ULUMUNA
Jurnal Studi Keislaman
Volume XV • Nomor 2 • Desember 2011

TERAKREDITASI Berdasarkan SK Dirjen Dikti Depdiknas
Nomor: 65a/DIKTI/Kep/2008

ISI

PEDOMAN TRANSLITERASI

Arab		Latin	Arab		Latin
ا	=	a	ف	=	f
ب	=	b	ق	=	q
ت	=	t	ك	=	k
ث	=	ts	ل	=	l
ج	=	j	م	=	m
ح	=	<u>h</u>	ن	=	n
خ	=	kh	و	=	w
د	=	d	ه	=	h
ذ	=	dz	ء	=	'
ر	=	r	ي	=	y
ز	=	z			
س	=	s			
ش	=	sy			**Untuk Madd**
ص	=	sh			**dan Diftong**
ض	=	dl	آ	=	â (a panjang)
ط	=	th	إي	=	î (i panjang)
ظ	=	zh	أو	=	û (u panjang)
ع	=	'	او	=	aw
غ	=	gh	أي	=	ay

I'JÂZ AL-QUR'ÂN IN THE VIEWS OF
AL-ZAMAKHSYÂRÎ AND SAYYID QUTHB

Mhd. Syahnan*

مستخلص: ومن أخطر المناقشات التي يتحدث بها خلال القرن الثالث من الهجري هي البحث عن معجزات القرآن الكريم استجابة عن استمرار الرد من الوحي التي تلقاها النبي ص.م. منذ ذلك القرن قامت الدراسات المختلفة على جوانب الإعجاز القرآن. هذه الرسالة تناقش على الرأيين الإمامين الكبيرين الزمخشاري وسيد قطب حتى انكشفت أبواب التشابه والاختلاف بين الرئيين عن الإعجاز. لقد وجد الكاتب في البحث هذه الرسالة على أن مزايا الزمخشاري في نهج القرآن من قبل فهم اللغة والبلاغة التي تدل على مميزة النص القرآن لا مثيل لها. وعلى العكس، شدد سيد قطب في إعداد الخصائص الرئيسية المهمة من قبل العلماء والفقهاء مسلم لأن هدفهم الرئيسي ليس لاثبات صحة الإعجاز. ومع ذلك، النهج في القرآن عندهم يدل على أنهم مؤهل في هذا المجال بأسلوبهم الجديدة في فهم القرآن الكريم.

Abstrak: *Salah satu perdebatan paling serius tentang al-Qur'an adalah mengenai kemukjizatannya yang muncul pada abad ketiga Hijriah sebagai respons terhadap penyangkalan berkelanjutan terhadap wahyu yang diterima oleh Nabi Muhammad saw. Sejak itu berbagai studi dilakukan tentang aspek i'jâz. Tulisan ini mendiskusikan pendapat al-Zamakhsyârî dan Sayyid Quthb, sehingga akan terungkap sejauhmana persamaan dan perbedaan pendapat mereka terhadap i'jâz. Penulis menemukan bahwa keunggulan pendekatan al-Zamakhsyârî terdapat pada aspek pemahaman bahasa dan retorika yang menunjukkan keistimewaan teks al-Qur'an yang tiada tara. Sebaliknya, Sayyid Quthb secara eksklusif menekankan pada elaborasi karakteristik penting al-Qur'an yang terabaikan oleh ilmuwan dan ahli hukum Muslim, sehingga tujuan utamanya bukan untuk pembuktian validitas i'jâz. Pendekatan mereka terhadap al-Qur'an membuktikan metode baru dengan kualifikasi masing-masing.*

---

*The author is lecturer at Faculty of Syari'ah of IAIN Sumatera Utara, Jl. Willem Iskandar Pasar V Medan Estate, 20371. e-mail: syahnan_m@yahoo.com

THE ISSUE of the miraculous nature of the Qur'an appeared during the third century of Islam, as a response to the continual denials of the divine revelation of Muhammad (revealed to Muhammad). Since that time, a number of studies have been undertaken on various aspect of i'jâz.[1] For instance, al-Zamakhsyârî, adopts al-Jurjânî's theories of construction and meaning, and applies this approach to understanding the Quranic text, as is evident in his al-Kasysyâf.[2] In addition, he uses this method to throw light on the miraculous nature (i'jâz), of the Qur'an, highlighting the inimitable beauty and the expressiveness of the text. Sayyid Quthb, on the other hand, claimed that al-Zamakhsyârî's achievement was only partially successful, and called for a comprehensive study of the Qur'an as a literary text, focusing on its aesthetic aspects and its stylistic unity. Quthb's ideas are best illustrated in his two main works,[3] in which he explains that a new approach to the study of i'jâz is required, one which will illuminate the general principles of artistic beauty in the Qur'an. This paper is an attempt to analyze the stylistic excellence and artistic expression of the Qur'an as expounded by al-Zamakhsyârî and Sayyid Quthb. In doing so, the extent to which their approach to i'jâz is similar to or different from one another will also be examined.

