1	ENHANCEMENT OF ¹⁴ C-PHENANTHRENE MINERALISATION WITH ROOT
2	BIOMASS FROM PAH-NAPL CONTAMINATED SOIL
3	
4	Gabriela M Vázquez-Cuevas, Carly J Stevens and Kirk T Semple*
5	Lancaster Environment Centre, Lancaster University, Lancaster, LA1 4YQ, UK
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	*Corresponding author: Phone no. +44 (0)1524 510554; email: k.semple@lancaster.ac.uk

27 Abstract

28 The study of the beneficial effects of the interaction between plants and soil microorganisms 29 towards bioremediation of contaminated soil has been studied over the past 30 years. This 30 subject has been summarized as the process where organic contaminants can be removed 31 from the soil through the interaction between roots and catabolic microbial populations. This 32 study assessed the tolerance of different plant species against polycyclic aromatic 33 hydrocarbon-non aqueous phase liquid (PAH-NAPL) contaminated soil and the feasibility of the use of their root biomass to promote the biodegradation of ¹⁴C-phenanthene. Toxicity 34 35 results showed that seeds germination was not affected by the presence of PAHs. Furthermore, mineralisation of ¹⁴C-phenanthrene was significantly enhanced by the addition 36 37 of root biomass after at least two weeks incubation. Moreover, bacterial numbers did not 38 show a significant relationship with ¹⁴C-phenanthrene mineralisation. Results showed that the higher mineralisation of ¹⁴C-phenanthrene is not related to an increase on the microbial 39 numbers as is normally assumed. 40 41 42 Keywords: Plant-enhanced, mineralisation, PAHs, diesel, roots, NAPL

44 1. Introduction

45 Soil bioremediation can be promoted by different biological mechanisms through the action 46 of microorganisms, soil invertebrates and plants. Where plants are involved, this is 47 commonly known as phytoremediation or plant-assisted remediation, which has been defined 48 as the use of higher plants to treat or stabilise contaminated soil (Wenzel, 2009). A key 49 partnership in the removal of pollutants from soil involves the impact of plants and plant 50 roots on the enhancement of microbial degradation in soil (Anderson et al., 1993). Despite of 51 this, the mechanisms in which plants stimulate microbial degradation is not fully understood 52 (Anderson et al., 1993; Pilon-Smits, 2005). The specific mechanisms of the biodegradative 53 processes are likely to vary between plant, microbial species and pollutant type due to a 54 number of physico-chemical and environmental factors (Pilon-Smits, 2005).

55 Several plant species have been tested to examine their potential for phytoremediation of 56 PAHs under specific soil conditions (Muratova et al., 2008; Rezek et al., 2008). So far, 57 grasses such as fescue (Festuca sp.) and ryegrass (Lolium sp.), along with legumes (e.g. M. 58 sativa) have shown to be suitable options to clean up hydrocarbons from the soil. These two 59 functional groups are often selected due to their extensive fibrous root structure, which 60 increases the soil-rhizosphere contact surface and penetration capacity (Aprill and Sims, 61 1990; Pilon-Smits, 2005), and their role on the fixation of nitrogen from the atmosphere into 62 the soil (Wenzel, 2009), respectively. Moreover, it also needs to take into consideration that 63 these species should be able to germinate and grow in highly contaminated soil, and in most 64 cases under nutrient limiting conditions (Moubasher et al., 2015; Wenzel, 2009). It is 65 generally agreed that a preliminary and effective way to test the phytoremediation potential 66 of specific plant species is through phytotoxicity tests (Muratova et al., 2008; Trapp and 67 Karlson, 2001). These types of assays use germination and early growth assessments as endpoints to determine suitability for growth in contaminated soil. For remediation of PAHs, 68

phytotoxicity assays have become a useful tool to assess plant tolerance to specific soil
conditions (Baek et al., 2004; Rorison and Robinson, 1986).

71 Phytotoxicity assays are usually done alongside with the quantification of initial and final 72 concentrations of the targeted pollutant (e.g. Aprill and Sims (1990); Corgié et al. (2003); 73 Günther et al. (1996); Joner et al. (2001); Miya and Firestone (2001); Olson et al. (2007); 74 Rezek et al. (2008); Smith et al. (2011); Thompson et al. (2008) for either single or mixtures 75 of PAHs). Furthermore, other approaches to test the effect of plants on the removal of PAHs 76 from soil have not been explored as extensively as the initial/final concentration assessment. Only a small number of studies have been reported where ¹⁴C-labelled pollutants were used 77 78 to test the potential of plant-associated microbial communities to mineralize hydrocarbons. 79 This approach offers a more realistic and accurate assessment of the fate and behaviour of a 80 specific pollutant, avoiding taking into account other sources of carbon being simultaneously 81 used by the soil microorganisms.

82 Using this approach, the impact of the root system, root biomass and root-derived substrates 83 towards has been assessed For example, Yoshitomi and Shann (2001) used exudates from corn (Zea mays L.) to look at the mineralisation of ¹⁴C-pyrene in rhizospheric and root-84 85 amended soil over 80 d; they found no significant difference between these two conditions, suggesting that the catabolic enhancing factor was the root exudate and not the whole root 86 system. Mueller and Shann (2007) studied the ¹⁴C-pyrene mineralisation in soil amended 87 88 with red maple root extracts and the influence of inorganic nutrient addition. In this case, 89 rates of mineralisation were greater when rhizosphere soil was used; however, these were 90 inhibited by inorganic nutrient amendments. Moreover, Oyelami et al. (2013) studied not only the effect of plant species in the mineralisation of ¹⁴C-phenanthrene, but they also 91 92 looked at how species diversity, composition and soil fertility could enhance the degradation 93 of ¹⁴C-phenanthrene in soil. The authors found that one of the most important elements was

94 the soil fertility, leaving the plant type and composition as secondary factors (Oyelami et al.,95 2013).

96	The hypothesis for this investigation was that the amendment of root biomass paste
97	simulating root decay and turnover in PAH-NAPL contaminated soil enhances the
98	mineralisation of ¹⁴ C-phenanthrene. To address this, the aims were (1) to assess the tolerance
99	of different plant species against PAH-NAPL highly contaminated soil, and (2) to use the
100	roots from the most resistant species as soil amendment to biostimulate the biodegradation of
101	¹⁴ C-phenanthrene, assessed through its mineralisation. Results from this study will allow
102	assessing in a more accurate and controlled manner any possible PAH underestimations often
103	misinterpreted as pollutant dissipation. Additionally, findings will contribute to the
104	understanding of the influence of root decay and turnover on the catabolic response of

105 microbial communities in PAH-NAPL contaminated soil.

