Tot plegat, el repertori i les anàlisis permeten mesurar els biaixos ideològics i estètics, les normes, els condicionaments i les expectatives imperants en cada moment i en cada context sociopolític i cultural de l'atrafegat segle xx pel que fa al desenvolupament de la llengua catalana. Tenim al davant un indicador molt útil per a entendre millor l'evolució ideològica experimentada per la llengua literària i pels gustos estètics al llarg del segle en la nostra cultura actuant aquí com a receptora.

Hi ajuda també la «Introducció general» del llibre que contextualitza Daudet en el seu moment històric: al *costat* de Zola i, tanmateix, *diferent*, com més *digerible* car menys extremista que el *pare* del naturalisme. Així el veié i definí Joan Sardà en el seu pròleg a la traducció castellana del *Nabab* de Daudet: «su gusto le aparta instintivamente de lo que repugna (...) la lección moral brota por dos conductos diferentes: brota de la aversión que el espectáculo del mal produce, y brota al par de esa simpatía que despierta en las almas la contemplación estética de los episodios del bien.»

Sens dubte aquesta manera de ser i d'escriure de Daudet va fer que fos conegut i traduït ben aviat al català, com el llibre que comentem posa de manifest. Però, l'anàlisi de *què i què no* es va traduir (o no s'ha traduït mai encara) de la producció literària de Daudet que Ribes fa en aquesta introducció és també significatiu per a entendre les expectatives ideològiques del nostre país en un moment donat. Posarem només un exemple: que tant *L'Avenç* (1883) com *La Veu de Catalunya* (1893) decidissin traduir el conte «La dernière

classe. Récit d'un petit Alsacien» s'entén en un context de defensa de l'ús de la llengua pròpia com a senyal d'identitat nacional contra un país invasor. La frase del mestre que imparteix la darrera classe (perquè Alsàcia passa a ser part d'Alemanya), Daudet la va adaptar del seu amic Mistral i diu molt del que va agradar a Catalunya per traduir el conte: «il fallait la garder entre nous et ne jamais l'oublier, parce que, quand un peuple tombe esclave, tant qu'il tient bien sa langue, c'est comme s'il tenait la clef de sa prison.»

Així doncs, en general no hi ha hagut manipulació ideològica de Daudet a Catalunya, però sí que podem comprovar, un cop més, com els camins de la Literatura Comparada, la Sociologia de la Literatura i de la Teoria de la Recepció ajuden a entendre el propi context històric, estètic i literari. El que no es troba en aquest volum són les supressions i els canvis lingüístics patits per les traduccions catalanes de Daudet: remetem el lector interessat per aquestes *manipulacions* concretes a la tesi de Ribes, disponible en xarxa.

El llibre, en conjunt, és digne i recomanable, sense reserves. Millor dit: feia falta. Si ja hi ha estudis sobre la presència de Zola, Daudet no s'havia treballat. L'estudi publicat aquí és, cal remarcar-ho, completament original.

Marta Giné
Universitat de Lleida
Departament de Filologia Clàssica,
Francesa i Hispànica

ŞERBAN, Adriana; MATAMALA, Anna; LAVAUR, Jean-Marc (eds.)
Audiovisual Translation in Close-up: Practical and Theoretical Approaches
Bern: Peter Lang AG, 2011.

Audiovisual translation (AVT) is one of the most rapidly growing research areas in

Translation Studies. It is more and more difficult to take in all that is happening

within AVT. Thematic and special issues come in handy in deepening one's knowledge of a specific area. Unfortunately at the same time they reduce our perspective and general insight. The volume under review, a follow-up to the conference «Audiovisual Translation: Multidisciplinary Approaches» hosted by the University of Montpellier, France, in 2008, has the undeniable advantage of presenting the reader with a wider perspective of AVT.

This collection of articles, edited by Adriana Şerban, Anna Matamala and Jean-Marc Lavaur, contains fifteen selected publications and is divided into five parts.

The first part comprised of four articles, addresses AVT and discourse analysis. The first one, co-authored by Veronica Bonsigniori, Silvia Bruti and Silva Masi, presents results from research on «English greetings, leave-takings and good wishes in dubbed Italian». The authors focus on a corpus from British and American films as well as Italian films and films dubbed into Italian. They come to the conclusion that conversational routines are not merely informative elements but also crucial indices of the social relationship between characters and that conversational routines are keys to orality. Overall it is a comprehensive and well written paper.

In the second contribution, Annjo K. Greenall takes up the topic of non-translation of swearing into Norwegian. The author compares the transfer of swearing in an Irish novel –*The Commitments*– and in the film based on this book. She notices that swearing in the film's subtitles was cut by half when compared with the literary translation and mentions various possible reasons for the non-translation, such as limitations of time and space, etc. Even though the article itself is interesting, I need to express some gripes about the research. First of all, in the quantitative analysis, the author refers to the rather vague notion of «instances of swearing» (p. 53). Judging from one of the examples mentioned (p. 56), it is possible that she

has counted each swearword in the spoken dialogue and each subtitled swearword as a single «instance». As far as I am aware one of the rules in subtitling is the rule of no-repetition. Therefore even if, as Greenall claims, there is enough time and space, the subtitler is very unlikely to –pardon me– translate «Fuck, fuck, fuck» as «Knulle, knulle, knulle». Secondly, in my belief the quantitative should at least indicate how many swearwords were actually omitted because of AVT constraints. There are far more translator-independent constraints in AVT than in literary translation. Therefore painting everything with the same brush seems rather unfair and in my opinion obscures the results of an interesting study.

