

VEIL OF KASHMIR

Poetry of Travel and Travail in Zhangzhungpa's
15th-Century Kāvya Reworking of the Biography
of the Great Translator Rinchen Zangpo (958-
1055 CE)

by
Dan Martin

In November of 1987, I visited Samten G. Karmay at his office, then on Rue du Président Wilson in Paris. With over twenty years' distance, and indeed that many years older, it is difficult to recall exactly what words were spoken during that meeting. As you get older you tend to look back on your past and identify particular turning points, discerning paths both taken and not taken. You are forced to become a historian of your own life. Suspended as I was in a veritable *bardo* between the incipient stages of that dreaded academic disease known as dissertationitis at a North American university and my second and longest sojourn in South Asia, I do not believe I was aware at the time just how important this meeting would be for setting me steadily on a course of research into 11th- and 12th-century Tibetan history, and especially the history of the Bon religion. In a word, it was inspirational.

In 1996, the last week of June, I attended a conference in the Spiti valley, quite near the border with Tibet, in Himachal Pradesh. It was a very long and tiring but eventful three-day bus trip from Delhi *via* Simla and Kinnaur. This conference was intended as a millennial celebration for Tabo Monastery's founding by Rinchen Zangpo in 996 CE. So needless to say, many of the papers were devoted to the Great Translator. When it was over the chair of the conference Samdhong Rinpoche, former head of the Tibetan university in Sarnath (The Central Institute of Higher Tibetan Studies) who among other things was famous for signing his name "S. Rinpoche" — then not as yet serving as Prime Minister for the Tibetan Government in Exile in Dharamsala — made some closing remarks. Among his criticisms aimed at the conference as a whole was that not one single paper had made reference to the Rinchen Zangpo biography by Zhangzhungpa. I, for one, took the Rinpoche's scolding to heart, and resolved to one day try and read Zhangzhungpa's work. Later on, in Dharamsala, Tashi Tsering Josayma, head of the Tibetan Institute for Advanced Studies (Amnye Machen Institute) and without any doubt one of the world's very best

scholars of Tibetan literature, kindly put in my hands a woodblock print from his personal library with permission to photocopy it.¹

The main topic of this paper is that same rather short *kāvya*² text by the 15th-century author Zhangzhungpa. Unfortunately for the world, but perhaps fortunately for us at the moment since we will not need to spend a great deal of time on it, not much is known about the biography of the biographer. The fuller version of Zhangzhungpa's name is Zhangzhungpa Chöwang Dragpa (Zhang-zhung-pa Chos-dbang-grags-pa). He was originally from the western Tibetan region of Gugé (Gu-ge), an area very closely associated with the subject of the biography, Rinchen Zangpo. Zhangzhungpa was born in 1404, and died in 1469. He composed one of his most famous works, and one of only a very few Tibetan works to be styled a Mahākāvya,³ telling the story of Rāma, in the year 1438. He was a monk, served as an abbot, and eventually founded a monastery, even if it was not among the more famous ones.⁴ If you look in biographies of Tsongkhapa, Zhangzhungpa's name is simply listed among his disciples, numbering upward of one hundred. Since he was only 15 when Tsongkhapa died, he could not have spent very much time studying with him. We can know a little bit from biographical dictionaries and from the colophons to his available works. The oldest reasonably informative passage on his life appears in the catalogue of monasteries known as the *Bai dūrya ser po* (p. 26), which may be translated [with slight paraphrasing to enhance intelligibility]:

The monastery in Nags-shod (in western Kham) named Sbus-mda' Rnam-rgyal-dpal-bar was founded by Zhangzhungpa Chöwang Dragpa. This per-

¹ See the bibliography under Zhang-zhung-pa (n.d.). I should take this opportunity to express my appreciation also for several persons who had a role in the earlier evolution of this paper, including a few who read it in its entirety in its draft stages. In particular I would like to thank Hubert Decler (Kathmandu), since his comments resulted in revisions of real substance.

² I have preserved several Sanskrit terms such as this since there is no sufficient English equivalent. It would certainly be misleading to translate *kāvya* as 'poetry' since it includes so much more than that (drama, poetic prose). The Tibetan word corresponding to *kāvya* is *snyan dngags* (modern Tibetan works sometimes simplify the spelling as *snyan ngag*).

³ Another text so styled was a life of the Buddha written by Bo-dong-pa Phyogs-las-rnam-rgyal (1375-1451), which would have been roughly contemporary to the work of Zhang-zhung-pa.

⁴ According to his life as found in a modern biographical dictionary, Ko-zhul (1992: 1464-1465), the name of the monastery he founded and headed, and the place where he died, was Nags-shod Sbus-mda' Rnam-rgyal-dpal-bar (or Nags-shod Sbus-mda'i *gdan-sa*). He first went to this place sometime after his composition of the Rāma story in 1438. In his 55th year (1458) he went to Chab-mdo Byams-pagling (founded in 1437) to teach sūtra and tantra. We may know from the *Vaidūrya ser po* (Sde-srid 1960: 248) that Zhangzhungpa was the second abbot of Chamdo (Chab-mdo) Monastery in Eastern Tibet (Khams), immediately after the founder and first abbot whose name was 'Bodhisattva' Shes-rab-bzang-po. He later on ascended the throne of the 'great monastic community' (*dgon sde chen po*) Gu-ru Dpal-'khor.

son was born in a Wood Monkey year (1404 CE) in Gugé in Western Tibet (Mnga'-ris). As a youth, he went to Central Tibet and studied with Tsongkhapa and his [two chief] disciples, was well educated in all the sūtras, tantras and sciences, and became a great scholar. Later on they would name him, together with Mus-srad-pa, as the 'Two of Perfect Judgment,' among the various other groups of disciples of Tsongkhapa. He finished the Great Commentary [by Mkhas-grub-rje] on the Kālacakra.⁵ His various compositions, praises to Lamas and the like, display charm and much skill in the *kāvya* ornaments. He also held the headship of Chab-mdo Byams-gling, founded a new monastery in Lho-khog,⁶ and did still other deeds for the Teachings. During his 68th year (i.e. 1469), at the place just mentioned, he passed into peace.⁷

Roughly surveying this information, we may see that during his life he migrated as a youth from his homeland in Western Tibet to Central Tibet, while we may know that he stayed in Ganden Monastery, soon after its founding by Tsongkhapa in 1409, since his two major *kāvya* works were written there according to their colophons. Following his studies in Central Tibet, he continued moving east, settling first in Chamdo in Kham, finally departing for the heavens in 'upper' (western) Kham.

The whole set of his collected works is not available, has never been published to the best of my knowledge, although it is known that a collection survives in Tibet. Indeed, we could locate a listing of its titles.⁸ We count altogether fourteen works (the first and last are themselves collections of minor titles), about five of them poetic in nature, to judge from the titles. Several of these works are somewhat more available, in original woodblock-printed form, in the Oriental Institute in St. Petersburg. See the listing in the appendix, where the titles are descriptive, or given in shortened forms, not the full titles (the poetic works are marked with asterisks).

Some basic questions that might be on many people's minds ought to be addressed before going into the text itself. First and foremost, 'Who was Rinchen Zangpo, and what might have led Zhangzhungpa to write a *kāvya* version of his life?' There are two areas in which we may say with much confidence that the Great Translator Rinchen Zangpo had a great and lasting impact on Tibet. Firstly and above all, he was a prolific translator of Indian Buddhist scriptures and commentarial works, well over 150 titles, and a very active reviser or editor of translations done by others. His translations effectively set the stan-

⁵ *The Great Commentary on the Kālacakra*, left incomplete by Mkhas-grub-rje when he died in 1438 CE, was completed by Zhangzhungpa. Woodblock prints of these lengthy Kālacakra works are preserved in the Oriental Institute, St. Petersburg (nos. B7639/4, B7641/1, B9032/1, B8526/1, B5678/1, B5681/1). Composed at Nag-shod Chos-gling, it is dated in the final colophon to a year 2327 years after the Buddha's Enlightenment, which ought to mean the year 1447 CE.

⁶ In about this time in his life he also became abbot of a monastery called Gu-ru Dpal-'khor, although he died at Spus-mda' Rnam-rgyal-dpal-'bar Monastery (Dondor 1993: 509).

⁷ Sde-srid (1960: 26).

⁸ The source is *Bod kyi bstan bcos* (1985:183).

dard for the New Translation schools, the Kadam, Kagyü and Sakya, and starting in the 15th century the Gelug. His translation work, for traditional Tibetan historians, marks the beginning of the 'New Translations' (*gsar 'gyur*), even though the translation work of Smṛti, which took place at the same time, is classified as the last of the 'Old Translations' (*snga 'gyur*). Secondly, he was a founder of numerous important monasteries in the western Himalayan region, and a great promoter of other religious arts, not only architecture, including especially the reproduction of Buddha-images and volumes of Buddhist scriptures inscribed with devotion and fine calligraphy. All these literary and artistic activities were carried out under the patronage of the king of Western Tibet who, according to Butön's Yoga Tantra history, donated one third of the fields he possessed to Rinchen Zangpo, and an equal amount to his ministers.⁹ Just how extensive this translation project was may be indicated in sources that say 75 Indian paṇḍitas were at work on it at the royal temple of Toling.¹⁰

It is more difficult to read the sources for what they do not specifically say, for their silences about other potential areas of greatness. For example, we might wonder about Rinchen Zangpo's greatness as an author. As far as we know only a very few small texts are said to have been composed by him, and next to nothing of this small corpus of writing is available today. Thus we can say with some confidence that his greatness was not due to texts he personally composed. Furthermore, he did not demonstrate greatness as a communicator to Tibetans at large. We have no record of his teaching before enthusiastic audiences, or of ordinary people gathering from all around to see him and hear his words. Some may prefer to find in this silence of the sources just another sign of his greatness as a scholar, as one who sat for endless weeks and months in his temples working on the Indian texts together with Indian paṇḍitas, and training junior translators. That is probably exactly how it was.

His translations bear in themselves testimony that he was not a 'popularizer.' The Tibetan translations he made are often admired for their close adherence to the Indian texts, but they reproduce the original grammar and syntax to a degree that makes their comprehension very difficult — difficult that is without resorting to oral explanations and/or written commentaries — for Tibetans who might be unable to read through the Tibetan words to the words of the Indian original. This style of translation was in fact criticized by some followers of the Old Translations (*snga 'gyur*) school, starting with the famous Nyingmapa intellectual Rongzompa Chökyi Zangpo (Rong-zom-pa Chos-

⁹ In Bu-ston (1968: 157-158) is an independent passage, not found in other sources, which might be translated: "It is said that of all the fields that belonged to the Mnga'-ris King, one third went to the ministers, and an equal part went to the Great Translator. Later on the fields of the Great Translator would be requisitioned as dry goods tax."

¹⁰ For historical details about Toling, see Vitali (1999).

kyi-bzang-po) whose lifespan overlapped with that of the Great Translator. For his words we have to rely on later Nyingmapa writers, since the original historical work by Rongzompa that they cite has not come down to us. In this work he argued for the ‘Six Superiorities of the Old Translations School,’ one of these being the superiority of their translation work. Zhe-chen Rgyal-tshab says,

Since the translators of the past were Emanation Bodies, they set down [their translations] according to the meaning. Hence [their translations] are easy to understand and achieve great power in their use of the etymological roots. Later translators were incapable of translating according to the meaning, so they translated word for word in [the original] order of the Indian text, making them literal and difficult to understand. In their use of the etymological roots there is little power.¹¹

This sort of criticism would suggest that not everyone would have ‘read’ Rinchen Zangpo’s accomplishments as a translator in the same light.

Our most significant source about Rinchen Zangpo is the biography written at Toling (Mtho-gling) by Khyitangpa (full name: Gu-ge Khyi-thang-pa Dpal-ye-shes) — one of his direct disciples — after the death of his teacher and therefore perhaps dating from as early as 1060 CE. Twice this text has been published together with an English summary or translation, while there are a number of other published editions and unpublished manuscripts.¹² By the testimony of its own colophon,

¹¹ Zhe-chen, *Chos-'byung*, p. 153. ‘Etymological roots’ translates Tibetan *byings* (which stands for Skt. *dhātu* in the context of language sciences, just as Tibetan *dbyings* stands for Skt. *dhātu* in Buddhist contexts). The earliest citation of the ideas of Rongzompa, whose exact dates are unknown, seems to occur in a work by Rog Bande Shes-rab-'od (1166-1244 CE; see Martin 2001: 116 for the complete citation, and references to parallel statements).

¹² This biography is the one translated and published in Tibetan script edition in Snellgrove & Skorupski (1980: II 85-98, 101-111). A 19-folio manuscript of the same biography may also be found appended to Tucci (1988: 103-121), in *Collected Biographical Material*, and in Negi (1996), the latter including a Hindi translation. Furthermore, the Tucci collection in Rome preserves a manuscript in 58 folios (De Rossi Filibeck 2003: 330, no. 654), and other manuscripts have been preserved in Tibet (Drepung Catalog, pp. 1529, 1563). There is an English summary in Rigzin (1984). The date would make it one of the earliest specimens of the biographical genre called *rnam thar* to be devoted to the life of a Tibetan (rather than an Indian) religious figure. Although critical historians may well entertain doubts as to the antiquity of this biography, it was certainly known, quite apart from Zhangzhungpa’s *kāvya* version of it, to authors of the 15th century, since it is directly cited in the 1484 history of the Bka'-gdams-pa order written by Lo-dgon-pa (1977: 291, 292), as well as in the 1476 history by 'Gos (1976: 68). A rather short Rinchen Zangpo biography, in the form of verses of praise, was composed by Gser-mdog Pañ-chen Shākya-mchog-Idan (1428-1507). In a critical vein, we may wonder why the information in Khyitangpa was not used by earlier historians. As far as I know at the moment, there is no mention of Khyitangpa’s biography, or of the unique information found in it, prior to Zhangzhungpa’s reworking of it. Is it possible that it was Zhangzhungpa himself who first made it public? I have no answer to this question, unfortunately, although further research might come up with one.

the biography that we have is only the medium-sized version, while a more abbreviated as well as a more extensive version existed, unfortunately not, or to put it in a more hopeful way perhaps not yet, available to us. Both Snellgrove and Tucci have expressed scholarly reservations about the authenticity of the text, reservations we will not explore here, except to say that we do not accept them as our guide. Some of the problems, inconsistencies and broken narration of the text to which they refer may be explained by its relatively abbreviated nature. Presumably the longer version would have dealt more thoroughly and consistently, and in a smoother narration, with those aspects of Rinchen Zangpo's life that in our medium-sized version seem rather sketchy, truncated, or even very occasionally out of place. A colophon apparently added to the end of some editions of the text by another hand, and not by the author, tells us that the details about "his masters and paṇḍitas and the teachings he received from them, his Dharma treasures, his wealth treasures and his artistic treasures including woodworking treasures and so forth are illuminated in the *Great Biography*."¹³

The content of Khyitangpa's biography brings us to cast heavy doubts on two popular historical narratives which are probably best known from the history of the Fourth Drugchen Incarnate Pema Karpo ('Brug-chen IV Padma-dkar-po), written between the years 1575 and 1580.¹⁴ One of these, a narrative with a background of its own often repeated by historians, is the story that the western Tibetan king Yeshé Ö picked 21 intelligent boys between the ages of ten and twenty to go to Kashmir in order to learn the art of translation.¹⁵ All but two, Rinchen Zangpo and the 'lesser translator' Legpai Sherab (Legs-pa'i-shes-rab), died from the heat. However, from the biography we know that Rinchen Zangpo first went to Kashmir with only two companions, and that Legpai Sherab was not among them. The translators in training were taken with him on the second trip. Samten G. Karmay pointed out these discrepancies long ago.¹⁶

¹³ Compare the slightly different English translation in Snellgrove & Skorupski (1980: II 98).

