

1-2014

Brahms the Exotic: The Representation of Non-European and Ethnic `Others' in the Hafiz/Daumer Settings of Opus 32, "Romanzen aus L. Tieck's Magelone," and "Zigunerlieder," Opus 103

Kristina Marie Eckelhoff
University of Arkansas, Fayetteville

Follow this and additional works at: <http://scholarworks.uark.edu/etd>

 Part of the [German Literature Commons](#), and the [Other Music Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Eckelhoff, Kristina Marie, "Brahms the Exotic: The Representation of Non-European and Ethnic `Others' in the Hafiz/Daumer Settings of Opus 32, "Romanzen aus L. Tieck's Magelone," and "Zigunerlieder," Opus 103" (2014). *Theses and Dissertations*. 2208. <http://scholarworks.uark.edu/etd/2208>

This Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by ScholarWorks@UARK. It has been accepted for inclusion in Theses and Dissertations by an authorized administrator of ScholarWorks@UARK. For more information, please contact scholar@uark.edu, ccmiddle@uark.edu.

Brahms the Exotic: The Representation of Non-European and Ethnic 'Others' in the Hafiz/Daumer Settings of Opus 32, *Romanzen aus L. Tieck's Magelone*, and *Zigunerlieder*, Opus 103

Brahms the Exotic: The Representation of Non-European and Ethnic 'Others' in the
Hafiz/Daumer Settings of Opus 32, *Romanzen aus L. Tieck's Magelone*, and *Zigunerlieder*, Opus 103

A thesis submitted in partial fulfillment
of the requirements for the degree of
Master of Music in Music

by

Kristina Marie Eckelhoff
University of Arkansas—Fort Smith
Bachelor of Arts in Music, 2009
University of Central Oklahoma
Master of Music in Vocal Performance, 2011

August 2014
University of Arkansas

This thesis is approved for recommendation to the Graduate Council.

Dr. Martin Nedbal
Thesis Director

Dr. Jennifer Hoyer
Committee Member

Dr. Elizabeth Markham
Committee Member

ABSTRACT

Though scholars, performers, and classical enthusiasts alike recognized and praised the many facets of his compositional craft, Johannes Brahms's treatment of poetry in his *Lieder* has led to much conflicting assessments. The negative critiques exist partially because the majority of scholars do discuss an interpretation of the poems but seldom explain precisely how Brahms conveys the texts' meanings through his music, leaving the more specific details of text-to-music relationship and what it shows about Brahms's own understanding of the texts unexplored.

Brahms's *Lieder* have also been criticized because of the supposed lack of exotic qualities in those works that portray non-Western characters or music, especially those dealing with Persian, Turkish, and Hungarian themes. Previous scholars have approached them with the attitude that they are musically not at all exotic, and as a result most of Brahms's *Lieder* with exotic subjects received little detailed attention in musicological research. Many of the dismissive critiques reflect a common misunderstanding of exotic works in musicological literature. As Ralph P. Locke has shown in his book *Musical Exoticism: Images and Reflections*, musicologists tend to focus on what he calls the "Exotic Style Only Paradigm," an approach referring only to music which explicitly evokes an exotic "other." As a result, many studies of musical exoticism overlook important clues in works that do not sound overtly exotic.

To solve the problem, Locke proposed a new, more inclusive approach to musical exoticism—the "All the Music in Full Context Paradigm." According to the "Full Context" view, scholars should not only look at the explicit musical markers of exoticism but also the extra-musical elements. This approach helps to identify not only exotic-sounding musical tropes, but also specific and previously overlooked points of view about exotic "Others." In this thesis, I will explore three song collections using Locke's "Full Context" view in order to challenge existing scholarship as well

as explain how Brahms used exotic subtleties to bring out the various meanings of the texts in a highly refined way.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

To Dr. Martin Nedbal, I express my deepest gratitude for absolutely everything. Under your tutelage, I have learned exactly what I need to do in order to succeed in musicology. Thank you for your positive attitude, your willingness to help whenever I needed it, the many edits of all my papers, and your guidance over the past two years. I would not be where I am without you.

Thank you to Dr. Jennifer Hoyer for introducing me to the wonderful world of German poetry and for always showing me how to engage my mind and approach the world (and my field) in so many different ways. Because of you, I have discovered where my true interests in research are.

Thank you to Dr. Elizabeth Markham for exposing me to the field of ethnomusicology, particularly Japanese music. Studying with you has been so fantastically fun! I sincerely appreciate your constant support and joy for learning and teaching.

To Dr. Rhonda Mains, I thank you for the support that you have given me and all the music students. The Music Department is fortunate to have your leadership.

Thank you to my family for supporting my decision to pursue a career in music. Since I was a child, you have listened to me practice for countless hours, bought all of my instruments, suffered through my childhood Shostakovich obsession, attended all of my recitals and concerts since I was ten years old, helped me pay for various music camps, and recognized my need for music. I will never forget all you have done to help me create opportunities to better my life through music and education.

A special thanks to Dr. Roxane LaCombe, who has given me endless emotional support. You have been a phenomenal voice professor, a wonderful friend, and a dedicated mother. You helped me find a voice and guided me into musicology. I would not be the musician or the woman I am today without you. Your indelible influence has changed my life in the most incredible way.

