317 27F primer (Core Genomic Facility, University of Sheffield).

318 The quality of all sequences was assessed using *plotQualityProfile()* from the R 'dada2'  
319 package (Callahan *et al.* 2016). Based on the obtained plots, sequences were trimmed in Genious to  
320 achieve an overall quality score >35. Using Mother, sequences longer than 300bp were aligned to  
321 the Silva.Bacteria.Fasta database, and taxonomy was classified using the RDP trainset 14 032015 as  
322 reference database.

323

#### 324 *Statistical analyses*

325 The effects of copper and time on mean siderophore production was tested using a linear mixed  
326 effects (LME; 'lme4' R package; Bates *et al.* 2014) model with copper x time (3-6 weeks post  
327 inoculation) as fixed categorical effects and random intercepts fitted for each community ( $n = 12$ ),  
328 and individual clones nested within communities ( $n = 24$ ), to account for temporal dependencies.

329 We used NMDS ordination plots to depict pair-wise Bray-Curtis dissimilarities in genus-level  
330 composition between microcosms. To test whether treatments differed significantly in their  
331 composition we used PERMANOVA with 999 permutations, and tested for equality of between-  
332 treatment variance using permutation tests for homogeneity of multivariate dispersion.

333 To test for the effect of copper on metal tolerance, we used LME with  $\ln(\text{OD}_{\text{Cu}}/\text{OD}_{\text{KB}})$  as  
334 response variable, copper background as fixed effect and a random slope fitted for mean-centred  
335 hours: random= $\sim$ (Hours)|Community/Clone. The model thus accounts for intrinsic differences  
336 between communities, and nested clones, in their ability to tolerate toxic copper over time, and  
337 explicitly tests whether pre-adaptation to copper increases mean copper tolerance. To test whether  
338 tolerance was directly mediated by variation in siderophore production, we replaced ‘copper  
339 background’ with clone-specific siderophore production.

340 In general, full models were simplified by sequentially eliminating non-significant terms ( $P >$   
341 0.05), after which the significance of the explanatory variables was established using likelihood  
342 ratio tests. In case of significant differences, Tukey contrasts were computed using the ‘multcomp’  
343 package (Hothorn *et al.* 2008), with  $\alpha < 0.05$ . We used R Version 3.1.3 for all analyses  
344 (<http://www.r-project.org>).

345

## 346 RESULTS

### 347 Foreign siderophores restore non-producers fitness in toxic copper broth

348 Non-producer growth was significantly lower in toxic copper compared to that of the producing  
349 wild type strain of *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* ( $F_{1,6} = 10.97$ ,  $P = 0.02$ ; Fig. 1). Crucially, the addition  
350 of heterospecific siderophores significantly reduced mean growth differences between strains (one-  
351 tailed t-test:  $t = 3.67$ ,  $d.f. = 3$ ,  $P = 0.035$ ; Fig. 1).

352

### 353 Microbial diversity, abundance and siderophore production along a natural metal gradient

354 We found that the proportion of siderophore-producing isolates was significantly greater in more  
355 contaminated soils (PC1:  $\chi^2 = 4.42$ ;  $d.f. = 1$ ,  $P = 0.04$  Fig. 2C). Because contamination co-varied  
356 with soil acidity (Pearson’s correlation:  $r = 0.61$ ,  $d.f. = 86$  and  $P < 0.001$ ; Fig. 2B), siderophore  
357 production also increased as a function of pH ( $\chi^2 = 28.16$ ;  $d.f. = 1$ ,  $P < 0.001$ ; Fig. 2C). Neither pH  
358 nor PC1 significantly affected microbial abundance (GLM:  $F_{1, 87} = 0.01$ ,  $P = 0.99$  for PC1 and pH;

359 Fig. 2D). Note that total iron content neither co-varied with pH (Pearson's correlation:  $r = 0.03$ , d.f.  
360 = 86 and  $P = 0.09$ ) nor affected siderophore producers (Fe:  $\chi^2 = 0.45$ ; d.f. = 1,  $P = 0.50$ ; Fig. 3).  
361 Both pH and PC1 predicted community structure: samples with similar range values of pH  
362 (PERMANOVA:  $R^2 = 0.087$ ,  $P < 0.001$ ) or PC1 ( $R^2 = 0.065$ ,  $P < 0.001$ ) had similar community  
363 composition. Because the explanatory power of these variables was relatively low (Fig. S1 in  
364 Supplementary Information), we performed a K-means analysis, which showed that samples were  
365 naturally divided into 2-3 groups differing significantly in their PC1 or pH, respectively (Fig. S2 in  
366 Supplementary Information). We used MRT to confirm these findings and observed that  $R^2$  was  
367 highest when pH was used as explanatory variable (pH:  $R^2 = 0.183$  and PC1:  $R^2 = 0.085$ ; Fig. 4).  
368 Alpha diversity was largely independent of PC1, but varied as a function of pH (Fig. S3 in  
369 Supplementary Information;  $P < 0.001$  for both indices).