- 106 2. Material and methods
- 107 2.1 Phytotoxicity testing
- 108 2.1.1 Soil spiking procedure

109 A clay loam soil with an organic matter content of 2.7 % was collected from Myerscough,

- 110 Preston, U.K., a complete characterisation is described elsewhere (Towell et al., 2011).
- 111 Following wet sieving (25% moisture content) through a 2 mm mesh, soil was spiked with a
- 112 molecularly balanced mixture of phenanthrene (Phe), benzo(a)anthracene (B[a]A), and
- benzo(a)pyrene (B[a]P) to deliver final total concentrations of 100 and 300 mg kg⁻¹, and 0.1%
- 114 (w/w) diesel using acetone:toluene (1:1) as a carrier. In addition, activated charcoal (0.1 %)

115 was also included as a variable given its ubiquity in the environment and significant impact

116 on the fate and behaviour of contaminants in soil (Rhodes et al., 2008), The selected amount

117 of activated charcoal has been previously reported to be high enough to significantly reduce

- 118 the bioaccessibility of 14C-phenanthrene (Rhodes et al., 2008). Soil preparation and spiking
- 119 procedure followed the methods described by Doick et al. (2003) for the introduction of
- 120 PAHs into wet soil using a stainless-steel spoon and a soil inoculum approach.
- 121 2.1.2 Seeds emergence and early growth

122 The seeds emergence and early growth studies included 9 plant species (Table 1) using 8 123 different soil treatments (n = 3) and 4 controls (Table 2) with a total of 324 experimental 124 units in a completely randomised arrangement. Methodology followed the guidelines 208 125 (OECD, 2003) and OCSPP 850.4100 (US EPA, 2012), both focused on the study of 126 ecological effects of chemicals in the environment. Given that these guidelines were 127 originally developed for pesticide testing, minor modifications were made based on specific 128 phytoremediation assays (Banks et al., 2003; Gao and Zhu, 2004; Muratova et al., 2009; 129 Phillips et al., 2006; Smith et al., 2006). In short, 50 g of spiked soil was placed into 9 cm 130 diameter pot with a disc of filter paper at the bottom of each to prevent soil loss from the

131 draining holes. Further, petri dishes were placed under each pot to control any leachate and 132 prevent cross-contamination. In each pot, 10 seeds of the appropriate species (Table 1) were 133 sown at equal distances from each other on soil surface. The pots were placed in a glasshouse 134 to complete a 4-week growing period at $\sim 25^{\circ}$ C with a 16/8 h photoperiod. At an initial stage, 135 pots were covered with a petri dish to promote germination and watered daily from the top to 136 prevent seed dryness, recording the daily germination rate. Once 50% of the control seeds of 137 each species emerged, the seeds emergence test was considered finished, and the early 138 growth assessment started. As the different plant species had different germination times, 139 pots from each species was considered to be part of an independent experiment, and 140 treatments were only compared against their counterpart from the same species. The 141 endpoints of the growth test were assessed weekly over a period of 21 d after 50% emergence 142 of the control pots as survival. During the growth test, plants were watered from the bottom. 143 At the end of the assay shoot and root biomass was harvested and oven dried for 72 h at 60°C 144 (Langer et al., 2010).

145 2.2 Rhizo-enhanced ¹⁴C-phenanthrene mineralisation in soil

146 2.2.1 Root amendments and soil preparation

147 Based on the results from the germination and phytotoxicity test (Section 2.1), four of the 148 species were identified as resistant to the PAH-NAPL mixture due to none or minimal 149 detrimental effects compared to control treatments at any of the PAHs concentrations. Seeds 150 of these species; two grasses (Sorghum bicolor L., Lolium perenne L.) and two legumes 151 (Glycine max L. and Medicago sativa L.), were sown into pristine soil from the same location 152 as the one used for the phytotoxicity stage. Seeds were grown in a glasshouse under standard 153 growth conditions (US EPA, 2012) for 21 d after seed emergence. After the growth period, 154 roots were harvested and cleaned by three consecutive washes with sterile deionized water 155 (Miya and Firestone, 2001). Each wash consisted on shaking the root into 100 ml sterile

156 deionized water for 30 minutes on an orbital shaker (Muratova et al., 2003) at 70 rpm.

Finally, the clean roots were blotted dry, cut into 1-2 mm pieces, and ground. The ground root tissue was mixed with a minimum amount of distilled water to facilitate homogeneity (Mueller and Shann, 2007) and then incorporated into the ¹²C spiked soil according to the treatments shown in Table 3 to get a final root amendment content of 0.5% (dry weight based). Additionally, control soil without ¹²C PAHs were also included, these had as a main objective to allow a clear visualisation of how the absence of PAHs affect the mineralisation process under the different tested conditions.

164 2.2.2 ¹⁴C-Phenanthrene mineralisation in soil

165 The ¹²C-PAHs spiked and root amended soil was stored in amber jars at 21 ± 1 °C in the dark

166 over 28 d to simulate ageing. To test how the root amendment affected ¹⁴C–phenanthrene

167 mineralisation rates over the time, three contact times were selected to conduct a

168 respirometric assay following the method described by Doick and Semple (2003) and Semple

169 et al. (2006). At 1, 14 and 28 d after ¹²C spiking and root amendment, 10 g (dry wt) incubated

170 soil from each treatment (Table 3) was placed into 250 ml modified Teflon lined screw cap-

171 Schott bottles (respirometers) in triplicate. Each respirometer also contained 30 ml of

172 sterilized minimal basal salts (MBS) medium (Fenlon et al., 2007) to give a soil:liquid ratio

173 of 1:3 (Doick and Semple, 2003), and incorporated a suspended 7 ml glass scintillation vial

174 containing 1 ml 1 M NaOH solution which served as a ¹⁴CO₂ trap. At every time point, each

175 respirometer was spiked with $^{12/14}$ C-phenanthrene (10 mg kg $^{-1}$ / 56 Bq g $^{-1}$, dry wt).

176 Respirometers were incubated at 21 ± 1 °C in the dark onto an orbital shaker at 100 rpm for

177 14 d. The ¹⁴C-activity in the ¹⁴CO₂ traps was assessed every 24 h by replacing the vial

178 containing NaOH and adding 5 ml Goldstar liquid scintillation cocktail. After storage in the

- 179 dark for 24 h, the ¹⁴C-activity was quantified using a Canberra Packard Tricarb 2250CA
- 180 liquid scintillation analyser. An analytical blank (pristine soil without ¹⁴C-phenanthrene) was

also set up to establish the level of background activity. The endpoints of this assay were the

182 lag phase (defined as the period of time before mineralisation reached 5%), maximum rate

183 (determined by the amount of ${}^{14}CO_2$ produced at any 24 h period of time), and the maximum

184 extent of mineralisation after 14 d (Fenlon et al., 2007).

185 2.2.3 Microbial enumeration

186 Total heterotrophic and PAH degrading bacteria for each treatment was quantified by

187 assessing the number of colony forming units (CFUs) following standard serial dilutions.