¹⁴ Hoffmann (1961: 115-116, 118-119) summarizes these accounts, primarily on the basis of Pema Karpo. See Vitali (1996: 179-81, 281 n. 427 *et passim*). When Hoffmann's book was written the Tibetan-language biography by Khyitangpa was hardly available, although Giuseppe Tucci did acquire one version of it for his collection, and published an Italian summary of it in 1932 (English translation in Tucci 1988: 53-74).

¹⁵ Actually, the story of the 21 children appears first in the 1167 history by Bsod-nams-rtse-mo (1968), and then in the 1261 history by Rig-pa'i-ral-gri (n.d.), the latter evidently copying directly from the former. The story of the kidnapping of Yeshé Ö by the Qarluq is missing in these. We do find it in a 14th-century history (Sakyapa 1996) and in the 1474 history by Dge-ye-ba, although the earliest (or next to earliest) one ought to be in the *Bu chos* (passage translated in Gangnegi 1998: 39). See the discussion in Vitali (1996: 187).

¹⁶ See Karmay (1998: 6). Notice also Snellgrove & Skorupski (1980: 87), where the Great Translator's two travel companions were [1] 'brother' (not his actual sibling) Bkra-shis-rtse-mo and [2] an unnamed native of Kulu Valley who accompanied

The other problematic narrative has Yeshé Ö captured by the Qarluq, and held in ransom for his weight in gold. Since Prince Jangchub Ö could not gather this much gold in time, he was asked by Yeshé Ö to use the money instead to invite Atiśa to Tibet, if at all possible. According to this story, Yeshé Ö was thrown in a dungeon by the Qarluqs and died.¹⁷ From the biography we may know that Yeshé Ö died of illness at home in his royal palace, and the stories of his capture and attempted ransom are therefore, despite many centuries of retelling, very likely baseless.

Zhangzhungpa wrote his poetic Rinchen Zangpo biography, as he explicitly states in his colophon, on the basis of the one written by Khyitangpa. One important element in his decision was certainly a sense of pride and allegiance to his homeland. Khyitangpa, like Zhangzhungpa, was a native of the kingdom of Gugé (although it is probable that Khyitangpa was of Kinnauri origins, it is also true that Kinnaur may have been ruled from Gugé in those times), and it was in Gugé's royal temple of Toling that Rinchen Zangpo did most of his translation work (spending there the entire first half of the 11th century). The verse just beyond the point at which I stopped my translation, verse 57, has nothing to correspond with it in the Khyitangpa biography, so we can imagine that Zhangzhungpa is speaking from his own perspective when he says:

The place known as Gugé, while it lies
on the ground of Jambu Island, its qualities
could be counted as far as the peak of existence.¹⁸
There dwell scholars of perfectly clear minds and books.

them only part of the way. According to Khyitangpa, Yeshé Ö sent with Rinchen Zangpo on his *second* trip to Kashmir 15 (not 21) persons (not youths), among them 'five intelligent ones, five to administer to him and five of great faith.' Among the 'five intelligent ones,' Legpai Sherab and two others (Mang-wer Byang-chub-shesrab and Rma Dge-ba'i-blo-gros) survived, while two died from fever. These details do not accord with what we find in other histories, and a thorough study of the problem remains to be written.

¹⁷ See especially Karmay (1998: 3), Eimer's (1974-5) classic study of the Qarluq captivity episode (Eimer gives the reference to the 1950 article by Helmut Hoffmann which I do not have at hand), as well as the more recent article by Gangnegi (1998), independent of Eimer's work. These are just my current thoughts on the subject, which may well require revision. Hubert Decler suggested to me that both stories could remain true if we were to understand that Yeshé Ö, while willing to die in prison, did not actually die there. Yet the king seems to have undergone still other, potentially fatal, tortures in prison. One of these involved applying moxibustion to a part of his body called the *rtsa sgo*, an unusual expression discussed by Eimer (p. 184, n. 3), although I believe it means 'feces gate' and therefore 'anus' (*bshang lam*, as it is glossed in the Yisun Chang dictionary). One translation says they "cauterized all his bodily channels," which clouded his mind and rendered him "no better than an animal" (Śakyapa 1996: 275).

¹⁸ 'Peak of existence' (also used in verse 25), which should correspond to *bhavāgra* in Sanskrit (Pāli *bhavagga*), is used to refer to the fourth of the four stages of the non-form realm (*ārūpya-dhātu*) in Buddhist cosmology.

I think that his writing of this poetic piece based on the classic biography of Rinchen Zangpo was in part at least an expression of his identification with his home area, perhaps even an expression of nostalgia or homesickness. Certainly Zhangzhungpa had personally experienced the hardships of travel far from home. It is unfortunate not to have any source that would enlighten us about the circumstances under which he composed his poetic masterpiece.

Other narratives about Rinchen Zangpo could have been useful to Zhangzhungpa, had he been a history writer and had he taken the trouble to locate them. There is quite significant information in two historical works by Butön which he could have made use of, for example. He could have found more about Rinchen Zangpo's later life in the biographies of Atiśa. However, he was content to limit himself to the classic biography. He was not a researcher.

You heard me correctly, 'He was not a researcher.' I have to admit that for some time I was impatient with Zhangzhungpa because of my personal predisposition to search for information of historical significance when reading such texts. Eventually I began to relax these concerns, admitting to myself that writing history — well, history in any critical sense — was not among Zhangzhungpa's aims. Only then was I able to start seeing his work as being in itself an artistic object of historical interest, and could then come to some historical conclusions about it.

Zhangzhungpa does considerably elaborate and embellish the story in some parts, while omitting or condensing other parts at will. But these innovations are almost all literary, not changes in substance. He basically follows the course of Khyitangpa's narration in his account of Rinchen Zangpo's travels.¹⁹ Nearly every incident on the road receives some kind of attention from Zhangzhungpa, although he seems to miss altogether the incident in which the Rinchen Zangpo's party, now reduced to two, at the mercy of a toll-keeper of a bridge, was swindled out of 50 cowrie shells from his total travel budget of 600 cowries (one text says 500 out of 600). This episode surely has dramatic and poetic possibilities, but perhaps Zhangzhungpa didn't like to see his hero successfully cheated. All the other incidents of the road are represented: the near death from sickness of his sole traveling companion, the close escape from a band of 300 robbers that same night, then three days without food when the two women came to the rescue (note how

¹⁹ Rinchen Zangpo's itinerary is quite obscure, as is the geography of Kashmir, as may be seen in both Tucci's (1988: 60-61 *et passim*) and Snellgrove & Skorupski's attempts to locate some of the places mentioned. I would guess that his most probable route to Kashmir, beginning at Toling in Gugé would have been via the Shipkyi Pass into the Spiti Valley, then into the Chandra River valley via the Kunzom Pass, then following the course of the Chandrabhaga still further west until turning northward at one point or another to reach Kashmir. Alternative routes would have been more difficult, and besides, the person taken as a guide was from the Kulu Valley, and so he could have been expected to be familiar with the general area of the Kulu Valley, and not with routes leading through Ladakh or what is now Uttar Pradesh.

Zhangzhungpa eroticizes this episode in verse 29), the danger from wild beasts, and the final indignity of the racial taunts from the Kashmiri children of which I will tell in a moment. But then came acceptance, and he traveled about Kashmir over the next seven years, with the added side trip to Magadha where he stayed five more years before returning to Kashmir to pack up his library, then home after an absence of thirteen years. All these other travels pass without incident, without the slightest obstacle intervening. He's literally riding on air, thanks to his mastery of the *siddhi* of Fast Feet that Tibetans know as *rkang mgyogs*.²⁰ We might almost fall into the trap of thinking that the trip to Kashmir is a little too action-packed, that it might just be a standard literary catalogue of the hazards of foreign travel, like we see in so much of our modern travel literature. Well, it is true that Zhangzhungpa subtracts some details that might detract from the dramatic effect, much as present-day real-life storytellers do, but he is nevertheless, in his own way, quite faithful to his source.

Zhangzhungpa would seem, at least at first, to show a reluctance to alter the wording when the *ḍākinīs* are speaking. Verses 15-16 are almost exact in wording (but be aware that Snellgrove's way of translating here is much different from mine), so we are rather surprised when the goddess in verses 25-26 gives a completely different speech. Some of the verses of Zhangzhungpa that I personally found most charming (verses 15-16 and 41) are in fact in Khyitangpa's words. Verse 41 reads:

At first troops of breast-milk drinkers
swarmed 'round to welcome the lord,
"Wow, look at this yellow man
with no mustache, how weird!"

Zhangzhungpa takes these engaging words of Khyitangpa (engaging more for their whiff of realism than for poetic devices) and takes them one imaginative but entirely believable step further:

They were making these cymbal-like sounds with their palms;
they were giggling and whirling their clothes.

After the eventful journey to Kashmir, and the semi-triumphant entry, the interest fades and the description is brief and sometimes extremely hurried (see the second half of verse 46, made up of four terse verbal clauses). Sitting together with paṇḍitas and books, even if it may have been the whole point of the quest, isn't all that exciting after all. Fast-forward to thirteen years later in just ten verses.

²⁰ This is the same phenomenon that was most famously described by Alexandra David-Neel in her book *Magic and Mystery in Tibet* (first published in French in 1929), chapter 6 (1971: 199-241). Although she is aware of the term *rkang mgyogs*, she generally calls it "lung-gom," which is *rlung sgom*, 'air meditation.' *Rkang mgyogs* translates Sanskrit *jaṅghākara*, a quite extraordinary skill nevertheless numbered among the Eight Ordinary Siddhis.

Indianness

Zhangzhungpa is being quite self-consciously 'Indian', and perhaps even more so when the actions are taking place in Tibet, as for example in verse 12, where he takes the unspecified tree of the original biography and makes it into a Sahakāra creeper.²¹ And he does not shy away from specialized *kāvya* vocabulary that might well confuse the naive or uninitiated Tibetan reader. One excellent example of this is in verse 17, where he uses the Tibetan word *ri yig* (the vowel sign for the first 'i' should be, but is not, reversed). This word translates as 'letter RI,' which is a clue that there might be a Sanskrit word with the sought-for meaning that begins with RI. In fact, with help from the glossaries, we may know that this *ri yig* is a word for the gods in general, and from this deduce that it must correspond in some way with the Sanskrit word *ṛbhu* which has this meaning. Much better known to literate Tibetans is the expression *ra gnyis*, which also uses a characteristic letter to hint at a word containing it. *Ra gnyis* means "two 'R's," referring of course to the two 'R's in Sanskrit *bhramara* for 'bee'. If you ask the natural question, what sense would "two 'R's" or 'letter RI' make to Tibetans since their language has neither a word for 'bee' with two 'R's in it nor a word for the gods beginning with the letter RI, I guess you might be missing the point of it all. It is precisely because it can only work in an Indian context that the literarily enlightened ones value it. It has the ring of authentic Indianness, and transplants the Tibetan writer and reader firmly into the Indian realm, forcing them to either 'think Indian' or be left entirely out of the communication loop. What is perhaps anyway remarkable is that the Tibetan reader is forced to 'think Indian' even when the story is taking place in Tibet.

Tibetan composition of kāvya

Just to give a sketchy history of Tibetan composition of *kāvya*, it is known that Tibetans did not attempt to write in full *kāvya* style until some students of Shongtön (who made the first complete translation of the *Kāvyaḍarśa*) did so somewhere around 1300. At about the same time, the Third Karmapa Rangjung Dorjé (d. 1339) composed 66 Jātaka stories in *campū* style,²² inspired by the 34 stories by Āryaśūra.²³ We also have a few *kāvya*-style Jātaka stories by the very famous Nying-

²¹ The Sanskrit dictionaries do not suggest that the Sahakāra was a creeper. Instead they say that it is a kind of fragrant mango tree.

²² The complete collection of 100 Jātaka stories has been published a few times. One sample story, the *jātaka* of Śrīsenā, has been published in *Gold Nugget* (I 192-226).

²³ Tibetans, on what they at least considered good authority, believed that Āryaśūra had intended to compose one hundred Jātaka stories, but only completed 34 before his death. Khoroché (1989: xi-xii) casts doubt on this idea, insisting that Āryaśūra's work is complete as it stands.

mapa teacher Longchen Rabjampa (d. 1363).²⁴ In short, when Zhangzhungpa was active, the practice of writing in Tibetan in *kāvya* style was only a little over a hundred years old.²⁵

Tibetan knowledge of Indian epic

We should at least briefly mention Tibetan knowledge of Indian epic, since this is of general significance for Tibetan *kāvya* studies, and of course more specifically for Zhangzhungpa's version of the Rāmāyaṇa. There did exist early on, in the 9th and mid-13th centuries, a few Tibetan sources for the contents of both the Mahābhārata and the Rāmāyaṇa, and pieces of the latter have been preserved in Dunhuang documents. There have been a few studies of Rāmāyaṇa texts among the Dunhuang documents (these documents ought to be older than the closing of the cave in around 1035 CE). It is known from an autobiography that Tāranātha, in the early 17th century, studied both Indian epics, and this led to the false idea that he had actually translated the Rāmāyaṇa. The only (somehow) complete translation of the Rāmāyaṇa was made by Gendun Chömpel in around the 1930's, parts of which have been published recently in India, although the full 4-volume version is supposedly being edited for publication in Lhasa. So, this leads us to wonder what Zhangzhungpa's source for the Rāmāyaṇa stories might have been, since he didn't have Dunhuang documents available to him, and there was not much literature in Tibetan for him to draw upon. Perhaps future studies will reveal his sources. Granted that our biographical resources are limited, still, there is no evidence that Zhangzhungpa studied Sanskrit in any depth or worked together with a paṇḍita, so we should not assume his ability to benefit directly from Indian language sources.

For Tibetan knowledge of both epics, the most significant early Tibetan source is Martön's mid-13th-century commentary on part of the verses of Sakya Paṇḍita's *Subhāṣitaratnanidhi*.²⁶ It is rather impressive just how much of the Mahābhārata is summarized by Martön, but it has been shown (Roesler 2002, 2002a) that he did not base his retelling directly on Indian-language sources, but drew largely from the Tibetan translation of a 9th-century commentary, probably composed in an Indic language in Tibet, by the Bengali Prajñāvarman.

²⁴ One of these, entitled *Po ta la kun tu dga' ba'i gnam*, published in *Gold Nugget* (I 257-300), has been translated by Guenther (1989: 17-58).

²⁵ I have written at greater length along these lines in "Indian Kāvya Poetry on the Far Side of the Himalayas: Translation, Transmission, Adaptation, Originality," forthcoming in a volume edited by Yigal Bronner and David Shulman.

²⁶ It may seem odd to give the title in Sanskrit, since it is evidently a Tibetan composition, but it is clear that some of its verses are more or less exactly copied from previous Indian collections. There is a recent complete English translation by John T. Davenport, *et al.* (Sakya Pandita 2000). This publication is all the more valuable for including a commentary by Sakya Khenpo Sangyay Tenzin.

