

# COMICS, CRIME, AND THE MORAL SELF

An Interdisciplinary Study of Criminal Identity

Submitted by

**Thomas Philip Giddens**

to the University of Exeter as a thesis for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy in Law

September 2011

This thesis is available for Library use on the understanding that it is copyright material and that no quotation from the thesis may be published without proper acknowledgement.

I certify that all material in this thesis which is not my own work has been identified and that no material has previously been submitted and approved for the award of a degree by this or any other University.

Signature: .....

# ***Abstract***

An ethical understanding of responsibility should entail a richly qualitative comprehension of the links between embodied, unique individuals and their lived realities of behaviour. Criminal responsibility theory broadly adheres to 'rational choice' models of the moral self which subsume individuals' emotionally embodied dimensions under the general direction of their rational will and abstracts their behaviour from corporeal reality. Linking individuals with their behaviour based only on such understandings of 'rational choice' and abstract descriptions of behaviour overlooks the phenomenological dimensions of that behaviour and thus its moral significance as a lived experience. To overcome this ethical shortcoming, engagement with the aesthetic as an alternative discourse can help articulate the 'excessive' nature of lived reality and its relationship with 'orthodox' knowledge; fittingly, the comics form involves interaction of rational, non-rational, linguistic, and non-linguistic dimensions, modelling the limits of conceptual thought in relation to complex reality. Rational choice is predicated upon a split between a contextually embedded self and an abstractly autonomous self. Analysis of the graphic novel *Watchmen* contends that prioritisation of rational autonomy over sensual experience is symptomatic of a 'rational surface' that turns away from the indeterminate 'chaos' of complex reality (the unstructured universe), instead maintaining the power of rational and linguistic concepts to order the world. This 'rational surface' is maintained by masking that which threatens its stability: the chaos of the infinite difference of living individuals. These epistemological foundations are reconfigured, via *Watchmen*, enabling engagement beyond the 'rational surface' by accepting the generative potential of this living chaos and calling for models of criminal identity that are 'restless', acknowledging the unique, shifting nature of individuals, and not tending towards 'complete' or stable concepts of the self-as-responsible. As part of the aesthetic methodology of this reconfiguration, a radical extension of legal theory's analytical canon is developed.

# Contents

ABSTRACT	2
TABLE OF FIGURES	7

CHAPTER ONE	<b>Introduction</b>	<b>9</b>
1.1	Approaching the living other	9
1.1.1	<i>Aesthetics and comics</i>	12
1.1.2	<i>Disciplinary location of the thesis</i>	14
1.2	Thesis overview	15
1.2.1	<i>Part one: 'Literature review'</i>	15
1.2.2	<i>Part two: 'The turn to the graphic'</i>	16
1.2.3	<i>Part three: 'Criminal identity and the rational surface'</i>	17
1.2.4	<i>Part four: 'Escaping the rational surface'</i>	19

## PART ONE LITERATURE REVIEW

CHAPTER TWO	<b>Enriching Understanding</b>	<b>23</b>
2.1	Introduction	23
2.2	Interdisciplinarity and indeterminacy	25
2.2.1	<i>Interdisciplinarity</i>	25
2.2.2	<i>Indeterminacy of meaning</i>	31
2.3	Enriching understanding of legal structures	37
2.4	Enriching understanding by exploring alternatives	43
2.4.1	<i>Indeterminacy and the turn to literary culture</i>	49
2.5	Enriching understanding through example	52
2.6	Enriching understanding through supplementation	58
2.6.1	<i>Relevance and circumspection</i>	63
2.7	Enriching understanding of human nature	64
2.8	Conclusion	68

## PART TWO THE TURN TO THE GRAPHIC

CHAPTER THREE	<b>Introducing Comics</b>	<b>72</b>
3.1	Introduction	72
3.2	Comics background	73