188 Plates were prepared using tryptone glucose yeast agar, also known as plate count agar

189 (PCA), and general purpose agar (GPA) amended with minimal basal salts (NaCl,

190 (NH₄)₂SO₄, KNO₃, KH₂PO₄, K₂HPO₄, MgSO₄·7H₂O), trace elements (LiCl(LiBO₂),

191 CaSO4·5H2O, ZnSO4·7H2O, Al2(SO4)3·16H2O NiCl·6H2O, CoSO4·7H2O(CoNO3), KBr, KI,

192 MnCl₂·4H₂O, SnCl₂·2H₂O and FeSO₄·7H₂O) and 0.2 % phenanthrene as sole source of

193 carbon (Fenlon et al., 2007). Microbial enumeration was incubated at 21 ± 1 °C and assessed

194 before and after the mineralisation experiment as recommended by Oyelami et al. (2013).

195 2.3 Statistical analysis

196 Statistical analysis was done using IBM SPSS Statistics software version 21. In all cases,

197 normality of the residuals was verified using the Shapiro-Wilk test with a 95% confidence

198 interval. In cases where data did not show a normal distribution, different data

199 transformations were tested before using a non-parametric test. Data with normal distribution

200 was analysed using an ANOVA analysis of variance and Tukey HSD post hoc test. When

201 data was not normally distributed and no transformation was possible, Kruskal-Wallis mean

202 rank of the group's analysis was used. Paired *t*-tests were used to test differences between

time points.

- 204 3. Results
- 205 3.1 Phytotoxicity test
- 206 3.1.1 Seeds emergence and early growth as survival
- 207 The impacts of the chemicals on seeds emergence were investigated (Figure 1). It was found
- that the germination of *F. rubra*, *C. angustifolium* and *P. lanceolata* in the growth control
- (C_g) was less than 50%. Therefore, these have not been included in any further analysis.
- 210 Overall, the number of seeds that germinated after 7 d was not affected by the presence of
- 211 PAHs or the other amendments. Only *T. repens* displayed significant differences across the
- different treatments (F = 3.546, p = 0.005), presenting a significantly lower germination rate
- in soil without (T1, p = 0.040) and with (C_d, p = 0.026) diesel (Figure 1).
- None of the species showed significant differences in survival within the different treatments (p > 0.05). Nonetheless, the lowest survival at the end of the experiment was presented by *T*. repens and *A. millefolium* when sown in the diesel control (C_d), suggesting the sensitivity of these two species towards diesel. Moreover, *S. bicolor* displayed the highest overall survival, being the only species to reach 100% survival.

219 3.1.2 Biomass

220 For both above and belowground biomass (dry wt), out of the six species tested, only *M*.

sativa and G. max were not significantly affected (p > 0.05) by any of the treatments (SI 1).

- 222 Furthermore, shoot and root biomass of *L. perenne*, *S. bicolor* and *T. repens* showed
- significant differences across the soil conditions. *L. perenne* had significantly higher shoot
- biomass when PAHs were present in the soil (F = 3.3776, p = 0.003), while only one
- treatment (T1) significantly enhanced root biomass (F = 6.534, p < 0.001). S. bicolor
- above ground biomass was significantly reduced by the presence of PAHs (F = 5.663, p < 100
- 227 0.001), while the root biomass was promoted when grown on contaminated soil (F = 2.758, p
- 228 = 0.019). A. *millefolium* only showed significant differences regarding root biomass,

displaying a significant reduction (F = 5.250, p = 0.001) on treatments with the higher PAH concentrations.

Root/shoot ratio, was affected in three of the six species tested (SI 2). *L. perenne* showed an increased ratio in the treatment containing 100 mg kg⁻¹ and diesel (T1) and only diesel (C_d) when compared to the growth control (F = 5.999, p < 0.001). Similarly, *S. bicolor* (F = 3.395, p = 0.006) and *T. repens* (F = 2.766, p = 0.019) also presented significantly higher ratios in the presence of contaminants.

236 3.2 Mineralisation of ¹⁴C-phenanthrene in soil

237 The mineralisation of ¹⁴C-phenanthrene was measured in soils under different conditions

238 (Figures 2-5 and SI 3). For the treatment in which soil was spiked with the mixture of PAHs

only (Treatment A, Figure 2), there were significand differences at each time point.

240 Nonetheless, specific effects were different throughout the incubation time: one day after

spiking and root amendment (Figure 2a), L. perenne amended soil showed a significantly

shorter lag phase than the rest of the treatments (F = 13.851, p = 0.001), while significant

higher total extents (F = 19.473, p < 0.001) and maximum rates of mineralisation (F = 5.531,

p = 0.016) were observed in soil without root amendments. After 14 d of incubation (Figure

245 2b), lag phases were significantly faster (F = 39.337, p < 0.001) and total extents higher (F =

42.555, p < 0.001) in the soils containing root amendments. In the soils incubated for 28 d,

trends observed after 14 d continued; the lag phase (F = 49.468, p < 0.001) was significantly

shorter in the *L. perenne* amendment compared to the non-amended treatment (Figure 2c).

249 Maximum rates (F = 69.700, p < 0.001) and total extents of mineralisation (F = 85.097, p < 0.001)

250 0.001) were also significantly higher in all root-amended treatments compared to the non-

amended soil.

252 When 0.1% (dry wt) activated charcoal (Treatment B) was added to the PAH mixture,

statistically significant differences were observed at each of the three sampling times (Figure

3). One day after spiking, S. *bicolor* amendment had a negative effect on the 14 C-254 phenanthrene mineralisation; this is reflected in a longer lag phase than the rest of the 255 treatments (F = 3.973, p = 0.004). Additionally, although the maximum rates of 256 257 mineralisation were similar across treatments (F = 2.960, p = 0.090), total extents of the 258 treatment amended with G. max and the rootless soil were significantly higher (F = 15.653, p = 0.001) than the grass-amended treatments (*L. perenne* and *S. bicolor*). After 14 d of 259 260 incubation (Figure 3b), lag phases were longer in the absence of roots compared to the root-261 amended treatments (F = 12.586, p = 0.003). At this time point, significant increases in the 262 maximum rates of mineralisation (F = 8.863, p = 0.008) were observed when soil was 263 amended with G. max roots. The total extents of mineralisation also significantly increased in 264 the presence of roots from all of the species (F = 124.072, p < 0.001). After 28 d of 265 incubation (Figure 3c), significant differences were found for the maximum rates and total 266 extents of mineralisation (p < 0.05). The maximum rates in soils containing L. perenne were significantly higher than in the other treatments (F = 25.505, p < 0.001), while total extents 267 were enhanced in the presence of roots from any species compared to the non-amended soil 268 269 in all the cases (F = 65.824, p < 0.001).

To observe the effect that a NAPL can have on the mineralisation of ¹⁴C-phenanthrene 270 271 (Treatment C), 0.1% (w/w) diesel was added to the PAH mixture (Figure 4). By the first and 272 second sample times of this treatment (Figure 4a-b), lag phases were significantly shorter in the treatments amended with grass roots after 1 day (F = 23.017, p = 0.002), and on non-273 274 amended soil after 14 d (F = 6.832, p = 0.011). In contrast, maximum rates and total extents of mineralisation remained unaffected in the other treatments (p > 0.05). By the end of the 28 275 276 d incubation (Figure 4c), the lag phases were significantly shorter in the L. perenne condition (F = 12.199, p = 0.003) compared to the rest of the treatments. Both maximum rates (F = 12.199, p = 0.003)277 278 24.143, p < 0.001), and total extents of mineralisation (F = 26.117, p < 0.001) were

significantly greater in all root-amended treatments compared to the control, with the highestvalues measured in *L. perenne* condition.