Some observations on influence and style

Now I would like to spend the remaining pages with some rather scattered observations on the work's characteristic style, and also, along more historical lines, what influences might be perceptible in it. While the conclusions have much more to do with influence than with style, some basic observations on style ought to be attempted. On a rather obvious and superficial level, we may see that Zhangzhungpa engages in various types of enjambment, letting the syntax ride over the *pāda* boundaries in interesting ways. Sometimes these are even rather extreme and potentially disconcerting ways, like in verse 45, where he allows the proper name Dharmatāśīla to ride over the *pāda* break. In my translation I've tried to preserve as best I could, within the limits imposed on us all by impossibility, the enjambment of the original, but I do not try to preserve the original syntax. (Just as I've tried to keep the same number of lines in each of the verses, although I've divided up the lines according to my own lights into 4-, 6-, and 8-line verses. The original has no punctuational device that would hint at the divisions between verses.)

The main thing that distinguishes Zhangzhungpa's poetry in the Rinchen Zangpo biography is the fairly profuse use of figures of meaning. I will not venture to identify the specific types of figures, although they obviously represent a fair range. The meter is simple and regular and there are few perceptible figures of sound. I've used some amount of alliteration in my translation, but there isn't much of it in the original. This is in contrast to his other most famous *kāvya* work, his *Rāmāyaṇa*, a longer work in 137 *ślokas*. Here there are a lot more varied usages of meters and figures of sound. We also have two detailed commentaries on his *Rāmāyaṇa*, and these commentaries take care to identify each and every figure of meaning according to the categories of Daṇḍin, which always represented the Tibetan standard. These commentaries are both 20th-century. The one by Zhalshul (Zhal-shul), a monk of Labrang Tashikhyil Monastery in Amdo, must have been composed before his death in around the 1920's. The other, by Khambum (Mkha'-'bum), must have been written shortly before its publication in 1997.

One thing that is both general and fairly obvious when comparing the two biographies is the difference in the 'pace' of the narrative. Where Khyitangpa tells one story after another during the course of the Kashmir travels, Zhangzhungpa sometimes slows things down and indicates, at least in some poetically abstract way, the laboriousness and trouble of the roads in between the cities where Rinchen Zangpo must have spent the majority of his time less heroically (perhaps) confronting the problems presented by the texts and their translation. In other places (verses 46 and 53 for examples), Zhangzhungpa even packs a large number of incidents into a single verse, with brief verbal

clauses in rapid succession, as if he were eager to forget Rinchen Zangpo's long years of studying and get back the road itself.

Somehow worth observing are the several *ślokas* in which the high and low are juxtaposed, usually with a half-*śloka* devoted to each and usually with a very abrupt transition from one to the other. Some of these involve the head (or eyes or hair) and the feet (verses 1, 4, 5[?] 9, 27 & 51, but note also verse 37 which is only partial), while a nearly equal number involve the sky and the earth (verses 5[?], 8[?], 38-40, 57[?]). The head-foot verses are sometimes in close proximity to the sky-earth verses. I don't know quite what to conclude about this, except that it might well be a reflex of the common Indian method of praising persons from head to foot, and gods from foot to head. In verses pertaining to Rinchen Zangpo we find it both ways, as if Zhangzhungpa were unsure if he was human or divine.

Another interesting thing to observe: Rinchen Zangpo is in several verses represented by the moon, in its crescent or waxing phases (verses 18, 20, 29). I think, besides indicating his status as a luminary, these lunar metaphors indicate his youth and his not yet realized potential as a translator.

Zhangzhungpa's poetic lineage

It was only quite recently that I gained the confidence to say something about the lineage of *kāvya* teachers that stands before and behind Zhangzhungpa. Tsongkhapa himself is an obvious candidate for an important predecessor in this field, even if Zhangzhungpa was only 15 when Tsongkhapa died. Within Zhangzhungpa's Rinchen Zangpo biography we find a verse, no. 28, which makes direct reference to the story of Sadāprarudita²⁷:

Giving no mind whatsoever to what came up,
to the cold and heat, the hunger and thirst,
this hero who set out to find
every last way of teaching of the Victor
robbed of his fame Sadāprarudita
who sought only the Perfection of Insight [Sūtra].²⁸

This would at the same time very likely be a reference to one of the two longer and most famous *kāvya* works by Tsongkhapa. In fact, this same verse has a phrase paralleling passages in the opening pages of Tsong-

²⁷ Tibetan: Rtag-tu-ngu, 'Always Weeping.' Part of his story has been nicely told in English in Paul (1985: 115-34).

²⁸ The rather outrageous contrast, making Rinchen Zangpo greater than the hero of a story contained in a set of the most important Mahāyāna scriptures, the *Prajñāpāramitā Sūtras*, is similar in kind to contrasts made in other verses. Notice in particular verse 52 where Rinchen Zangpo is compared with the bodhisattva Mañjuśrī, and even more remarkable, in verse 53, where it is implied that Rinchen Zangpo's deeds surpassed those of all the Buddhas.

khapa's work,²⁹ which serves to strengthen the impression that this verse is an homage, or even a meta-poetic comparison with, Tsongkhapa's work. The following verse, no. 29, has an even more marked phrase parallel with the other main *kāvya* work of Tsongkhapa. Even with this hyperbole that finds Sadāprarudita fading under the comparison, Zhangzhungpa would seem to be telling us in an oblique manner that Sadāprarudita's heroic quest as recounted by Tsongkhapa inspired his own account of Rinchen Zangpo's travel to Kashmir.

So let's have a look at the colophon of Tsongkhapa's *campū* on Sadāprarudita.³⁰ Among the three persons credited with inspiring the work or with teaching him *kāvya*, one is Rendawa, a Sakyapa teacher with whom Tsongkhapa studied many subjects, another is Döndrub Rinchen, his original childhood teacher in Amdo, while the third is a 'bilingual master' named Namkha Zangpo.

Looking into a few of the many biographies of Tsongkhapa, we find that Namkha Zangpo attempted at least to teach Tsongkhapa Sanskrit grammar.³¹ This is very surely the same Namkha Zangpo who is responsible for a few translations of Sanskrit grammatical works that are found in the Tanjur.³² One of the biographies says Tsongkhapa

²⁹ It does seem very likely that Zhangzhungpa is making a metapoetic statement in his verse 28, indicating an important source of his inspiration, and this intuition is considerably strengthened when we see that Zhangzhungpa's words opening verse 28, "*gang yang gang dang tsha ba dang // bkres dang skon pa mi sems shing*," find a parallel (more in meaning and grammatical structure than in wording) in the Sadāprarudita story (Tsong-kha-pa 2000: 1): "*gang yang lus dang srog la mi lta ba'i brtson 'grus...*" ('Assiduity without any consideration whatsoever for body and life...'). In the following verse, number 29, we find a still louder echo of a phrase from Tsongkhapa's *kāvya* biography of Drakpa Jangchub (Zhangzhungpa's words *smin legs zung // yid bsrubs gsal ba bzhin* echoing Tsongkhapa's *smin legs gzugs la yid srubs bzhin*). At the moment I am considering these literary parallels as being very strongly suggestive of influence, not necessarily overwhelmingly persuasive.

³⁰ This work is preserved in the several reprint versions of the Collected Works of Tsongkhapa, but I prefer to make reference to a separate modern edition (Tsong-kha-pa 2000), which also includes an interesting modern commentary (Tshe-tan Zhabs-drung 2000). There are certain places, most clearly verses 4 and 28-29, where Zhangzhungpa echoes specific poetic phrases used by Tsongkhapa in his Sadāprarudita story. I think that there are more general parallels between these two works, since both are *kāvya* rewritings of accounts of journeys in quest of books.

³¹ The only references in English that I know of for this episode in Tsongkhapa's life are in Tucci (1999: 428): "At the school of the lotsāva Nam mk'a bzañ po, he learns rhetoric and obtains the realization of Sarasvatī," and another brief reference in Thurman, *Life and Teachings of Tsong Khapa*, p. 11: "He received teachings on the technical aspects of poetry from the Translator Namkha Zangpo..." From Kaschewsky's German-translated life of Tsongkhapa, we may know that his studies with Namkha Zangpo took place in the autumn of his 23rd year (therefore in 1379; see Kaschewsky 1971: I 87). A very extensive biography of Tsongkhapa written in the years 1843-1845, which has the virtue of quoting at length from earlier biographies, tells the story of Tsongkhapa's relationship with Channga Dragpa Jangchub and his studies with Namkha Zangpo (Dar-han Mkhan-sprul 1992: 162-164).

³² These translations of Sanskrit grammatical works are Candragomin's *Uṇādi* (*U ṇa la sogs pa*; Toh. no. 4427) and Durgasimha's *Kalāṇādisūtra* (*Ka lā pa'i u ṇa la sogs pa'i mdo*; Toh. no. 4425). We might note, since this demonstrates an active interest in

studied with Namkha Zangpo the *Candrapa* and so forth but did not actually succeed in it (certainly the one semester he spent studying it would not have been enough).³³ Namkha Zangpo is described here as a Bodongpa grammarian. Tsongkhapa went on to study with him the *Kāvyaśāstra* and other *kāvya* texts and became very skilled in it, composing a prayer to Sarasvatī³⁴ and other *kāvya* pieces of which it was said that they “reveal the *rasas* of the *alaṅkāras*” (*rgyan gyi nyams 'char*). Immediately the biography adds: “A year after this, the Channga Dragpa Jangchub died, and he was asked by the lay and monastic leaders to compose a biography, so he composed the *Togjō Lhunpo* (*Rtogs-brjod Lhun-po*).” This is a shortened title for the second of Tsongkhapa’s two most famous *kāvya* works, the one devoted to the life of the short-lived Drigung Kagyüpa teacher Channga Dragpa Jangchub (1356-1386).³⁵ Tsongkhapa composed this poetic biography in 1387 at the order (*bkas bskul*, ‘urged on by the command’) of the ruler of Tibet at the time, Miwang Dragpa Gyaltsen (re. 1385-1432), who would in later years prove to be one of Tsongkhapa’s greatest financial supporters. It was in about this same time that Tsongkhapa stopped being primarily a student and became widely recognized, even famous, as a teacher, already some twenty years before he founded Ganden Monastery.

I believe that all of Tsongkhapa’s main *kāvya* pieces were composed when he was about 24 years of age, even while admitting that his later works are not free of *kāvya* influence. One rather long poetic work, his *Praise to Mañjuśrī*,³⁶ written in 1394, is an example. However, in general,

kāvya, that he also completed his uncle Byang-chub-rtse-mo’s translation of Kālidāsa’s *Meghadūta* (*Sprin gyi pho nya*; Toh. no. 4302) and he revised one of the three translations of Ratnākaraśānti’s work on metrics, the *Chandoratnākara* (*Sdeb sbyor rin chen 'byung gnas*; Toh. no. 4304). On Tibetan translations and studies of Sanskrit metrics, see Smith (2001: 202).

³³ Of course, most of the biographies phrase this diplomatically. They put it in ways like this: He learned Sanskrit grammar well, but he would not openly admit this (*gsan nas mkhas par mkhyen kyang dngos su zhal gyis mi bzhes so*). Mkhas-grub-rje’s earlier biography (the *Dad pa’i ’jug ngogs*, ‘Faith’s Port of Entry’) is not quite so diplomatic. He says that Tsongkhapa nourished strong hopes of completely mastering the main outlines of Sanskrit grammar under Namkha Zangpo, but these hopes were not fulfilled on account of a few inclement circumstances (*de dus bla ma lotstsha ba nam bzang pa [-nam mkha’ bzang po] spyan snga bas gdan drangs nas phebs ’dug pas / khong pa’i drung du sgra’i sa ris yongs su rdzogs pa zhig mdzad par bzhed pa’i thugs ’dun che bar yod pa la / ’gal rkyen cung zhig byung bas mdzad pa ma grub*).

³⁴ This definitely means the brief and rather *śrīngāra-rasa*-tinged *stotra* (both a praise and an invocation) to Sarasvatī translated in Kilty (2001: 20-21). The biographies quote one line from it, the one Kilty translates, “Those alluring honeybee eyes in that lotus face.”

³⁵ For Tibetan text and English translation of a devotional prayer addressed to Gagspa-byang-chub, see Kilty (2001: 102-107).

³⁶ For translations of this work, see Thurman (1990: 188-197) and Kilty (2001: 22-69), the latter including the Tibetan in its original script. A remarkable poetic work, one that I haven’t been able to date, is his words of advice for Bshes-gnyen Sba-ba, written without using any vowel signs at all. This is immediately noticeable, and has a special difficulty in that it is impossible to use the genitive and instrumental cases. This work has been published in *Gold Nugget* (pp. 365-373).

his works came to be more and more concerned with strictly Buddhist matters, employing increasingly well-defined philosophical vocabulary, with correspondingly less poetry.

It was possible to learn more about Tsongkhapa's grammar and *kāvya* teacher Namkha Zangpo who appears to have directly inspired the writing of both of his longer *kāvya* compositions (and these two works were considered as a pair, and were even printed together as a pair³⁷). In fact, he was a nephew of Jangchub Tsemo (Byang-chub-rtse-mo), and therefore a member of the main line of Sanskritists (of the Bodongpa school) that descended in uncle-nephew succession directly from the disciple of the translator in around 1270 of the Kāvyaśāstra, Shongtön (Shong-ston). Hence, surprisingly or not, Zhangzhungpa would seem to be a rather direct heir of the main lineage of Tibetan Sanskritists, even though there is no evidence that he (or Tsongkhapa for that matter) was very successful in the Sanskrit language itself — much like later Gelugpa writers who would practice *kāvya* arts as a Tibetan tradition, without the help of any sustained study of Sanskrit. For example, even with all those Indian paṇḍitas at the court of the Fifth Dalai Lama (1617-1682), Giuseppe Tucci could still write his classic 1957 article that sheds light on his disabilities as a Sanskrit scholar. I would say that Tucci's article is rather unfair, however, in the sense that he doesn't mention any of Tibet's better Sanskritists, leaving us with the unfortunate impression there never were any.

Now, fearing you may already be tiring of reading, I would like to invite you to relax your overheated critical minds and imagine with me for a moment a small school of poetics in a larger institute of higher education — let's call it the Gregory Corso School of Disenfranchised Poetics, at the Tilopa Institute in Colorado Springs. A short flashback to the beginning of the story: A group of English and Comp. Lit. majors spend a semester studying with the most highly renowned Sanskritist in the entire eastern seaboard. Finding Sanskrit *sandhi* rules and second aorists somewhat daunting, they drop out and head for the Rockies. In Colorado Springs, they eagerly sign up for night courses in the Gregory Corso School, and as the rapidly balding Beat poet lecturers retire and pass away one by one, some of them take up positions there. Eventually, due to their influence, the idea to write poetry in the Indian *kāvya* mode starts to gather momentum until it catches on and becomes a minor trend. Soon they have literally thousands of enthusiastic admirers all over North America buying their books and trying their hands at poems in near approximation of the various Sanskrit meters, with *yamakās* falling on either side of every other *pāda*-break, all about night lotuses opening under the moonbeams and *cakora* birds feeding off raindrops in mid-air. Their Bible is, of course, Ingall's translation of the *Subhāṣitaratnakośa* and not, mind you, the Sanskrit text edition. But their English poetry, and this is more to the point, is as Indian as it could possibly get.

³⁷ Tse-tan Zhabs-drung (2000: 71).