DEDICATION

This thesis is dedicated to my late grandparents, George and Melba Craig, who cultivated my interest in music when I was a child, and to my voice professor, Dr. Roxane LaCombe, who has provided constant support and encouragement throughout my musical career.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Introduction.....	1
Chapter I: Brahms, Daumer, and the Persian <i>Ghazal</i>	4
Chapter II: A Comparative Analysis of Brahms's Exotic Women in <i>Romanzen aus L. Tieck's Magelone</i> , Op. 33.....	21
Chapter III: Brahms and the <i>Style Hongrois</i>	39
Conclusion.....	63
Bibliography.....	64

INTRODUCTION

Though scholars, performers, and classical enthusiasts alike recognized and praised the many facets of his compositional craft, Johannes Brahms's treatment of poetry in his *Lieder* has often confused scholars, resulting in much conflicting scholarship. Some critics found him to be dull and conservative whereas some like Arnold Schönberg noted how progressive he was.¹ When one scholar claimed that Brahms had no clue how to work with poetry, another acknowledged his exceptional ability to set texts in innovative ways. Several of the negative critiques suggested his inability to set poetic texts written by lesser known writers rather than the obviously popular German writers, such as Goethe, Eichendorff, or Heine.² Though Brahms was rumored to have purposely chose minor poets, because the poetry supposedly needed "help," many found his "helpful" settings to be unsuccessful.³ But the majority of these critiques, especially the negative ones, are not always backed by analytical evidence.

These criticisms exist partially because many of Brahms's *Lieder* have been studied in an isolated manner. Brahms, a technical master, paid close attention to the structure of the poems he chose to set, yet not many people have examined the poems in their own context. The majority of scholars do discuss an interpretation of the poems but seldom explain precisely how Brahms conveys the texts' meanings through his music. In several books on Brahms *Lieder*, the expression is discussed in terms of how the settings evoke an overall feel or even specific feelings, but the more specific details of text-to-music relationship and what it shows about Brahms's interpretation receives little focus.

¹ Arnold Schönberg, "Brahms the Progressive," reprinted in *Style and Idea: Selected Writings of Arnold Schönberg*, edited by Leonard Stein, translated by Leo Black (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1984), 398-441.

² George S. Bozarth and Walter Frisch, "Brahms, Johannes: Lieder and Solo Vocal Ensembles," *Grove Music Online, Oxford Music Online*, <http://oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/51879pg11> (accessed September 14, 2013).

³ Bozarth.

Brahms's *Lieder* have also been criticized because of the supposed lack of exotic qualities in those works that portray non-Western characters or music, especially those dealing with Persian, Turkish, and Hungarian themes. The majority of scholars have approached them with the attitude that they are not at all exotic, and as a result most of Brahms's exotic *Lieder* receive little detailed attention in musicological research. Many of the negative and dismissive critiques reflect a common misunderstanding of exotic works in musicological literature. As Ralph P. Locke has shown in his book *Musical Exoticism: Images and Reflections*, musicologists tend to focus on what he calls the "Exotic Style Only Paradigm," an approach referring only to music which explicitly evokes an exotic person or place. As a result, many studies of musical exoticism overlook important clues in works that do not sound overtly exotic, especially in the German Romantic Lied.⁴ Locke noted that "German art songs (*Lieder*) almost consistently did not [use stylistic markers of person or place], even when songs were based on poems that incorporated Persian or Turkish references and images."⁵

To solve the problem, he proposed a new, more inclusive approach to musical exoticism—the "All the Music in Full Context Paradigm." According to the "Full Context" view, scholars should not only look at the explicit musical markers of exoticism but also elements such as verbal cues, structure, programmatic content, and other subtle indicators that stereotype exotic characters as primitive, unrefined, irrational, and morally inferior.⁶ This approach helps to identify not only exotic qualities of non-Western locations, but also specific traits about exotic "Other" characters who are often depicted in a negative manner. Such problems exist within several Brahms *Lieder* and represent most probably a major cause of dissent between scholars.

In this thesis, I will explore three song collections using Locke's "Full Context" view in order to challenge existing scholarship as well as explain how Brahms used exotic subtleties to bring

⁴ Ralph P. Locke, *Musical Exoticism: Images and Reflections* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2009), 48-59.

⁵ Locke, 134.

⁶ Locke, 79.

out the various meanings of the texts in a highly refined way. The first chapter addresses the text-to-music relationship and the connection to the exotic in the final three songs from the Opus 32 collection, all of which are “ghazals” inspired by one of Persia’s greatest poets. The songs appear to be “typical Brahms” when viewed through the “Exotic Only” lens, but Locke’s alternative view reveals that each piece contains subtle exotic markers, both within the text and music.

The second chapter investigates the relationship between two female characters in Brahms’s only song cycle, the *Romanzen aus L. Tieck’s Magelone*, Opus 33. Based on a strange poetic genre, the *Magelone Lieder* contains both clever representation of the poetry but also several exotic qualities in one particular piece. At a surface level, again, these pieces sound like Brahms, but using “Full Context” view shows how the European character is presented as refined and dignified whereas the exotic character is depicted as the exact opposite.

