





Dairy value chain in Honduras and Nicaragua: Background proposals for the CGIAR Research Program on Livestock and Fish

March 2011









ILRI works with partners worldwide to help poor people keep their farm animals alive and productive, increase and sustain their livestock and farm productivity, and find profitable markets for their animal products. ILRI's headquarters are in Nairobi, Kenya; we have a principal campus in Addis Ababa, Ethiopia, and 14 offices in other regions of Africa and Asia. ILRI is part of the Consultative Group on International Agricultural Research (www.cgiar.org), which works to reduce hunger, poverty and environmental degradation in developing countries by generating and sharing relevant agricultural knowledge, technologies and policies.

© 2011 International Livestock Research Institute (ILRI)



COSO This publication is copyrighted by the International Livestock Research Institute (ILRI). It is licensed for use under the Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-Share Alike 3.0 Unported License. To view this license, visit http://creativecommons.org/ licenses/by-nc-sa/3.0/. Unless otherwise noted, you are free to copy, duplicate, or reproduce, and distribute, display, or transmit

any part of this publication or portions thereof without permission, and to make translations, adaptations, or other derivative works under the following conditions:

ATTRIBUTION. The work must be attributed, but not in any way that suggests endorsement by ILRI or the author(s)

NON-COMMERCIAL. This work may not be used for commercial purposes.

SHARE ALIKE. If this work is altered, transformed, or built upon, the resulting work must be distributed only under the same or similar license to this one.

NOTICE:

For any reuse or distribution, the license terms of this work must be made clear to others.

Any of the above conditions can be waived if permission is obtained from the copyright holder.

Nothing in this license impairs or restricts the author's moral rights.

Fair dealing and other rights are in no way affected by the above.

The parts used must not misrepresent the meaning of the publication. ILRI would appreciate being sent a copy of any materials in which text, photos etc. have been used.

Download the full Program proposal: http://cgspace.cgiar.org/handle/10568/3248

Important note: Full information on references is included in the Program proposal that can be downloaded from http://cgspace.cgiar.org/handle/10568/3248

International Livestock Research Institute

P O Box 30709, Nairobi 00100, Kenya Phone + 254 20 422 3000 Email ILRI-Kenya@cgiar.org

P O Box 5689, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia Phone + 251 11 617 2000 Email ILRI-Ethiopia@cgiar.org

www.ilri.org

Dairy value chain in Honduras and Nicaragua: Background proposals for the CGIAR Research Program on Livestock and Fish

In Central America, dairy products are an important dietary component for consumers from all social strata. The potential to increase the consumption of dairy products is high, with domestic consumption growth rates in Honduras and Nicaragua of 6.7 and 11.7%, respectively. Average per capita consumption in Latin America is currently 100 kg Litres of Milk Equivalent (LME) per year versus 265 kg LME for USA (FEPALE 2006). In lower income strata in Central America– representing the majority of the population—the per capita consumption is far below the Latin American average.

Population growth and on-going urbanization create favourable conditions for expanding markets. In 2030, the Central American population will be 56 million, compared to 35 million in 2005. Moreover, 65% of the population will live in cities of more than 50,000 inhabitants, compared to the current 40%. Most urban consumers have access to electricity and hence refrigeration facilities. Population expansion will be accompanied by a growing diversity of consumer preferences for a great variety of dairy products. Strengthening small industries to enter market niches for products with higher added value would change the business panorama of the value chain for small producers.

Why this value chain?

The majority of the poor in Latin America live in tropical lowlands or hillsides. About 50% of this population, mostly rural dwellers, is still considered poor (UNDP 2003). Within the rural sector, dual-purpose livestock systems (meat and milk) constitute a principal economic activity of small producers. About 400,000 small-scale producers in Central America own livestock, with more than 75% of income being generated by milk sales. Nicaragua and Honduras, with more than 200,000 poor smallholder livestock producers, are key players for developing the dairy sector in the region.