The third contribution in this section, by Adriana Tortoriello, is a good example of what AVT research could and should be like. First of all Tortoriello analyzes the subtitled dialogs along with gestures and paralinguistic elements. Secondly while analyzing the strategies implemented by subtitlers to preserve semiotic cohesion, she goes after the examples of explicitation and collocation rather than the eternal «reduction, condensation and elimination strategies» (p. 63). Thirdly, an interesting choice of films (Italian and Senegalese) allows her to observe how strategies change depending on the source culture of the film. It is a well written article and it offers a number of practical guidelines which could be used in AVT didactics.

Zoë Pettit explores the relation of the network of signs of an audiovisual text in three translations (English subtitles, French subtitles and dubbing) of the South African film *Tsotsi*. The results show that translations generally tend to match the on-screen action. What is interesting is that the variations Pettit notices are neither language-dependent nor do they depend on the type of translation, but they seem to be the result of the individual decisions made by translators. As much as I value the article from the scientific point of view, I have to say that inserting all examples in just

one table is a rather problematic and distracting solution for the reader.

Foreign language acquisition is one of the most popular arguments brought out in the eternal discussion on the superiority of subtitling over dubbing. The second part of the volume under review consists of two contributions which do not take a stand in the discussion, but deliver facts on the impact of subtitles on foreign language learning. Elisa Ghia presents the results of her study on the effect of exposure to interlingual subtitles on the acquisition of foreign language syntax. Her experiment follows the assumption that «language acquisition driven from exposure to audiovisual input occurs mostly as a background process» (p. 96). Therefore during the experiment the twenty-two Italian EFL learners were asked to watch fifteen American or British films with Italian subtitles under ordinary viewing circumstances (one per week and without re-watching difficult passages). The findings show that watching foreign language films with interlingual subtitles actually does influence the acquisition of syntax but also general comprehension and production skills. The findings are promising, the reasoning is clear and the article is simply well written and interesting.

Annamaria Caimi explores the possibility of learning through a cognitive analysis of the subtitles. The author created an interesting proposal of a lesson plan which involves pre- and post-viewing tasks. The plan was actually put into practice by the author, who formulates useful guidelines for students, teachers and translators based on this experience. I must say that the concept itself is very convincing and I can see how it could be applied also in AVT training. Unfortunately, the article does not mention how this method actually enhanced the linguistic competences of the experiment participants or what was their attitude to such teaching formulae.

Quality in AVT is a topic that has not produced much interest. Articles in part

three of this book shed some light on this topic from three different perspectives: performance, effect and working environment. The first article in this part is co-authored by Adriana Pagano, Fabio Alves and Vera Lúcia Santiago Araújo. The authors present the findings of their pilot experiment which set out to compare the performance of translation students and professional subtitlers as far as their cognitive rhythms, the quality of the produced subtitles and linguistic choices in terms of register are concerned. The article comments on the findings from each one of the three stages. Notwithstanding the ambitiousness of the project I must say that the article seems overloaded and therefore at times superficial. The data gathered by the authors could serve for three more elaborate articles.

Pierre Dumouchel, Gilles Boulianne and Julie Brousseau try to answer the question how to measure quality in live closed captioning. Their article begins with an extensive presentation of existing measures which apparently do not take into account summarization nor lexical, syntactic and semantic mistakes. The authors propose a new metric which, as opposed to the previous ones, concentrates on the quality of preserved meaning. The authors claim that their metric is applicable to any captioning method and that it has been successfully applied in a live-subtitled Parliamentary debate.

The last contribution in this section, by Kristiina Abdallah, presents an insider's view on how the AVT production network works. Applying the actor-network theoretical framework, Abdallah shows how a network consisting of clients and translators was formed and how different understandings of quality within the network can lead to an ultimate failure. It is an eye-opening and comprehensive study which shows how different elements –i.e. clients, subcontractors as well as different social, political and economic elements– interact.

In spite of the fact that the need of reception studies within the AVT was stressed many times, not many scholars have ventured into this terrain. This need is addressed in the fifth part of this collection of articles, which includes two contributions. The first contribution, by Tiina Tuominen, focuses on subtitles reception strategies. Tuominen showed the American film –*Bridget Jones: The Edge of Reason* (2005)– with Finnish and Swedish subtitles to eighteen research participants. Research results reveal that subtitle reception is a fairly easy, subconscious and superficial process. What is more, viewers admit to overlooking mistakes as long as there are not too many of them and as long as they do not «force them to stop or slow down the reading».