370

### 371 **The effect of copper on siderophore production in experimental communities**

372 Our assay of siderophore production along a natural gradient showed that siderophore production  
373 was greater in more contaminated soils. However, it remains unclear whether metals are a  
374 significant driver explaining variation in siderophore production. Notably, pH is an important  
375 predictor of soil bacterial diversity and composition (e.g., Fierer & Jackson 2006; Griffiths *et al.*  
376 2011), and correlated positively with contamination, making any interpretation ambiguous. To  
377 determine a causal link between metals and siderophore production, we carried out an experiment  
378 and characterised and measured siderophore production of multiple clones as well as their metal  
379 tolerance. We found that mean siderophore production was significantly greater in communities  
380 subjected to copper contamination (LME: copper effect:  $\chi^2 = 6.91$ ; d.f. = 1;  $P < 0.01$ ; Fig. 5A). Note  
381 that overall siderophore production decreased through time (time effect:  $\chi^2 = 16.02$ ; d.f. = 1;  $P <$   
382  $0.001$ ) independent of treatment (time x treatment effect:  $\chi^2 = 0.001$ ; d.f. = 1;  $P = 0.98$ ). Soil acidity  
383 marginally increased following copper contamination (mean pH  $\pm$  SE after 3 and 6 weeks of

384 incubation in control =  $7.13 \pm 0.05$ ,  $7.09 \pm 0.02$  and in copper =  $6.90 \pm 0.04$ ,  $6.60 \pm 0.05$ ), indicating  
385 that siderophore production was greater in more acidic compost.

386 We identified clones at the genus-level to explore the role of ecological sorting in driving  
387 siderophore production. Community composition varied significantly between treatments  
388 (PERMANOVA:  $F_{1, 11} = 3.88$ ,  $P = 0.015$ ; multivariate dispersion:  $F_{1, 11} = 0.021$ ,  $P = 0.91$ ; Fig. 5B),  
389 with siderophore-producing genera being selectively favoured in copper-contaminated compost  
390 (Fig. 5C and Table S2). Crucially, clones isolated from copper-contaminated communities were  
391 significantly less inhibited when grown in toxic copper broth compared to those from non-  
392 contaminated communities (LME:  $\chi^2 = 6.80$ ; d.f. = 1;  $P < 0.01$ ; Fig. 5D), which was mediated by  
393 increased siderophore production (LME:  $\chi^2 = 16.68$ ; d.f. = 1;  $P < 0.001$ ).

394

## 395 DISCUSSION

396 In this study, we investigated how heavy metals affected ecological selection for siderophore  
397 production – an interspecific microbial public good – across a natural contamination gradient and  
398 during a controlled experiment in compost. We hypothesised there could be selection for both  
399 increased and decreased siderophore production, because of the detoxifying effect of siderophores  
400 and the potential for interspecific exploitation, respectively. Our findings suggest that the presence  
401 of toxic metals resulted in net ecological selection for taxa that produced large amounts of  
402 siderophore, although this doesn't rule out the possibility that some exploitation occurs. We also  
403 confirmed that bacteria producing more siderophores suffered less growth inhibition in toxic copper  
404 broth.

405 Ecological selection for increased siderophore production contrasts with previous *in vitro*  
406 within-species (*P. aeruginosa*) results, in which non-producing 'cheats' were able to outcompete  
407 siderophore producers in copper-contaminated broth (O'Brien *et al.* 2014), resulting in a net  
408 reduction in siderophore production in the presence of toxic metals. A key reason for this difference  
409 is likely to be the spatial structure in soil/compost resulting in localised detoxification, such that



410 producers and their immediate neighbours gain the most from siderophores (Hamilton 1964; West  
411 & Buckling 2003; Buckling *et al.* 2007; West *et al.* 2007; Lujan *et al.* 2015). Hence, low  
412 siderophore producers should experience more of the toxic metal effect. Limited dispersal would  
413 also lead to immediate neighbours having a higher probability of being conspecifics - a likely  
414 reason as to why taxa that typically produce more siderophores dominated metal-contaminated  
415 communities. Direct comparison of intra- and inter-specific changes in siderophore production in  
416 soil would tease apart the differing roles of spatial and community structure in determining these  
417 results.

