

<sup>27</sup>See Parker, "Constitution of the Five Nations," 50, and Wallace, *White Roots of Peace*, 54. Fenton, in his introduction to Parker's texts, states that the term "implied their racial superiority." "The Constitution of the Five Nations," 9.

<sup>28</sup>A basic book on this subject is Frances Moore Lappe's *Diet for a Small Planet* (New York: Ballantine Books, Inc., 1971).

<sup>29</sup>See Frank G. Speck, *The Tutelo Spirit Adoptions Ceremony*. (Harrisburg, PA: Historical Commission, 1942) 2.

<sup>30</sup>See Elizabeth Tooker, "Iroquois Since 1820," in *Handbook of North American Indians*, 456.

<sup>31</sup>Wallace, *White Roots of Peace*, 6f.

<sup>32</sup>See Walter H. Capps's Introduction to *Seeing with a Native Eye*, ed. by Walter H. Capps 2; and Ake Hultkrantz, "The Contribution of the Study of North American Indian Religions to the History of Religions," *ibid.*, 89, 93.

<sup>33</sup>An artistic as well as textual introduction to the Haudenosaunee beliefs about creation is the 1982 *Akwesasne Notes Calendar*, available from Akwesasne Notes, Mohawk Nation, via Rooseveltown, N.Y. 13683.

<sup>34</sup>See Randle, "Iroquois Women," 170, 180.

## Critique

Herzog's article is organized around three threads which she proposes as useful for strengthening the fabric of contemporary U.S. society. The three threads, teased from an exploration of a portion of the Dekanawida-Hayonwatha stories (narrative and ritual of the Haudenosaunee) are:

1. the high status of women in Haudenosaunee society
2. the understanding of statecraft as a sacred responsibility toward all creation
3. peace as justice and wholeness in the social order.

The threads found in stories dating back to about the 15th century provide a view of beliefs denominated by the Haudenosaunee society as being praiseworthy and of good report.

Traditions and rituals are not a mirror of reality. Indeed they are often developed as a formal goal, exceeding the grasp, for what should be valued rather than what is. As goals unconsummated by the present generation, stories may be set forth seeking a promise of fulfillment by the next.

The *Bible's* Psalm 78, for example, provides a different culture's similar acknowledgement of the use of stories for educating, training

and directing future generations toward better ends than the past. To paraphrase:

Let children hear the mighty deeds which God performed of old; which in our younger years we saw and which our fathers told. Our lips shall tell them to our sons, and they again to theirs; that generations yet unborn may teach them to their heirs. Thus shall they learn, in God alone their hope securely stands; that they may never forget his works, but practice his commands.

When evaluated in terms of stories, the three threads highlighted by Herzog are not unique but rather quite commonly found in the fabric of other cultures. Is it surprising then that other cultures have similarly failed to have their stories form a unity with reality?

The author proposes to “get a better perspective on Western tradition by observing the strengths and weaknesses of a completely different social order.” Herzog’s success at this task is limited by her failure to maintain a separation between traditional stories and reality in each social order during the evaluation process. At points in the reiteration of the Haudenosaunee *stories* Herzog pauses to remark, with strength of feeling, on certain *realities* of the Western social order deserving condemnation.

Although the article provides interesting insight into Haudenosaunee life, its value is somewhat diminished by the broad brush strokes used to relate the stories to Western culture and social order. It might be useful to consider how stories of women, religion, and peace have been similarly resistant to acculturation in Western societies; an analysis of “feminine qualities” as they are assigned to viewpoint and behavior rather than genetics and the role of androgyny in such a review would be most enlightening. It is true of all cultures and social orders that “you don’t have anything if you don’t have stories,” for “in the belly of this story the rituals and the ceremonies are still growing.”

Linda Jean Carpenter  
Brooklyn College, CUNY