281 The effect of possible interactions between PAHs, diesel and activated charcoal was also 282 measured (Figure 5). At the first time point (Figure 5a), M. sativa and S. bicolor amended 283 treatments showed significantly shorter lag phases (F = 19.154, p = 0.003). Moreover, total 284 extents of mineralisation were significantly reduced by the presence of roots of any species 285 (F = 21.273, p = 0.002), while maximum rates of mineralisation were not affected by the 286 addition of roots. After 14 d (Figure 5b), the lag phases were significantly different (F =287 14.017, p < 0.001), being shorter in both the soil amended with L. perenne, as well as the 288 non-amended soil. Maximum rates were also influenced by the treatments; exhibiting highest 289 maximum rates when roots of any of the species were added to the soil (F = 11.381, p =290 0.001). In contrast, total extents of mineralisation were unaffected by the different treatments. 291 After 28 d incubations, all mineralisation measurements: lag phases (F = 17.077, p < 0.001),

292 maximum rates (F = 47.729, p < 0.001), and total extents (F = 11.832, p = 0.001) were

significantly enhanced by the addition of any of the roots (Figure 5c).

Controls measuring the mineralisation of ¹⁴C-phenanthrene in the absence of ¹²C-PAHs were 294 295 also assessed in pristine soil, as well as in soils containing activated charcoal and diesel 296 amendments (SI 4). Overall, controls behaved in a similar way after 1 and 14 d incubation. 297 Most significant differences were observed after 14 d, where soil without root amendment 298 often displayed shorter lag phases, especially when L. perenne was added. Such are the cases of the pristine soil (F = 13.645, p = 0.002), soil with activated charcoal (F = 246.58, p < 100299 300 0.001), and solvent amended soil (F = 22.061, p < 0.001). However, after 28d incubation, 301 maximum rates of mineralisation were significantly faster when L. perenne was used as amendment in pristine (F = 4.592, p = 0.033), diesel (F = 3.935, p = 0.023), and the mixture 302 303 of activated charcoal and diesel controls (F = 4.618, p = 0.035). Total extents of

mineralisation were also significantly higher in three of the controls by the addition of roots from *L. perenne*, with the exception of the control amended with a mixture of diesel and activated charcoal (F = 1.106, p = 0.417). Lag phases presented differences in all treatments, with significantly shorter values in the absence of roots for the pristine soil (F = 160.66, p < 0.001), and individual amendments of diesel (F = 11.683, p = 0.001) and activated charcoal (F = 227.18, p < 0.001).

310 3.3 Enumeration of bacteria

311 Microbial numbers were significantly influenced by all treatments and conditions (p < 0.05).

312 For both total heterotrophic and phenanthrene degrading bacteria (CFU g⁻¹soil dw)

313 significantly increased after the addition of ¹⁴C-phenanthrene at all time points (p < 0.01),

314 with the exception of the phenanthrene degrading bacteria at the last sampling time (28 d).

315 The numbers of total heterotrophic bacteria in soil before the mineralisation assay were 316 influenced by the different contaminant conditions, as well as by the root amendments at the 317 different time points (SI 5). One day after spiking, the control pristine soil showed that root 318 amendments increased the numbers of total heterotrophic bacteria (F = 131.952, p < 0.001), 319 especially by G. max. This same effect was also observed in treatments containing diesel 320 (Treatments C and D). After 14 d, total heterotrophic bacteria numbers were significantly 321 reduced compared to the first time point (t = 5.774, p < 0.001). CFUs from pristine soil 322 displayed the largest reduction, especially when roots from L. perenne and G. max were 323 present. Furthermore, all soil conditions displayed the highest microbial numbers in the 324 presence of either one of the grass species (L. perenne or S. bicolor). Finally, after 28 d 325 incubation, total heterotrophic bacterial numbers were not significantly different to those 326 measured after 14 d (t = -1.846, p = 0.068).

327 Numbers of phenanthrene degrading bacteria were also significantly influenced by the 328 different soil conditions and amendment with root biomass (p < 0.05). One day after spiking, 329 roots from legumes (M. sativa and G. max) increased the CFUs in the grass- and non-330 amended treatments with the exception of the diesel and solvent controls. After 14 d 331 incubation, most soil conditions excluding the mixture of PAHs, activated charcoal and diesel 332 (Treatment D), led to significantly higher numbers of phenanthrene degrading bacteria in the 333 presence of roots (p < 0.05). After 28 d incubation, the same trend was observed with 334 decreased microbial numbers in the plant-free controls and an enhanced presence of bacteria 335 in soil amended with *M. sativa* root biomass (p < 0.05).

336 Overall CFU total heterotrophic bacteria from "respirometers" significantly decreased in 337 number over time (p < 0.05). Initially, all treatments contained significantly higher CFU 338 numbers (p < 0.05) in the presence of plant roots, exhibiting consistently higher values when 339 *M. sativa* was used. After 14 d, the opposite trend was observed, with the exception of the 340 treatments containing activated charcoal (Treatments B and D), where root-amended soil 341 presented increased microbial numbers but without specific pattern regarding plant identity. 342 This effect was also observed only in the control amended with diesel (Treatment G). After 343 the 28d sampling, root amendments showed to significantly enhance three out of the nine 344 conditions. This trend was observed on the treatment containing PAHs and activated charcoal 345 (Treatment B, F = 376.55, p = 0.001), the one including a mixture of PAHs, diesel and 346 activated charcoal (Treatment D, F = 22.089, p = 0.002), and the control for diesel 347 (Treatment G, F = 17.493, p = 0.004). In the rest of the conditions, as observed before, root 348 amendments reduced the total heterotrophic CFUs.

The phenanthrene degrading bacteria from "respirometers" was only affected by the plant
amendments in the first two sampling points (1 and 14d). In both cases, *L. perenne* roots

351 consistently produced a significantly larger number of CFUs (p < 0.05). At the final sampling

- 352 point of the mineralisation assay (28d), treatments without root amendments presented
- 353 significantly less CFU than any of the root amended treatments (p < 0.05). Overall results
- also showed that *L. perenne* and *M. sativa* amendments produced the highest CFUs numbers
- across the different soil conditions.

