



**In association with the Met Office
and the Institute for Animal Health**

The impacts of weather and climate change on the spread of bluetongue into the United Kingdom

Submitted by Laura Elizabeth Burgin to the University of Exeter
as a thesis for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy in Geography
in May 2011

This thesis is available for Library use on the understanding that it is copyright material and that no quotation from the thesis may be published without proper acknowledgement.

I certify that all material in this thesis which is not my own work has been identified and that no material has previously been submitted and approved for the award of a degree by this or any other University.

Signature:

Abstract

A large epizootic of the vector-borne disease bluetongue occurred in northern Europe from 2006-2009, costing the economies of the infected countries several hundreds of millions of euros. During this time, the United Kingdom (UK) was exposed to the risk of bluetongue by windborne incursions of infected *Culicoides* biting midges from the northern coast of mainland Europe. The first outbreaks which occurred in the UK in 2007 were attributed to this cause. Although bluetongue virus (BTV) no longer appears to be circulating in northern Europe, it is widely suggested that it and other midge-borne diseases may emerge again in the future, particularly under a changing climate.

Spread of BTV is strongly influenced by the weather and climate however limited use has been made of meteorologically based models to generate predictions of its spread to the UK. The extent to which windborne BTV spread can be modelled at timescales from days to decades ahead, to inform tactical and strategic decisions taken to limit its transmission, is therefore examined here.

An early warning system has been developed to predict possible incursion events on a daily timescale, based on an atmospheric dispersion model adapted to incorporate flight characteristics of the *Culicoides* vectors. The system's warning of the first UK outbreak in September 2007 was found to be greatly beneficial to the UK livestock industry. The dispersion model is also shown to be a useful post-outbreak epidemiological analysis tool.

A novel approach has been developed to predict BTV spread into the UK on climate-change timescales as dispersion modelling is not practical over extended periods of time. Using a combination of principal component and cluster analyses the synoptic scale atmospheric circulations which control when local weather conditions are suitable for midge incursions were determined. Changes in the frequency and timing of these large scale circulations over the period 2000 to 2050 were then examined using an ensemble of regional climate model simulations. The results suggest areas of UK under the influence of easterly winds may face a slight increase in risk and the length of the season where temperatures are suitable for BTV replication is likely to increase by around 20 days by 2050. However a high level of uncertainty is associated with these predictions so a flexible decision making approach should be adopted to accommodate better information as it becomes available in the future.

Acknowledgements

I firstly thank my supervisors Suraje Dessai, Marie Ekström (now CSIRO) and Tim Quine at the University of Exeter. Marie provided much of the inspiration for the science in this PhD and continued to be supportive after emigrating to Australia, Suraje very kindly took over supervision of the project and provided many very useful scientific insights. I'm also grateful to Tim for initially accepting me as a student in the geography department.

My supervisor at the Met Office, Paul Agnew, is also greatly appreciated for all his help and encouragement.

The Atmospheric Dispersion Group at the Met Office all deserve acknowledgement too for their help innumerable ways. John Gloster is particularly thanked for acting as my 'mentor'. Special thanks are also due to Matthew Hort, Andrew Jones, David Thomson and Doug Middleton for their discussions on dispersion modelling and NAME.

This work would not have been possible without the collaboration and expert advice of Anthony Wilson, Chris Sanders, Simon Carpenter, Simon Gubbins and Philip Mellor at the Institute for Animal Health.

I'm grateful to Mark Harrison at the Met Office for his initial encouragement to take on a PhD. Brian Golding and Derrick Ryall, Met Office, are also thanked for allowing me the time and funding to work on this thesis.

Defra contract SE4204 also provided funding for this research.

Finally I owe enormous thanks to my parents, Annette, Jo and Rob for their support.

Contents

Tables and Figures	7
Author's Declaration.....	11
Abbreviations.....	12
Symbols.....	14
Chapter 1: Introduction	15
1.1 Weather, climate change and vector-borne diseases	15
1.2 Bluetongue and its <i>Culicoides</i> vectors	19
1.2.1 BTV	19
1.2.2 Midge flight behaviour and the influence of the weather	21
1.2.3 BTV in Europe	23
1.3 Research Motivation and Aims.....	28
1.4 Thesis Outline	29
Chapter 2: Literature Review	31
2.1 Modelling techniques for the spread of bluetongue	31
2.1.1 Statistical models of changes in bluetongue distribution.....	31
2.1.2 Process-based models of bluetongue transmission.....	34
2.1.3 Trajectory models of wind-borne vector spread	36
2.1.4 Discussion of the modelling approaches in relation to the thesis aims	39
2.2 Background to the modelling approaches used in the thesis	40
2.2.1 Atmospheric dispersion modelling.....	41
2.2.2 Synoptic climatology	44
2.2.3 Ensembles of climate models	47
2.3 Summary.....	52
Chapter 3: Modelling the wind-borne transport of midges as an atmospheric dispersion problem.....	54
3.1 Introduction to NAME	54
3.1.1 Meteorological data	54
3.1.2 Source information.....	55
3.1.3 Advection and dispersion	55
3.1.4 Loss processes	58
3.1.5 Model output	58
3.1.6 Model evaluation.....	59
3.2 Development of NAME to model midge flight.....	60
3.2.1 Overview of the method.....	60
3.2.2 NAME midge model version 0 (2007).....	61
3.2.3 NAME midge model version 1 (2008).....	62
3.2.4 NAME midge model version 2 (2009).....	64
3.2.5 NAME midge model version 3 (2010).....	67