After the poultry sector, milk production and marketing, and the dairy-products industry constitute the fastest growing livestock subsector in the region and continue offering valuable opportunities for small producers. Interventions to increase small-farm productivity should therefore be based on milk production, the creation of value-added products in the dairy industry and the improvement of linkages along this increasingly dynamic value chain.

However, several factors limit the participation of small-scale farmers in dairy value chains. The quality of milk produced by small farmers is usually poor, due to a lack of adequate on-farm infrastructure, inappropriate milking practices, and collective investment in cooling systems on the farm and for transportation. In addition, links of individual farmers to associations and from these to buyers remain weak. The lack of strong links along the value chain inhibits not only the flow of information on what constitutes product quality and how to achieve it but also the establishment of quality-based incentive systems that benefit both producers and buyers. This suggests a need for tools to improve small-scale producer efficiency, links between actors in the value chain and increasing the level of added value generated by the dairy sector overall.

Production constraints

Constraints include low and unstable productivity, poor milking hygiene and bulk milk collection. They are related to low productivity and poor quality milk, and often to high production costs. Some producers receive low prices because of a lack of storage capacity, especially in times of high production (rainy season). In addition, milk quality is often low due to long periods between milking and cooling, which takes place in large milk collection centres in nearby towns. Usually cooling starts after 2–3 hours, but during the rainy season when roads deteriorate this can take up to 5 hours, further increasing bacterial count and acidity.

Supply constraints

In spite of an annual average growth rate of 4.2%, second only to poultry as a source of animal protein (FAOStat 2009), milk production is not sufficient to meet growing domestic demand. This situation is further exacerbated by high seasonal fluctuations in milk availability with markedly reduced production levels during the dry period (Fujisaka et al. 2005).

Initiatives are needed to improve productivity, hygiene and general quality in milk producing farms, particularly among the smaller producers. Improved forage-based systems are key (Peters et al. 2003), providing year-round sufficient quantities of high quality feed based on a combination of high quality grasses and legumes in a diversified resilient landscape often including shrubs and trees, and combined with conservation technologies (hay, silage). Genetic improvement of animals and improved herd and farm management are also essential.

Market/institutional constraints

Constraints to the marketing of raw milk largely explain the wide presence of micro-processors, some on the farms themselves, to produce fresh cheese and cream sold in local markets. This contrasts with the increasingly stringent food safety standards which demand differential responses of milk producers especially to reach more profitable formal markets in urban centres. An analysis of the value chain (e.g. the case of informal cheese exports from Nicaragua to El Salvador) is needed to determine which proportions of the revenues are going to the different actors (farmers, intermediaries, retailers), to be able to focus interventions on improving the economic situation and thus conditions at producers' level, improving overall quality, hygiene and profitability.

In milk collection, solutions are needed to improve milk collection processes and food safety measurements in collaboration with industry partners and to improve quality control and food safety standards from production to local and regional markets.