The final chapter examines several elements in one of Brahms’s late song collections, the *Zigeunerlieder (Gypsy Songs)*, Opus 103. He composed two settings of these songs, first a vocal quartet and then a solo version. Scholars have mostly focused on the latter, ignoring the exotic elements from Brahms’s original composition. Building upon previous scholarship that has attempted to interpret the “Gypsy-ness” of the *Zigeunerlieder* using the “Exotic Only” way, I show that Brahms both implemented several “Hungarian” characteristics in his songs and constructed an image of the European “us” and exotic “other,” thus making the Opus 103 *Zigeunerlieder* some of his most obviously exotic *Lieder*.

CHAPTER I
BRAHMS, DAUMER, AND THE PERSIAN *GHAZAL*
IN THE OPUS 32 *LIEDER*

Around the turn of the nineteenth century, German poets discovered and began to emulate Middle Eastern and Oriental poetry. Scholars on the subject began to emerge, such as Friedrich Rückert who translated several Oriental works. The form that most strongly impacted German poetry was the Persian *ghazal*, particularly the works of the famous fourteenth century poet and devout Sufi, Mohammed Shams od-Din-î-Hafiz î Shiraz, or simply Hafiz. Goethe wrote several Hafiz-inspired lyric poems in his *West-östlicher Divan* collection which was set by several *Lieder* composers, most notably Franz Schubert. Rückert along with August Graf von Platen also published several Hafiz-inspired poems that more closely followed the structure of a traditional *ghazal*, of which the most important is the rhyme scheme and the use of couplets.⁷ Each couplet, moreover, expresses a new theme or idea. The use of couplets, the presence of repetitions sometimes found in *ghazals*, and the rhyme structure most certainly was conducive to the German *Lieder* tradition, particularly in the early part of the nineteenth century when *Lieder* were more strophic and folk-like.

Given that Brahms typically turned to minor poets for his *Lieder*, it is not surprising that he selected the “ghazals” of the lesser known Georg Friedrich Daumer. In many published Brahms studies, scholars have mistakenly noted Daumer’s poems from his collection entitled *Hafis* as direct translations of Hafiz’s *ghazals*. But Daumer’s “ghazals” were in fact no direct translation; they were merely inspired by Hafiz, and Daumer frequently used thematic content similar to that of Hafiz and sometimes even snippets of Hafiz’s *ghazals*.⁸ Brahms set seven poems from Daumer’s *Hafis* collection—the three from Opus 32 (Nos. 7, 8, and 9), two from Opus 47 (Nos. 1 and 2), and one from Opus 57 (No. 2). Opus 32, No. 2 has also been referred to as a *ghazal*, yet since Daumer

⁷ *Ghazals* typically contain rhyming couplets and a refrain.

⁸ Elizabeth Blanton Momand, “Finding the Connection: Hafez—Daumer—Brahms,” DMA treatise, (University of Texas at Austin, 2001), 2; Eric Sams, *The Songs of Johannes Brahms* (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 2000), 341.

included it in his section entitled “Poetische Zugaben aus verschiedenen Völkern und Ländern – aus der Moldau” (“Additional poetry from different people and lands – from Moldavia”), it will not be included in this study of the *ghazal* emulations of the Opus 32 collection.

The “ghazals” of Opus 32 have all received various conflicting evaluations, yet none that would examine their exotic qualities. With the “Exotic Only” approach, Brahms’s artistic choices make little sense and have aroused discord in musicological circles. The “Full Context” approach, however, allows for a more comprehensive understanding of how Brahms depicted the exotic and highlighted the sensuality of the “ghazal.” In this chapter, I will challenge existing critiques of both text and music, showing how Brahms musical choices connect to the exotic Hafiz, relate to Daumer’s poetic structure, and bring out the themes of the text.

“Bitteres zu sagen denkst du,” the seventh song in the Opus 32 *Lieder* and the first of the “ghazals,” has been acknowledged both as one of Brahms’s loveliest settings and a poor attempt to capture the essence of the *ghazal*. Multiple scholars tend to focus on the latter critique, referring to Daumer’s poem as “inane.”⁹ Harrison was especially critical in his book where he described “Bitteres zu sagen” along with other Daumer texts as being “a poor response, on the part both of composer and translator, to Persia’s great poet, especially when compared to the *Hafiz Liebeslieder* ... by Szymanowski (which uses Bethge’s superior German translations).”¹⁰ Considering that Daumer’s poems were *inspired by* Hafiz rather than actual translations of Hafiz, the latter critique is perhaps too strong. Also, Szymanowski, a Polish composer strongly influenced by Middle Eastern and Oriental subjects, purposely implemented obvious exotic markers in many of his works, including his *Hafiz*

⁹ Lucien Stark, *A Guide to the Solo Songs of Johannes Brahms* (Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press, 1995), 70; A. Craig Bell, *Brahms: The Vocal Music* (London: Associated University Press, 1996), 55.

¹⁰ Max Harrison, *The Lieder of Brahms* (New York: Praeger Publishers, 1972), 2.

Liebeslieder.¹¹ The non-German composers of *Lieder* typically did not restrict themselves to subtle uses of exotic indications. In contrast, the exotic markers in Brahms’s setting are almost purely extra-musical—they exist more within the text-music relations rather than in the exotic sounds of the music itself, a characteristic that previous scholars have overlooked.