356 4. Discussion

357 4.1 Phytotoxicity of PAH-NAPL contaminated soil

358 Different phytotoxicity parameters can be used to assess the ability of a plant to germinate 359 and grow in PAH contaminated soil (Maila and Cloete, 2002). For instance, seed emergence 360 cannot always be used as a reliable endpoint of phytotoxicity, as seeds typically obtain 361 nutrients from internal materials at the earliest stages of germination. Nevertheless, when 362 diesel is included, the low molecular weight fractions have been shown to have inhibitory 363 effects on the germination of some species (Henner et al., 1999). In the current study, these 364 effects were only observed for T. repens. This overall lack of toxicity has also been observed previously by Smith et al. (2006), who found that germination of different species (including 365 *T. repens*) was unaffected by the presence of these fractions. The absence of phytotoxic 366 367 effects of hydrocarbons (especially PAHs) on germination / seed emergence of different 368 species has been also reported by multiple authors, including Hamdi et al. (2012) and 369 Smreckzak and Maliszewska-Kordybach (2003), who also attributed this lack of toxicity to 370 the low bioavailability of these hydrophobic chemicals.

371 The phytotoxicity assessment, based on seeds survival, showed that S. bicolor was the most 372 suitable species to be grown in a PAH-NAPL amended soil. Previous studies have shown 373 similar results; for example, Muratova et al. (2009) observed an increased survival of S. *bicolor* at 10 mg kg⁻¹ phenanthrene compared to the control uncontaminated soil. This result 374 375 gains importance considering that S. bicolor has also been found to enhance the 376 bioremediation process of crude oil contaminated soil (Banks et al., 2003). As a consequence, 377 this species would be able to both germinate and grow in contaminated soil while promoting 378 the remediation of contaminated soil.

Although PAH contaminated soil is generally assumed as toxic for most plant species, thereare some reported cases where PAHs have been found to have enhancing effects on plant

381 growth. For instance, Maliszewska-Kordybach and Smreczak (2000) observed this trend, 382 reflected on increased root growth of certain grass species. The authors described this 383 behaviour as a feedback control mechanism, which in this case is reflected as an enhanced 384 growth of plants as a response to be exposed to PAHs (Maliszewska-Kordybach and 385 Smreczak, 2000). Overall, the lack of consensus regarding the effect of PAHs on germination 386 and growth of plant species could be attributed to the natural variability on seed viability, as 387 well as the specific characteristics of the soil used for the test. These factors have already 388 been suggested by different authors such as Maliszewska-Kordybach and Smreczak (2000), 389 who concluded that soils with sandy textures had greater phytotoxic effects on most of the 390 tested plant species. Additionally other soil properties including organic carbon content, 391 cation-exchange capacity, or specific surface area will also play an important role on the fate 392 and behaviour of organic pollutants (Chung and Alexander, 2002). In the present study, 393 overall seed survival remained unaffected by the presence of PAHs in L. perenne, S. bicolor, 394 *M. sativa* and *G.max*. The lack of phytotoxic effects of the mixture of PAHs might be the 395 result of the combination of two main factors. First, these four species presented a higher 396 PAH and NAPL tolerance, which has also been reported before (Banks et al., 2003; Gao and 397 Zhu, 2004; Muratova et al., 2003; Phillips et al., 2006). And second, the soil used has been 398 defined as high-content silt and clay soil, which might be producing a higher rate and extent 399 of the pollutant's sequestration hence reducing its bioavailability.

400 4.2 Effect of root amendments in the mineralisation of ¹⁴C-phenanthrene

401 When root biomass from different plant species was added to PAHs contaminated soil, the

402 impact on the mineralisation of ¹⁴C-phenanthrene became significantly higher after 2 weeks

403 incubation for soil contaminated only with PAHs. When diesel was also present in the

404 mixture (PAH-NAPL), this behaviour was only observed after 4 reaching in some cases total

405 extents of mineralisation close to 100%. In all cases, studies reporting this same trend have

406 been consistently reported, especially using L. perenne and M. sativa. These two species have 407 been found to be effective enhancers of the dissipation of PAHs from soil by several authors 408 such as Binet et al. (2000), Joner et al. (2001) or Phillips et al. (2009). Other authors have 409 also observed that a higher biodegradation of hydrocarbons can be achieved by the use of 410 plants, either as a whole or by the use of part of them (e.g. root biomass)(Miya and Firestone, 2001; Rentz et al., 2005; Smith et al., 2011; Sun et al., 2011). Moreover, when ¹⁴C isotopes 411 412 were used, similar results have also been observed. For instance, Reilley et al. (1996) consistently found higher mineralisation of ¹⁴C-pyrene in simulated rhizospheric soil. 413 414 Additionally, the temporal factor observed in this study has also been observed by other authors, reporting an initial inhibition on the mineralisation of ¹⁴C-pyrene, followed by an 415 416 increased biodegradation after 100 d of incubation (Mueller and Shann, 2007). This same 417 behaviour was also observed by Macleod and Semple (2002), who observed that microbes required an adaptation period in order to biodegrade ¹⁴C-pyrene. In this case, authors 418 419 suggested that this behaviour could indicate that period of microbial growth was necessary 420 before mineralisation started (Macleod and Semple, 2002). 421 Even though the specific processes producing this enhanced dissipation of hydrocarbons from 422 soil are not completely understood, the overall consensus is that this effect is due to increases 423 in the numbers of pollutant degrading microbes when plants are introduced into contaminated 424 soil - termed the "rhizosphere effect" (Aprill and Sims, 1990; Binet et al., 2000; Chiapusio et 425 al., 2007; Fan et al., 2008; Günther et al., 1996; Radwan et al., 1998). However, measurement of bacterial numbers in this study did not show a significant positive relationship with ¹⁴C-426 427 phenanthrene mineralisation for either total heterotrophic or phenanthrene-degrading 428 bacteria. Nonetheless, a similar decreasing trend has been reported previously by Nichols et 429 al. (1997), concluding that this effect could be the result of an environment with limited 430 amounts of accessible carbon and other nutrients. Another reason for this trend could be 431 related to a priming effect, which can be characterized by a fast increase of the microbial

432 populations after a change in the system (soil spiking and amendment) followed by a 433 reduction of the microbial numbers after every time point (Kuzyakov, 2002). M. sativa was 434 the only species that produced higher CFUs of phenanthrene degrading bacteria after 14 and 435 28 d incubation, but with no visible pattern among treatments. This specific behaviour 436 produced by *M. sativa* has previously been reported by Phillips et al. (2006), who observed a positive correlation between the mineralisation of ¹⁴C-phenanthrene and microbial numbers 437 from soil planted with *M. sativa*. Given the overall findings, the observed higher ¹⁴C-438 439 mineralisation from soil amended with roots could be related to a putative increase of the 440 bioavailability of the contaminant, but this was not measured directly in this study. However, 441 a similar conclusion has also been proposed by Joner et al. (2002), who suggested that 442 rhizospheric soil could produce a change in surface adsorption processes controlling the fate 443 of hydrocarbons in soil (Joner et al., 2002; Reilley et al., 1996). Furthermore, authors 444 hypothesized that substances produced by roots due to exudation, decay and turnover might also have a contributing factor in the biodegradation process (Mueller and Shann, 2007; 445 446 Rentz et al., 2005).