3.3	Uncertainty and sensitivity analyses of the midge activity equation.....	68
3.3.1	Uncertainty analysis in the seasonal parameters.....	68
3.3.2	Sensitivity analysis of the meteorological variables.....	70
3.3.3	Uncertainty associated with the meteorological input.....	73
3.4	Evaluation of the midge dispersion model using case studies and model inter-comparisons.....	75
3.4.1	Results.....	76
3.4.2	Summary of the case study results.....	83
3.5	Application of the model in an early warning system.....	84
3.5.1	Aim of the early warning system.....	84
3.5.2	Design and operation of the early warning system.....	85
3.5.3	Use of the system in an emergency response situation.....	87
3.5.4	Summary of the midge model's use in an early warning system.....	89
3.6	Discussion.....	90
3.7	Summary.....	93
Chapter 4: Synoptic scale circulation patterns associated with windborne incursions of <i>Culicoides</i> into the UK.....		95
4.1	Introduction.....	95
4.2	Data and Methods.....	96
4.2.1	Overview.....	96
4.2.2	Data.....	97
4.2.3	Map pattern classification method.....	99
4.3	Results.....	102
4.3.1	PCA and cluster analysis.....	102
4.3.2	Comparison of the results from the map-pattern classification with an alternative objective-GWL catalogue.....	110
4.3.3	Surface climate characteristics of the pressure patterns.....	114
4.3.4	Representation of the synoptic situation during midge incursion events by the map pattern classification.....	117
4.3.5	Comparison of the results from the map-pattern classification with the James objective-GWL catalogue for midge incursion days.....	120
4.4	Discussion.....	123
4.5	Summary.....	125
Chapter 5: The effect of climate change on incursions of midges into the UK in future decades.....		127
5.1	Introduction.....	127
5.2	Data and Methods.....	128
5.2.1	Overview.....	128
5.2.2	Data.....	130
5.2.3	Analysis of pressure patterns in the RCMs.....	133
5.2.4	Evaluation of the RCMs with observation data from ERA-Interim.....	133
5.2.5	Analysis of the seasonal occurrence of pressure patterns in the RCM and ERA-Interim datasets.....	134
5.3	Results.....	135
5.3.1	Pressure pattern classification.....	135
5.3.2	Variations in the frequency of the pressure pattern types between RCMs.....	143
5.3.3	Changes in the frequency of pressure pattern types.....	149

5.3.4	Changes in occurrence of pressure patterns associated with midge incursions during the bluetongue season	156
5.3.5	The influence of the driving GCM on the results from the RCMs	162
5.4	Discussion	167
5.5	Summary	170
Chapter 6:	Conclusions	172
6.1	Thesis summary	172
6.2	Conclusions	174
6.3	Scope for future work	177
6.4	Concluding remarks	178
Glossary	180
References	181

Tables and Figures

Tables

3.1	Temperature thresholds used in the source term of model version 2	64
3.2	Windspeed thresholds used in the source term of model version 2	65
3.3	Results from the stepwise regression analysis for the sensitivity of the midge seasonal dynamics equation to the meteorological input data	73
3.4	Details of the case study outbreaks	77
4.1	Results of the principal component analysis.....	104
4.2	Seasonal and annual relative frequency distribution of each pressure pattern.....	110
4.3	Relative frequency of pressure pattern persistency.....	110
4.4	Seasonal and annual frequency of each GWL from the James catalogue.....	113
4.5	Seasonal and annual frequency of each group of GWL similar to the map-pattern classification PPs	114
4.6	Seasonal and annual relative frequency distribution of midge days associated with each pressure pattern	118
5.1	GCMs and RCMs used by different research institutes in the ENSEMBLES project	131
5.2	Comparison of the frequency of each pressure pattern type calculated from the RCMs with the results from ERA-Interim for 2001-2010.....	148
5.3	Comparison of the frequency of each pressure pattern type during the bluetongue season calculated from the RCMs against the results from ERA-Interim for 2001-2010	159