The main subject of “Bitteres zu sagen” is the narrator’s attempt to placate an angry lover, but it also connects to thematic material in Hafiz’s poetry. The narrator (of an unknown gender) optimistically endures the anger of another person, a theme that occurs quite often in Hafiz’s *ghazals*.

Bitteres zu sagen denkst du;	You are thinking of something bitter to say
Aber nun und nimmer kränkst du,	But now nor ever might you cause offense
Ob du noch so böse bist.	Although you are so angry.
Deine herbe Redetaten	Your harsh words
Scheitern an korallner Klippe,	Founder on coral cliffs
Werden all zu reinen Gnaden,	But become pure grace.
Denn sie müssen, um zu schaden,	For they must, in order to cause shame,
Schiffen über eine Lippe,	Sail over a pair of lips
Die die Süsse selber ist.	Which is Sweetness itself.

As Momand has explained, Daumer’s poem shares with Hafiz a religious aspect. Instead of feeling hurt by the other person (usually referred to as the “beloved,” also a metaphor for God, in *ghazal* poetry), the narrator focuses more on the positive aspects of the behavior. Specifically, the notion that such hateful words must pass over lips that are “Sweetness itself” corresponds to the Sufi (a mystical branch of Islam) ideology that one must be willing to embrace pain as something pleasant.¹² Daumer’s use of “sweet lips” also connects to Hafiz in another, more personal way. Actually, Hafiz’s nickname was “sugar lips,” because his poetry often contained sentimental expressions. Additionally, it was quite common for a *ghazal* poet to include his or her name in the final couplet of the poem, and Momand showed that “sweet lips” occurs in a number of Hafiz’s *ghazals*, which is no surprise given his nickname. Interestingly, this possible play on words which occurs at the end of “Bitteres

¹¹ Alistair Wightman, *Karol Szymanowski: His Life and Work* (Burlington, VT: Ashgate Publishing Company, 1999).

¹² Momand, 63.

zu sagen” can also suggest that Daumer might have been naming himself—he was introduced to Brahms as “the German Hafiz.”¹³

Brahms appears to have picked up on the religious undertones of the text. His setting of “Bitteres zu sagen” contains an ecclesiastical tone, but the connection between the song and the religious undertones of Daumer’s “ghazal” has been overlooked likely because without knowledge of Hafiz’s themes emerging in Daumer’s poem, this text does not appear in any way religious. Musically, the setting evokes the style of a hymn or Lutheran chorale rather than a Persian or other non-European musical tradition. The accompaniment is predominately chorale-like in that the treble of the accompaniment consistently doubles the melodic line of the vocal part, and it moves in a three-part voicing, much like the upper three voices move in a hymn. The piece concludes with a plagal (or “amen”) cadence.

“So stehn wir, ich und meine Weide,” the eighth song in the Opus 32 *Lieder*, has by far been the most widely criticized, disliked song in the entire collection. At a surface level, the text and music seem incongruous, yet examining both the exotic nature of the text and Brahms’s intricate word painting reveals that the musical setting is, in fact, highly refined and representative of the poem’s meaning. In his book on Brahms’s vocal music, A. Craig Bell delivered a harsh critique, both of the poem and the music. Regarding the poem, he stated:

[“So stehn wir”] is the one comparatively ineffective and disappointing song of the set—a fact due, I am convinced, to the poem, which is so inapt in the context of the rest, so intransigent and discrepant, that one wonders why Brahms ever chose to set it. In a mood supposedly caustic and ironic, the poem, in feminine rhymes, declaims against the discord between “him” and “her,” their altercations, and his inability to please her however much he tries.¹⁴

Bell has overlooked an important element of the poem—a connection to the exotic Hafiz. Daumer modeled this poem after a Persian *ghazal*, so Bell’s comparison of the “So stehn wir” text to

¹³ Harrison, 57.

¹⁴ Bell, 55-6.

other texts in Opus 32, the majority of which are neither Hafiz-inspired nor *ghazal* emulations, makes little sense. The fact that this text seems out of place from the rest of the Opus 32 songs is irrelevant since this collection is not a song cycle and therefore not bound to cyclical unity. Many scholars have done this, though, since this collection has been understood as an autobiographical composition.

In order to best interpret the setting, it is better to first compare Daumer's text to the source of inspiration—Hafiz. Daumer's text does convey much of what Bell criticized, particularly the discord between the lovers and the inability of one lover to please the other, a common theme in Hafiz's poetry.

So Stehn wir, ich und meine Weide So leider mit einander beide.	So we stand, I and my mistress. So sad with one another.
Nie kann ich ihr was tun zu Liebe, Nie kann sie mir was tun zu Leide.	Never can I do anything to please her. Never can she do anything to pain me.
Sie kränket es, wenn ich die Stirn ihr Mit einem Diadem bekleide;	It hurts her feelings when upon her brow I adorn her with a crown;
Ich danke selbst wie für ein Lächeln Der Huld, für ihre Zornbescheide.	I myself am thankful as much for a smile Of favor as for a furious reply. ¹⁵

Momand observed that, though Daumer's text certainly was not a translation of Hafiz, the thematic element of two lovers' contradicting behaviors is strikingly similar to Hafiz's 169th *ghazal*, particularly the first few couplets. Their actions are not identical to those of the subjects in Daumer's text, but they do show that when one person does one thing, the other person does the opposite:¹⁶

If after Him, I go, He up stirreth calamity (saying wherefore comes thou after me):
And if I sit (abstaining) from search, in wrath, He ariseth.