True, like most analogies, especially hypothetical ones, this one is a ripe grape easily reduced to a thin and empty skin if pressed very hard. But perhaps it succeeds in conveying my own general view about the Gelug *kāvya* tradition. Of course there have been a few notable and perhaps even great Sanskritists within the ranks of the Gelugpas, Darlo Ngawang Puntsog³⁸ for example. In other schools a very few undoubtedly fine Sanskritists like Tāranātha (b. 1575) and Situ Panchen (1700-1775) would appear. In short, in the 14th and particularly in the early 15th centuries when Zhangzhungpa wrote, the *kāvya* tradition in Tibet was in a process of local adaptation. Over time it would form a very solid and enduring part of the mainstream Tibetan literary tradition, one that still has a good number of admirers and practitioners. Zhangzhungpa, as author of two of the most admired Gelug *kāvya* works, very arguably represents a landmark in that developing tradition. True, Zhangzhungpa's was not the first *kāvya* work to be devoted to the life of a Tibetan. In this he was preceded by Tsongkhapa's *campū*³⁹ on the life of Dragpa Jangchub, which might have even given him the idea. However, Zhangzhungpa was the first, as far as I know, to write such a biography entirely in *kāvya*-style verse.⁴⁰ This seems to be the main thing that is new about it, in addition, of course, to the creative freshness and imagination displayed in its composition. That it is truly an homage, and not an exercise in plagiarism⁴¹ ought to go without saying.

³⁸ Dar Lo Ngag-dbang-phun-tshogs was active during the reign of the Fifth Dalai Lama, when he translated Anubhūti's *Sarasvatīvyākaraṇa-sūtra* (*Brda sprod pa dbyangs can gyi mdo*) together with the Indians Balabhadra and Gokulanāthamiśra (Toh. no. 4297). He was the first Tibetan to translate Pāṇinian grammar, and composed his own commentaries on the subject. He also translated Indian medical works, including a work on optometry attributed to Manaho (Toh. no. 4443), a former physician to Shah Jahan who visited Tibet. It seems some of these medical translations are unavailable today. For more on him, see Smith (2001: 196-197, 243).

³⁹ The usual word in Tibetan for the mixed prose and verse genre is *spel ma*.

⁴⁰ I do know about verses in praise of eighteen aspects of the life of the ruler Rabrtan-kun-bzang-'phags by Bo-dong-pa Phyogs-las-rnam-rgyal, an author who lived from 1376 to 1451, making him a near contemporary of Zhangzhungpa (*Literary Arts in Ladakh*, vol. 1, pp. 91-106). This may very well be in a *kāvya* style, and is entirely in verse, yet it differs from Zhangzhungpa's work in taking the form of a devotional prayer-petition, each *śloka* ending in a vocative or subjunctive verbal form. If we were to accept praise-petitions entirely in *kāvya* verse, we would need to refer to even earlier works such as a few by Sakyapa figures as early as the mid-12th century as well as mid- or late-11th-century verses of praise recounting the life of Atiśa (although Atiśa was an Indian, he lived for a long time in Tibet, and verses in his praise probably strongly influenced subsequent *stotras* that took Tibetan teachers as their subject). For present purposes we exclude these verse praise-petition biographies from consideration.

⁴¹ Academics frequently express the idea that plagiarism is an alien concept in Tibetan and Indian literature. That this is manifestly untrue in the case of India may be known by consulting Meera (1986) and the sources given there. Plagiarism involves a conscious effort to unjustly assume the authority that comes with authorship by concealing one's actual sources. An homage, quite the contrary, pays honor to the original work and its author.

And since Zhangzhungpa's overriding concern was to create a literary homage to both Rinchen Zangpo and his biography by Khyitangpa, it is on literary grounds that it must be judged. Seeing and appreciating his success as an artist, rather than his missed chance to play the historian, we could also forgive him for obscuring the geography of the Vale of Kashmir, already unclear enough in Khyitangpa. For both of them, the trials of their heroes' travels were much more interesting than an identifiable terrain. In the end it is our problem, not theirs, if we choose to go on valuing information over inspiration and facts over the truths revealed in the unexpected and inexplicably beautiful turns our languages can take.

A note on the translation

The following text edition and translation covers approximately the first two-thirds of the text, the journey to Kashmir that is our concern here. I leave the way open for others to make more perfect and complete studies and translations in the future. I highly recommend those who have not studied Tibetan to read it, if not on the first then on the second reading, together with Snellgrove & Skorupski's English translation of the Khyitangpa biography. In fact, this should be framed as a demand, not a suggestion. I imagine those who do know Tibetan will have an even more enjoyable time uncovering mistakes I've committed, alternative translations and so forth. This is all part of the fun. I suggest that they, too, must follow along with Khyitangpa's biography, but in its Tibetan form. Only by doing so is it possible to appreciate how a single word or two in Khyitangpa can touch off astounding flights of poetic fantasy in Zhangzhungpa's verse. Until you have tried it yourself, you will have to take my word for the fact that reading Zhangzhungpa with Khyitangpa in mind allows you to understand it much better, or even at times prevents the embarrassing situation of not understanding it at all. I am afraid there may be no way to avoid the conclusion that reading Tibetan *kāvya* requires, as Hubert Decler (in homage, as he pointed out, to Frank Zappa) put it to me so felicitously, "a great deal of audience participation." This is my attempt, through a combination of translation and commentary, to plagiarize Zhangzhungpa in a language that was not his own. Or is it, too, like Zhangzhungpa's, a work of homage? So it could seem. Well, at least I hope I haven't created a parody. That was not at all my intention.

A text edition with a translation

gangs can gyi skad gnyis smra ba thams cad kyi gtsug gi rgyan lo chen thams
cad mkhyen pa rin chen bzang po'i rnam thar snyan dngags punḍa ri ka'i
phreng ba bzhugs so //

Puṇḍarika Garland Kāvya: The Biography of the Great Allknowing
Translator Rinchen Zangpo, of all the Snowland's Bilinguals the Crest
Ornament.

[1v]

na maḥ shrī gu ru sarba dznyā na ratna bha drā ya /

Namaḥ śrīguru-sarvajñāna-Ratnabhadrāya.

dpal ldan yon tan sbrang rtsi'i dog pa yis //
'khyud pa'i zhabs sen reg pa'i dge mtshan can //
lha dbang gtsug gi mtsho skyes phreng ba yis //
'gro 'di'i spyi bo rtag tu mdzes gyur cig //

1

“There are virtues in touching the toenail covered over
with the dollop of honey of glorious qualities;
may the lake-born (lotus) garland on the head of Indra
always beautify this creature's crown.

tshogs gnyis rin chen ma lus gcig bsod pa //
bskal bzang bsod nams phung po ya mtshan zhes //
mkhas mang ded dpon tshogs 'dis bstod pa'i gru //
sbyar bas thub bstan mtsho chen gang bar gyur //

2

“The jewels of the two accumulations all gathered together
in a single body, an amazingly fortunate merit heap.”
Ships of praise such as these by hosts of many-skilled sea captains
have been composed. May they fill the great ocean of Buddha's
teachings.

kai la shas mtshan byang du dge slong mchog //
bya yi gdong can thub bstan mig bu zhig //
'byung ngo kun dga' rangs pa bskyed cig ces //
ston pas bstod tshig phreng ba rnam par spel //

3

*2 mig bu: B dmigs bu. 3 'byung ngo: B 'byung po. bskyed: B skyed.

Note that the first three lines of this verse are clearly supposed to be words of the Buddha, but the scriptural source text is not at all clear. “One with a bird face” is a rather obscure but not therefore unknown epithet of the Great Translator. It is rather odd and interesting that it is used, in the form *bya'i gdong pa can*, in the translation colophon of a tantra in the Kanjur. See Tōh. no. 499. Notice also in some following verses some references to the role of birds in his conception, something that may seem shamanic or at least folkloric, but is also known from such literate sources as the Bon scriptures on the conception of Lord Shenrab.

“In the north country marked by Mt. Kailash, a superior *bhikṣu*,
one with a bird face, a guide for those blind to Buddha's teachings
will emerge. Let yourself rejoice, oh Ānanda.”
Thus the Teacher has added to the rosary of praises.

mchod pa gsal byed thal mo sbyar mdzes pa* //
tshangs pa'i cod pan sa la lhung ba na** //
sa skyong tshogs 'di'i gtsug rgyan gser ldan ma'i*** //

4

Ito ba'i rgyan du ci ste mi bgyid lags //

1 mdzes pa: B mdzes su. 4 bgyid: B bgyi.

*Note that *gal byed* and *mdzes pa* in this line may both be epithets of the moon.

Tsongkhapa's work on *Sadāprarudita* (at p. 112) has the nearly parallel phrase "*cod pan sa la ltung byed pa.*" *Gser-ldan-ma (f. Golden One) or *gser ldan ma* (f. golden one) occurs again below. According to *Knowing One Disentangles All*, it may refer to the outer ocean, falling brook, Ganges, surface of the earth, autumn, Ūmā the wife of Viṣṇu, etc. It ought to correspond to Skt. Rukmavati or Rukmiṇī.

As a way of expressing offerings, joined palms are beautiful.
If the diadem of Brahma* has fallen to the ground,
why should it not serve as stomach ornament of Golden One,
as the crest jewel of the whole range of Earth Protectors?*

*Diadem of Brahma' occurs in the title of a work composed by Tsongkhapa, a brief poetic praise to Maitreya (Tōh. no. 5275, part 29). Several later authors composed commentaries on this work. **Earth Protectors may refer to either mountains or rulers.

5

nyid kyi yab rje 'byor pa dul bas rgyan //

yon tan skyil krung 'gro 'di'i spyi bor 'dzegs //

grong khyer sa rnams gser gyi khang pa'i phreng //

mu tig tshogs 'bar brgya byin sar gshegs 'dra //

3 grong khyer sa: BG grong khyer pa.

As for your own father, a lord, ornamented with wealth and a subdued
nature,
the crossed legs of his virtues scale to the peak of this creature's
crown.*

He was like an Indra on earth [ruling over] the earth of the village,
a blazing heap of pearls, a garland of golden houses.

*Here Rinchen Zangpo's father is, as in *guruyoga* practice, visualized as the Teacher seated cross-legged above the crown of his head.

6

mtho ris dpal mo yum gyi yon tan ches // [2r]

skrag ldan sgyu 'phrul zhag bdun nyid du lhung //

khyod sku'i 'dab ldan yum gyi pad tshal du //

gshegs pa la 'gran chu gter sgrol byed bshes //

legs bris 'di dag bsod nams nor 'dzin gyis //

gdong la skrag pas kun bzang shar gyi ri'i //

phrag pa la 'dzegs de tshe yan lag mchog //

gser gyi 'dab bzang rkang stegs rnam par bsten //

1 dpal mo: dbal mo (?). 3 pad tshal: B dga' tshal. 5 gyis: BG gyi.

Your mother, a glorious goddess in heaven, being great with goodness,
you descended in just seven days with awesome magic.

The winged ones [that would be] your body competed in reaching
the lotus pond that was your mother. The friend for crossing the
watery treasury*

and the finely drawn one** were frightened of her face for its wealth of
merit

and so climbed to the shoulder of the all-good eastern mountain.*** At
the same time

a golden fine-winged [bird]**** used her uppermost limb (head) for its perch.

*This poetic expression is quite ambiguous. *Sgrol byed bshes* can be an epithet for the sun (perhaps Skt. *tarāṇī*) which ‘crosses’ the sky. However, since it is the water treasury (ocean) that is crossed, it probably should mean a ship. But then, from the context, it has to mean a kind of bird (not certain which bird is intended, although from the original biography, it would have to be a cuckoo bird...). **Finely drawn one (perhaps Skt. *lekha* or *sulekha*) may be a name for a god or gods in general, or of the peacock, which is the meaning here. ***In the original biography it is clear that the two birds are on the shoulders of his mother, and the symbolisms of the three birds, including the one on her head, is explained in a passage near the end of the same work. ****Fine-winged (or fine-leafed) may, according to *Knowing One Disentangles All*, mean the *garuḍa* bird or the *somarāja* (hemp) plant. According to the original biography, the bird on her head should be the parrot, presaging his later activities as a translator. Note, too, that uppermost limb (i.e., ‘head’) may be a name for certain trees (*shing tsha*, or, *shing be ta sa*). *Gold Nugget*, I believe quite wrongly, gives a note explaining the phrase *gser gyi ‘dab bzang* as an epithet of coral (I simply fail to comprehend how ‘fine leaves of gold’ could reasonably qualify coral, which in Tibetan experience generally means the bright red variety).

7

yon tan mtha’ dag kun ‘gro nags na bde //
 ’brug sgra’i gar gyi ngang tshul la chags pa //
 spyod bzang yum gyi ‘o ma’i chu gter che //
 gyen du ‘phyur ldan ‘dir ni rnam par rol //

All her qualities extending everywhere, the Delighter in the Forest,*
 loving the style of the thunder dance[r],**
 disported in this great overflowing water treasury
 of the milk of the mother of good deportment.

*I take the *nags na bde* (delighter in the forest) to be equivalent to *nags na dga’* (happy in the forest), which according to *Knowing One Disentangles All*, may be an epithet of either the cuckoo or the elephant. Note, too, that *kun ‘gro* (goes everywhere) is a frequent poetic epithet of the sky. ***Thunder dancer’ of course means the peacock (*Gold Nugget* agrees), which becomes agitated at the prospect of rain.

8

mkha’ ‘gro* dril chen glu dbyangs gre ‘gyur brgya’i //
 ser bus ‘dar ldan rab sad bu mo’i mtsho** //
 khyab ‘jug rkang par bcos pa’i lus kyi ni //
 mgrin sngon ral pa’i mtho ris skas la ‘dzegs //

3 lus kyi: B lus kyi. 4 ‘dzegs: B ‘dzeg.

**Mkha’ ‘gro* (like Skt. *khaga*) may have a number of meanings, among them bird, *deva*, sun and arrow. It may also mean *dāka* or *dākinī* (*mkha’ ‘gro* as a shortened form of *mkha’ ‘gro ma*, omitting the feminine ending). **I am as yet uncertain what to make of the ‘maiden lake,’ although it may be a misspelling for *bud med kyiis ‘tsho* (Skt. *jāyājīva*), one who makes a living through his wife, i.e., a dancer, although one source makes this equivalent to goatherd (possibly Skt. *jāvala*). Or possibly the reading ought to be *bu mo’i tshogs* (group of maidens, possibly Skt. *kanyākula*).

Awakened, shivering, by the breeze of a hundred turnings of the vocal
 chords of song,
 the great bell of the sky goes, the maiden lake,
 body fitted out with Viṣṇu’s feet,
 scaled the ladder to the heaven of the Blue Necked with long locks.

phyag mthil rtsibs stong 'khor los mtshan pa dang //
 sa la dbyangs yig phreng ba lhan cig tu //
 legs bkod khyod ni srid pa'i 'khrul pa la //
 bzhad pa'i tshem phreng 'od kyis sa 'di 'gegs //
 1 'khor los: B 'khor lo'i. 3 legs bkod: B bkod legs. 4 tshem: B tshems. 'gegs: BG
 'gengs.

The thousand-spoked wheels stamped on the soles of your feet
 and the rosaries of vowels on the ground went well together.
 The light from the strands of your teeth, laughing*
 at life's illusions, charmed this earth.