Criteria	Rationale						
Growth	rowth Import substitution						
opportunity Nicaragua: import: USD 17.7 million							
	In Central Americ wages than in ot indirect jobs in t Pomareda (2005) America (five co	ca the dairy s her livestock he area of su) estimates to untries) at ab	sector generate activities (FEC pplies, equipm tal jobs create out 11 million	es more than 5- ALAC 2006). T aent, and servic d by dairy proo , with more tha	40,000 direct jo he sector also g ces that form pa duction, indust an half of them	obs, usually with higher generates about 1,600,000 art of the dairy cluster. ry and distribution in Central are in rural areas.	
	Distribution						
	 quality of products. The most extended market represents 60% of total milk production (mainly smallholder farmers) and consists mainly of raw milk and fresh white cheese with a short shelf I due to low (hygienic) quality. About 20% of these fresh cheeses produced in Nicaragua is export to El Salvador. Pasteurized milk (including UHT), white and matured cheeses of several varieties and cream, all requiring refrigeration, are marketed in the larger cities and represent about 40% total regional production. Supermarkets and local stores are the main channel for delivery. They have access to distribution services from industries or collectors of industrial products. In Hond a network of small dairy processing units (CRELs) guarantees storage capacity and good hygieni conditions and at the same time provides services to dairy farmers (e.g. veterinary products, fee supplements). Trade The main dairy product traded is white fresh or semidry cheese, followed by pasteurized milk, including some long-life presentations. They account for 65% of total dairy exports, primarily w the region. Most dairy exports from Nicaragua are destined to Guatemala and El Salvador. Value of exports of dairy products (thousands USD) 					In the scale, type and ilk production (mainly by seese with a short shelf life d in Nicaragua is exported eses of several varieties d represent about 40% of annel for delivery. They all trial products. In Honduras, acity and good hygienic eterinary products, feed	
Country 2005 2006 2007 2008 Main pro-							
	Costa Rica	2005	36 327	47 580	57 650	Fluid milk and cheese	
	El Salvador	4.381	5.084	6.764	7.894	Fresh and dry cheese	
	Guatemala	3,215	3,509	3,643	2,984	Fresh and dry cheese	
	Honduras	10,504	10,878	11,462	18,410	Fresh and dry cheese	
	Nicaragua	32,008	57,663	89,847	116,239	Fresh and dry cheese	
	Consumption The poorest 50% of the population (CEPAL 2004) consume small amounts of dairy products (in fluid milk equivalents), primarily fresh raw milk and white of local origin. The higher value dairy products are consumed primarily by the urban middle and higher and rural middle class. There are therefore two challenges: to supply low cost, high quality dairy products for the poor, while at the same time capturing the market for high value added dairy products consumed by a smaller segment of the consumer to the poor.						

Market development

Local markets. Largest increases in demand will come from urban consumers, however, the rural population itself comprises a relevant market, with the basic dairy products (raw milk, fresh cheese, and cream) being an important part of the diet. Social programs such as the 'Vaso de Leche' (a glass of milk for every student attending public schools) in Honduras is an example of this and helps to boost local demand.

Criteria	Rationale			
	Regional markets			
	The regional market consists specifically of the urban population of the Caribbean Basin countries obtaining products from small retailers and supermarkets, and to food industries that use milk, cheese cream, and other dairy products, and is estimated to represent a population of 150 million consumer Trade agreements also create opportunities for high value dairy products entering high income niche markets, where differentiated products can be sold successfully, for instance, Central American dairy exports to the US markets are essentially fresh and semi-mature cheeses targeted at the Central American immigrant market in major US cities. To obtain sustained access to these markets, however significant changes in both policies and public and private institutions will be needed.			
	Dairy (milk, cheese) is the most important source of animal protein in both Honduras en Nicaragua including the poorest category. The challenge is providing them with nutritious less expensive dairy products, especially for children, while ensuring adequate food safety and product quality.			
Pro-poor potential	Nicaragua and Honduras have currently 120,000 and 100,000 poor livestock keepers, respectively. Most dairy farms in Central America are small and scattered, although there are some dairy clusters in a selected number of zones. The typical dairy oriented farm carries, on average, 5 to 10 milking cows that produce between 15 and 50 kg of milk per day. Milk production is 3–5 kg per cow per day. Income comes from milk production (75%) and sale of weaned male calves and culled cows (25%), compared to 95% of income coming from milk in specialized dairy systems. This dual-purpose system is more risk averse and allows farmers more flexibility when either the milk or beef price fluctuates by feeding calves more milk when price is low, such as often during the rainy season. Milk production contributes between 5.9% and 9.2% of the agricultural gross domestic product (AGDP) and between 0.9% and 1.9% of the gross domestic product (GDP). When contributions from the dairy-products industry and other activities of the cluster are included, these figures triple. Furthermore, in the 'dairy basins' of each country, the importance of dairy activities is much more			
	significant than what the aggregate figures for each country suggest.			
Researchable supply constraints	 Production constraints. As mentioned before, constraints are low and unstable productivity, seasonal feed constraints poor milking hygiene, and bulk milk collection. Supply constraints. In spite of an annual average growth rate of 4.2%, as a source of animal protein only second to poultry (FAOStat 2009), milk production is not sufficient to meet growing domestic demand. Initiatives are needed to improve productivity, quality, hygiene and general quality in milk producing farms, particularly among the smaller producers. Market/institutional constraints. An analysis of the value chain (e.g. the case of informal cheese exports from Nicaragua to El Salvador) is needed to determine which proportions of the revenues are going to the different actors (farmers, intermediaries, retailers), to be able to focus interventions on improving the economic situation and thus conditions at producers' level, improving overall quality, hygiene and profitability. 			