418 Siderophore production decreased in all our experimental communities over time, which is  
419 likely caused by novel abiotic selection pressures resulting from laboratory conditions. We also  
420 cannot rule out the possibility that non-producers did in fact benefit from siderophores produced by  
421 other community members. However, as the decrease occurred in both copper and non-copper  
422 environments, this reduction cannot be explained by exploitation of detoxifying siderophores. That  
423 is not to say that this exploitation does not play a role in the observed levels of siderophore  
424 production, but that the beneficial effects of siderophores to the producers outweigh these costs.  
425 This is analogous to the evolution of collective antibiotic resistance in microbial populations (Lee *et*  
426 *al.* 2010; Vega & Gore 2014), where resistant cells enhance the survival capacity of the overall  
427 population by allowing 'weaker' cells to endure more antibiotic stress than they could in isolation.

428 In our survey of a former mining area, soil acidity and total contamination positively co-  
429 varied, with both prolonged metal leaching in acidic soils and precipitation in more basic soils  
430 likely contributing to this pattern (Alloway 1990; Adriano 2001). This covariance may well have  
431 contributed to the observed patterns. First, acidity is a major determinant of microbial community  
432 composition (e.g., Fierer & Jackson 2006; Griffiths *et al.* 2011), hence pH-mediated selection may  
433 have indirectly favoured taxa that produce siderophores in larger amounts. Second, acidity affects  
434 metal speciation and bio-availability to microbes in variable ways (Lofts *et al.* 2004; Gobran &  
435 Huang 2011), with iron becoming largely insoluble at pH > 6.5 (Guerinot 1994). As such, increased

436 siderophore production in basic soils, which also had the highest metal concentrations, may have  
437 been driven by selection imposed by iron limitation. However, our experimental manipulations,  
438 where the same compost community was propagated with and without copper, strongly suggest a  
439 direct effect of metal-imposed selection on siderophore production. This manipulation did have a  
440 small effect on pH (copper decreased pH from approximately 7.1 to 6.6), but in this case there was  
441 negative, rather than positive, covariance.

442 It was initially surprising to find that microbial densities were similar along the contamination  
443 gradient; several studies have demonstrated that toxic metals reduce microbial abundance (reviewed  
444 in Giller *et al.* 1998). These differences may perhaps reflect relatively low concentrations of  
445 biologically available metals in our study; we only measured total metal content. Moreover, given  
446 the mining history of our focal site, microbes are likely to be relatively well adapted to toxic metals;  
447 ~~selection of taxa with increased copper tolerance occurred very rapidly in our experiment. Note that,~~  
448 ~~other more heavy metal resistance mechanisms, in addition to siderophore production, such as metal~~  
449 ~~reduction, reduced cell permeability~~ (Nies 1999; Bruins *et al.* 2000; Valls & De Lorenzo 2002)  
450 ~~were not investigated here, and hence~~ their importance relative to siderophores in determining metal  
451 resistance is unknown.

452 Human-imposed metal contamination is a major problem for natural ecosystems. Several  
453 studies have noted that addition of siderophores or siderophore-producing microbes could aid in  
454 detoxifying contaminated soils, particularly when combined with the use of hyper-accumulating  
455 plants, which commonly extract metals more efficiently when they are bound to siderophores  
456 (Lebeau *et al.* 2008; Dimkpa *et al.* 2009). Crucially, hyper-accumulating plants take up  
457 siderophore-metal complexes before metals flow back in the system following siderophore decay.  
458 Our results provide some key insights into the optimal use of siderophores for phytoremediation.  
459 The addition of high siderophore-producing bacteria following recent contamination events is likely  
460 to be effective, because these organisms should have a selective advantage and hence contribute to  
461 increasing community-level siderophore production. However, siderophore addition is unlikely to

- Angus Buckling 6/10/17 13:52  
**Deleted:** ,
- Angus Buckling 6/10/17 13:53  
**Deleted:** through
- Angus Buckling 6/10/17 13:55  
**Deleted:** direct
- Angus Buckling 6/10/17 13:55  
**Deleted:** not investigated here
- Angus Buckling 6/10/17 13:55  
**Deleted:** ,
- Angus Buckling 6/10/17 13:56  
**Deleted:** in addition to siderophore production. Selection of taxa with increased copper tolerance occurred very rapidly in our experiment, although
- Angus Buckling 6/10/17 13:57  
**Deleted:** we cannot rule out a role of additional resistance mechanisms positively co-varying with siderophore production, and

474 significantly improve phytoremediation of historically contaminated sites, in which siderophore  
475 production will already have been stabilised by selection. The direct addition of siderophores, while  
476 providing a short-term benefit, may actually result in longer-term negative effects on  
477 phytoremediation regardless of length of time since contamination, as selection for siderophore  
478 production is relaxed. More generally, our results highlight that interspecific public goods  
479 production can be maintained at high levels in natural microbial communities, despite the potential  
480 of exploitation by cheating non-producers.