And, if, through desire, a moment on a highway,
I fall, like the dust at his foot, like the (swift) wind, He fleeth.

And, if I desire (only) half a kiss, a hundred reproaches,

¹⁵ Translation by Momand.

¹⁶ Momand, 71.

Like sugar, from the small round box of his (small) mouth, He outpoureth.

The acclivity and declivity of love's desert is calamity's snare:
A lion-hearted one is where, who not calamity shunneth?

That deceit, that I behold in thy eye,
Many a reputation (it is) that, even with the dust of the path, it spillesh.

When I speak to him, saying: "Wherefore consortest thou with (other) persons?"
So, He doth that, with blood, my tears, He mixeth.

Ask thou for (long) life and a great patience; (because then thou wilt see) that the sphere,
 sorcery-practising,
A thousand tricks more strange than this evoketh.

Hafiz! place thy head on the threshold of submission:
For if thou make contention, with thee, Time contendeth.¹⁷

The most obvious difference between Daumer's poem and Hafiz's *ghazal* is the gender of the speaker's subject: whereas Daumer's subject is female, Hafiz's is male.¹⁸ Momand noted that Daumer's "difference in gender does not bear significant enough weight to change the similarity in thought between the two poems."¹⁹ While this statement bears some truth in that the gender does not change the nature of the contradictory behaviors, but the gender swap does identify the female as the highly irrational character rather than the male. In contrast to Hafiz's *ghazal* in which the speaker submits (referring back to the Sufi concept of "pain with pleasure"), Daumer emphasizes the irrationality through concluding with a feeling of resignation rather than submission. Interestingly, Brahms appears to have interpreted the tone of the text in a similar way considering that he repeated the first couplet of text ("So we stand, I and my mistress, so sad with one another"), ending the piece with a sadness not present in Hafiz's *ghazal*.

¹⁷ Mohammed Shams od-Din-î-Hafiz î Shiraz, *The Divan-I-Hafiz*, translated by H. Wilberforce Clarke (London: The Octagon Press LTD, 1974), 324-5.

¹⁸ In the Persian *ghazal* tradition, gender was seldom an issue, meaning that the poems were not predominately focused on the male or female. Some *ghazals* were even directed to a same-sex subject.

¹⁹ Momand, 72.

Considering that female irrationality was a common trope of exoticism in Western music as well as in nineteenth century German music and literature in general, the female subject in “So stehn wir” can be interpreted as both an “Exotic Other” and a reflection of nineteenth century gender expectations.²⁰ Daumer, however, did create an image of an irrational subject, which Brahms supported. Brahms emphasized the irrational and contradictory behaviors reflected in the text, most prominently through rhythmic contradiction and instability in his musical setting. Some scholars have criticized this instability of the entire piece, even stating that Brahms “largely ignores the poem’s irony,” but in fact, the two-against-three pattern and offbeat entrances actually brings out the subjects’ conflict in the text.²¹ For example, the opening “So stehn wir” is the most unstable line of the entire piece, so Brahms immediately depicted the clashing lovers. The song begins with a pickup measure and equal note values (half notes) are given to the opening three words. The declamatory nature of this opening statement, however, is undermined by the rhythmic instability in the accompaniment. The treble of the piano offsets the voice with an upbeat triplet entrance, giving this part of the accompaniment a triple meter feel against the voice’s duple meter. The bass then enters on the upbeat of the first full measure in a duple meter, two full beats after the voice entrance. So, three contrasting layers exist from the beginning of the song—the duple meter vocal line, the triple meter treble voice of the accompaniment, and the offbeat, duple meter bass, all of which musically reflect the conflict within Daumer’s text.

²⁰ Locke, 82.

²¹ Stark, 72.

Figure 1. “So stehn wir,” mm. 1-4. Rhythmic instability between the three voices.

Brahms also brought out the subjects' conflict through irregular melodic phrasing. In many of Brahms's *Lieder*, the phrase structure commonly matches the poetic format, but in “So stehn wir,” he departed from Daumer's “ghazal” structure. Though the rhyme scheme of the text deviates from the typical rhyme scheme in a *ghazal*, Daumer basically upheld the couplet format and maintained an evenness which is not expressed musically. Instead, the musical setting depicts the irrational behavior of the subject through its unpredictable phrasing. The first and second couplets contain unexpected musical interruptions in their lines, likely adhering to Daumer's sentence structure which ends with a punctuation, but the evenness of the couplets are disrupted by the inconsistent phrasing. For example, within the second couplet, the first line (“Nie kann ich ihr was tun zu Liebe”) occurs in three measures whereas the second line's (“Nie kann si mir was tun zu Leide”) melody is stretched over four measures, plus a downbeat. The second couplet, moreover, is musically the longest in the song. The remaining two couplets do receive equal phrasing, but what makes them seem irregular is their brevity. Each couplet contains six measures of melodic material rather than each line having an individual melodic phrase. This brevity, when coupled with harmonic dissonances, creates a sense of frustration, further bringing out the conflict within the text.