*'Opening' and 'blossoming' are also possible translations.

legs gsung gtsug lag snang byed bzang po yi //
 dkyil 'khor las 'phos ngur smrig mtshon bzang ni //
 nges par 'byung blo 'dab brgya deng 'grogs pa // [2v]
 dge ba kun byed sprul pa'i 'khor lo* nyid //
 2 las: B la. 3 deng: BG dang.
 *Sprul pa'i 'khor lo (*nirmanacakra*) may refer to the navel *cakra*. Note that
 syllables from the name of Legs-pa-bzang-po, teacher at Rinchen Zangpo's
 novice ordination, are hidden in this verse.

An emanation from the *maṇḍala*
 of the good illuminator of the practical skill of fine expression,
 the good symbolism of saffron color is the mind revolted [by suffering],
 a veritable wheel for emanating all virtues together with their hundred
 petals.*

*'Hundred petals' may refer to lotus, peacock, chariot, woman and saffron,
 according to *Knowing One Disentangles All*.

chos rgyal indra bhū ti'i grong khyer pa'i //
 glegs bam brgya byin grong gi yi ge can //
 pho nya'i* gdams pa 'dzin de las dkar brgya'i //
 lcags kyus drangs te phyag gi ldum rar 'ongs //
 *Pho nya, which of course means 'messenger,' is also a frequent synonym for
 skygoer (*mkha' 'gro ma*; Skt. *ḍākinī*).

A man from the city of Dharma King Indrabhūti
 had a sacred volume in the script of Indranāgara
 containing secret precepts of the Messenger. Pulled by the hooks
 of a hundred good deeds it was coaxed into the garden of your hands.

'phags yul yi ge las 'ongs don bzang po //
 mun par byed gad mngal gyi dri ma yi //
 blo mig rab rib gsal ba'i thabs gang zhes //
 sa ha ka ra'i* 'khri shing grib ma la //
 mnyam par 'jog pa'i bsam gtan la bzhugs tshe //
 rmi lam skrun par byed de nye bar 'ongs //
 2 gad: BG gang. 3 gsal ba'i: B bsal ba'i. 5 bzhugs: B zhugs.
 *Sahakāra, a type of mango tree, although here it must be a creeper. *Gold Nug-
 get* explains it as the mango tree which has fruits named *sa ha ka ra* only when
 it has been watered with milk. The original biography doesn't specify what
 kind of tree it was.

'What method might I find to remove the film from my eyes and mind that came from the impurity of the womb, a dust that darkens the good meanings that would come from the script of India?' he thought.

In the shade of a Sahakāra creeper
he sat and settled himself into meditation,
and making plans for a dream one came nigh.

13

de tshe de yi yid kyi mkha' //
byu ru'i chu 'dzin nyi gzhon brgya'i //
mdangs kyi rnam par bkra ba bzhin //
mkha' 'gro'i gzugs kyi rnam par khyab //
3 kyi: G kyis. 4 kyi: BG kyis.

On that occasion, the space within his mind,
as if with the vari-colored glowing
of one hundred youthful suns* upon the coral sea,
was completely filled by the forms of sky goers.

*Sunrises.

14

dga' ma gser gyi gdong mdzes ma //
mu tig do shal 'og pag gis //
mkha' la sprin dkar rgod bzhin du //
bung ba'i glu dbyangs 'di byas so //
2 gis: B gi. 3 rgod: B 'god.

A beauty, a golden faced lover,
girdled with strings of pearls,
as if formed of white clouds in the sky,
made this bee melody:

15

srin bu'i kha mchus rang lus 'ching ba ltar //
yul la zhen pa bdud kyi brgya ru chud //
bde 'gro thar pa 'dod pa'i mi su dag //
nub phyogs kha che'i yul du phyin nas kyang //
rgya gar shar nub chu bzhin nyul nas ni //
dam chos rgya mtsho bod du bsgyur na bde //
1 mchus: BG chus. 'ching ba: B bcings pa. 2 zhen pa: B zhen pas. brgya: BG
rgya. 3 'dod: B 'don. 4 nub phyogs: B byang phyogs. 5 nyul: B myul.

"Just as the silkworm's spittle binds up its own body,
attachment to homeland puts us in delusion's snare.
Whoever desires better rebirth or liberation, it would be best
if he went to the land of Kashmir in the west,* and
then, meandering like a brook in India's east and west,
bent** the course of the ocean of holy Dharma toward Tibet.

*The original biography says 'north.' **Or, 'translated.'

16

'dab gshog ma rdzogs mkha' lding sras de la //
mkha' yi pha rol rtog zhes yum gyi bka' //
'da' bar dka' ba de thos rnam par 'dar //
ngo 'dzum nag po bdud la bsdigs pa bzhin //
nyin byed gdong pa chu 'dzin yol ba'i gos //
'dzam pa ci zhes bskyed mdzad ti tis dris //

2 rtog: B rtogs; G rnyog. 4 bsdigs: B bsdig. 6 'dzam pa: BG 'dzin pa. bskyed: G skyed.

“The sky-hoverer’s child,* its wings not yet developed,
should set its sights on the horizon.” The command of the Mother,
difficult to disobey, you heard and you shook.
“This dark look of displeasure, as if exorcising a demon,
this water-bearer (cloud), this cloth that veils the bright face of the
sun...

What is it my gentle one?” asked the Titi-bird that raised him.**

*Sky-hoverer means *garuḍa*. In general, in Tibet, it is thought that the *garuḍa* chick doesn’t need to develop its wings, since they have already grown while it was still inside the egg... **Unclear, although one might follow the variant reading. Tib. *ti ti* may stand for Skt. *tittiri*, a partridge which makes the sound *titti*, or it may mean the sound *titti* itself.

17

mkha’ gro ’brug gi bu mo zab mo’i sgra //
snying la skrag pa ster ba sgrags te smras //
gnag gi gnyen* bcas ri yig** tshogs bcas kyis //
rnam dpyod dbu ba dkar po’i do shal can //
rin chen tshogs ’dzin dzā hu’i bu mo*** de //
'phags yul nub phyogs kha che’i rgya mtshor btang //

1 bu mo: B bu mos. 2 te: B de. 3 gnag: B snag. bcas: B rnams. 5 dzā hu’i: B dza hu’i.

Gnag gi gnyen* is a slight misspelling of *snag gi gnyen*. It corresponds to Skt. *jñāteya* or *sālohita*. Khyitangpa calls him an ‘elder brother’ (*a pho* or *phu bo*, depending on the manuscript) and supplies the name Tashi Tsemo (Bkra-shis-rtse-mo). Apparently it means siblings or relatives, although *Gold Nugget* is more specific, saying that it means siblings who share one or both parents. However, the traveling companion of Rinchen Zangpo, although perhaps in truth some kind of relative, is not listed among his brothers. *Ri yig*, literally ‘the letter *ri*,’ makes obscure reference to an unspecified Sanskrit word that begins with the letter ‘*ṛ*’. This word is Skt. *ṛbhu*, a name for the gods in general. *Gold Nugget* says it may mean either the group of children of a *deva*, or the sons of a king. ****Dzā hu’i bu mo*, ‘daughter of *Dzā hu*,’ is from Skt. *Jāhnavī*, an epithet for the Ganges derived from the name of her adoptive father *Jahnu*.

He told her, uttering the profound words of the sky goer,
daughter of lightning, that strike fear in the heart.
The daughter of *Jahnu*, container for hosts of precious substances,
necklaced in the white foam of her doubts as she was,
sent him together with a sibling
and accompanied by a host of gods
to the ocean that is Kashmir, to the west of the Country of Saints.

18

snying rje’i lang tsho rgyas pa’i zla ba de //
bkra shis rgyu skar ’od zer rtse mo’i tshogs //
khrid de dam chos mkha’ yi lam zhugs kyis //
nya ri (?) tog sde* mun chen bag yod byos //
3 khrid: B ’khrid. 4 nya ri: BG nya yi.

**Nya yi tog* is explained in a note in *Gold Nugget*. Literally, ‘fish-tip,’ it means the god of lust. ‘Troops of the god of lust’ here means, according to the same source, spirit (or delusionary) impediments.

This pitiable youth, a waxing moon, brought in his train
 an accumulation of the auspicious ray-tips of the lunar asterisms,
 and through induction into the sky-way of the Dharma
 fled the great darkness of the fish-tipped one's troops.

19

rnga yab g.yo ldan* shing rta'i 'phrul 'khor** gyis //
 chu mthong*** 'gog pa lhur len ri dwags 'dzin //
 'di yi mgon bcas dpal ldan snyan ngag mkhan //
 ku mud tshal 'di kun dga'i ge sar rgod //

1 'phrul: B 'khrul. 2 mthong: B mthongs.

*These are names of two of the eight minor continents in the cosmography,
 Rnga-yab and G.yo-ldan (the latter may also mean the Gtsang-po or Brahma-
 putra River, river in general, woman, deceiver). **'Phrul 'khor, 'contraption.'

****Chu mthong*, slight misspelling for *chu mthongs*, a poetic equivalent for 'sky'.
Ri dwags 'dzin means 'trap game animals.'

A chariot contraption [pulled by] Camara and Utkāṭa
 was blocking the sky, trapping the quarry of his persistence.
 Together with it's lord, the glorious poet,
 this kumuda* pond revealed its stamens of delight.

*The *kumud[a]* is the night lotus. It opens its petals in the evening just when
 the 'normal' lotuses are closing theirs.

20

zla ba rang gi rjes 'brangs skar tshogs dang // [3r]
 'grogs pa rdzogs pa'i dus kyi 'phags pa'i yul //
 nye ba ma hā saṃ gha'i grong khyer du //
 snying stobs bzhon pa kho nas drangs par gyur //
 1 'brangs: B 'brang. 3 ma hā saṃ gha'i: B ma hā pi gha'i.

The moon accompanied by its own followers, the constellations,
 neared the country of saints in its age of perfection,
 and was brought to the town of the Mahāsaṅgha
 through nothing if not the steed of courage.

21

der ni nyal 'gro'i* rgyun chen po //
 indra nī la'i gos bzang can //
 gser ldan ma yi lto ba ni //
 ril gyi 'khyud bar byed pa ste //

4 gyi: BG gyis.

**Nyal 'gro*, 'reclining-motion' may, according to *Knowing One Disentangles All*,
 mean water in general, or more specifically falling water (although this latter
 would seem not to fit well with the literal meaning).

There we find the great reclining-motion stream
 dressed in the finest lapis lazuli silk
 which entirely envelops
 the abdomen of the Golden One.

22

de la rkang pas 'thung ba yis //
 ska rags snying la 'jigs ster ba //
 yod de de bsrung gnod sbyin mo //
 sdig can sog le'i* sems 'chang ba //
 de yi dmod pa'i dug mda' yis //
 'dun na 'don** de rnam par lhung //

1 yis: B yi. 3 bsrung: B srung. 5 de yi: B de yis. dmod pa'i: B dmad pa'i. mda'
 yis: G mda' yi. 6 'dun: B mdun.
 **Sdig can*, 'sinful,' may be an epithet for the early winter. *Sog le* means 'saw'
 [for cutting]. ***Dun na 'don* is slight misspelling for *mdun na 'don*, in Tibetan
 dictionaries said to mean 'minister' (*blon po*), although it is used as a trans-
 lation of Skt. *purohita*, which means 'chaplain, priest.'

There there were [tight] girdles of foot-drinkers (trees)
 that grant fear to the heart
 and, protecting them, a *yakṣiṇī*,
 her heart sinful and saw-like.
 With the poison arrow of her curse
 [our] royal priest was brought down.

23

snying stobs chu yi rdul tshogs kyis //
 gang ba'i gser gyi chu 'dzin yang //
 mi 'dod bye ma'i 'thor rlung gis //
 skad cig rnam par 'khrugs pa thog //
 3 bye ma'i: B bye ba'i. 4. thog: BG thob.

Even a golden cloud filled with
 hosts of water droplets of courage
 collapses when an unwanted sandstorm
 comes suddenly to disturb it.

24

nyi ma dang ni dga' ba'i mig //
 lhan cig zum tshe ltas 'di mthong //
 dpal mo gser gyi go cha can //
 phyogs kun bsrung ba'i yi ge'i phreng //
 gser gyi khu bas 'dri byed pa //
 de yis mgon 'di dbugs phyung ngo //
 4 ge'i: G ge. 5 'dri: B 'bri. 6 de yis: G de yi. 'di: B de.

When the sun and the eye of delight
 closed together, you witnessed this sight:
 The glorious goddess with golden armor,
 a garland of letters to protect all of space
 written in liquid gold —
 by this the lord was relieved.*

*Or, 'Thereby the lord's breath was restored.'

25

kwa yi spyod bzang 'o ma'i mtsho //
 srid rtse'i bar du lud khyod kyī //
 mngag* gzhug gdung byed tshang tshing** ni //
 kho mos da lta thal bar bya //
 1. kwa yi: BG ka ye. 2 lud: G lung. 3 bzhug: G gzhug.
 **Mngag*, meaning 'to seek, to order, commission, send.' According to *Gold
 Nugget*, *mngag gzhug* means 'messenger' or 'servant.' ***Tshang tshing*, 'thick-
 ness, denseness' (like a forest).

"My goodness, the milk ocean of your good actions
 could flood [the world] right up to the peak of existence.
 Your orders I myself will now carry out
 and take you through the beating sun, the impenetrable [forests].

Veil of Kashmir

39

sa 'dir dgra bo nor phyir srog 'dor ba //
mthar byed rta babs ka ba'i dpung ba can //
brgya phrag gnod pa 'byung ngo phyag gis ni //
lcags kyus grogs 'di khrid de myur bar song //
2 babs: B bab. 3 gis: B gi. 4 myur bar: B myur du.

26

In this land are enemies ready to give up their lives for wealth,
executioners with shoulders (troops) that are gateway pillars.
Hundreds have been brought to harm. With your hands
take along the company of this hook* and go quickly."

*One may perhaps only imagine that the 'hook' alludes to the side-path, taken
to avoid ambush, in the Khyitangpa biography.

27

zhes smras pa dang lhan cig nyid kyis ni //
zum pa'i 'dren byed 'dab brgyas nyi 'od thob //
rmi lam ltas de'i rjes zhugs 'dzin ma yi //
lto la gom pa bzhi bcu bkod pa na //
lung bstan ba der sleb ba'i dpung gi tshogs //
mig gi 'od zer cig car mun pas khyab //
1 zhes: B ces. nyid: BG gnyid. 3 de'i: B de. rjes: G rje'i. 4 na: B ni. 5 ba: B sa; G
pa. sleb ba'i: B slebs pa'i.

Even as she said this, simultaneously
your closed conveyors (eyes), lotuses drinking sunlight,
followed after the indications of the dream.
When you had taken forty steps on the stomach of the holder (earth),
the hosts of troops pointed out in [her] prophecy arrived
and all at once the light rays of their eyes covered over with darkness.

28

gang yang grang dang tsha ba dang //
bkres dang skom pa mi sems shing* //
rgyal ba'i chos tshul ma lus kun //
'tshol la zhugs pa'i sems dpa' 'dis //
sher phyin kho na 'tshol byed pa'i //
rtag tu ngu yi grags pa phrogs //
4 'tshol: B tshol.
*I believe there may be echoes here of the following phrase in Tsongkhapa's
kāvya biography of Sadāprarudita: "gang yang lus dang srog la mi lta ba'i brtson
'grus kyi stobs."

Giving no mind whatsoever to what came up,
to the cold and heat, the hunger and thirst,
this hero who set out to find
every last way of teaching of the Victor
robbed of his fame Sadāprarudita
who sought only the Perfection of Insight [Sūtra].