Biographies

Al-Zamakhsyârî

Abû al-Qâsim Mahmûd ibn 'Umar al-Zamakhsyârî, a scholar of Arabic, a theologian and a philologist, was born at

---

[1]For a general survey see e.g., Abdul Aleem, "'Ijazu'l-Qur'an," *Islamic Culture*, vol. 7 (1933), 64-82, 215-33. For a more comprehensive analysis of the study of *i'jâz* from classical to modern time see Issa J. Boullata, "The Rhetorical Interpretation of the Qur'an: *I'jâz* and Related Topics," in *Approaches to the History of the Interpretation of the Qur'an*, ed. Andrew Rippin (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1988), 139-57.

[2]See generally al-Zamakhsyârî, *Al-Kasysyâf 'an Haqâ`il Ghawâmidh al-Tanzîl*, 4 vols. (Beirut: 1947).

[3]Sayyid Quthb, *Al-Tashwîr al-Fannî fî al-Qur'ân* (Cairo, n.p. 1962). Quthb applied the method and elaborated it in detail in his second work *Masyâhid al-Qiyâma fî al-Qur'ân* (Cairo, n.d.). See Boullata, "The Rhetorical...," 150-51.

Zamakhshar, a village in Khwârazm, in 467-8/1057. He spent so much of his life in Mecca that he is earned the title (laqb) 'jâr Allâh' (the neighbour of God) in reference to his long sojourn in the holy city.[4] As a theologian, he followed the teachings of the Mu'tazilites', and as a philologist, he was a strong advocate of the superiority of the Arabic language and an opponent of the Shu'ûbiyya movement. He died at Jurjâniyya in Khwârazm in 538/1144. His most prominent works include his Quranic exegesis Al-Kasysyâf,[5] completed in 528/ 1134, which is characterized as an important contribution to the study of linguistics and rhetoric. This commentary, which displays a brilliant knowledge of language, is characterized strongly by the personal viewpoint and talent of the author.

Sayyid Quthb

Sayyid Quthb Ibrâhîm Husayn Syâdhilî was born about 1906 in the village of Qaha, in Asyut province, to an influential family that was both pious and affected by modern influences. His father was a member of one of the political parties formed near the beginning of the twentieth century.[6] After receiving a traditional education, Sayyid Quthb entered Dâr al-'Ulûm, where he graduated in 1933. He worked as an inspector in the Ministry of Education for a short time but soon left to become a full-time writer. In 1948, he went to the United States on an

---

[4]See generally, Ahmad al-Hûfî, *Al-Zamakhsyârî* (Cairo, 1966); C. Brockelmann, "al-Zamakhsyari," *The Encyclopaedia of Islam*, vol. IX, ed. M.Th. Houtsma et al. (Leiden: E.J. Brill & Sons, 1933-38), 1205-7.

[5]For more information on his works, see Dionisius A. Agius, "Some Bio-bibliographical Notes on Abû al-Qâsim Mahmûd b. 'Umar al-Zamakhsyârî," *Al-Arabiyya* (*Journal of the American Association of Teachers of Arabic*) vol. 15, nos. I-2 (1982), 108-30.

[6]For a general biography on Sayyid Quthb see *inter alia*: Yvonne Y Haddad, "Sayyid Quthb: Ideologue of Islamic Revival," in *Voices of Resurgent Islam*, ed. John L. Esposito (New York: 1983), 67-98; Ana Belen Soage, "Islamism and Modernity: The Political Thought of *Sayyid* Qutb." *Totalitarian Movements & Political Religions*, vol. 10, no. 2 (2009), 189-203; Andrew F. March, "Taking People As They Are: Islam As a 'Realistic Utopia' in the Political Theory of Sayyid Qutb," *American Political Science Review* 104, 1 (2010): 189-207.

educational mission for two and a half years. Upon his return, he joined the Muslim Brotherhood (*Al-Ikhwân al-Muslimûn*) and rapidly became one of its leading ideologues.[7]

Al-Zamakhsyârî's Theory of Stylistic Excellence

His View on the Miraculous Nature of the Qur'an

Given the fact that both scholars treat the theme under discussion extensively, consideration of their views will be limited to the aspects that are most significant (the most significant aspects). To begin with, al-Zamakhsyârî argues that there are two reasons for considering the Qur'an a miracle, one of which is the truth of its information about the unseen.[8] To support his argument he utilizes Qs. Al-Baqarah (2):23-4:

> And if you are in doubt concerning that We have sent down on Our servant, then bring a sûra like it, and call your witness, apart from God, if you are truthful. And if you do not - and you will not - then fear the Fire, whose fuel is men and stones, prepared for unbelievers.[9]