Brahms's linguistic stresses also represent the irrationality and conflict within “So stehn wir,” in that they conflict with the stresses in Daumer's poem, which is set in iambic pentameter (a series

of five iambic feet—unstressed syllable, stressed syllable). The musical setting is undeniably lyrical, which is somewhat strange considering that one might expect a more aggressive song given the nature of the text. Here, though, Brahms again (whether intentionally or coincidentally) seems to be embracing the Sufi concept of willingness to accept pain as pleasure by avoiding aggressive rhythms, disjunct melodic lines, or jarring harmonies. Instead, he brought out the conflict between the two subjects by rejecting Daumer's stress patterns and creating conflict between the voice and the accompaniment.

With the "Exotic Only" viewpoint, the slight conflict between poet and composer seems like an act of carelessness on Brahms's part. The more broad view, however, shows that Brahms's word stresses sound much more speech-like than Daumer's. As mentioned, Daumer's poem is in iambic pentameter, but rather than beginning with the unstressed syllable, Brahms contradicted Daumer's pattern and began with three stresses which in turn makes the statement more declamatory and somewhat aggressive, thus rejecting the idea of submission. For example, he achieves this at the beginning by placing the opening "So stehn wir" on a succession of three half notes that all occur on downbeats. Though there are other strong statements throughout the song, no other words in the piece are as declamatory as this phrase, emphasizing that the two lovers are at a standstill. The opening is also more harmonically grounded than any of the other sentences in the poem in that it outlines the tonic chord of F minor. Rather than being strange, as some scholars have suggested, it is actually crafty text painting—the grounding of this phrase in the tonic harmony adds weight the strong, declamatory statement. Brahms continued a similar pattern throughout the rest of the song, beginning each sentence with a stressed syllable rather than the unstressed syllable in Daumer's iambic meter, again creating a more naturally speech-like but aggressive setting.

Figure 2. Syllabic stresses in Daumer's original poem and Brahms's musical setting.

Daumer	Brahms
1. ∪ / ∪ / ∪ / ∪ / ∪ So Stehn wir, ich und meine Weide	/ / / / ∪ / ∪ / ∪ So Stehn wir, ich und meine Weide
2. ∪ / ∪ / ∪ / ∪ / ∪ So leider mit einander beide.	/ / ∪ / ∪ / ∪ / ∪ So leider mit einander beide.
3. ∪ / ∪ / ∪ / ∪ / ∪ Nie kann ich ihr was tun zu Liebe,	/ / ∪ / ∪ / ∪ / ∪ Nie kann ich ihr was tun zu Liebe,
4. ∪ / ∪ / ∪ / ∪ / ∪ Nie kann sie mir was tun zu Leide.	/ / ∪ / ∪ / ∪ / ∪ Nie kann sie mir was tun zu Leide.
5. ∪ / ∪ / ∪ / ∪ / / Sie kränket es, wenn ich die Stirn ihr	/ / ∪ / ∪ / ∪ / / Sie kränket es, wenn ich die Stirn ihr
6. ∪ / ∪ / ∪ / ∪ / ∪ Mit einem Diadem bekleide;	∪ / ∪ / ∪ / ∪ / ∪ Mit einem Diadem bekleide;
7. ∪ / ∪ / ∪ / ∪ / ∪ Ich danke selbst wie für ein Lächeln	/ / ∪ / ∪ / ∪ / ∪ Ich danke selbst wie für ein Lächeln
8. ∪ / ∪ / ∪ / ∪ / ∪ Der Huld, für ihre Zornbescheide.	∪ / / ∪ / ∪ / ∪ Der Huld, für ihre Zornbescheide.

In addition to the word stresses in “So stehn wir,” Brahms implemented another metric element which disrupts the iambic meter of Daumer’s text, further suggesting irrationality. Brahms adheres to Daumer’s meter in line eight, beginning on an unstressed syllable, but after the first iambic foot, he inserted a musical version of the dactyl (stressed-unstressed-unstressed) within a quarter-note triplet on the second beat of measure 28. Interestingly, it occurs on the final line of text, specifically the word “ihre” (“her”), and can be interpreted stressing the female subject’s irrationality more than the speaker’s.

Figure 3. Mm. 28-31. Musical representation of the dactyl. The stress naturally falls on “für,” leaving “ihre” as unstressed upbeats.

Figure 4. “So stehn wir,” mm. 1-4. Rhythmic instability between the three voices.

In “Bitteres zu sagen” and “So stehn wir,” the exotic qualities within the text and music extremely subtle. In the final song of Opus 32, “Wie bist du, meine Königin,” however, Brahms became more obviously exotic. “Wie bist du” is arguably one of Brahms’s most beautiful songs and certainly one of the most popular of his *Lieder*. According to Bell, “the reason for this favoritism is clear, namely, the sheer appeal of its melody.”²² He even goes so far as to say that “[d]etailed comment or analysis is surely unnecessary: the song has sung itself into the world’s heart as one of the greatest love songs.” This setting though, like so many of Brahms’s songs, does not go without conflicting viewpoints. Hancock acknowledged that “Wie bist du” is “almost equally notorious for its faulty declamation.”²³ Most notably, many scholars take issue with the equal stress on the opening

²² Bell, 56.