481

#### 482 **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

483 This work was funded by the AXA Research Fund, BBSRC and NERC to AB. SOB was funded by  
484 a “Bridging the Gaps” award and PhD scholarship from the University of Exeter. NT was funded by  
485 the EU’s Horizon 2020 programme under the Marie Skłodowska-Curie grant agreement (656647).  
486 AML was supported by Marie Curie International Incoming Fellowships within the EU Seventh  
487 Framework Programme. AB acknowledges support from the Royal Society.

488 **REFERENCES**

- 489 1.  
490 Adriano, D.C. (2001). *Trace elements in terrestrial environments*. Springer-Verlag, New York, NY,  
491 USA.
- 492 2.  
493 Alloway, B.J. (1990). *Heavy metals in soil*. John Wiley & Sons, New York, NY, USA.
- 494 3.  
495 Anderson, M.J. (2001). A new method for non-parametric multivariate analysis of variance. *Austral*  
496 *Ecol.*, 26, 32-46.
- 497 4.  
498 Angly, F.E., Dennis, P.G., Skarszewski, A., Vanwonderghem, I., Hugenholtz, P. & Tyson, G.W.  
499 (2014). CopyRighter: a rapid tool for improving the accuracy of microbial community profiles  
500 through lineage-specific gene copy number correction. *Microbiome*, 2, 11.
- 501 5.  
502 Barber, M.F. & Elde, N.C. (2015). Buried treasure: evolutionary perspectives on microbial iron  
503 piracy. *Trends Genet.*, 31, 627-636.
- 504 6.  
505 Bates, D., Maechler, M., Bolker, B. & Walker, S. (2014). lme4: Linear mixed-effects models using  
506 Eigen and S4.
- 507 7.  
508 Brankatschk, R., Bodenhausen, N., Zeyer, J. & Bürgmann, H. (2012). Simple absolute  
509 quantification method correcting for quantitative PCR efficiency variations for microbial  
510 community samples. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.*, 78, 4481-4489.
- 511 8.  
512 Braud, A., Geoffroy, V., Hoegy, F., Mislin, G.L.A. & Schalk, I.J. (2010). Presence of the  
513 siderophores pyoverdine and pyochelin in the extracellular medium reduces toxic metal

514 accumulation in *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* and increases bacterial metal tolerance. *Environ.*  
515 *Microbiol. Rep.*, 2, 419-425.

516 9.

517 Braud, A., Hoegy, F., Jezequel, K., Lebeau, T. & Schalk, I.J. (2009). New insights into the metal  
518 specificity of the *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* pyoverdine–iron uptake pathway. *Environ.*  
519 *Microbiol.*, 11, 1079-1091.

520 10.

521 Breiman, L., Friedman, J., Stone, C.J. & Olshen, R.A. (1984). *Classification and regression trees.*  
522 Wadsworth International Group, Belmont, CA, USA.

523 11.

524 Bruins, M.R., Kapil, S. & Oehme, F.W. (2000). Microbial resistance to metals in the environment.  
525 *Ecotoxicol. Environ. Saf.*, 45, 198-207.

526 12.

527 Buckling, A., Harrison, F., Vos, M., Brockhurst, M.A., Gardner, A., West, S.A. *et al.* (2007).  
528 Siderophore-mediated cooperation and virulence in *Pseudomonas aeruginosa*. *FEMS*  
529 *Microbiol. Ecol.*, 62, 135-141.

530 13.

531 Burt, R. (1998). History of metalliferous mining. In: *The geology of Cornwall* (eds. Sellwood, EB,  
532 Durrance, EM & Bristow, CM). University of Exeter Press Exeter, pp. 211-225.

533 14.

534 Caliński, T. & Harabasz, J. (1974). A dendrite method for cluster analysis. *Communications in*  
535 *statistics: theory and methods*, 3, 1-27.

536 15.

537 Callahan, B.J., McMurdie, P.J., Rosen, M.J., Han, A.W., Johnson, A.J.A. & Holmes, S.P. (2016).  
538 DADA2: high-resolution sample inference from Illumina amplicon data. *Nature methods*, 13,  
539 581-583.