In interpreting these verses al-Zamakhsyârî argues that men are unable to meet the challenge to produce a comparable sûra, so the Quranic information about the unseen should be regarded as inimitable. More importantly, Muhammad's compatriots did not have knowledge of the earlier stories which were told in the Qur'an; therefore they must have been sent through a superhuman source. In addition, it is not impossible that the semblance of such information based on custom was absent, whereas no information like it was foretold. Thus, al-Zamakhsyârî reasons that the Qur'an carries within itself information on the unseen, and therefore it is a miracle.[10]

---

[7]A. B. Husayn, *Ibid.*, 39-48; and see generally Mahmûd 'Abd al-Hamîd, *Al-Ikhwân al-Muslimûn* (Cairo: Dâr al-Da'wa, 1978).

[8]Al-Zamakhsyârî, *Al-Kasysyâf*, vol. 1, 424, 437; vol. 2, 385.

[9]It should be noted that the English translation of the Quranic verses throughout this essay is adopted from Arthur J. Arberry, *The Koran Interpreted* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1983).

[10]Al-Zamakhsyârî, *Al-Kasysyâf*, vol. 1, 428; also stated in Munîr Sulthân, *I'jâz al-Qur'ân* (Alexandria: al-Ma'ârif, 1986), 172; Mushthafâ al-Shâwî al-Juwaynî, *Manhaj al-Zamakhsyârî fî Tafsîr al-Qur'ân wa Bayân I'jâzih* (Cairo: Dâr al-Ma'ârif, 1984), 217-8.

Furthermore, through the use of meaning al-Zamakhsyârî observes that there are three specific categories where Quranic information on the unseen can be regarded miraculous. First, the verse in itself may convey information of the unseen, al-Zamakhsyârî points out as in Qs. Al-Baqarah (2):94-5. The second category contains verses that give information about the future events; the case in point is Qs. Al-Hijr (15):91. The final category concerns something which exists in the universe which al-Qur'an told about before its existence; examples of this are contained in Qs. al-Mâ'idah (5):54, Qs. al-Rûm (30):1-3, and Qs. al-Fath (48):28, all which prove the truth of the prophecy of Muhammad, for no one but only God knows about the information of the unseen.[11]

Another aspect that constitutes *i'jâz al-Qur'ân*, according to al-Zamakhsyârî, is its *nazhm* (construction). He maintains that *nazhm* is the essence of the miraculous nature of al-Qur'an, and its established principles include the concept of *tahaddî* (challenge), an aspect that exegetes must take into account.[12] Regarding to the mysterious beauty of al-Qur'an, al-Zamakhsyârî comments that its beauty cannot be explored except by means of the science of *nazhm,* otherwise they will remain undiscovered.[13] In connection to this, al-Zamakhsyârî makes a serious and comprehensive study of *balâghah*, he asserts that knowledge of *balâghah* and its style will not only uncover the *i'jâz al-balâghî* of al-Qur'an, but will also reveal the secret meanings of the Qur'anic text.

Al-Zamakhsyârî's Justification of the Beauty of Nazhm

Al-Zamakhsyârî elaborates his discussion of *balâghah* in his comments on the repetition of verses such as "*fabi'ayyi âlâ'i rabbikumâ tukadzdzibân,*" found throughout Qs. al-Rahmân. He argues that the purpose of repetition in this verse is to emphasize that people should not neglect the message it carries. Similarly, he believes that the phrase "*waylun yawma'idzin li al-mukadzdzibîn,*" found repeatedly in Qs. al-Mursalât, as well as the

---

[11]See al-Zamakhsyârî, *Al-Kasysyâf*, vol. 1, 262; vol. 2, 184; vol. 2, 237.
[12]*Ibid*, vol. 2, 24.
[13]*Ibid*., 302.

repetition of stories and information in themselves are meant to be present in the heart and to be remembered at every occasion.[14] On the whole, it appears that the purpose of repetition, according to the understanding of al-Zamakhsyârî is to strengthen the meaning of the verses in the minds of the believers and influence their stagnant thoughts.

In analyzing the beauty of the esoteric meaning concealed in the arrangement and the mode of speech of al-Qur'an, al-Zamakhsyârî points to verses such as Qs. al-Hujurât (39):3.

> "O believers, raise not your voices above the Prophet's voice, and be not loud in your speech to him, and you are loud one to another, lest your works fail while you are not aware. Surely those who lower their voices in the presence of God's messenger, those are they whose hearts God has tested for Godfearing; they shall have forgiveness and a mighty wage."