29

rid kyang dga' spro'i gzi brjid can //
zla tshes 'dra de rjes 'brangs bcas //
gshegs tshe rkang 'thung dra ba'i gseb //
khyed pos mngon par sprul pa yi //
nu ma mngon dga' smin legs* zung //
yid bsrubs** gsal ba bzhin du snang //
de dag snying ni dang ba dang //

phrag pa zas kyi khur gyis non //

1 brjid: B byin. 2 'brangs: B 'brang. 3 gseb: G seb. 4 khyed pos: BG byed pos. 6
bsrubs: B srub. 7 dang ba: B dad pa.

Smin legs* may be taken to mean *smin ma legs*, 'fine [pair of] eyebrows,' but the Yisun Chang dictionary says it just means 'beautiful face.' *Yid bsrungs*, or rather *yid srubs*, 'mind churning' equivalent to 'dod lha (Kāma), the third Hor month, and desire. I believe there are very strong echoes here from words in Tsongkhapa's poetic biography of 'Bri-gung Grags-pa-byang-chub: "*smin legs gzugs la yid srubs bzhin*."

Even in your emaciation resplendent with joy,
like the crescent moon, together with your followers
you went, and in the tight latticework of foot-drinkers (trees)
a pair of beautiful faced [women] appeared, their nipples thrilled,
as if to rid you of a churning mind (lust).
They were pure of heart,
their shoulders heavy laden with food.

30

dwang ba'i mig chus sdig pa yi //
dri ma 'khrud cing zas kyi tshogs //
ro brgya ldan pas nyer mchod de //
bde chen grong gshegs don grub bzhin //
srog dor na yang dam pa la //
phan btags drin lan mi 'dor ste //
de yi mgo sgyes lcang lo'i shas // [3v]
dge legs slad du mngon par bzhes //

1 dwang ba'i : B dang ba'i. 4 bde chen: B sde chen. 5 dor: B 'dor. 6 ste: B te. 7
de yi: B de dag.

They served you stacks of food of hundred tastes,
while the purity of their tears were
washing away the impurities of sin.
As you fulfilled your purpose in traveling to the city of bliss,
even had you given your life you would not leave
without repaying this kindness, so you took with you
some locks that grew on their heads in order to make merit [for them].

31

sbrang rtsis myos pa'i bung ba de //
mkha' lding 'pham byed 'dab ma'i gar //
nyin phyed bskyod pas kha che'i yul //
gnyis sgyes grong khyer mdun sar phyin //

1 de: B des. 2 'pham: B pham. 4 mdun sar: B bdun par.

Those bees drunk on honey
outdid the sky-hoverer* in the dancing of their wings
and in a half day's travel came into the presence**
of the twice-born city in the land of Kashmir.

*Probably here intended as an epithet specific to the *garuḍa*. **Crowd[s] or council[s] are also possible translations of *mdun sa*, or 'dun sa, the same word spelled two ways.

32

der ni de dag grong pa'i skad //
zur chag la sogs thos bsam gyis //
khongs su chud de ku mud ta //

zla ba mthong ba nyid kyis rgod //
2 bsam: B tsam. 3 khongs su: BG khong du. ku mud ta: B ku mu da.

The dialects of the townspeople there,
Apabhramṣā, etc., by simply hearing and reflecting,
you memorized them just as the *kumud* lotus
laughs (opens) at its very first sighting of the moon.

33

de las rgyang grags song ba'i nags //
'jigs rung lce spyang phem sgra sgrog //
bung ba g.yo ba'i mun gtibs pas //
so ldan 'gram pa gnag gyur pas //
2 lce: B ce. phem: B phai. sgrog: B sgrogs. 3 gtibs pas: G gtibs pa. 4 gyur pas: B
gyur pa; G rgyur pas.

In a forest, a *kroṣa*'s distance from that town,
fearsome jackals yapping "Phem!"
darkened by swarms of swarming bees,
tuskers with temples blackened [with rut],*

*Both the swarms of bees and the blackened temples of the elephant are meta-
phoric for the darkness of the forest, but of course they also belong together,
since in Sanskrit literature the bees always swarm around the rutting ele-
phant's ichor.

34

der ni stag gi chung mas ma yi dngos //
gsar du thob ste bkres pas rnam par 'khrugs //
de mthong chu bur lta bu'i lus 'di ni //
'jig pa ring ba min snyam skad cig bsam //
4 'jig: G 'jigs. bsam: B bsams.

it was there the tiger's wife, finding fresh food,
was suffering excruciating hunger pangs.
He no sooner saw this than thought,
'This bubble-like body's destruction draws nigh.'

35

skabs der mig sman mdog can gcer ngu zhig //
mkha' la gar byed nyi ma 'bum dag spro //
zla ba tshes pa ltar dkar mi rkang gi //
gling bu'i sgra chen mkha' yi pha mthar sgrogs //
1 ngu: BG bu. 4 sgrogs: G sgrog.

It was then that a naked man the color of kohl ('eye medicine')
came dancing in space emitting the light of a lakh of suns.
and roared out the sound of a human thigh-bone flute,
white as the crescent moon, audible on the far side of the sky.

36

de ni grub pa mchog brnyes pa //
ratna siddhi zhes bya ste //
sgra de gdong lnga'i gad rgyangs su //
'khrul ldan stag mo nags mthar bros //
1 de: B der. 2 ratna siddhi: B ratna sirlhi.

This was a man who had attained
the supreme siddhi, Ratnasiddhi by name.

At the sound, mistaking it for the roar of the five-faced (lion),
the tiger fled to the furthest reaches of the forest.

37

ka la ba ti zhes bya'i grong //
khu byug gi rgyas skyed tshal du //
bsod nams pir gyis ri mo yis //
zhabs mthil gzugs brnyan 'dri zhing gshegs //
1 ti: G ri. 2 gi: G gis. 3 gyis: B gyi.

You set out for the town called Kalabati,*
an aviary for raising cuckoo birds,
painting pictures with the designs on your soles,
using the paintbrush of your merit.

*Ka-la-pa-ta, with variant manuscript readings Ka-la-cag-ti, etc., in
Khyitangpa. It seems to be impossible to identify.

38

de nas kasmir rgyal po'i khab //
mig la myos pa ster byed pa //
grong khyer pha mtha' gnam sngon gyi //
pha mtha' rnam par 'khyud pa mthong //
3 gyi: B gyis.

Then you beheld the Kashmir king's fortress
which granted the boon of drunkenness to the eyes,
the furthest reaches of the city
entirely embracing the horizons of the blue sky.

39

skar ma'i tshogs nams nam mkha' la //
rten med gnas par mi nus te //
sa 'dir lhan cig 'khod pa zhes //
bdag nyid chen pos rnam par bsam //
3 'khod: B 'god.

The great personage thought to himself,
'The hosts of stars in space,
with nothing to hold on to, could not stay where they were,
so together they settled down on this earth.'*

*This closely corresponds to a passage found in only one of the manuscripts of
Khyitangpa. See the footnote discussion in Snellgrove & Skorupski 1980: II 88-
9.

40

grib brtan yon tan me tog tshogs //
'thu zhing chu klung bu mo rnams //
phyogs kyi bu mo'i rna lung la //
rna rgyan 'god phyir rings par rgyu //

Picking the flowery clumps of Dribten's* qualities
the riverside maidens wandered afar
in order to place the ear ornaments
in the earrings of the space maidens.

*Dribten (Grib-brtan) means 'stable shadow,' because of a legendary cave in
which the Buddha cast a permanent shadow, which was then regarded as an
important place of pilgrimage. Generally it is identified as being in the neigh-

borhood of Srinagar. Among its most famous visitors were the Chinese travelers Faxian and Xuanzang.

41

thog mar nu zho 'thung ba'i tshogs //
 'dus te mgon de bsus byas nas //
 ka ye ltos shig ser mdog can //

sma ra* med 'di ya mtshan zhes //

2 de: B 'di. bsus: B bsu. 3 shig: G zhid. ser: B gser.

*Tib. *sma ra* may be a 'hidden' borrowing from Skt. *śmaśru*, 'beard, moustache' (Lithuanian *smakrà*).

At first troops of breast-milk drinkers
 swarmed around to welcome the lord,
 "Wow, look at this yellow man
 with no moustache, how weird!"

42

pheg rdog* thal mo'i sgra 'byin zhing //
 ga zha byed cing gos dag 'thor //
 'chi med mdun sas gang gi ni //
 nor bsrung sder mo mchod 'os pa //

1 rdog: B rdog. 4 bsrung: B srung.

*For *pheg rdog*, read *pheb rdog*, a musical instrument of the cymbal type, somewhat larger than the *ting shags* (finger cymbals).

They were making cymbal sounds with their palms,
 they were giggling and whirling their clothes.
 When it's in the councils of the deathless [gods]
 the claw of the property-protector (dog) is worth venerating.

43

bzhi mdo chen por ston pa bzhin //
 'byung po dgongs pas bsod snyoms mdzad //
 der ni gnyis skyes mngon shes lnga //
 'dzin 'dras phyag 'tshal 'dab brgya yis //
 gang ba'i dngul gyi slob phor ni //
 phul te ma 'ongs lung brtan byas //

5 slob: BG spos. 6 brtan: BG bstan.

As they pointed the way to the crossroads,
 they thought you might be an elemental spirit. There you begged alms
 and a twice-born [brahmin] who seemed to have the five super-
 knowledges
 prostrated and offered you a silver incense burner
 filled with hundred-petalled [flowers],*
 and spoke prophetically of the future.

**Dab brgya* is a poetic term much favored in this work, which causes the translator pause, since it has many possible meanings. It could refer to the water-lily, Skt. *nalina* or *śatapatra* (with a multitude of meanings!). Only one of the manuscripts of Khyitangpa seems to identify this *brahmin* as Śraddhākara-varman, but I think this is a misleading insertion. See verse 46 below.

44

ka lingka yi grong dbus na //
 gtsug lag khang chen bi ha ra //
 'jig rten kun la rnam grags par //
 brgya phrag cha yi* lnga rig gis // [4r]
 mdun bdar** gu ṅa mi tra gang //

sgra tshad rig pa gang zhig gis //
 phyogs su lung gyur de bsten nas //
 gang blo chu shel khong par ni //
 ma lus mtshon 'phos dbyangs can bzhin //

1 ka ling ka yi: B ka li ka yi. 4 cha: B lnga. 9 mtshon: B tshon.

*According to *Gold Nugget* (and note the different reading), this refers to five hundred Mahāyāna teachers (for which the area was famous). **In Yisun Chang dictionary [wrongly] spelled *bdun bdar*. It means the soldiers who go out in front, the frontline. The corresponding Skt. is probably *puraskṛta* (or *puraskāra*).

In the middle of the town[s] of Kalinga,*
 in a *vihara* known in all the world,
 a great center of learning,
 was one Guṇamitra,** at the forefront
 in knowledge of five groups of one hundred.
 He fell down at his side and studied with him
 all the sciences of grammar and logic.
 Like Sarasvatī he transferred every single color [of knowledge]
 in the interior of his water-crystal mind. ***

*The geography, again, is impossible since Kalinga was a country south of Orissa, and we are still in Kashmir until verse 48. But the original biography has several readings, in its various manuscript versions, for this city name. **He may or may not be Guṇamitra the disciple of Buddhaśrīrjñāna in the tradition of Prajñāpāramitā that descended from Haribhadra. ***I would like to thank Penpa Dorjee of Sarnath for his help with this verse, particularly the two last lines. *chu shel*, or 'water crystal' is Skt. *candrakānta*. This translucent gemstone, when struck by moonlight, starts to liquify. The close association of Sarasvatī with whiteness in general and the moon in particular goes some distance toward explaining the metaphorical usage here.

45

de dang mkhan po dharma ta //
 shī la dge 'dun bcas pa las //
 gsol bzhi'i cho ga* rnam dag gis //
 bsnyen rdzogs dgra bcom mngon sum nyid //
 bidha ra grong tshogs mchod kyis //
 brnyes byas nmal 'byor grub mchog la //
 de nas yid bzhin bsam 'phel zhes //
 bya ba'i rkang mgyogs dngos grub** brnyes //

1 dharma ta: B dharmā ta. 2 shī la: B shri la. 5 bidha ra: BG bindha ra. 6 brnyes: B mnyes. la: B las.

*According to *Gold Nugget*, this is a specific part of the ordination rite for *bhikṣus* (and of other rites as well). *gsol bzhi* is short for *gsol ba dang bzhi*, which corresponds to Skt. *jñāpticatortha[karma]*. *Mvy.* no. 8992. This is the part of the ritual that includes the formal announcement of *bhikṣu* status, and so might be considered the most important moment. In Pāli, *ñatticatutthakamma*. ***Gold Nugget* explains that this is one of the 'ordinary' *siddhis*, traditionally eight in number. A ritually empowered substance is rubbed on the feet, making it possible to encircle Jambu Island entirely in one instant.

Together with him the ordinator Dharmatā-
 śīla* with his community of monks, performed
 the Rite of Announcement and the Four, conferring
 full ordination. Then with your own eyes you saw
 an Arhat in the city of Vidhara,

a yogi with the supreme *siddhi* granted in a group ceremony.
From him you obtained the *siddhi* of Fast Feet
known as 'Wish-Granting Mind Multiplier.'

*At this point, Khyitangpa mentions only the Kashmiri Dharmaśānta, with no mention of an ordination ceremony. The only Dharmatāśīla I know about is the paṇḍita translator active in Imperial Tibet, although he cannot be the one intended for clear and simple chronological reasons.

46

grong khyer ta ma la sinta //
shrāddha ka ras mdzes der gshegs //
dbang rab nos shing rgyud kun thos //
man ngag thob cing grub pa brnyes //
3 nos: B mnos.

Then he went to the city Tamalasinta,
beautified by the presence of Śraddhākara,*
received the high initiations, learned all the tantras,
obtained the precepts, attained *siddhi*.

*Khyitangpa: Ṭa-ka-ka-ra-bar-ma. Śraddhākara varman is a relatively well-known name since he translated many texts together with the Great Translator, and several of his rather short compositions are preserved in the Tanjur.

47

gang yang rung yul gshegs brtson tshe //
lhag pa'i lha yi lung bstan pa //
'jig rten rin chen mtha' dag gis //
rang nyid gcig pu brgyan 'dod 'di //
gdeng can dbang po nā ro pa'i //
rin chen mchog 'di 'dor ba mtshar //
1 tshe: B che. 5 gdeng: B gdengs.

While striving to travel in this and that region
your extraordinary divine form (*vidam*) prophesied,
"Peculiar this desire to ornament yourself alone
with every precious substance in the world,
while throwing away the supreme jewel
of Nāropa, lord of cobras."

48

ces pa'i tshig mda'i 'jam pa'i dbyangs //
dbyangs can rgyud mang lta bu thos //
gur kum dog pas rkang pa yi //
'degs 'jog 'gog pa lhur len pa //
phu la ha ri grub pa'i grong //
yid mgyogs rdzu 'phrul mchog gi gshegs //
1 ces pa'i: B zhes pa. 2 mang: B mangs. 3 dog pas: B dog pos. 5 phu la ha ri: B
phu la ha ri. 6 yid mgyogs: B yi 'grogs. gi: BG gis.