²³ Hancock, 158.

words “Wie bist du,” claiming some sort of syntactical error or misplaced language stress. Bell dismissed it as an example of “carelessness” that was, for Brahms, an exception rather than how he typically set texts.²⁴

The stresses on the opening phrase, however, reveal an emphasis on the text’s subject rather than a senseless musical choice. The speaker of the poem is clearly fixated on a woman—her smile, her ability to bring life into the speaker, and the constant effect of bliss.

Wie bist du, meine Königin
Durch sanfte Güte wonnevoll!
Du lächle nur Lenzdüfte weh’n
Durch mein Gemüte, wonnevoll!

How are you, my Queen
Through gentle goodness, blissful!
You merely smile, and spring fragrance wafts
Though my spirit, blissfully!

Frisch aufgeblühter Rosen Glanz,
Vergleich ich ihn dem deinigen?
Ach, über alles, was da blüht
Ist deine Blüte wonnevoll!

The radiance of freshly blooming Roses.
Shall I compare it to yours?
Ah, over everything that blooms there
Is your bloom blissful!

Durch tote Wüsten wandle hin
Und grüne Schatten breiten sich.
Ob fürchterliche Schwüle dort
Ohn Ende brüte, wonnevoll!

Wander through dead wastelands
And green shadows spread.
Even if fearful oppressiveness
Broods there without end, blissfully!

Lass mich vergehn in deinem Arm!
Est ist in ihm ja selbst der Tod.
Ob auch die herbste Todesqual
Die Brust durchwüte, wonnevoll!

Let me vanish in your arms!
It is in them that death itself.
Even if also the sharpest pain
Rages in my breast, blissful!

Brahms set the opening words “Wie bist du” to equal note values, thus changing the linguistic stress from Daumer’s iambic text. Scholars have argued that this is contrary to the natural speech pattern of the German language, but given that these are one-syllable words, Brahms’s setting actually sounds more speech-like than if the poem were spoken in the iambic meter—“wie bist du” would be unstressed, stressed, and unstressed if he had adhered strictly to Daumer’s poetic meter. But by placing equal weight on each word and creating a very direct statement, the focus is immediately placed on the woman, as the narrator is speaking directly to her. Furthermore, he

²⁴ Bell, 56-7.

consistently altered the stresses at the beginning of Daumer's lines which emphasizes important phrases, such as the "freshly blooming" roses (a popular theme in Hafiz's poetry), that are connected to the subject.²⁵ Without considering the extra-musical qualities, this exotic theme can easily be overlooked.

Whereas in the earlier songs Brahms decided to emphasize the ideas of primitivism, aggression, and irrationality, in "Wie bist du," he stressed the images of excess and sensuality. In *Musical Exoticism*, Locke briefly mentioned Brahms's setting of "Wie bist du." He recognized that the excessive repetition of the word "wonnevoll" (blissful), coupled with being "reinforced by the Eastern origin of the poem's form, must have evoked for many of Brahms's listeners the image of the Middle East as a space of limitless pleasure."²⁶ But "wonnevoll" is already repetitive in Daumer's poem—it concludes each of the four quatrains of text. Brahms repeats it even more in his modified strophic setting, adding dramatic pauses, which further brings out the text's sensuality. Sams argued that the "pauses and repetitions may tend to obscure the verse-form, and even the meaning," but in fact, Brahms's setting enhances the meaning rather than obscuring it.²⁷

²⁵ Momand, 60.

²⁶ Locke, 135.

²⁷ Eric Sams, *The Songs of Johannes Brahms* (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 2000), 89.

Figure 5. Daumer's and Brahms's stresses.

Daumer	Brahms
1. Wie bist du, meine Königin	*Wie bist du, meine Königin
2. Durch sanfte Güte wonnevoll	Durch sanfte Güte wonnevoll
3. Du lächle nur Lenzdüfte weh'n	*Du lächle nur Lenzdüfte weh'n
4. Durch mein Gemüte, wonnevoll!	Durch mein Gemüte, wonnevoll!
5. Frisch aufgeblühter Rosen Glanz,	*Frisch aufgeblühter Rosen Glanz,
6. Vergleich ich ihn dem deinigen?	Vergleich ich ihn dem deinigen?
7. Ach, über alles, was da blüht	*Ach, über alles, was da blüht
8. Ist deine Blüte wonnevoll!	Ist deine Blüte wonnevoll!
9. Durch tote Wüsten wandle hin	*Durch tote Wüsten wandle hin
10. Und grüne Schatten breiten sich.	*Und grüne Schatten breiten sich.
11. Ob fürchterliche Schwüle dort	*Ob fürchterliche Schwüle dort
12. Ohn Ende brüte, wonnevoll!	Ohn Ende brüte, wonnevoll!
13. Lass mich vergehn in deinem Arm!	*Lass mich vergehn in deinem Arm!
14. Est ist in ihm ja selbst der Tod.	*Est ist in ihm ja selbst der Tod.
15. Ob auch die herbste Todesqual	*Ob auch die herbste Todesqual
16. Die Brust durchwüte, wonnevoll!	Die Brust durchwüte, wonnevoll!