Figures

1.1	Summary of components of vector-borne disease dynamics influenced by climate change	17
1.2	Transmission cycle of BTV	21
1.3	Routes of introduction of BTV into Europe during 1998-2006	24
1.4	BTV-1 and BTV-8 outbreaks in France at 26 November 2008.....	26
1.5	Bluetongue restriction zones as of 1 January 2011	27
1.6	Outline of modelling techniques for different timescales	30

2.1	Schematic of the variation in height and structure of the boundary during the course of the day.....	42
3.1	Nested domains of the Unified Model.....	55
3.2	Flowchart used in conjunction with NAME midge model version 0 to assess the level of bluetongue risk	62
3.3	Comparison of 'inert-tracer' particles and 'midge' particles overnight on 1-2 July 2008, using version 1 of the NAME midge model.....	64
3.4	Total <i>Culicoides</i> caught by a 'truck-trap' at Compton during hourly intervals on 30 June 2008	66
3.5	Seasonal cycle of <i>Culicoides</i> during 2008	66
3.6	Results from Dieppe of the sampling-based uncertainty analysis of the statistical parameters in the midge dynamics equation	69
3.7	Scatter plots of expected trap catch against temperature and wind speed and a box plot of the values of expected trap catch during the presence and absence of rain	70
3.8	Mean error in surface temperature and surface wind speed for NWP data from the Unified Model	74
3.9	Model output of a likely incursion of midges overnight on 4-5 Aug 2007 leading to the first UK outbreak in Suffolk	78
3.10	Most likely incursions of midges on 22-23 Sep 2007 from Wismar, northern Germany leading to outbreak on Lolland, Denmark	79
3.11	NAME midge model results from a source in Denmark for the overnight period on 7-8 Oct 2008 which potentially led to the outbreak in southern Norway.....	80
3.12	Location of farms in Norway found to test positive for BTV8 antibodies	81
3.13	Location of outbreaks in Sweden.....	82
3.14	Results from MATCH and the NAME midge model analyses of outbreaks in Sweden showing potential incursions on 14-15 Aug 2008	82
3.15	36-hour back trajectories on 17-18 Aug 2000 calculated by Alba et al. (2004) and NAME.....	83
3.16	24-hour long trajectories of 100 particles plotted in NAME from other potential sources of virus in Tunisia and Algeria at 18Z on 17 Aug 2000	83
3.17	Screenshot of the early warning website	86
3.18	Example of the data available from the early warning website, shown in the print-out format.....	86
3.19	Land surface temperature anomalies for western Europe from CRUTEM3 for April to October for 2006, 2007 and 2008.....	88
3.20	Number of days identified by NAME as having winds directed from infected areas on the near Continent to coastal south east counties of England for 2006, 2007 and 2008	89
4.1	Example of output from the NAME used to determine midge incursion events	99

4.2	Graphical aids used to determine the number of principal components to retain ...	103
4.3	Loading patterns of the first five rotated principal components	105
4.4	Average de-seasonalised pressure patterns for each cluster	108
4.5	Examples of the James objective GWL base patterns showing south-westerly flow across Europe in summer and winter	112
4.6	Wind roses showing wind speed and direction at 00Z for clusters 1-5 at Langdon Bay	116
4.7	Boxplots showing the range, median and upper and lower quartiles for temperature at 00Z for each cluster at Langdon Bay	117
4.8	Composite MSLP patterns for all dates of midge incursions in cluster 2 and cluster 5 and example synoptic charts for a midge incursion event in cluster 2 on 04/09/05 and cluster 5 on 27/04/07	119
4.9	Midge incursions events classed by weather types from the James (2006) objective-GWL classification	121
4.10	The main weather types from the James (2006) objective-GWL classification found to be present during midge incursion events	122
5.1	The combination of regional climate models and driving general circulation models available from the ENSEMBLES website	132
5.2	Map-pattern classification of de-seasonalised mean sea level pressure from KMNI-RACMO2 for 2001-2010	137
5.3	Map-pattern classification of de-seasonalised mean sea level pressure from KMNI-RACMO2 for 2011-2020	138
5.4	Map-pattern classification of de-seasonalised mean sea level pressure from KMNI-RACMO2 for 2021-2030	139
5.5	Map-pattern classification of de-seasonalised mean sea level pressure from KMNI-RACMO2 for 2031-2040	140
5.6	Map-pattern classification of de-seasonalised mean sea level pressure from KMNI-RACMO2 for 2041-2050	141
5.7	Map-pattern classification of de-seasonalised mean sea level pressure from ERA-Interim for 2001-2010	142
5.8	A comparison of PP2 and PP5 from the map-classification of de-seasonalised MSLP (hPa) produced in chapter 4 and the “south-westerly” and “easterly” map-pattern classification of de-seasonalised mean sea level pressure for 2001-2010 from KMNI-RACMO2	143
5.9	The frequency of each pressure pattern classification types for each decade.....	145
5.10	The change in frequency of south-westerly, north-westerly, easterly, cyclonic and westerly pressure pattern classifications each decade from 2001 to 2050	151
5.11	The average length of the bluetongue season in each decade as calculated from the ENSEMBLES regional models.....	156
5.12	The average length of the bluetongue season in each decade as calculated from the ENSEMBLES regional models after bias correction.....	157