This soft melody (Mañjuḥoṣa) of arrow-like words* he heard
as if it were made by Sarasvatī's *vinā*.
He persisted in the raising, placing and stopping
of his feet spotted with saffron,
and flew with supreme miraculous speed of thought
to the *siddha* town of Phullahari.**

**'Arrow-like words' (or 'one with words like arrows') may refer to the gods in general, since their words, like arrows, always hit their targets. **Phullahari is

Nāropa's hermitage, in a forest probably north of Nālandā in present-day Bihar. See Niyogi (1976: 287) for a discussion on its location.

49

bde chen lang tsho stong nyid kyi //
 dga' mar 'khyud mkhas kun tu bzang //
 tshems phreng ge sar khyod kyi gdong //
 zla ba gsar ba shar pas rgod //
 4 gsar ba: B sar ba.

The boys of bliss are skilled in embracing
 their girlfriends of emptiness. Good in every way,
 your strings of teeth, anthers of your face,
 are revealed upon the rising of the new moon.

50

nyi zla'i rlung bzhon phrogs nas ni //
 gang gis bzhon nas dbu ma'i lam* //
 zhugs te zung 'jug gzhal yas khang //
 skad cig gis bgrod 'dus pa'i lam //
 2 bzhon: B zhon.

**Gold Nugget* unfortunately explains *dbu ma'i lam* as if it were referring to the Mādhyamika philosophical view, when in fact the context here, being yogic, surely refers to the Central Channel of the subtle body. Successful yoga practitioners, whether Buddhist or Nath, dissolve the solar and lunar currents into the Central Channel.

Sun and moon robbed of their wind-steeds,
 what have they to ride on but the Central Channel?
 And what they enter is the palace of union,
 a combination path traversed in an instant.

51

sa gsum rin chen gcig pu des //
 khyod kyi ral ba rnam par mdzes //
 yul dbus 'dzin mar zhabs mthil gyis //
 rtsibs stong 'khor lo'i ri mo bkod //
 3 gyis: B gyi.

This jewel* unique in all the three worlds
 beautified the locks of your hair, and
 in Magadha the soles of your feet
 left thousand-spoked wheel designs in the soil.

*The 'jewel' here means the unique jewel offered by Nāropa, and this ends the account of his trip to Phullahari to meet Nāropa (notice Snellgrove & Skorupski's footnote). Recall that Nāropa was, in verse 47, called 'lord of cobras,' and in India, but not only in India, cobras are believed to bear jewels on their heads (or the markings on their heads resemble jewels...). For a general discussion of folklore associating stones with snakes, see Jeffreys (1942).

52

gang dag dgag sgrub khri' 'dug na //
 'jam dpal dpa' bo dngangs byed pa //
 mkhas mchog gu ṅa mi tra sogs //
 paṅ chen bcu phrag bdun dang lnga'i //
 rigs tshul nor bu'i do shal gyis //
 khyod nyid mgrin pa rnam par bkra //
 3 mchog: B chen. 5 rigs: B rig.

When you sat on the throne for establishing and refuting,*
even heroic Mañjuśrī would have been left breathless.

The jewelled necklaces of methods of reasoning
of the seventy-five Great Paṇḍitas,
including the supreme scholar Guṇamitra,
came to beautify your own neck.

*I.e., when he engaged in oral debates.

53

gang yang mdo sngags gzhung bzang brgya //
bsgyur cing zhus te gtan la phab //
rgyal ba kun gyi ma mdzad pa'i //
ston pa'i bya ba mtha' dag mdzad //

A hundred fine texts of sūtras and tantras
you translated, corrected and edited.
You performed all the deeds of a teacher
such as had not been performed by all the Victors (Buddhas).

54

bya ba byas te zhag drug gis //
'phags pa'i yul nas rang yul byon //
ti se gtsug tor 'chang ba yi //
pu hrang zhes bya gangs kyi yul //
3 ti se: B ti se'i. 4 pu hrang: B pu hrangs.

These deeds done,* in six days you made it
from Saint Country to your native land,
to the land of snows called Purang**
which bears Kailash as its crown.

*These deceptively simple words, "deeds done," echo an expression in the opening sections of the Prajñāpāramitā Sūtras (and in some other sūtras as well). One who has 'done the deeds' is a Tathāgata. Or alternatively, as *Gold Nugget* explains it, it means one has completed all the deeds associated with the 'three learnings.' **The name of Pu-hrang, like many other place names in Western Tibet, is in pure Zhang-zhung language. The *pu* means 'head,' while the *hrang* means 'horse.' Hence it corresponds to Tibetan **Rta-mgo*, and means the 'head' [of the river that comes from the mouth of the] 'horse.' In Tibetan sources sometimes it is the Brahmaputra River that comes from the mouth of the horse, although there is confusion on this point. Ti-se is also very likely a name of Zhang-zhung origin, which I would like to interpret to mean 'Water Peak.'

Sigla

The main line of text is always based on Zhang-zhung-pa n.d., for which see the bibliography. Variants are supplied from:

B: Text in *Gold Nugget*, vol. 1, pp. 507-519. This version has occasional explanatory footnotes.

- G: Zhang chung ba Phyogs las rnam par rgyal ba chos kyi dbang phyug grags pa'i dpal, *Gangs can gyi skad gnyis smra ba thams cad kyi gtsug gi rgyan lo chen thams cad mkhyen pa rin chen bzang po'i rnam thar snyan dngags punḍa rī ka'i phreng ba*, contained in: Gu ge Khri thang pa Dznyā na shrī, *Byang chub sems dpa' lo tsā ba rin chen bzang po'i 'khrungs rabs dka' spyad sgron ma rnam thar shel phreng lu gu rgyud*, Organizing Committee for the Commemoration of 1000 Years of Tholing Temple (Dharamsala 1996), pp. 37-57.

Unavailable to me is the six-folio woodblock print kept in the Tucci collection (De Rossi Filibeck 2003: 330, no. 653) which, according to the catalog entry, was printed at 'Brog Ri-bo-che Dga'-ldan-gling (actually this is the place of composition, identical to Ganden Monastery). It would seem not to be entirely identical to Zhang-zhung-pa n.d., since it is described as bearing the marginal key-letter MUM (instead of the key-letter KA and the marginal title *Rnam thar*).

Appendix
A preliminary listing of works by Zhangzhungpa

1. **Miscellaneous Works*, including his *Garland of Waves*, written in praise of 'Lord Great Personage' [Tsongkhapa] (*Rje bdag nyid chen po la bstod tshig rba rlabs kyi 'phreng ba sogs gsung thor bu le'u tshan*).
2. **Verse Biography of Great Translator Rinchen Zangpo* (*Blo [sic] chen rin chen bzang po'i rnam thar tshigs bcad ma*). The full title of this work, the main subject of this paper, has just been given.
3. **Cluster of New Moons*, a 'Mixed' [i.e., mixed prose and verse] *Kāvya* (*Spel ma'i snyan ngag zla ba gsar ba'i phon po*).⁴²
4. *Treatise on Glorious Kālacakra* (*Dpal dus kyi 'khor lo'i rnam bzhaḡ*).⁴³
5. *Rite for Laying out the Lines of the Cloth-Painted [Maṇḍala]* (*Ras bris kyi thig tshon gyi cho ga*).
6. *Treatise that Grinds [to Dust] All Bad Statements* (*Smra ngan thams cad rnam par 'thag pa'i bstan bcos*).⁴⁴
7. *Dedication Passage of the Explanatory Commentary on the 'Thad Idan* (*'Thad ldan gyi 'grel bshad kyi mchod brjod*).⁴⁵
8. *Method for Interpreting the Abhisamayālamkāra according to the Ultimate View, the Prasaṅgika* (*Mngon rtogs rgyan gyi mthar thug gi lta ba thal 'gyur du 'grel tshul*).⁴⁶
9. *A Thousand Doses of Word Clarification* (*Tshig gsal stong mthun*).⁴⁷

⁴² This may be the Avadāna of Prince Moonlight (*Rgyal bu zla ba'i rtogs brjod*), attributed to Zhangzhungpa in MHTL, no. 11047. This is surely the same as the poetical work entitled *Rgyal sras zla ba'i rtogs brjod snyan ngag* (I believe this may be a retelling of Jātakamāla story no. 31, on Prince Candra), in 22 folios, that is listed as being in the possession of the Khri-byang Bla-brang in Bylakuppe, in Karnataka.

⁴³ I am not certain whether this should be identified with the "Ṭik-chen" commentaries, which are available, or some as yet unavailable work.

⁴⁴ A work in 47 folios, its complete title is supplied in Tōhoku catalogue [Tōh.], no. 5462: *Phyin ci log gi gtam gyi sbyor ba la zhugs pa'i smra ba ngan pa rnam par 'thag pa'i bstan bcos gnam lcags 'khor lo*. From the title it is quite obviously polemical in nature, and it seems it ought to be considered a work of Mkhas-grub-rje (as such it is available in the latter's collected works), although Zhangzhungpa might have served (as he did in other cases) as note-taker, transcriber or secretary in its composition. Another possibility is that Zhangzhungpa wrote a further work, one with a similar title, defending the polemic by his teacher Mkhas-grub-rje.

⁴⁵ This work is apparently related to (perhaps a preface to) a commentary on the *Pramānaviniścaya* of Dharmakīrti. Its fuller title is listed in *Materials for a History of Tibetan Literature* (MHTL), no. 11864: *Zhang zhung chos dbang grags ba'i rnam nges 'thad ldan gyi 'grel bshad*.

⁴⁶ Copies exist in the Oriental Institute, St. Petersburg (nos. B7568/12, B7638/5, B7836/2). It was composed at Nags-shod Rnam-rgyal-dpal-'bar Monastery in a *sgrol byed* (*bhānutāra*) year, which corresponds to the Wood Monkey year (1464 CE).

⁴⁷ Two different woodblock printings of this work exist in the Oriental Institute, St. Petersburg (nos. B7638/4, B8532/1, B4964/1). It is a lengthy work of 260 (or 272)

10. Commentary on the Praise of Interdependent Origination (*Rten 'brel bstod pa'i 'grel ba*).⁴⁸
11. Guidance on the [Philosophic] View (*Lta khrid*).⁴⁹
12. Method of Purifying the Mind on the Stages on the Path to Enlightenment (*Byang chub lam gyi rim par blo sbyong tshul*).
13. *The Story of King Rāma (*Rgyal po rā mā na'i gtam rgyud*).⁵⁰
14. *Brief Works including the Bhairava Prayer (*'Jigs byed smon lam shis brjod sogs le'u tshan*).⁵¹

One work not listed here by title, although it probably would be included as part of text 1 above, is his *Praise to Milarepa*, which has been published.⁵² We may hope that a complete set of his collected works will be published before long. Meanwhile this information just given may be supplemented by consulting the website of the Tibetan Buddhist Resource Center (www.tbrc.org; Person RID P4341), which when last I looked listed 27 titles by Zhangzhungpa.

folios. For the complete title of this work, which is based on his notes to the lectures of his teacher Mkhas-grub-rje, *Dbu ma rtsa ba'i 'grel pa tshig gsal gyi mtha' bzhi'i skye ba 'gog pa'i stong thun*, and a discussion of the meaning of the words correctly spelled *stong thun* ['Thousand Doses' or 'Thousand Sessions'], see Cabezón (1992: 403-404) and Thubten Jinpa (2002: 189. n. 12). A shorter related work by Zhangzhungpa, in 25 folios, is also in the Oriental Institute (no. B4950/5).

⁴⁸ See MHTL, no. 11281.

⁴⁹ The full title is *Chos rje thams cad mkhyen pa dge legs dpal bzang pos gsungs pa'i lta khrid zhang zhung pas zin bris su btab pa*, which tells us that it is a kind of memo of oral presentations by his teacher Mkhas-grub-rje.

⁵⁰ Kapstein (2003: 782-6) discusses this text and supplies several verses in English translation. Some parts of it are included in Chapter Two of Matthew Kapstein's "A Reader of Classical Tibetan," which may be located at the THDL (Tibetan and Himalayan Digital Library) website.

⁵¹ A 4-folio work, with the title *Dpal rdo rje 'jigs byed kyi smon lam dang shis brjod*, is preserved in the Oriental Institute, St. Petersburg (nos. B7681/6, B7806/16).

⁵² A copy of this work, with added annotations explaining unusual expressions, is found in *Gold Nugget* (1988: I 467-472), while there is an original block-print located in the Oriental Institute at St. Petersburg (no. B7254/1). Its full title is *Bcom ldan 'das rje btsun bzhad pa'i rdo rje la bstod pa'i tshigs su bcad pa ka la ping ka'i sgra dbyangs* (also listed in MHTL, no. 11050). It was written at Nags-shod Chos-gling at the behest of Drung Rin-chen-mchog-sbyin-pa, a so-far unidentified official. A different work, on the *sādhana* of Vajrabhairava, which includes prayers written by Zhangzhungpa, is located in the Oriental Institute (no. B8079/12). The 13th Dalai Lama composed a commentary on this just-mentioned work (for which see Oriental Institute, no. B9229/1), testifying to its popularity, while the colophon to this work states that it was very commonly recited. Still another work, entitled *Gsang ba'i 'khor lo'i tikka*, is listed in MHTL, no. 11988. There is yet another short prayer listed in MHTL, no. 15931.

Bibliography

Bod kyi bstan bcos

- 1985 *Bod kyi bstan bcos khag cig gi mtshan byang dri med shel dkar phreng ba* ['Stainless White Crystal Rosary: A Listing of Some Tibetan Treatises'], Mtsho sngon mi rigs dpe skrun khang (Xining).

Bsod-nams-rtse-mo (1142-1182)

- 1968 *Chos la 'jug pa'i sgo* ['Gateway for Entering into Dharma'], contained in [his collected works as contained in]: *Sa skya pa'i bka' 'bum*, The Toyo Bunko (Tokyo 1968), vol. 2, pp. 318.3.1-345.3 (the history of Tibet begins at p. 343.1.2). Composed in 1167.

Bu-ston Rin-chen-grub (1290-1364)

- 1968 *Rnal 'byor rgyud kyi rgya mtshor 'jug pa'i gru gzings* ['Ship for Entering the Ocean of Yoga Tantras'] (= *Rnal 'byor rgyud kyi chos 'byung*), contained in: *The Collected Works of Bu-ston*, Lokesh Chandra (New Delhi 1968), vol. 11 (DA), pp. 1-184. Composed in 1341.

Cabezón, Ignacio José

- 1992 *A Dose of Emptiness: An Annotated Translation of the sTong thun chen mo of mKhas grub dGe legs dpal bzang*, State University of New York Press (Stony Brook).

Collected Biographical Material

- 1977 *Collected Biographical Material About Lo-chen Rin-chen bzan-po and His Subsequent Reembodiments*, "a reproduction of a collection of manuscripts from the library of Dkyil Monastery in Spiti," Rdo-rje-tshe-brtan (?). This important publication is not currently available to me.

Dar-han Mkhan-sprul Blo-bzang-'phrin-las-rnam-rgyal (mid-19th century)

- 1992 *'Jam mgon chos kyi rgyal po tsong kha pa chen po'i rnam thar* ['Biography of the Mañjuśrī Lord Dharma King Tsongkhapa the Great'], Mtsho sngon mi rigs dpe skrun khang (Xining).

David-Neel, Alexandra

- 1971 *Magic and Mystery in Tibet*, Dover Publications (New York), reprint of 1932 edition; the original French edition appeared in 1929.

De Rossi Filibeck, Elena

- 2003 *Catalogue of the Tucci Tibetan Fund in the Library of IsIAO, Volume 2*, Istituto Italiano per l'Africa e l'Oriente (Rome).