First, he seeks to explain the grammatical position of each part of the verse. Thus, he says that "*yaghudldlûna ashwâtahum*," is the noun of *inna* while the predicate of the nominal clause is the sentence of both the subject and predicate of the nominal clauses, each of which are definite nouns. He argues that the adduction of rewards i.e., *maghfirah* and *ajrun 'azhîm* as indefinite nouns indicate the utmost confidence and contentment of those who respect the Prophet for his lowering of the voice, considering this an indication of the extent of the Prophet's self-esteem.[15]

Another verse worth mentioning is Qs. Al-Baqarah (2):1, "*Alif lâm mîm, dzâlik al-kitâb lâ rayba fîhi hudan li al-muttaqîn*," (That is the Book, wherein is no doubt, guidance to the godfearing). In examining this verse al-Zamakhsyârî gives a lengthy discussion on its grammatical aspects. However, suffice it to say that, according to him, *Alif lâm mîm*, is a clause and stands as the principle, whereas *dzâlik al-kitâb, lâ rayba fîhi*, and *hudan li al-muttaqîn* are the second, third, and fourth clauses respectively. Al-Zamakhsyârî argues that such an arrangement describes its eloquence in detail and illuminates its beauty. The reason is not only because of its presentation in a harmonious

---

[14]*Ibid.*, 422.
[15]Sulthân, *I'jâz...*, 180; al-Juwaynî, *Manhaj...*, 239.

arrangement but also because of the unity of ideas in all segments of the verse under discussion. In addition, he adds that the verse is a challenge; it is indicated that *kitâb* is qualified by the utmost perfection which is meant to determine its challenging (*tahaddî*) aspect. What is more, the negation of any sort of doubt in it is also an attestation of its completeness, for completeness can only be established from truth and certainty.[16]

In regard to the last part of the verse, it is confirmed as unquestionable. Al-Zamakhsyârî then maintains that the order of the four segments must have significance in the purity of style. Thus, the first is constructed to show the most benevolent and elegant method for using the secret (symbolic) sign. The second indicates eminent (magnificent) communication, while the third concerns the position of *rayba* which comes before the adverb *fîhi*, and the fourth uses substruction, putting the verbal noun (*hudan*) in the position of adjective (*hâdin*). Its introduction with the indefinite noun is also part of the mysterious arrangement. Finally, al-Zamakhsyârî points out the idea of conciseness (*îjâz*) in designating *al-muttaqîn*, and asserts that this idea gives us an insight into the mystery of the speech of God.[17] Al-Zamakhsyârî also declares that the beauty of the composition of the verses depend on their expression and the revelation of eloquent content. To prove the case under discussion, he calls our attention to the language used by the Prophet Ibrâhîm in giving a warning to his father against the perpetration of sin and resistance to worship of the One true God. Ibrâhîm seeks to solve the problem by proposing rational distinction. Thus, al-Zamakhsyari examines the way in which such a verse is arranged in the best communication and narrative, elegant style, use of courtesy, gentleness, good manner, and offering sincere advice from God. The reason for his mistake is his persistence in accepting the advice. As worship is the ultimate glorification; therefore no one deserves to be worshipped except one who possesses the utmost benefaction, namely the Creator.[18]

---

[16]Al-Zamakhsyârî, *Al-Kasysyâf*, vol. 1, 17.

[17]*Ibid.*; al-Juwainî, *Man<u>h</u>aj*..., 240-1.

[18]Al-Zamakhsyârî, *Al-Kasysyâf*, vol. 2, 8-9.

Al-Zamakhsyârî supports his scientific refinement on the excellence of the *nazhm* of the Qur'an with his analysis of the verses like sûra 67:19, "*awalam yaraw ilâ al-thayri fawqahum shâffâtin wa yaqbidlna...*" The main problem here is the use of verb *yaqbidlna* instead of *qâbidlâtun* which seems as though it would be more appropriate. He argues that the action of flying on the air by aligning the wings resembles the action of swimming in the water, since both requires the stretching and spreading of limbs; the verb form is meant to appear to the sense of motion in both instances. Holding/gripping (*al-qabdl*), on the other hand, is alien to the word 'spread' (*al-basth*). The verb form is designed to indicate the sense of flying if not the actual action; this is to say, it intends to imply that the birds are setting in rows, all of which are gripping one after the other, as though swimming in water.[19]

The style of depiction and portrayal in the Qur'an are also topics which al-Zamakhsyârî discusses. He comments that it is not uncommon in Arabic for literary expression (*al-ta'bîr al-adabî*) to be used to bring out the hidden meaning and remove the veil of the real, permitting imagination to be perceived as positive/real. The illusion becomes certain and the invisible is perceptible. Exemplication then, conveys and clarifies the meanings, since it functions as a means of depicting and forming meanings.[20] There are numerous examples, to mention only two, one of which is Qs. al-Dukhân (44):29 "*famâ bâkat 'alayhim al-samâ' wa al-ardl wa mâ kânû munzharîn*," Commenting on this verse, al-Zamakhsyârî says that when a prominent person amongst the Arabs died, in order to respect him they would say, "the heaven, earth and wind are crying for him, and the sun grew gloomy for him." The use of a similar tone of expression is also found in both tradition and poetry, expressions that al-Zamakhsyârî describes as exaggeration to the necessity of grieving and crying over death. Thus, the verse can be interpreted as a sarcastic negation of the situation of those who glorified over the loss of the deceased. Another example worth mentioning is Qs. al-Hasyr (59):21.