540 16.

541 Caporaso, J.G., Kuczynski, J., Stombaugh, J., Bittinger, K., Bushman, F.D., Costello, E.K. *et al.*

542 (2010). QIIME allows analysis of high-throughput community sequencing data. *Nature*

543 *Methods*, 7, 335-336.

544 17.

545 Cordero, O.X., Ventouras, L.-A., DeLong, E.F. & Polz, M.F. (2012). Public good dynamics drive

546 evolution of iron acquisition strategies in natural bacterioplankton populations. *Proc. Natl.*

547 *Acad. Sci. U. S. A.*, 109, 20059-20064.

548 18.

549 De'Ath, G. (2002). Multivariate regression trees: a new technique for modeling species–

550 environment relationships. *Ecology*, 83, 1105-1117.

551 19.

552 De'Ath, G. (2007). mvpart: Multivariate partitioning.

553 20.

554 Dimkpa, C., Weinand, T. & Asch, F. (2009). Plant–rhizobacteria interactions alleviate abiotic stress

555 conditions. *Plant Cell Environ.*, 32, 1682-1694.

556 21.

557 Edgar, R.C. (2010). Search and clustering orders of magnitude faster in BLAST. *Bioinformatics*,

558 26, 2460-2461.

559 22.

560 Estrela, S., Morris, J.J. & Kerr, B. (2016). Private benefits and metabolic conflicts shape the

561 emergence of microbial interdependencies. *Environ. Microbiol.*, 18, 1415-1427.

562 23.

563 Fierer, N. & Jackson, R.B. (2006). The diversity and biogeography of soil bacterial communities.

564 *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U. S. A.*, 103, 626-631.

565 24.

566 Frank, S.A. (1994). Genetics of mutualism: the evolution of altruism between species. *J. Theor.*  
567 *Biol.*, 170, 393-400.

568 25.

569 Fuglede, B. & Topsoe, F. (2004). Jensen-Shannon divergence and Hilbert space embedding. In:  
570 *Proceedings of the IEEE International Symposium on Information Theory* p. 31.

571 26.

572 Galet, J., Deveau, A., Hôtel, L., Frey-Klett, P., Leblond, P. & Aigle, B. (2015). *Pseudomonas*  
573 *fluorescens* pirates both ferrioxamine and ferricoelichelin siderophores from *Streptomyces*  
574 *ambofaciens*. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.*, 81, 3132-3141.

575 27.

576 Gans, J., Wiolinsky, M. & Dunbar, J. (2005). Computational improvements reveal great bacterial  
577 diversity and high metal toxicity in soil. *Science*, 309, 1387-1390.

578 28.

579 Ghoul, M. & Mitri, S. (2016). The ecology and evolution of microbial competition. *Trends*  
580 *Microbiol.*, 24, 833-845.

581 29.

582 Giller, K.E., Witter, E. & Mcgrath, S.P. (1998). Toxicity of heavy metals to microorganisms and  
583 microbial processes in agricultural soils: a review. *Soil Biol. Biochem.*, 30, 1389-1414.

584 30.

585 Gobran, G.R. & Huang, P. (2011). *Biogeochemistry of trace elements in the rhizosphere*. Elsevier,  
586 Amsterdam, The Netherlands.

587 31.

588 Griffin, A.S., West, S.A. & Buckling, A. (2004). Cooperation and competition in pathogenic  
589 bacteria. *Nature*, 430, 1024-1027.

590 32.

591 Griffiths, R.I., Thomson, B.C., James, P., Bell, T., Bailey, M. & Whiteley, A.S. (2011). The  
592 bacterial biogeography of British soils. *Environ. Microbiol.*, 13, 1642-1654.  
593 33.

594 Guerinot, M.L. (1994). Microbial iron transport. *Annu. Rev. Microbiol.*, 48, 743-772.  
595 34.

596 Hamilton, W.D. (1964). The genetical evolution of social baviour. I. *J. Theor. Biol.*, 7, 1-16.  
597 35.

598 Hamilton, W.D. & Axelrod, R. (1981). The evolution of cooperation. *Science*, 211, 1390-1396.  
599 36.

600 Harrison, F. & Buckling, A. (2005). Hypermutability impedes cooperation in pathogenic bacteria.  
601 *Curr. Biol.*, 15, 1968-1971.  
602 37.