Don-rdor & Bstan-'dzin-chos-grags

- 1993 *Gangs ljongs lo rgyus thog gi grags can mi sna* ['Select Famous Persons in the History of the Snow Land'], Bod ljongs mi dmangs dpe skrun khang (Lhasa).

Drepung Catalog

- Dpal brtsegs bod yig dpe rnying zhib 'jug khang*, 'Bras spungs dgon du bzhugs su gsol ba'i dpe rnying dkar chag, Mi rigs dpe

- skrun khang (Beijing 2004), in 2 volumes, pagination continuous.
- Eimer, Helmut
1974-5 Die Gar Log-Episode bei Padma dkar po und ihre Quellen, *Orientalia Suecana*, vols. 23-24 (1974-75), pp. 182-99.
- Gangnegi, Hira Paul
1998 A Critical Note on the Biographies of Lo chen Rin chen bZang po, *Tibet Journal*, vol. 23, no. 1 (Spring), pp. 38-48.
- Gold Nugget
Gangs ljongs mkhas dbang rim byon gyi rtsom yig gser gyi sbram bu ['Gold Nugget: Compositions, Chronologically Arranged, of the Master Scholars of the Snow Land'], edited by Blo-bzang-chos-grags & Bsod-nams-rtse-mo, Mtsho sngon mi rigs dpe skrun khang (Xining 1988), in 3 volumes (pagination continuous). This is the only truly extensive anthology that exists of (primarily) *kāvya*-style pieces composed by Tibetans.
- 'Gos Lo-tsa-ba Gzhon-nu-dpal (1392-1481)
1976 George N. Roerich & Gendun Chömpel, trs., *The Blue Annals*, Motilal Banarsidass (Delhi 1976). Composed in 1476-1478.
- Guenther, Herbert
1989 *A Visionary Journey: The Story of the Wildwood Delights and the Story of the Mount Potala Delights* [by Longchen Rabjampa; Klong-chen Rab-'byams-pa], Shambhala (Boston).
- Hoffmann, Helmut
1961 *The Religions of Tibet*, tr. by Edward Fitzgerald, George Allen (London). Original German version published in 1956.
- Ingalls, Daniel H.H.
2000 *Sanskrit Poetry from Vidyākara's Treasury*, Belknap Press of Harvard University Press (Cambridge).
- Jeffreys, M.D.W.
1942 Snake Stones, *African Affairs*, vol. 51 (October 1942), pp. 250-253.
- Karmay, Samten G.
1998 The Ordinance of lHa Bla-ma Ye-shes-'od, contained in: Samten G. Karmay, *The Arrow and the Spindle: Studies in History, Myths, Rituals and Beliefs in Tibet*, Mandala Book Point (Kathmandu), pp. 3-16. This is a reprint of an article first published in 1980.
- Kapstein, Matthew T.
2003 The Indian Literary Identity in Tibet, contained in: Sheldon Pollock, ed., *Literary Cultures in History: Reconstructions from South Asia*, University of California Press (Berkeley 2003), pp. 747-802.
- Kaschewsky, Rudolf
1971 *Das Leben des lamaistischen Heiligen Tsongkhapa Blo-bzañ-grags-pa (1357-1419), dargestellt und erläutert anhand seiner Vita "Quellort allen Glückes,"* Asiatische Forschungen series no. 32, Otto Harrassowitz (Wiesbaden), in 2 volumes.

- Khoroche, Peter
1989 *Once the Buddha Was a Monkey: Ārya Śūra's Jātakamālā*, University of Chicago Press (Chicago).
- Kilty, Gavin
2001 *The Splendor of an Autumn Moon: The Devotional Verse of Tsongkhapa*, Wisdom Publications (Boston).
- Knowing One Disentangles All*
Rnam-rgyal-tshe-ring, *Bod yig mngon brjod gcig shes kun grol*, Kan su'u mi rigs dpe skrun khang (Lanzhou 1991).
- Ko-zhul Grags-pa-'byung-gnas & Rgyal-ba Blo-bzang-mkhas-grub
1992 *Gangs can mkhas grub rim byon ming mdzod* ['Dictionary of the Generations of Scholars and Accomplished Ones of the Glacier Land'], Kan su'u mi rigs dpe skrun khang (Lanzhou).
- Literary Arts in Ladakh*
The Literary Arts in Ladakh, "a reproduction of a collection of Bhotia manuscripts on poetics, prosody, Sanskrit grammar, lexicography, etc., from the library of the former ruling family," Kargyud Sungrab Nyamso Khang (Darjeeling 1972), in five volumes.
- Lo-dgon-pa Bsod-nams-lha'i-dbang-po (1423-1496)
1977 *Bka' gdams rin po che'i chos 'byung rnam thar nyin mor byed pa'i 'od stong* ['A Thousand Lights Making Day of the Biographies and Dharma History of the Precious Kadampa School'], contained in: *Two Histories of the Bka'-gdams-pa Tradition from the Library of Burmiok Athing*, Gonpo Tseten (Gangtok), pp. 207-393. Composed in 1484.
- Martin, Dan
2001 *Unearthing Bon Treasures: Life and Contested Legacy of a Tibetan Scripture Revealer, with a General Bibliography of Bon*, Brill (Leiden).
- Meera, S.
1986 Samvāda or Plagiarism as Viewed by Sanskrit Ālaṅkārikas, *Annals of Oriental Research, University of Madras*, vol. 32, pt. 1, pp. 1-12.
- MHTL
Lokesh Chandra, *Materials for a History of Tibetan Literature*, Mrs. Sharada Rani (New Delhi 1985).
- Mvy.
Bon-zo-kan-wa yon'yaku taiko Mahabuyutttopatti (Mahāvyutpatti), ed. Sakaki Ryozauro, Tokyo, 1965, reprint of 1916 edition.
- Negi, Roshan Lal
1996 *Gu ge khyi thang pa dznyān shrīs mdzad pa'i lo tstsha ba rin chen bzang po'i rnam thar shel 'phreng lu gu rgyud (Guge Khyithan Nivāsī Jñānaśrī Viracita Locāvā Ratnabhadra kī Jīvanī Sphaṭika Ratnamālā)*, Karuna Foundation (Delhi). Tibetan text with Hindi translation, and a list of the translations done by Rinchen Zangpo.

- Niyogi, Pushpa
1976 Some Buddhist Monasteries in Ancient Bihar, *Journal of Indian History*, vol. 54 (1976), pp. 273-98.
- Oriental Institute, St. Petersburg collection CD, distributed by Asian Classics Input Project, and also made available on their website.
- Paul, Diana Y.
1984 *Women in Buddhism: Images of the Feminine in the Mahāyāna Tradition*, University of California Press (Berkeley).
- Rig-pa'i-ral-gri
n.d. *Thub pa'i bstan pa rgyan gyi me tog* ['Ornamental Flower for the Sage's Teaching']. A 31-folio manuscript found in the library of the Palace of National Minorities, Beijing, although by now it may have been repatriated to Tibet. Composed in 1261.
- Rigzin, Tsepak
1984 Rinchen Zangpo: The Great Tibetan Translator (958-1055 AD), *Tibet Journal*, vol. 9, no. 3 (Autumn), pp. 28-37.
- Roesler, Ulrike
2002 Not a Mere Imitation: Indian Narratives in a Tibetan Context. Contained in: Alfredo Cadonna & Ester Bianchi, eds., *Facts of Tibetan Religious Tradition*, Leo S. Olschki Editore (Firenze), pp. 153-77.
2002a The Great Indian Epics in the Version of Dmar ston Chos kyi rgyal po. Contained in: Henk Blezer & Abel Zadoks, eds., *Religion and Secular Culture in Tibet: Tibetan Studies II*, Brill (Leiden), pp. 431-50.
- Sakya Pandita (Sa-skya Paṇḍi-ta Kun-dga'-rgyal-mtshan)
2000 *Ordinary Wisdom: Sakya Pandita's Treasury of Good Advice*, tr. by John T. Davenport, with Sallie D. Davenport and Losang Thonden, Wisdom Publications (Sommerville).
- Sakyapa Sonam Gyaltzen (Sa-skya-pa Bsod-nams-rgyal-mtshan)
1996 *The Clear Mirror: A Traditional Account of Tibet's Golden Age*, Snow Lion (Ithaca). Translated by McComas Taylor and Lama Choedak Yuthok. Originally composed in Tibetan in the 14th century.
- Sde-srid Sangs-rgyas-rgya-mtsho (1653-1705)
1960 *Bai dūrya ser po* (= *Dpal mnyam med ri bo dga' ldan pa'i bstan pa zhwa ser cod pan 'chang ba'i ring lugs chos thams cad kyi rtsa ba gsal bar byed pa bai dūrya ser po'i me long*) ['Yellow Beryl Mirror: Clarifying the Roots of All the Dharma Traditions of the Bearers of Yellow Hats, the Teachings of the Glorious and Incomparable Mountain Gandenpas'], Lokesh Chandra, Śatapiṭaka series no. 12 [1 and 2] (New Delhi). Composed in 1698.
- Smith, E. Gene
2001 *Among Tibetan Texts: History and Literature of the Himalayan Plateau*, ed. by Kurtis R. Schaeffer, Wisdom Publications (Boston).

- Snellgrove, David L.
1987 *Indo-Tibetan Buddhism: Indian Buddhists and Their Tibetan Successors*, Shambhala Press (Boston). In 2 volumes (pagination continuous).
- Snellgrove, David L. & Tadeusz Skorupski
1980 *The Cultural Heritage of Ladakh*, Aris & Phillips (London), in 2 volumes.
- Thupten Jinpa (Thub-bstan-sbyin-pa)
2002 *Self, Reality and Reason in Tibetan Philosophy: Tsongkhapa's Quest for the Middle Way*, Routledge Curzon (London).
- Thurman, Robert A.F.
1990 *Life and Teachings of Tsong Khapa*, Library of Tibetan Works and Archives (Dharamsala).
- Tôhoku catalogue
Tôh. nos. 1-4569: Hakuju Ui, *et al.*, *A Complete Catalogue of the Tibetan Buddhist Canons*, Tôhoku University (Tokyo 1934).
Tôh. nos. 5001-7083: Yensho Kanakura, *et al.*, *Catalogue of the Tôhoku University Collection of Tibetan Works on Buddhism*, Tôhoku University (Sendai 1953).
- Tshe-tan Zhabs-drung 'Jigs-med-rigs-pa'i-blo-gros (1910-1985)
2000 *Mkhas dbang tshe tan zhabs drung mchog gis byang chub sems dpa' rtag tu ngu'i rtogs brjod dpe khrid sgrar phab pa che long tsam yi ger bkod pa nyin mo'i snang ba* ['The Light of Day: A Somewhat Rough Composition on the Vocabulary and Similes of the Avadāna of Sadāprarudita, the Bodhisattva, by the Master Scholar Tshe-tan Zhabs-drung'], contained in: *Byang chub sems dpa' rtag ngu'i rtogs brjod snyan dngags dpag bsam gyi ljon pa dang de'i 'grel bshad nyin mo'i snang ba* ['Paradise Creeper Kāvya: The Avadāna of Sadāprarudita the Bodhisattva and Its Commentary, The Light of Day'], Mtsho sngon mi rigs dpe skrun khang (Xining), pp. 53-293.
- Tsong-kha-pa Blo-bzang-grags-pa (1357-1419)
2000 *Byang chub sems dpa' rtag ngu'i rtogs brjod snyan dngags dpag bsam gyi ljon pa*, contained in: *Byang chub sems dpa' rtag ngu'i rtogs brjod snyan dngags dpag bsam gyi ljon pa dang de'i 'grel bshad nyin mo'i snang ba*, Mtsho sngon mi rigs dpe skrun khang (Xining), pp. 1-52.
- Tucci, Giuseppe
1957 *The Fifth Dalai-Lama as a Sanskrit Scholar*, *Sino-Indian Studies*, vol. 5 [Kshitis Roy, ed., *Liebenthal Festschrift*], nos. 3-4, pp. 235-240.
1988 *Rin-chen-bzan-po and the Renaissance of Buddhism in Tibet around the Millen[n]ium (Indo-Tibetica II)*, tr. by Nancy Kipp Smith, Aditya Prakashan (New Delhi). The original Italian-language publication was dated 1932.
1999 *Tibetan Painted Scrolls*, SDI Publications (Bangkok). Reprint of the 1949 edition.

Vitali, Roberto

- 1996 *The Kingdoms of Gu.ge Pu.hrang: According to mNga'.ris rgyal.rabs by Gu.ge mkhan.chen Ngag.dbang grags.pa*, Tho ling dpal dpe med lhun gyis grub pa'i gtsug lag khang lo 1000 'khor ba'i rjes dran mdzad sgo'i go sgrib tshogs chung (Dharamsala).
- 1999 *Records of Tho.ling: A Literary and Visual Reconstruction of the 'Mother' Monastery in Gu.ge, High Asia*, Amnye Machen Institute (McLeod Ganj).

Zhal-shul Ngag-dbang-bstan-pa'i-rgya-mtsho

- 1983 *Rā ma na'i rtogs brjod rgyal po rā ma na'i gtam rgyud las brtsams pa'i snyan ngag gi bstan bcos dri za'i bu mo'i rgyud mang gi sgra dbyangs*, "a Tibetan khandakāvya on the Rāmāyana theme; with its commentary called the *Dri med shel gyi 'bab stegs* by Zhal-shul Ngag-dbang-bstan-pa'i-rgya-mtsho," Pema Wangchen (Gangtok 1983).

Zhang-zhung-pa Chos-dbang-grags-pa (1404-1469)

- n.d. *Gangs can gyi skad gnyis smra ba thams cad kyi gtsug gi rgyan lo chen thams cad mkhyen pa rin chen bzang po'i rnam thar snyan dngags punḍa rī ka'i phreng ba* ['Punḍarīka Garland Kāvya: Of All the Snowland's Bilinguals the Crest Ornament, the Great All-Knowing Translator Rinchen Zangpo's Biography'], a woodblock print in 6 folios (marginal notations: KA, *rnam thar*), photocopy courtesy of Tashi Tsering, Amnye Machen Institute, McLeod Ganj. No printing information is supplied. Guṇamitra is depicted in a woodcut miniature on the left-hand side of folio 1 *verso*, labeled: *'phags yul mkhas pa'i gtsug gi rgyan // paṅ chen gu ṅa mi tra'i zhabs //*. On the right hand side is similarly a miniature of Śraddhākaravarman, holding Vajra and Bell, labeled: *gsum ldan rdo rje 'dzin pa'i gtso // shra dha ka ra warma'i zhabs //*. On folio 2 *recto* is, on the left-hand side, a woodcut of Rinchen Zangpo labeled: *gangs can skad gnyis smra ba'i mchog // sarba dznyā na rin chen bzang //*. On the right-hand side is a woodcut of the author himself labeled: *mkhas dang grub pa'i 'khor lo sgyur // snyan dngags mkhan chen chos dbang grags*.

Zhe-chen Rgyal-tshab Padma-rnam-rgyal (1871-1926)

- 1971 *Snga 'gyur rdo rje theg pa gtso bor gyur pa'i sgrub brgyud shing rta brgyad kyi byung ba brjod pa'i gtam mdor bsdus legs bshad padma dkar po'i rdzing bu* (added English title: *A Concise Historical Account of the Techniques of Esoteric Realization of the Nyingmapa and Other Buddhist Traditions of Tibet*), T.Y. Tashigangpa (Leh, Ladakh). Composed in 1910.