447 5. Conclusions

448 The phytotoxicity findings reported in this study show that the grasses (L. perenne and S. 449 *bicolor*) and legumes (*M. sativa* and *G. max*) are suitable for plant-enhanced biodegradation, 450 as these are capable of germinating and growing in contaminated soil without showing 451 detrimental effects. When these four species were tested to assess the effect of root tissue on the mineralisation of ¹⁴C-phenanthrene, all species produced enhanced mineralisation after 452 453 two and four weeks since root biomass amendment. This suggests that root amended soil has greater potential to mineralise ¹⁴C-phenanthrene than soils lacking plants or root biomass. 454 455 Microbial numbers of both heterotrophs and phenanthrene degrading bacteria did not appear 456 to have a significant relationship with the mineralisation parameters. The total CFUs were 457 reduced over time despite the increasing extents in the mineralisation of ¹⁴C-phenanthrene. 458 Results from the present study suggest that the increased mineralisation of ¹⁴C-phenanthrene 459 might be the result of (1) the enhancement of the bioavailability of the contaminant as well as 460 (2) the contribution of readily available C and nutrients from root exudation, decay and 461 turnover, rather than to an increase on the number of bacteria capable to degrade PAHs as is 462 generally assumed.

463 Acknowledgements

464 GVC would like to thank the Mexican National Council for Science and Technology

- 465 (CONACyT) for their financial support through a scholarship (No. 313807) to pursue
- 466 postgraduate studies at the Lancaster Environment Centre, Lancaster University.

467 References

- Anderson, T.A., Guthrie, E.A., Walton, B.T., 1993. Bioremediation in the rhizosphere.
 Environ. Sci. Technol. 27, 2630-2636.
- 470 Aprill, W., Sims, R.C., 1990. Evaluation of the use of prairie grasses for stimulating 471 polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbon treatment in soil. Chemosphere 20, 253-265.
- 472 Baek, K.-H., Kim, H.-S., Oh, H.-M., Yoon, B.-D., Kim, J., Lee, I.-S., 2004. Effects of crude
- 473 oil, oil components, and bioremediation on plant growth. J. Environ. Sci. Health A Tox.
- 474 Hazard Subst. Environ. Eng. 39, 2465-2472.
- Banks, M.K., Kulakow, P., Schwab, A.P., Chen, Z., Rathbone, K., 2003. Degradation of
 crude oil in the rhizosphere of Sorghum bicolor. Int. J. Phytoremediat. 5, 225-234.
- Binet, P., Portal, J.M., Leyval, C., 2000. Dissipation of 3-6-ring polycyclic aromatic
 hydrocarbons in the rhizosphere of ryegrass. Soil Biol. Biochem. 32, 2011-2017.
- 479 Chiapusio, G., Pujol, S., Toussaint, M.L., Badot, P.M., Binet, P., 2007. Phenanthrene toxicity
- 480 and dissipation in rhizosphere of grassland plants (Lolium perenne L. and Trifolium pratense
- 481 L.) in three spiked soils. Plant Soil 294, 103-112.
- 482 Chung, N., Alexander, M., 2002. Effect of soil properties on bioavailability and extractability
 483 of phenanthrene and atrazine sequestered in soil. Chemosphere 48, 109-115.
- 484 Corgié, S.C., Joner, E.J., Leyval, C., 2003. Rhizospheric degradation of phenanthrene is a
 485 function of proximity to roots. Plant Soil 257, 143 150.
- 486 Doick, K.J., Lee, P.H., Semple, K.T., 2003. Assessment of spiking procedures for the
 487 introduction of a phenanthrene- LNAPL mixture into field- wet soil. Environ. Pollut. 126,
 488 399-406.
- 489 Doick, K.J., Semple, K.T., 2003. The effect of soil: water ratios on the mineralisation of
 490 phenanthrene: LNAPL mixtures in soil. FEMS Microbiol. Lett. 220, 29-33.
- Fan, S., Li, P., Gong, Z., Ren, W., He, N., 2008. Promotion of pyrene degradation in
 rhizosphere of alfalfa (Medicago sativa L.). Chemosphere 71, 1593-1598.
- 493 Fenlon, K.A., Jones, K.C., Semple, K.T., 2007. Development of microbial degradation of
- 494 cypermethrin and diazinon in organically and conventionally managed soils. J. Environ.495 Monit. 9, 510-515.
- 496 Gao, Y., Zhu, L., 2004. Plant uptake, accumulation and translocation of phenanthrene and
 497 pyrene in soils. Chemosphere 55, 1169-1178.
- 498 Günther, T., Dornberger, U., Fritsche, W., 1996. Effects of ryegrass on biodegradation of
 499 hydrocarbons in soil. Chemosphere 33, 203-215.
- 500 Hamdi, H., Benzarti, S., Aoyama, I., Jedidi, N., 2012. Rehabilitation of degraded soils
- 501 containing aged PAHs based on phytoremediation with alfalfa (Medicago sativa L.). Int.
- 502 Biodeterior. Biodegradation 67, 40-47.

- 503 Henner, P., Schiavon, M., Druelle, V., Lichtfouse, E., 1999. Phytotoxicity of ancient gaswork
- soils. Effect of polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons (PAHs) on plant germination. Org.
- 505 Geochem. 30, 963-969.
- Joner, E.J., Corgié, S.C., Amellal, N., Leyval, C., 2002. Nutritional constraints to degradation
 of polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons in a simulated rhizosphere. Soil Biol. Biochem. 34, 859864.
- 509 Joner, E.J., Johansen, A., Loibner, A.P., dela Cruz, M.A., Szolar, O.H.J., Portal, J.M., Leyval,
- 510 C., 2001. Rhizosphere effects on microbial community structure and dissipation and toxicity
- of polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons (PAHs) in spiked soil. Environ. Sci. Technol. 35, 2773-
- 512 2777.
- 513 Kuzyakov, Y., 2002. Review: Factors affecting rhizosphere priming effects. J. Plant Nutr.514 Soil Sci. 165, 382-396.
- 515 Langer, I., Syafruddin, S., Steinkellner, S., Puschenreiter, M., Wenzel, W., 2010. Plant
- 516 growth and root morphology of Phaseolus vulgaris L. grown in a split-root system is affected 517 by heterogeneity of crude oil pollution and mycorrhizal colonization. Plant Soil 332, 339-
- 518 355.
- 519 Macleod, C.J.A., Semple, K.T., 2002. The adaptation of two similar soils to pyrene 520 catabolism. Environ. Pollut. 119, 357-364.
- 521 Maila, M.P., Cloete, T.E., 2002. Germination of Lepidium sativum as a method to evaluate
- polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons (PAHs) removal from contaminated soil. Int. Biodeterior.Biodegradation 50, 107-113.
- Maliszewska-Kordybach, B., Smreczak, B., 2000. Ecotoxicological activity of soils polluted
 with polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons (PAHs) Effect on plants. Environ. Technol. 21,
- 526 1099-1110.
- Miya, R.K., Firestone, M.K., 2001. Enhanced phenanthrene biodegradation in soil by slender
 oat root exudates and root debris. J. Environ. Qual. 30, 1911-1918.
- 529 Moubasher, H.A., Hegazy, A.K., Mohamed, N.H., Moustafa, Y.M., Kabiel, H.F., Hamad,
- A.A., 2015. Phytoremediation of soils polluted with crude petroleum oil using Bassia
- scoparia and its associated rhizosphere microorganisms. Int. Biodeterior. Biodegradation 98,113-120.
- 533 Mueller, K.E., Shann, J.R., 2007. Effects of tree root-derived substrates and inorganic
- nutrients on pyrene mineralization in rhizosphere and bulk soil. J. Environ. Qual. 36, 120-127.
- 536 Muratova, A., Dmitrieva, T., Panchenko, L., Turkovskaya, O., 2008. Phytoremediation of oil-537 sludge–contaminated soil. Int. J. Phytoremediat. 10, 486-502.
- 538 Muratova, A., Golubev, S., Wittenmayer, L., Dmitrieva, T., Bondarenkova, A., Hirche, F.,
- 539 Merbach, W., Turkovskaya, O., 2009. Effect of the polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbon
- 540 phenanthrene on root exudation of Sorghum bicolor (L.) Moench. Environ. Exp. Bot. 66,
- 541 514-521.