603 Hendershot, W.H. & Lalonde, H. (2008). Soil reaction and exchangeable acidity. In: *Soil sampling  
604 and methods of analysis* (eds. Carter, MR & Gregorich, EG). CRC Press Boca Raton, USA, pp.  
605 173-178.  
606 38.

607 Hofte, M., Buysens, S., Koedam, N. & Cornelis, P. (1993). Zinc affects siderophore-mediated high  
608 affinity iron uptake systems in the rhizosphere *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* TNSK2. *Biometals*, 6,  
609 85-91.  
610 39.

611 Hothorn, T., Bretz, F. & Westfall, P. (2008). Simultaneous interference in general parametric  
612 model. *Biometrical Journal*, 50, 346-363.  
613 40.

614 Kruskal, J.B. (1964). Nonmetric multidimensional scaling: a numerical method. *Psychometrika*, 29,  
615 115-129.  
616 41.



617 Kummerli, R., Griffin, A.S., West, S.A., Buckling, A. & Harrison, F. (2009). Viscous medium  
618 promotes cooperation in the pathogenic bacterium *Pseudomonas aeruginosa*. *Proceedings of*  
619 *the Royal Society of London. Series B, Biological sciences*, 276, 3531-3538.  
620 42.

621 Kummerli, R., Schiessl, K.T., McNeill, K. & Ackermann, M. (2014). Habitat structure and the  
622 evolution of diffusible siderophores in bacteria. *Ecol. Lett.*, 17, 1536-1655.  
623 43.

624 Lebeau, T., Braud, A. & Jézéquel, K. (2008). Performance of bioaugmentation-assisted  
625 phytoextraction applied to metal contaminated soils: a review. *Environmental Pollution*, 153,  
626 497-522.  
627 44.

628 Lee, H.H., Molla, M.N., Cantor, C.R. & Collins, J.J. (2010). Bacterial charity work leads to  
629 population-wide resistance. *Nature*, 467, 82.  
630 45.

631 Legendre, P. & Gallagher, E.D. (2001). Ecologically meaningful transformations for ordination of  
632 species data. *Oecologia*, 129, 271-280.  
633 46.

634 Legendre, P. & Legendre, L.F. (2012). *Numerical ecology*. Elsevier, Oxford, UK.  
635 47.

636 Lofts, S., Spurgeon, D.J., Svendsen, C. & Tipping, E. (2004). Deriving soil critical limits for Cu,  
637 Zn, Cd, and Pb: a method based on free ion concentrations. *Environ. Sci. Technol.*, 38, 3623-  
638 3631.  
639 48.

640 Lujan, A.M., Gomez, P. & Buckling, A. (2015). Siderophore cooperation of the bacterium  
641 *Pseudomonas fluorescens* in soil. *Biol. Lett.*, 11, 20140934.  
642 49.

643 MacQueen, J. (1967). Some methods for classification and analysis of multivariate observations. In:  
644 *Proceedings of the Fifth Berkeley Symposium on Mathematical Statistics and Probability*, pp.  
645 281-297.  
646 50.

647 Maizels, R.M., Blaxter, M.L. & Scott, A.L. (2001). Immunological genomics of *Brugia malayi*:  
648 filarial genes implicated in immune evasion and protective immunity. *Parasite Immunol.*, 23,  
649 327-344.  
650 51.

651 Martin, M. (2011). Cutadapt removes adapter sequences from high-throughput sequencing reads.  
652 *EMBnet.journal*, 17, 10-12.  
653 52.

654 McMurdie, P.J. & Holmes, S. (2013). phyloseq: An R package for reproducible interactive analysis  
655 and graphics of microbiome census data. *PLoS One*, 8, e61217.  
656 53.

657 Mitri, S. & Foster, K.R. (2013). The genotypic view of social interaction in microbial communities.  
658 *Annu. Rev. Genet.*, 47, 247-273.  
659 54.

660 Morris, J.J. (2015). Black Queen evolution: the role of leakiness in structuring microbial  
661 communities. *Trends Genet.*, 31, 475-482.  
662 55.

663 Morris, J.J., Lenski, R.E. & Zinser, E.R. (2012). The Black Queen hypothesis: evolution of  
664 dependencies through adaptive gene loss. *MBio*, 3, 2 e00036-00012.  
665 56.

666 Nies, D.H. (1999). Microbial heavy-metal resistance. *Appl. Microbiol. Biotechnol.*, 51, 730-750.  
667 57.

668 Nriagu, J.O. & Pacyna, J.M. (1988). Quantitative assessment of worldwide contamination of air,  
669 water and soils by trace metals. *Nature*, 333, 134-139.  
670 58.