---

[19]*Ibid*, vol. II, 478; al-Juwainî, *Manhaj*, 244.

[20]Al-Zamakhsyârî, *Al-Kasysyâf*, vol. I, 31; al-Juwainî, *Manhaj*, 253.

If We had sent down the Koran upon a mountain, thou wouldst have seen it humbled, split asunder out of the fear of God.

Al-Zamakhsyârî explains that the purpose of the *tamtsîl* here is to express reprehension over men's sternness of heart and their being minimal reverence and contemplation of adversities and deterrence when reading the Qur'an.[21] Examples like this are familiar in the Arab use whereas the Qur'an is not revealed except in the style and method of the Arabic.

Sayyid Quthb's Aesthetic Approach

Quthb's Call for New Approach

In contrast to al-Zamakhsyârî, Sayyid Quthb shows little interest in proving the validity of *i'jâz*, but rather concentrates on the Qur'an's aesthetic aspects inspired by artistic considerations regardless of their religious value.[22] In addition, he also tries to keep his method of interpretation free from the baggage of linguistics, syntactical, juristic, historical, and mythical commentaries which prevailed prior to his time. He maintains that scholars added little to the discussion of *i'jâz* and its analysis.[23] Thus, the proceeding discussion will focus on an examination of his method in his twin works on the subject.

Quthb argues that the source of charm (*siḥr*) of al-Qur'an lies in its harmonious and integral thesis. The cohesiveness of the Qur'an comes from neither the historical narrations nor the sequence of chapters, but rather the sensitivity of the Qur'anic discourse as represented in the usage of images and tones and its employment of psychological and spiritual shades in order to imprint its message and views, all of which were integral to its

---

[21]Al-Zamakhsyârî, *Al-Kasysyâf*, vol. 2, 449; al-Juwainî, *Manhaj*, 255.

[22]Quthb's preoccupation with the purely artistic features of the Qur'an was criticized by Ḥasan al-Bannâ (1906-1949) for ignoring the religious aspects of the text; see Yûsuf al-'Azham, *Râ'id al-Fikr al-Islâmî al-Mu'âshir al-Syahîd Sayyid Quthb* (Damascus, Beirut: Dâr al-Qalam, 1980), 247. However, *Tashwîr* is considered to be the foundation of Quthb's Quranic studies and has a great influence on his *Tafsîr fî Zhilâl al-Qur'ân* (Beirut: Dâr al-Syurûq, 1988).

[23]For a detail account on how the Qur'an should be approached, see generally *al-Tashwîr*..., 24-33.

'artistic inimitability' (*al-i'jâz al-fannî*).[24] To support this thesis Quthb cites the story of 'Umar ibn al-Khaththâb and al-Walîd ibn al-Mughîrah, both of whom were impressed by the charm of al-Qur'an despite their contrasting orientations.[25] Quthb agrees that there are a number of reasons for early converts to accept Islam, such as the charismatic personality of the Prophet, the patience and sacrifice undertaken by the Muslims, and tolerance of the shari'ah. However, Quthb argues that al-Qur'an itself was a decisive factor which bewitched the pagans into accepting Islam.[26]

Quthb's Artistic Expression

In his discussion on Qur'anic artistic portrayal, Quthb asserts that portrayal is the favourite device of Qur'anic style. "It is an established method, a comprehensive characteristic, using variations in colour, movement, tone and sound,..."[27] and expressions that help to magnify imagery and make it lively and humane. To support his main thesis, Quthb gives extensive examples from Quranic verses such as Qs. al-A'râf (7):40, in which the impossibility of non-believers entering heaven is equated to the impossibility of a camel entering a needle eye (... the gates of heaven shall not be opened to them, nor shall they enter paradise until the camel passes through the eye of the needle. Even so we recompense the sinners).[28] In a way, Quthb's treatment on this verse resembles that of al-Zamakhsyârî's discussion on *al-tamtsîl wa al-takhyîl*.

Furthermore, Quthb argues that sensual dramatization and magnification (*takhyîl al-ḥissî wa al-tajsîm*) are the methods which form the foundation of Quranic portrayal, as in Qs. al-Takwîr (81):18, "*wa al-shubḥi idzâ tanaffas*" (by the dawn when it

---

[24]Sayyid Quthb, "Al-Tashwîr al-Fannî fî al-Qur'ân al-Karîm," *Al-Muqtathaf*, vol. 94, no. 2 (1 February 1939), 206-7.