- 542 Muratova, A., Hübner, T., Tischer, S., Turkovskaya, O., Möder, M., Kuschk, P., 2003. Plant-
- 543 rhizosphere-microflora association during phytoremediation of PAH-contaminated soil. Int. J.
- 544 Phytoremediat. 5, 137-151.
- Nichols, T.D., Wolf, D.C., Rogers, H.B., Beyrouty, C.A., Reynolds, C.M., 1997. Rhizosphere
 microbial populations in contaminated soils. Water Air Soil Pollut. 95, 165-178.
- 547 OECD, 2003. Terrestrial Plant test. 208: Seedling Emergence and Seedling Growth Test, In:
- 548 Development, O.f.E.C.-o.a. (Ed.). Organisation for Economic Co-operation and
- 549 Development, p. 19.
- 550 Olson, P.E., Castro, A., Joern, M., DuTeau, N.M., Pilon-Smits, E.A.H., Reardon, K.F., 2007.
- 551 Comparison of plant families in a greenhouse phytoremediation study on an aged polycyclic
- aromatic hydrocarbon-contaminated soil. J. Environ. Qual. 36, 1461-1469.
- 553 Oyelami, A.O., Okere, U.V., Orwin, K.H., De Deyn, G.B., Jones, K.C., Semple, K.T., 2013.
- 554 Effects of plant species identity, diversity and soil fertility on biodegradation of phenanthrene
- 555 in soil. Environ. Pollut. 173, 231-237.
- 556 Phillips, L.A., Greer, C.W., Farrell, R.E., Germida, J.J., 2009. Field-scale assessment of
- weathered hydrocarbon degradation by mixed and single plant treatments. Appl. Soil Ecol.42, 9-17.
- 559 Phillips, L.A., Greer, C.W., Germida, J.J., 2006. Culture- based and culture- independent
- assessment of the impact of mixed and single plant treatments on rhizosphere microbial
- communities in hydrocarbon contaminated flare- pit soil. Soil Biol. Biochem. 38, 2823-2833.
- 562 Pilon-Smits, E., 2005. Phytoremediation. Annu. Rev. Plant Biol. 56, 15-39.
- 563 Radwan, S.S., Al-Awadhi, H., Sokhoh, H.A., El-Nemr, I.M., 1998. Rhizospheric
- 564 hydrocarbon-utilizing microorganisms as potential contributors to phytoremediation for the 565 oily Kuwaiti desert. Microbiol. Res. 153, 247-251.
- 505 only Kuwani desert. Microbiol. Res. 155, 247-251.
- Reilley, K.A., Banks, M.K., Schwab, A.P., 1996. Dissipation of polycyclic aromatic
 hydrocarbons in the rhizosphere. J. Environ. Qual. 25, 212-219.
- 568 Rentz, J.A., Alvarez, P.J.J., Schnoor, J.L., 2005. Benzo[a] pyrene co-metabolism in the
- presence of plant root extracts and exudates: Implications for phytoremediation. Environ.
 Pollut. 136, 477-484.
- 571 Rezek, J., in der Wiesche, C., Mackova, M., Zadrazil, F., Macek, T., 2008. The effect of
- 572 ryegrass (Lolium perenne) on decrease of PAH content in long term contaminated soil.573 Chemosphere 70, 1603-1608.
- Rhodes, A.H., Carlin, A., Semple, K.T., 2008. Impact of black carbon in the extraction and
 mineralization of phenanthrene in soil. Environ. Sci. Technol. 42, 740-745.
- Rorison, H., Robinson, D., 1986. Mineral Nutrition, In: Moore, P.D., Chapman, S.B. (Eds.),
 Methods in Plant Ecology. Blackwell Scientific Publications, United Kingdom, pp. 145 214.
- 578 Smith, M.J., Flowers, T.H., Duncan, H.J., Alder, J., 2006. Effects of polycyclic aromatic
- 579 hydrocarbons on germination and subsequent growth of grasses and legumes in freshly
- 580 contaminated soil and soil with aged PAHs residues. Environ. Pollut. 141, 519-525.

- 581 Smith, M.J., Flowers, T.H., Duncan, H.J., Saito, H., 2011. Study of PAH dissipation and
- 582 phytoremediation in soils: comparing freshly spiked with weathered soil from a former
- 583 coking works. J. Hazard. Mater. 192, 1219-1225.
- 584 Smreckzak, B., Maliszewska-Kordybach, B., 2003. Seeds germination and root growth of 585 selected plants in pah contaminated soil. Fresen. Environ. Bull. 12, 946-949.
- 586 Sun, M., Fu, D., Teng, Y., Shen, Y., Luo, Y., Li, Z., Christie, P., 2011. In situ
- 587 phytoremediation of PAH-contaminated soil by intercropping alfalfa (Medicago sativa L.)
- with tall fescue (Festuca arundinacea Schreb.) and associated soil microbial activity. J. Soils
 Sediments 11, 980-989.
- 590 Thompson, O.A., Wolf, D.C., Mattice, J.D., Thoma, G.J., 2008. Influence of nitrogen
- addition and plant root parameters on phytoremediation of pyrene- contaminated soil. Water
 Air Soil Pollut. 189, 37-47.
- 593 Towell, M.G., Browne, L.A., Paton, G.I., Semple, K.T., 2011. Impact of carbon
- nanomaterials on the behaviour of C-14-phenanthrene and C-14-benzo-[a] pyrene in soil.
 Environ. Pollut. 159, 706-715.
- Trapp, S., Karlson, U., 2001. Aspects of phytoremediation of organic pollutants. J Soils &Sediments 1, 37-43.
- US EPA, U.S.E.P.A., 2012. 850.4100 Seedling Emergence and Seedling Growth, In:
 Agency, U.S.E.P. (Ed.), United States, p. 32.
- Wenzel, W., 2009. Rhizosphere processes and management in plant-assisted bioremediation(phytoremediation) of soils. Plant Soil 321, 385-408.
- 602 Yoshitomi, K.J., Shann, J.R., 2001. Corn (Zea mays L.) root exudates and their impact on
- 603 14C-pyrene mineralization. Soil Biol. Biochem. 33, 1769-1776.
- 604