5.13	The change in frequency of the south-westerly and easterly pressure pattern classifications during the average bluetongue season in each decade to 2050	160
5.14	Changes to the seasonal occurrence of south-westerly and easterly pressure patterns types in RACMO2 driven by ECHAM5	163
5.15	Changes to the seasonal occurrence of south-westerly and easterly pressure patterns types in RCA driven by ECHAM5	164
5.16	Changes to the seasonal occurrence of south-westerly and easterly pressure patterns types in RCA driven by BCM	165
5.17	Changes to the seasonal occurrence of south-westerly and easterly pressure patterns types in HIRHAM driven by BCM.....	166
6.1	A schematic representation of a holistic approach to the modelling of vector-borne disease transmission dynamics	177

Author's Declaration

The research contained in this thesis was partly carried out for a joint collaboration project between The Met Office and Institute for Animal Health funded by Defra (project SE4204 “The spread of bluetongue and related diseases by wind-borne vector *Culicoides*”). Chapter 3 presents the results for much of the Met Office contribution to this project.

The provision of data from field and laboratory experiments and expert advice regarding midge flight behaviour were provided by collaborators at the Institute for Animal Health, as detailed in separate sections in Chapter 3 entitled “midge data used in model development”. Other work in this chapter regarding adaptation to the existing NAME model and its subsequent use was carried out solely by the author as detailed in the “model modifications” and results sections. This included writing new FORTRAN code, running the model, analysing the results and producing the images and data required for the early warning website.

All other research, presented in Chapters 4 and 5, was all carried out solely by the author.

Abbreviations

ADNS	Animal Disease Notification System
AHSV	African horse sickness virus
AWS	Automatic weather station
BL	Boundary layer
BTV	Bluetongue virus
CMIP	Coupled Model Intercomparison Project
Defra	Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs
ECMWF	European Centre for Medium-Range Weather Forecasts
EIP	Extrinsic incubation period
EHDV	Epizootic hemorrhagic disease virus
FBL	Flight boundary layer
GCM	General (or Global) Circulation Model
GHG	Greenhouse gas
IAH	Institute for Animal Health
IPCC	Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change
IPCC AR4	The Fourth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change
IPCC FAR	The First Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change
MME	Multi-model ensemble
MSLP	Mean sea level pressure
NAME	Numerical Atmospheric-dispersion Modelling Environment
NAO	North Atlantic Oscillation
NDVI	Normalized Difference Vegetation Index
NWP	Numerical weather prediction
OIE	World Organisation for Animal Health (formerly the Office International des Epizooties)
PCA	Principal component analysis
PCs	Principal components

PDF	Probability density function
PP	Pressure pattern
PPE	Perturbed physics ensemble
PRUDENCE	Prediction of Regional scenarios and Uncertainties for Defining European Climate change risks and Effects
RCM	Regional climate model
RPC	Rotated principal component
SRC	Standardized regression coefficient
UKCP09	UK Climate Projections 2009
UM	Unified model
Z	Zulu Time or Universal Coordinated Time

Symbols

C	Concentration
$d\xi$	Increment of a random process
Δt	Timestep
K	Eddy diffusivity
κ	Molecular diffusivity
M_1	Temperature
M_2	Wind speed
M_3	Presence of rain
t	Time or Julian Day
τ_u	Lagrangian timestep in the horizontal
τ_w	Lagrangian timestep in the vertical
u	Instantaneous wind velocity
u'	Fluctuating component of the instantaneous wind velocity
\bar{u}	Mean wind
$u(x, y, \eta)$	Wind velocity vector
$u'(x, y, \eta)$	Turbulence velocity vector
$u_l(x, y, \eta)$	Low-frequency meander vector
x	Position in the x-direction
$x(x, y, \eta)$	Particle position vector
σ_u	Horizontal velocity variance
σ_w	Vertical velocity variance
σ_{eff}	Effective velocity variance
μ	Expected number of midges