[25]See generally Sayyid Quthb, *Al-Tashwîr...,* 11-14.

[26]Sayyid Quthb, *Al-Tashwîr*, p. 18; Ibrahim M. Abu-Rabi', *Intellectual Origins of Islamic Resurgence in the Modern Arab World* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1996), 104-5.

[27]Boullata, "The Rhetorical...," 151; Sayyid Quthb, *al-Tashwîr...*, 34-5.

[28]*Ibid*, 36.

breathes). In this instance, a human quality, that is breathing, is ascribed to the morning to the effect that it gives meanings and states.[29] Similarly, Quthb maintains that anthromorphic expressions in the Qur'an like "He sat on the throne," "His throne on the water," and "The Hand of Allâh is above their hands," all of these are examples of dramatization and magnification, the purpose of which is to clarify abstract meanings.[30]

In regard to repetition of parts of the Quranic narratives, unlike al-Zamakhsyârî,[31] Quthb perceives this as subordination of the religious message, in which tales in the Qur'an are treated in a variety of ways. Some tales are presented at length, like those of Yûsuf, Ibrâhîm and Sulaymân, whereas stories such as those of Zakariyyâ, Syu'ayb and Shâli<u>h</u> are treated only briefly. In addition, some tales are given either from the beginning or at a later stage, such as the tales concerning the birth of Jesus and Yûsuf respectively.[32]

Another aspect that constitutes the representation in Quthb's scheme is the artistic symmetry (*al-tanâsuq al-fannî*) of al-Qur'an. Quthb argues that the musical rhythm and harmonious pattern perform a fundamental harmonizing task in the rhetoric of al-Qur'an. The case in point is like Qs. al-Najm (53):1-5.

> *wa al-najm idhâ hawâ*
> (By the star when it plunges)
> *mâ dhalla shâhibukum wa mâ ghawâi*
> (your comrade is not astray, neither errs)
> *wa-mâ yanthiqu 'an al-hawâ*
> (nor speaks he out of caprice)
> *in huwa illa wa<u>h</u>yun yû<u>h</u>â*
> (This is naught but a revelation revealed)
> *'allamahû shadîdu al-quwâ*
> (taught him by one terrible in power).[33]

Finally, incorporated into Quthb's scheme of artistic symmetry is the portrayal by al-Qur'an of the Resurrection Day

---

[29]Quthb, *Al-Tashwîr...*, 63-4.
[30]*Ibid*, 73.
[31]*Ibid*, 64.
[32]*Ibid*, 134-9.
[33]*Ibid*, 86-8.

in which he discovers symmetry between the parts of the scene with its expressions and the underlying rhythm and music. These Qur'anic imagery deals with death, resurrection, happiness and suffering, the portrayals of which are breathlessly rapid reflecting the calamity.[34] He maintains that the Quranic representation of the idea of bodily resurrection at the end of time is unprecedented due to its deep impact on the mind, the thoroughness of its imagery and the purity of its conception.[35]

The comparison al-Zamakhsyârî's and Quthb's views is briefly shown as follows.

al-Zamakhsyârî	Sayyid Quthb
Truth of Quranic information on the unseen, future events, foretold existence of things	Source of charm/*sihr* of Qur'an is its harmonious and integral thesis
Mysterious beauty and eloquence/*i'jâz al-balâghî*	Artistic inimitability/(*al- i'jâz al-fannî*)
Construction (*nazhm*)	Artistic symmetry (*al-tanâsuq al-fannî*), musical rhythm and harmonious pattern
Literary expression (*al-ta'bîr al-adabî*); portrayal and style of depiction	Sensual dramatization and magnification (*takhyîl al-hissî wa al-tajsîm*)
al-tamtsîl wa al-takhyîl	Artistic portrayal helps to magnify imagery and make it lively and humane
Linguistic and theological	Free from the baggage of linguistics, syntactical, juristic, historical and mythical commentaries
Esoteric meaning	Sensitivity of Qur'anic discourse and employment of psychological and spiritual aspects
Sectarian (Syi'ah)	Non-sectarian

The Significance of al-Zamakhsyârî's and Sayyid Quthb's Qur'anic Interpretation

Sayyid Quthb's popularity amongst the Islamist circle and Islamic studies as a scholar and ideologist of *al-Ikhwân al-*

---

[34]Quthb, *Masyâhid...*, 58.
[35]*Ibid*, 37, 39-42.