671 O'Brien, S. & Buckling, A. (2015). The sociality of bioremediation. *EMBO reports*, e201541064.  
672 (59.

673 O'Brien, S., Hodgson, D.J. & Buckling, A. (2014). Social evolution of toxic metal bioremediation  
674 in *Pseudomonas aeruginosa*. *Proceedings of the Royal Society of London. Series B, Biological*  
675 *sciences*, 281, 20140858.  
676 60.

677 Oksanen, J., Blanchet, F.G., Kindt, R., Legendre, P., O'Hara, R.B., Simpson, G.L. *et al.* (2010).  
678 Vegan: Community Ecology Package.  
679 61.

680 Oliveira, N.M., Niehus, R. & Foster, K.R. (2014). Evolutionary limits to cooperation in microbial  
681 communities. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U. S. A.*, 111, 17941-17946.  
682 62.

683 Ouellette, M.H., Legendre, P. & Borcard, D. (2012). Cascade multivariate regression tree: a novel  
684 approach for modelling nested explanatory sets. *Methods Ecol. Evol.*, 3, 234-244.  
685 63.

686 Øvreås, L. & Torsvik, V. (1998). Microbial diversity and community structure in two different  
687 agricultural soil communities. *Microb. Ecol.*, 36, 303-315.  
688 64.

689 Pande, S., Kaftan, F., Lang, S., Svatoš, A., Germerodt, S. & Kost, C. (2016). Privatization of  
690 cooperative benefits stabilizes mutualistic cross-feeding interactions in spatially structured  
691 environments. *ISME J.*, 10, 1413-1423.  
692 65.

693 Preheim, S.P., Perrotta, A.R., Martin-Platero, A.M., Gupta, A. & Alm, E.J. (2013). Distribution-  
694 based clustering: using ecology to refine the operational taxonomic unit. *Appl. Environ.*  
695 *Microbiol.*, 79, 6593-6603.

696 66.

697 Rajkumar, M., Ae, N., Prasad, M.N.V. & Freitas, H. (2010). Potential of siderophore-producing  
698 bacteria for improving heavy metal phytoextraction. *Trends Biotechnol.*, 28, 142-149.

699 67.

700 Rao, C.R. (1995). A review of canonical coordinates and an alternative to correspondence analysis  
701 using Hellinger distance. *Qüestió*, 19, 23-63.

702 68.

703 Ratledge, C. & Dover, L.G. (2000). Iron metabolism in pathogenic bacteria. *Annu. Rev. Microbiol.*,  
704 54, 881-941.

705 69.

706 Ruijter, J., Ramakers, C., Hoogaars, W., Karlen, Y., Bakker, O., Van den Hoff, M. *et al.* (2009).  
707 Amplification efficiency: linking baseline and bias in the analysis of quantitative PCR data.  
708 *Nucleic Acids Res.*, 37, e45-e45.

709 70.

710 Schalk, I.J., Hannauer, M. & Braud, A. (2011). New roles for bacterial siderophores in metal  
711 transport and tolerance. *Environ. Microbiol.*, 13, 2844-2854.

712 71.

713 Schloss, P.D., Westcott, S.L., Ryabin, T., Hall, J.R., Hartmann, M., Hollister, E.B. *et al.* (2009).  
714 Introducing Mothur: open-source, platform-independent, community-supported software for  
715 describing and comparing microbial communities. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.*, 75, 7537-7541.

716 72.

717 Schwyn, B. & Neilands, J.B. (1987). Universal chemical assay for the detection and determination  
718 of siderophores. *Anal. Biochem.*, 160, 47-56.

719 73.

720 Shepard, R.N. (1962). The analysis of proximities: multidimensional scaling with unknowns  
721 distance function. I. *Psychometrika*, 27, 125-140.

722 74.

723 Suleman, L. (2016). Extracellular bacterial proteases in chronic wounds: a potential therapeutic  
724 target? *Adv. Wound Care*, 5, 455-463.

725 75.

726 Teitzel, G.M., Geddie, A., De Long, S.K., Kirisits, M.J., Whiteley, M. & Parsek, M.R. (2006).  
727 Survival and growth in the presence of elevated copper: transcriptional profiling of copper-  
728 stressed *Pseudomonas aeruginosa*. *J. Bacteriol.*, 188, 7242-7256.

729 76.

730 Therneau, T., Atkinson, B. & Ripley, B. (2015). rpart: Recursive Partitioning and Regression Trees.

731 77.

732 Valls, M. & De Lorenzo, V. (2002). Exploiting the genetic and biochemical capacities of bacteria  
733 for the remediation of heavy metal pollution. *FEMS Microbiol. Rev.*, 26, 327-338.