605 Tables

606 607 Table 1. Test plant species

Family	Species
	Lolium perenne*
Pocacea	Festuca rubra
	Sorghum bicolor*
	Medicago sativa*
Fabaceae	Trifolium repens
	Glycine max*
Asteraceae	Achillea millefolium
Onagraceae	Chamerion angustifolium
Plantaginaceae	Plantago lanceolata

*Species used for both phytotoxicity and mineralisation assay

Treatment	Characteristics
T1	$100 \text{ mg kg}^{-1}\Sigma \text{ PAH} + 0.1\% \text{ (w/w) diesel}$
T2	100 mg kg ⁻¹ Σ PAH + 0.1 % (dry weight) activated charcoal
Т3	$300 \text{ mg kg}^{-1}\Sigma \text{ PAH} + 0.1\% \text{ (w/w) diesel}$
T4	300 mg kg ⁻¹ Σ PAH + 0.1 % (dry weight) activated charcoal
T5	$100 \text{ mg kg}^{-1}\Sigma \text{ PAH} + 0.1\% \text{ (w/w) diesel} + 0.1\% \text{ (dry weight) activated charcoal}$
T6	$300 \text{ mg kg}^{-1}\Sigma \text{ PAH} + 0.1\% \text{ (w/w) diesel} + 0.1\% \text{ (dry weight) activated charcoal}$
T7	$100 \text{ mg kg}^{-1}\Sigma \text{ PAH}$
T8	$300 \text{ mg kg}^{-1}\Sigma \text{ PAH}$
Cd	Diesel control: 0.1% (w/w) diesel
Cac	Activated charcoal control: 0.1 % (dry weight) activated charcoal
C_s	Solvent control: 10 ml kg ⁻¹ 1:1 toluene:acetone
\overline{C}_{g}	Growth control: Clean soil

609Table 2. Summary of treatments for the phytotoxicity assay

Treatment	Characteristics
А	$100 \text{ mg kg}^{-1} \Sigma \text{ PAH}$
В	100 mg kg ⁻¹ Σ PAH + 0.1 % (dry weight) activated charcoal
С	$100 \text{ mg kg}^{-1}\Sigma \text{ PAH} + 0.1\% \text{ (w/w) diesel}$
D	100 mg kg ⁻¹ Σ PAH + 0.1% (w/w) diesel + 0.1 % (dry weight) activated charcoal
E	Pristine soil
F	0.1 % (dry weight) activated charcoal
G	0.1% (w/w) diesel
Н	0.1% (w/w) diesel + 0.1 % (dry weight) activated charcoal
I	1:1 Toluene : Acetone solution

Table 3. Summary of treatments for the ¹⁴C-phenanthrene mineralisation assay

- 614 Figure captions
- 615 **Figure 1** Germination rate estimated at the 7th day after sowing as the percentage of
- 616 germinated seeds among the seeds sown (Muratova et al. 2008). T1 = 100 mg kg⁻¹ Σ PAH +
- 617 0.1% (w/w) diesel, T2 = 100 mg kg⁻¹ Σ PAH + 0.1 % (dry weight) activated charcoal, T3 =
- 618 300 mg kg⁻¹ Σ PAH + 0.1% (w/w) diesel, T4 = 300 mg kg⁻¹ Σ PAH + 0.1% (dry weight)
- 619 activated charcoal, T5 = 100 mg kg⁻¹ Σ PAH + 0.1% (w/w) diesel + 0.1% (dry weight)
- 620 activated charcoal, T6 = $300 \text{ mg kg}^{-1}\Sigma \text{ PAH} + 0.1\%$ (w/w) diesel + 0.1 % (dry weight)
- 621 activated charcoal, T7 = 100 mg kg⁻¹ Σ PAH, T8 = 300 mg kg⁻¹ Σ PAH, C_d = Diesel control:
- $622 \quad 0.1\%$ (w/w) diesel, C_{ac} = Activated charcoal control: 0.1 % (dry weight) activated charcoal,
- 623 $C_s =$ Solvent control: 10 ml kg⁻¹ 1:1 toluene:acetone, $C_g =$ Growth control: Clean soil.
- 624 Marked boxes (*) represent significant differences against the growth control (Cg) of each
- 625 species. Solid lines represent the mean value of the growth control (Cg) used as baseline for
- 626 the analysis of variance (ANOVA) test. Error bars represent the standard error of the mean (n
- 627 = 3)

Figure 2 Mineralisation of ¹⁴C-phenanthrene in soil spiked with 100 mg kg⁻¹ Σ PAH, Root amendments: (•) *L. perenne*, (\odot) S. *bicolor*, (∇) *M. sativa*, (∇) *G. max*, and (\blacksquare) without roots after 1 (**a**), 14 (**b**), and 28 (**c**) days ageing. Error bars represent the standard error of the mean (*n* = 3).

- 632 **Figure 3** Mineralisation of ¹⁴C-phenanthrene in soil spiked with 100 mg kg⁻¹ Σ PAH and
- 633 0.1% activated charcoal. Root amendments: (•) *L. perenne*, (\bigcirc) *S. bicolor*, (∇) *M. sativa*,
- 634 (\bigtriangledown) *G. max*, and (\blacksquare) without roots after 1 (**a**), 14 (**b**), and 28 (**c**) days ageing. Error bars
- 635 represent the standard error of the mean (n = 3)
- **Figure 4** Mineralisation of ¹⁴C-phenanthrene in soil spiked with 100 mg kg⁻¹ Σ PAH and 0.1% diesel. Root amendments: (•) *L. perenne*, (\odot) *S. bicolor*, (∇) *M. sativa*, (∇) *G. max*, and (**I**) without roots after 1 (**a**), 14 (**b**), and 28 (**c**) days ageing. Error bars represent the standard error of the mean (n = 3)
- **Figure 5** Mineralisation of ¹⁴C-phenanthrene in soil spiked with 100 mg kg⁻¹ Σ PAH, 0.1%
- 641 activated charcoal (dw) and 0.1% diesel (w/w). Root amendments: (•) *L. perenne*, (\circ) *S.*
- 642 *bicolor*, $(\mathbf{\nabla})$ *M. sativa*, (∇) *G. max*, and (\mathbf{I}) without roots after 1 (**a**), 14 (**b**), and 28 (**c**) days
- 643 ageing. Error bars represent the standard error of the mean (n = 3)

645 Figure 1





