Muslimûn remains particularly strong in Egypt and other Arab countries.[36] Perhaps one reason for his continuing legacy is the profound and masterful integration of the Qur'an in his thought. Quthb's *tafsîr* is a direct successor to that of Muhammad 'Abduh and Rashîd Ridha. In fact, it adopts 'Abduh's methods in both explicit and implicit interpretations. This stems from the fact that Quthb's mentor, Hasan al-Bannâ (d. 1949), was once a student of 'Abduh's disciple Rashîd Ridhâ. Thus, akin to the mentor, *Fî Zhilâl al-Qur'ân* may also be identified as a *tafsîr bi al-ra'y* whose distinguishing features of which is not confined to any sectarian interpretation. The author also avoids the grammatical, dialectical, and legal discourse which characterizes traditional commentaries and which, he says, "conceals the Qur'an from my soul and my soul from al-Qur'an."[37] In addition, his interpretation is motivated by his belief and concern for what he saw as the failure of previous *mufassir* to understand the true essence of the Qur'an. In his *tafsîr*, he insists on the literal interpretation of scripture and relates the sacred text to contemporary ideas and challenges, the result of which is often to bypass and disregard the work of centuries of theological and legal expertise.[38]

Al-Zamakhsyari, however, stemming from the obvious meaning of verse he seeks for alternative interpretations on the basis of grammatical and variant readings while paying full attention to the notion of the rhetorical beauty (*i'jâz*) of al-

---

[36]Shahrough Akhavi observes that due to Sayyid Quhb's overall standing as an Islamic thinker and activist, he may be compared with Turkish Bediuzzaman Said Nursi (1873-1960), Pakistani Abû al-A'lâ Mawdûdî (1903-1979), Irani 'Alî Sharî'atî (1933-1977) and even Ayatollah Ruhollah al-Musavi Khomeini. See Akhavi, "Sayyid Qutb," in *The Oxford Encyclopedia of the Modern Islamic World*, ed. John L. Esposito (New York: Oxford University Press, 1995), 3: 400-4.

[37]Quthb, *Zhilâl*, vol. 1, 2nd edition, Cairo, 1953, 5.

[38] Despite the worldwide recognition, however, Quthb has been criticized for stepping beyond the boundaries of the prevailing views in many respects. For further information on criticism of Quthb's thought see Abdelwahab Meddeb, *The Malady of Islam* (New York: Basic Books, 2003); Abou el Fadl, *Great Theft: Wrestling Islam from the Extremists* (San Francisco: Harper, 2005).

Qur'an. In contrast to Quthb, Al-Zamakhsyari's exegesis inclined to philosophical tendency. However, his acknowledged Mu'tazilism does not seem to have diminished the popularity of his Qur'anic commentary among non Mu'tazilite scholars. Although *al-Kasysyâf*, especially for the Mu'tazilite, is considered to be the greatest intellectual achievement in Qur'anic exegesis, it has consistently been the target of criticism in such work as *Anwâr al-Tanzîl wa Asrâr al-Ta'wîl* by al-Baydhawî (d. approximately between 1286 and 1316).[39] Nonetheless, despite vehement attacks on *al-Kasysyâf* by such prominent Sunnites such Ibn Taymiyyah and Ibn Hazm the libraries around the world contain hundreds of manuscripts and many printed editions of the work.[40] Thus, by comparing the thought of the two exegetes it is clear that they have opened new avenues to understand the Qur'an from new perspectives.

Concluding Remarks

From our discussion above, some very loose trends become evident. First, in interpreting the verses of the Qur'an, al-Zamakhsyârî always utilized grammatical analysis while repeatedly showing the matchless excellence of the Quranic text. Second, with the same token, al-Zamakhsyârî's approach gains significance through its perceptive linguistic and rhetorical aspects. Third, Sayyid Quthb, unlike his counterpart, does not pay any attention to linguistic, philosophical and other aspects of interpretation, but rather focuses on elaborating a significant characteristic of the Qur'an that had been neglected by Muslim scholars and jurists. As such, interest in proving the validity of *i'jâz* is not his main purpose. Nonetheless, their approach to al-Qur'an, imprints fresh methods each of which stands on its own right (validity). *Wa al-Lâh a'lam bi al-shawâb.●*

---

[39] See for instance in Lutfi Ibrahim, "The Concept of Divine Justice according to al-Zamakhsyârî and al-Baydhawî," *Hamdard Islamicus*, vol. 3 (1980), 3-17.

[40] See generally, Andrew J. Lane, *A Traditional Mu'tazilite Qur'an Commentary: the Kashshâf of Jâr Allâh al-Zamakhsharî* (Leiden: Brill, 2006).

Bibliography

Abdelwahab Meddeb, *The Malady of Islam* (New York: Basic Books, 2003).

Abou el Fadl, *Great Theft: Wrestling Islam from the Extremists* (San Francisco: Harper, 2005).