	3.2.1 <i>A brief history of text and image</i>	75
	3.2.2 <i>Defining comics</i>	80
	3.2.3 <i>Recent history, censorship, and juvenility</i>	85
	3.2.4 <i>The 'simplicity' of comics</i>	87
	3.3 <b>Words and images</b>	91
	3.3.1 <i>Comics and other literary forms</i>	94
	3.4 <b>Comics and the current project</b>	96
	3.4.1 <i>Comics and criminal justice</i>	96
	3.4.2 <i>Introducing Watchmen</i>	100
	3.5 <b>Conclusion</b>	104
<b>CHAPTER FOUR</b>	<b><i>Comics and Aesthetics</i></b>	<b>106</b>
	4.1 <b>Introduction</b>	106
	4.2 <b>Reason and aesthetics in the comics form</b>	107
	4.3 <b>Reading the comics form</b>	113
	4.3.1 <i>Comics and semiotics</i>	113
	4.3.2 <i>The complexity of the comics page</i>	116
	4.4 <b>Metaphysics of surface</b>	123
	4.5 <b>Conclusion</b>	128
<b>PART THREE CRIMINAL IDENTITY AND THE RATIONAL SURFACE</b>		
<b>CHAPTER FIVE</b>	<b><i>Rational Choice and Criminal Justice</i></b>	<b>131</b>
	5.1 <b>Introduction</b>	131
	5.2 <b>Immanuel Kant and criminal justice</b>	132
	5.2.1 <i>Kantian abstract autonomy</i>	135
	5.2.2 <i>Kant and criminal identity</i>	140
	5.3 <b>Rational choice</b>	142
	5.3.1 <i>Abstracting the individual</i>	142
	5.3.2 <i>Criminal responsibility theory</i>	145
	5.3.3 <i>Rational choice in criminal responsibility</i>	150
	5.4 <b>Criminal identity in context</b>	154
	5.4.1 <i>Contextualising the Kantian self</i>	156
	5.4.2 <i>Self and context</i>	162
	5.4.3 <i>The return to astonishment</i>	168
	5.5 <b>Conclusion</b>	172
<b>CHAPTER SIX</b>	<b><i>Spectrality and Self-Making</i></b>	<b>173</b>
	6.1 <b>Introduction</b>	173
	6.2 <b>Spectrality and the moral self</b>	175

6.2.1	<i>The criminal spectre</i>	175
6.2.2	<i>Rorschach and spectrality</i>	179
6.2.3	<i>Spectrality and Kantian moral theory</i>	185
6.3	Who makes the phenomenal world?	189
6.3.1	<i>Osterman/Manhattan and the free will debate</i>	192
6.3.2	<i>The universal mechanism, quantum physics, and free will</i>	196
6.4	Who makes the self?	201
6.4.1	<i>Osterman/Manhattan's radical shift in identity</i>	201
6.4.2	<i>Synthesis of the self and the comics form</i>	204
6.5	The self as a nexus of drives and influences	210
6.5.1	<i>The art of one's self</i>	210
6.5.2	<i>Anchoring the nexus in lived experience</i>	216
6.6	Conclusion	219
 <b>CHAPTER SEVEN <i>Making Criminal Identity</i></b>		<b>221</b>
7.1	Introduction	221
7.2	Foucault's disciplinary subject	223
7.2.1	<i>Sovereignty, law, and disciplinary power</i>	223
7.2.2	<i>Making the criminal</i>	226
7.3	Who makes the world of criminal theory?	221
7.3.1	<i>Law and science as homo-cultural products</i>	231
7.4	Making world and self in criminal theory	235
7.4.1	<i>Criminal theory and the linguistic</i>	240
7.5	The rational surface	242
7.5.1	<i>Human value on the rational surface</i>	242
7.5.2	<i>Criminal identity and the rational surface</i>	249
7.6	Conclusion	250
 <b>PART FOUR ESCAPING THE RATIONAL SURFACE</b>		
 <b>CHAPTER EIGHT <i>Maintaining the Rational Surface</i></b>		<b>253</b>
8.1	Introduction	253
8.2	Outside the rational surface	256
8.3	Classical masculinity	262
8.4	Modern masculinity	268
8.4.1	<i>Modern masculinity and the rational surface</i>	273
8.5	Chaos, the sublime, and modern masculinity	278
8.6	Conclusion	283

CHAPTER NINE	<b><i>Relational Masculinity</i></b>	<b>285</b>
9.1	Introduction	285
9.2	Metaphysics of becoming	287
9.3	Relational masculinity	292
	9.3.1 <i>Dan Drieberg and relational patterning</i>	292
	9.3.2 <i>The haunted self</i>	296
9.4	Nietzsche and the non-linguistic	299
	9.4.1 <i>The Nietzschean self</i>	299
	9.4.2 <i>Escaping the rational surface</i>	304
9.5	Approaching chaos	309
9.6	Relational masculinity and criminal theory	315
	9.6.1 <i>Enriching understanding of criminal identity</i>	315
	9.6.2 <i>Relational masculinity and responsibility</i>	319
9.7	Conclusion	324
CHAPTER TEN	<b><i>Conclusion</i></b>	<b>326</b>
	<i>APPENDIX ONE</i>	331
	<i>APPENDIX TWO</i>	332
	<i>APPENDIX THREE</i>	333
	<i>BIBLIOGRAPHY</i>	334