Criteria	Rationale		
Enabling environment	Technological policies for cattle production are provided in four major areas: pasture improvement including use of multipurpose forages and sylvopastoral systems, genetics, reproductive technology and farm management. Integrated pasture systems with sylvopastoral components will also contribute to mitigation to climate change (e.g. carbon sequestration), conservation of biodiversity (including reducing pressure on natural forests) and improve water use.		
	Animal health and food safety policies. The efforts of the national veterinary services have centred on the development of technical capacity and human capital In recent years there has been more interaction with the private sector and attention to market access. There is a need for integrated animal health management—better use of veterinary medicine—to comply with safety standards.		
	Commercial policies. Countries in general have agreed to lower tariffs in bilateral trade agreements, particularly with the US. Yet in the case of Central America, one of the greatest problems is the not-harmonized external tariffs for dairy products. Bilateral trade between these countries is important, yet it is limited by different tariffs and other regulations regarding extra-regional imports.		
	Environmental policies and ecosystem services. Livestock production has long been an important cause of natural habitat and biodiversity loss in Latin America (Pagiola et al. 2006). In Central America deforestation as a result of the establishment of pastures is expected to continue as a result of growing demands for livestock products and low productivity. Therefore, immediate dissemination of efficient and environmentally friendly, i.e. eco-efficient (CIAT 2009) farm technologies, such as the establishment of improved pastures, legumes and integration of sylvopastoral practices reducing emissions and increasing carbon fixation, is required to improve competitiveness in local and regional economies, while leaving a minimal ecological footprint.		

Criteria	Rationale
Existing momentum	Dual-purpose cattle systems constitute a principal economic activity for around 400,000 small producers in Central America, with more than 75% of income generated by milk sales. Significant progress toward poverty alleviation and improved diets for consumers can be made through intensification of these systems. The specific arguments can be summarized as follows:
	Cash flow for small producers. Dairy is often the most important provider of cash for small producers, utilizing productive systems strongly based on domestic resources (land and labour) and offers a route for capitalization and escape poverty.
	Potential for high value dairy products. Currently small producers cannot compete in commodity oriented systems due to their inability to take advantage of economies of scale associated with large intensive operations. They must therefore engage in vertical integration aimed at producing and marketing value added products with local identity based on high-quality raw milk (Pomareda 2007).
	Taking advantage of expanding markets. Population growth and on-going urbanization accompanied by a growing diversity of consumer preferences for a great variety of dairy products create favourable conditions.
	Gradual trade liberalization. In the trade agreements with the US the participating countries have negotiated between 10 and 15 years of decreasing protection for the dairy sector. The remaining time should be utilized to develop differentiated high value products and to gain market access both locally and with partner countries.
	Needs and opportunities for private investment. In order to increase competitiveness and to improve productivity and added value, small producers and industry enterprises will need an injection of capital and knowledge.
	Multiplier effects and scaling up . One important aspect of promoting milk production and small-scale high quality dairy industries is the multiplier effect for local economies, through employment generation and the development of small businesses for input supply and services.
	Increased integration with formal market chains for fresh milk
	There exists a high seasonal variability in production of fresh milk affecting both utilization of production capacities and availability to consumers. The linkage of improved production technologies such as drought adapted forages and forage management connected with milk quality standards and organized collection and support services provide a unique opportunity to improve income generation across the value chain, while enhancing product quality to consumers.
	Small and medium-scale industrialization: search for value added products
	Thousands of small processing units generate products based on raw material of limited quality. In contrast, most of the available quality milk is collected in bulk by a few plants, which can then generate products of guaranteed safety. The opportunity lies in identifying, motivating, and supporting a segment of these small-scale industries to grow and become involved in the principles of guality.