Dominique Bairstow's article presents the results of research aimed at examining the film comprehension effects resulting from the presence of subtitles. Her experiment involved presenting an extract from the Alfred Hitchcock film *North by Northwest* (1959) in original version and with French subtitles to native speakers of English and French with a high level of French and a low fluency level in English respectively. The results, based on a film-comprehension questionnaire, confirmed that for viewers fluent in the film's dialogue language, subtitles are distracting rather than helpful and vice versa. However, she also discovered that the processing of visual information by the French viewers in the presence of English subtitles was actually boosted. It is a well written article; however I have one serious doubt: the author claims to have measured the proper understanding of the film. Is there really something like «proper understanding» of a film?

The fifth part, dedicated to audio description, consists of four articles. It begins with Paula Igareda's contribution on a description of emotions and gestures. Working on the assumption that current practices are very often based on «guide-lines not supported by any scientific evidence» (p. 224), Igareda puts forward a proposal of classifying and identifying emotions conveyed by gestures and facial expressions and implements it to analyze a corpus of five Spanish spoken films. Based on her research she proposes possible solutions for audio description. This article crosses the border of theory and ventures into the land of practice by giving audio describers food for thought and practical tips.

The contribution by Pilar Orero focuses on the challenges that diverse languages might pose in AD. Orero bases her digression on Eric Khoo's film *Be with Me* (2005) and does not make do with audio subtitles of the foreign languages spoken in the film. She analyzes various examples where communication is carried out through spoken, tactile and written languages and shows how is the message rendered in AD. When I come to think about it, her article is actually stating the obvious. However, I would dare to say, that many will not notice this «obviousness» unless someone clearly points it out to them, just as Orero does in her article. Definitely worth reading, especially by present or future audio describers.

Recently we have been able to observe a change of attitudes towards stiff AD guidelines. This idea, that has been germinating for some time now, blossomed during the Media4ALL conference in London (June 2011), where it was agreed that there is a need for a more creative approach towards AD. These circumstances make the contribution by John-Patrick Udo and Deborah Fels even more interesting. The authors describe an experiment in creating unconventional (written by the director, written from the perspective of a character from the play, etc.) audio description for life theatre. Their article is interesting, inspiring and –which should be mentioned– ahead of its time. Nevertheless it would be very interesting, if not necessary, to run reception studies, because regardless

of how «fun, interesting and fulfilling» (p. 278) it could be for the audio describers it is necessary to guarantee at least a similar level of entertainment for the audience.

In their contribution Agnieszka Chmiel and Iwona Mazur take a closer look at the pioneering years of audio description in Poland, giving special attention to the quality of the scripts. The article starts with a presentation of the origins and the state of the art of AD in Poland. Unfortunately this information is rather outdated. However, this shortcoming could be regarded as an indicator of the rapid changes that have taken place in Poland since 2008. The main part of the article presents results of qualitative analysis of seven Polish audio described programs against English guidelines. In general the authors come to a conclusion that Polish audio descriptions «comply with the majority of the guidelines», but they also identify mistakes and errors. Although it is a well written article, my feeling is that the most interesting part

is yet to be published. As Chmiel and Mazur indicate this publication is only part of an AD-Verba project and one of the next steps reception studies among blind and partially sighted audiences.

In the introduction of the volume under review, the editors stress that the aim of the book is to offer the reader «a meaningful contribution to audiovisual translation in both its theoretical and practical dimensions» (p. 12). It is my pleasure to say «mission accomplished». This book offers a handful of fresh ideas for those interested in general AVT development and research directions. It could be especially useful for students searching for MA thesis inspiration.

Anna Jankowska
Jagiellonian University
UNESCO Chair for Translation Studies
and Intercultural Communication

SETTON, Robin (ed.)
Interpreting Chinese, Interpreting China
Amsterdam, Filadèlfia: John Benjamins, 2011, 188 p.

Interpreting Chinese, Interpreting China, editat per Setton, presenta una selecció d'articles que permetran al lector entendre millor la situació actual de la interpretació i de la recerca en interpretació a la Xina. En aquest sentit, es tracta d'un llibre que es publica en un moment clau: els intercanvis entre la Xina i la resta del món són cada cop més freqüents i ja no es limiten a trobades diplomàtiques o a reunions entre empresaris, sinó que el xinès emergeix com a llengua internacional en tota mena d'àmbits. A més a més, no tan sols la interpretació del xinès s'estén i amplia els seus horitzons, sinó que la recerca que se'n deriva s'obre camí en temes i aproximacions cada cop més diversos. Tanmateix, aquesta recerca se sol difondre en xinès,

motiu pel qual publicacions com la que tenim entre mans tenen el valor afegit d'ampliar el ventall de lectors potencials a partir d'una llengua franca, com és el cas de l'anglès.

El volum destaca per una gran diversitat temàtica; una diversitat que, d'altra banda, és del tot necessària si es pretén donar una visió àmplia de l'estat de la qüestió de la interpretació a la Xina. Mentre que la introducció de Setton i l'informe de Wang i Mu són els capítols més generals i descriptius, en la resta s'exposen qüestions d'anàlisi més concretes que, certament, reflecteixen els grans temes de la recerca en interpretació: el paper dels intèrprets en diferents moments històrics, la interpretació en llengua de signes, la