734 78.

735 Vavrek, M.J. & Larsson, H.C.E. (2010). Fossil: palaeoecological and palaeogeographical analysis  
736 tools.

737 79.

738 Vega, N.M. & Gore, J. (2014). Collective antibiotic resistance: mechanisms and implications. *Curr.*  
739 *Opin. Microbiol.*, 21, 28-34.

740 80.

741 West, S.A. & Buckling, A. (2003). Cooperation, virulence and siderophore production in bacterial  
742 parasites. *Proceedings of the Royal Society of London. Series B, Biological sciences*, 270, 37-  
743 44.

744 81.

745 West, S.A., Diggle, S.P., Buckling, A., Gardner, A. & Griffin, A.S. (2007). The social lives of  
746 microbes. *Annu. Rev. Ecol. Syst.*, 38, 53-77.  
747 82.  
748 Willis, A. & Bungle, J. (2014). breakaway: Species Richness Estimation and Modeling.  
749  
750

1 **FIGURE LEGENDS**

2 **Figure 1. Siderophores act as an interspecific public good in toxic copper broth.** Mean  
3 Malthusian growth rate ( $m$ )  $\pm$  SE of a siderophore-producing (black bars) and non-  
4 producing (white bars) strain of *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* in toxic copper broth ( $\text{CuSO}_4$ ).  
5 The addition of heterospecific siderophores (ferrioxamine, ornibactin, schizokinen and  
6 yersiniabactin) significantly reduces mean growth differences between producing and non-  
7 producing strains.

8  
9 **Figure 2. The effect of soil acidity and heavy metal contamination on microbial**  
10 **abundance and siderophore production in natural soils.** (A) Heavy metal loadings on  
11 the first principal component (PC1), which explained 27% of the observed environmental  
12 variation; (B) Positive correlation between soil acidity (pH) and heavy metal  
13 contamination (PC1); (C) Proportion of siderophore producers and (D) microbial density  
14 ( $\log_{10}$ -transformed bacterial cells  $\text{g}^{-1}$  soil) as a function of heavy metal contamination and  
15 soil acidity. Lines and shaded area depict the fitted relationships  $\pm$  standard error.

16  
17 **Figure 3. Relationship between soil acidity, iron and siderophore production.** (A) Soil  
18 acidity (pH) and total iron content (%) do not co-vary and (B) variation in total iron  
19 availability does not affect the proportion of siderophore producers along a natural heavy  
20 metal gradient associated with historical mining activity. Line and shaded area depict the  
21 fitted relationships  $\pm$  standard error.

22  
23 **Figure 4. Community composition variation changes as a function of soil acidity.**  
24 Multivariate regression tree (MRT) analysis was used to estimate the impact of soil acidity  
25 (pH) and heavy metals (PC1) on community structure, indicating that pH is the main  
26 environmental driver explaining variation in community structure. The most parsimonious

1 tree (A) shows that the community could be divided into 3 different leaves (colored  
2 symbols) based on microbial abundance and composition. The composition within leaves  
3 is represented in a PCA plot (B), where small points represent individual samples and large  
4 points represent the group mean (within leaf). The most important taxa in each leaf are  
5 summarized in Supplementary Table S1.

6  
7 **Figure 5. The effect of copper contamination on experimental microbial communities**  
8 **in compost. (A)** Copper addition results in a net increase in mean per capita siderophore  
9 production  $\pm$  SE over time, where open circles and black circles represent non-  
10 contaminated and copper-contaminated experimental communities, respectively; **(B)**  
11 NMDS ordination plot depicting the pair-wise Bray-Curtis dissimilarity between soil  
12 microcosms after six weeks of incubation (stress = 0.096). Points represent individual  
13 microcosms belonging to the non-contaminated (open circles) and copper-contaminated  
14 (black circles) treatment, such that microcosms similar in their genus-level composition are  
15 ordinated closer together; **(C)** Relative abundance of the ten most common genera and  
16 their mean siderophore production. Genera are listed in order of their mean across-  
17 treatment siderophore production, increasing from top to bottom, such that blue- and red  
18 genera are non-producers and producers, respectively. See Table S2 in Supplementary  
19 Tables for more details; **(D)** The effect of copper background (filled and open symbols are  
20 presence and absence of copper contamination, respectively) on metal tolerance, where  
21 more negative values indicate a stronger inhibitory effect of  $\text{CuSO}_4$  on bacterial growth.  
22 Bars denote 1 SE.