Research and supporting action

The three main principles to improve small-scale dairy production across Central America are: (1) a value chain approach from producer to local, national and international markets addressing constraints and capitalizing on opportunities; (2) a focus on specific regions where dairy has an important potential to mobilize the local economy; and (3) a focus emphasizing learning across different biophysical and socio-economic environments and defining specific options for local, national and regional policies and programs.

Potential interventions include:

- Improved forage, pasture and sylvopastoral systems that are resilient to climate change to increase productivity (including growth of animals) and assure stable milk production throughout the year, and including improving economic efficiency by reducing production costs
- Improve milk quality and hygiene through better processing techniques
- Strengthen farmers' organizations, at the production, processing and marketing level (including promotion of niche products and Protected Designation of Origin).

Gender

Roles of women and men vary according to the different components of the dairy value chain. Whereas in general the crop–livestock sector has a mostly masculine character (10–20% of farms are owned/managed by women), women play an important role especially in processing and management of resources. In small farms (with some dairy cattle) they are sometimes also involved in feeding and milking, but in general they engage mainly in processing of milk (e.g. fresh cheese, *cuajada*) for household consumption and local/regional markets. In larger dairy farms with more products the men are usually engaged in production and marketing, whereas the women control inputs, do the financial administration and participate in decision processes on production and marketing.

Geographic focus

Nicaragua and Honduras are among the poorest countries in the region; about 50% of the population live below poverty line. Livestock production and in particular dairy is one of the most important agricultural activities, with the majority in smallholder systems. The main emphasis of the value chain will be Nicaragua, but with potential scaling into Honduras. The systems studied are of relevance to the Central American region and beyond: if successful the research and development efforts will have an impact on national dairy value chains. The major action sites with the highest potential for impact in Nicaragua include the South Pacific Region of Nicaragua (Rivas), Matiguas, Muy Muy, RAAN (Siuna), Las Segovias and Chinandega. For Honduras, Olancho and Yoro have been identified for scaling.

Potential for impact

With the increasing population, changing demographics and external trade opportunities, there is an increasing internal and external market for dairy products. While direct impacts are expected from improved production and income generation for the 220,000 poor livestock producers in Nicaragua and Honduras, beneficiaries will be much greater including the large number people linked to the dairy chain and rural and urban consumers facing a shortage of dairy products. In Central America the dairy sector generates more than 540,000 direct jobs, usually with higher wages than in other livestock activities (FECALAC 2006). The sector also generates about 1,600,000 indirect jobs in the area of supplies, equipment and services that form part of the dairy cluster. Pomareda (2005) estimates total jobs created by dairy production, industry and distribution in Central America (five countries) at about 11 million, with more than half of them are in rural areas.

Opportunities	and constraints and the re	search and development actions to overcome them		
Value chain components	Developmental challenge	Researchable issues and supporting actions	Indicative partners	Outcomes
	How to organize efficient and sustainable input	Researchable issues	Research	
Inputs	services for smallholders including	Conduct gap analysis to identify upgrading needs in terms of technological changes needed to meet public and buyer	CATIE SIDE	Inputs and services are accessible to smallholder farmers
anu services	Animal health	standards Strengthen local dairy clusters by Identifying key support	INTA	Farmers organized and linked to service providers, and development and
	Milk hygiene	services	DICTA	research
		Supporting actions	Supporting actions	Conducive policy environments
		Develop a business development plan and budget for	Nitlapan	
•		upgrading needs	CANISLAC	
		Facilitate integration between small farmers, small dairy	SwissContact	
		and process upgrading	GTZ/DED, UNAG, URACCAN	
		Develop local platforms for collective action and link these to relevant organizations		