Ahmad al-Hûfî, *Al-Zamakhsyârî* (Cairo: n.p. 1966).

Ana Belen Soage, "Islamism and Modernity: The Political Thought of *Sayyid* Qutb." *Totalitarian Movements & Political Religions*, vol. 10, no. 2 (2009), 189-203.

Andrew F. March, "Taking People As They Are: Islam As a 'Realistic Utopia' in the Political Theory of Sayyid Qutb," *American Political Science Review*, vol. 104, no. 1 (2010), 189-207.

Andrew J. Lane, *A Traditional Mu'tazilite Qur'an Commentary: the Kashshâf of Jâr Allâh al-Zamakhsharî* (Leiden: Brill, 2006).

Darwish al-Jundi, *Al-Nazhm fî Kasysyâf al-Zamakhsyârî* (Cairo: n.p. 1969).

Dionisius A. Agius, "Some Bio-bibliographical Notes on Abû al-Qâsim Mahmûd b. 'Umar al-Zamakhsyârî", *Al-Arabiyya* vol. 15, no. 1-2 (1982).

Helmut Gatje, *The Qur'an and it's Exegesis: Selected Texts with Classical and Modern Muslim Interpretations* (London and Henley: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1976).

Ibrahim M. Abu Rabi', "Discourse, Power, and Ideology in Modern Islamic Revivalist Thought: Sayyid Quthb", *The Muslim World*, vol. 81, no. 3-4 (1991).

_____, *Intellectual Origins of Islamic Resurgence in the Arab World* (Albany. New York: SUNY Press, 1996).

Issa J. Boullata, "The Rhetorical Interpretation of the Qur'an: I'jâz and Related Topics", in ed. Andrew Rippin, *Approaches to the History of the Interpretation of the Qur'an* (Clarendon Press: Oxford, 1988), 139-157.

Jane I Smith, *"Sayyid Quthb." An Historical and Semantic Study of the Term 'Islâm' as Seen in a Sequence of Qur'an Commentaries* (Missoula: University of Montana, 1982).

J. J. G. Jansen, *The Interpretation of the Koran in Modern Egypt* (Leiden: E.J. Brill, 1980).

Lutfi Ibrahim, "The Concept of Divine Justice according to al-Zamakhsyârî and al-Baydhawî," *Hamdard Islamicus*, vol. 3 (1980), 3-17.

Mahmûd 'Abd al-Hamîd, *Al-Ikhwân al-Muslimûn* (Cairo: Dâr al-Da'wa, 1978).

Muhammad Tawfiq Barakât, *Sayyid Quthb: Khulshât Hayâtih, Manhajuh fî al-Haraka, al-Naqd al-Muwajjah Ilayh* (Beirut: Dâr al-Da'wa, n.d.).

Munîr Sulthân, *I'jâz al-Qur'ân: Bayn al-Mu'tazila wa al-Asha'ira* (Alexandria: al-Ma'ârif, 1986).

Mushthafâ al-Shâwî Al-Juwainî, *Manhaj al-Zamakhsyârî fî Tafsîr al-Qur'ân wa Bayân I'jâzih* (Cairo: n.p. 1959).

Olivier Carré, *Mystique et politique: lecture rùvolutionnaire du Coran par Sayyid Quthb, frère musulman radical* (Paris: Presses de la Fondation Nationale des Sciences Politiques, 1984).

R. L. Nettler, "Sayyid Quthb's Qur'anic Views on Islamic Society and Polity," in *Democracy in the Middle East*, Proceedings of the 1992 Annual Conference of BRISMES.

S. D. Khâlidî, *Sayyid Quthb: Min al-Milâd ila al-Istishhâd* (Damascus: Dâr al-Qalam, 1991).

Sayyid Quthb, *Al-Tashwîr al-Fannî fî al-Qur`ân* (Cairo, n.p. 1962).

_____, *Masyâhid al-Qiyâma fî al-Qur`ân*, 2nd ed. (Cairo: Dâr al-Ma'ârif bi-Mishr, 1966).

_____, *Fî Zhilâl al-Qur`ân*, 1st ed. (Cairo: Dâr Ihya` al-Kutub al-'Arabiyya, n.d.) 30 vols. in 5; 4th ed. (Beirut: Dâr al-'Arabiyya li al-Thiba'a wa al-Nashr wa al-Tawzî', n.d.) 30 vols. in 8. Also revised ed. 20 vols., in 6 tomes (Beirut: Dâr al-Syurûq, 1973).

Shalâh 'Abd al-Fattâh Khâlidî, *Sayyid Quthb, al-Syahîd al-Hayy* (Amman: Maktabat al-Aqshâ, 1981).

Al-Zamakhsyârî. *Al-Kasysyâf 'an Hâqâ'il Ghawâmidh al-Tanzîl* (Beirut, n.d. 1947).