comes	igh quality feed year round educed seasonality of milk production ldressing seasonal supply constraints proved milk quality and quality etter linkage of smallholder producers formal market gher standard of products from formal market hanced sustainability of smallholder op–livestock system and improved silience to climate change an wironmental shocks
Indicative partners Ou	Research CATIE Hi INTA ac DICTA In Re SIDE supporting actions to GTZ/DED, UNAC, URACCAN Hi in
Researchable issues and supporting actions	Researchable issues Develop improved forage options and facilitate the access of small-scale dairy producers to improved forage alternatives to increase and sustain milk production Develop methodologies for balanced rations at smallholder level <i>Supporting actions</i> Train technicians and producers in methodologies for balancing rations Facilitate the development of farmer led seed supply systems Connect small producers with service providers to assist in the formation of rural enterprises Prepare manuals on milking techniques, milk handling and conservation, and hygienic milking
Developmental challenge	How to enhance resilient productivity at farm level including to overcome seasonal or continuous gaps in feed quantity and quality to improve milk hygiene to develop sustainable production systems resilient to climate change
Value chain components	Production

Value chain components	Developmental challenge	Researchable issues and supporting actions	Indicative partners	Outcomes
	How to provide	Researchable issues	Research	
Transport	consumers year round with high quality	Develop low-cost traceability systems for collection	SIDE	Higher productivity of smallholder
and	dairy products, and maximize productivity	points capable of assessing the milk quality of individual producers and promote the use of payment systems based	CATIE	livestock producers
processing	of smallholder livestock	on milk quality.	Supporting actions	Hign quality dairy products available to consumers vears round
	producers	Supporting actions	INTA	
		Link small-scale producers to	DICTA	
		Modern conservation and transport systems for raw milk.	GTZ/DED, UNAG, URACCAN	
		Quality enhancing processing systems		
		Modern distribution and sales systems for dairy products		
		Facilitate mechanism to comply with food safety regulations		
		Provide policy support for value of official recognition of certifications made by private animal health services		

Value chain components	Developmental challenge	Researchable issues and supporting actions	Indicative partners	Outcomes
	How to link smallholder	Researchable issues	Research	
	producers to the formal market for dairy products	Implement processes of new product development	SIDE	Higher availability of high quality dairy
Marketing	and how to provide higher cutality products	Testing of simple but robust monitoring and evaluation	CATIE	products
	in the informal market, enhancing availability.	tools that allow to assess the health of the chain on an on- going basis	INTA	Higher productivity of smallholder dairy enterprises
	of high quality dairy		DICTA	Functional value chain linking formal
	products to consumers year round	Supporting actions	Supporting actions	and informal markets
		Development of a shared business vision between actors	CANISLAC	
		in the chain	CONAGAN	
		Strengthening of the small dairy firm as a 'social intermediary' that provides both business value to buyers	SwissContact	
		but also social value to producers and local communities	GTZ/DED, UNAG, URACCAN	
		Building clear and transparent governance into the chain for rule setting, enforcement and conflict management		
Crossentting	How door tho	Accorement officies of transformation of dain voluo chain		Condor occitiv in daine coloria
issues	transformation of the dairy value chain affect gender relations	on gender equity		centrer equity in trainy value cliant enhanced

Inputs	Intermediate outcome	Ultimate outcome	Impacts
and services	Improved productivity	• 50% increase in dairy annual production for target value chains by 2012	 Availability of dairy products to consumers in the region
Production	 Better linkage of small producers to formal and improvement of informal markets 	• 10% households participating	their standard of living through participation in the value chain
Transport and processing			
Marketing			

Summary of indicators along the impact pathway that we believe can achieve these impacts.

VC component	Value chain outcomes				
Inputs and services	Accessible to smallholder farmers	Farmers organized and linked to service providers			
Production	High quality feed year round and Reduced seasonality of milk production	Improved milk quality and quality	Better linkage of smallholder producers to formal market	Enhanced sustainability and resilience of smallholder crop–livestock systems	
Processing	Higher productivity of smallholder livestock producers	High quality dairy products available to consumers years round			
Marketing	Higher availability of high quality dairy products	Higher productivity of smallholder dairy enterprises	Functional value chain linking formal and informal markets		

Full information on references is included in the Program proposal that can be downloaded from <u>http://cgspace.cgiar.org/handle/10568/3248</u>