Brahms also effectively emphasized the sensuality of the text by creating a tense-and-release pattern in the two measures preceding “wonnevoll” in both the first and second quatrains. In measure 15, for example, the downbeat stresses a C in the voice against a D in the treble of the accompaniment and then resolves into the next measure on the tonic E-flat chord. Rather than moving stepwise, though, the D in the accompaniment leaps up a ninth, introducing the measure-

long “wonnevoll” melody in the piano before the voice enters on the word a measure later. This dramatic break in the text emulates the need for a deep breath before a release. After the vocal statement of “wonnevoll” in measure 17, Brahms repeated the word in the next measure, further emphasizing “bliss.”

Similarly, Brahms implemented a break in the text preceding “wonnevoll” in the third quatrain, but the music takes on a darker tone in order to reflect what happens in the text. To depict the wastelands, the key changes from E-flat major to E-flat minor by way of an abrupt common tone modulation. As the narrator speaks of green shadows spreading, the harmony lightens and moves back to E-flat major. After shifting through other keys (possibly depicting the “wandering”), the piece eventually reverts back to E-flat minor on the phrase “ohn Ende brüte” to represent endless oppression. During the break in text, the treble accompaniment plays a syncopated E-flat minor first inversion chord while the bass descends into the pedal tones. Suddenly, “wonnevoll” emerges in a range much higher than the accompaniment and in a major key that transitions back to E-flat major, which depicts the triumph of bliss over oppression. The accompaniment moves away from the low-range syncopations to a cascading effect that emerges from the voice. This sentimental expression with modulation causes the word “wonnevoll” to stand out even more from the previous two quatrains. Moreover, Brahms included an extra statement of “wonne” before the second complete repetition of the word adding even more emphasis to “bliss.”

Figure 6. Mm. 52-60.

dort ohn — En - de brü - te, won - ne -

voll, won - ne - won - ne - voll.

sf *dimin.* *dolce*

p *espress.*

J. B. 142

Brahms treated “wonnevoll” somewhat differently in the final quatrain of text, but the emphasis on “bliss” is equally effective. The most obvious difference in this quatrain is the absence of a measure long break in the text. Instead, the vocal line states the word in a relatively declamatory manner and then the piano echoes the statement. Like in the third quatrain, there is a repetition of the syllable “wonne” before the final repetition of the word, again reiterating bliss.

Figure 7. Mm. 71-81. No major pause before “wonnevoll.”

ob auch die herb - ste To - des - qual die Brust durch - wü - te, won - ne -
voll, won - ne - won - ne - voll! G.F. Daumer, nach Hafis

Examining the “ghazals” from the Opus 32 *Lieder* using Locke’s “Full Context” view shows how exotic these pieces truly are, even though at a surface level they sound much like a typical German *Lied*. The musical connection to Hafiz has been overlooked largely because the repetitive nature and rhyme scheme in *Lieder* parallels that of the *ghazals*. With the “Exotic Only” approach, the exotic markers are easily obscured, but with the more inclusive, alternative approach, one can more fully comprehend the nature of Brahms’s artistic choices that for so long had aroused conflicting, uninformed critiques.

CHAPTER II
A COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS OF BRAHMS'S EXOTIC WOMEN
IN ROMANZEN AUS L. TIECK'S MAGELONE, OP. 33

Brahms's cycle *Romanzen aus L. Tieck's Magelone*, Op. 33, a work based on texts from Ludwig Tieck's story *Wundersame Liebesgeschichte der schöne Magelone und des Grafen Peter aus der Provence*, is often used as an example of the composer's inability to set texts to music. Ernst Walker stated that "Tieck's sham medievalism often really gets in the way of our appreciation, and to some extent, I feel, in the way of the composer's musical inspiration."²⁸ In his book on Brahms's vocal music, A. Craig Bell described listening to the *Romanzen* as "an unrewarding task, leaving one with the impression that this is not the same composer who wrote the great songs we know" but provides no evidence to support his claim.²⁹ However, Brahms's attention to detail in his setting of Tieck's poetry shows exceptional ability to work with lesser known texts, especially in his depiction of the two female characters within the story: Magelone, an Italian Princess, and the exotic Sulima, daughter of a Moorish Sultan. Examining Brahms's differentiation of these two characters in a fuller context makes it possible to solve what Eric Sams refers to as "special problems of interpretation and appreciation."³⁰

Compared to the rest of his output, Brahms's Magelone *Romanzen* appear quite chaotic—the variation in compositional style and structure between the songs was a source of confusion for scholars throughout most of the twentieth century. John Daverio's contribution in *German Lieder of the Nineteenth Century* finally alluded to what had been a misunderstanding: while the *Romanzen* are stylistically convoluted, they musically reflect the style of the *Kunstmärchen* ("art fairy tale"), the literary genre of Tieck's story and which is also quite convoluted.³¹ As Tieck's story seemed to

²⁸ Ernest Walker, "Brahms as a Song-Writer," *The Musical Times* 74, no. 1083 (May, 1933): 407.

²⁹ Bell, 45.

³⁰ Sams, 91.

³¹ John Daverio, "The Song Cycle: Journeys Through a Romantic Landscape," in *German Lieder in the Nineteenth Century*, 2nd ed., edited by Rufus Hallmark (New York: Routledge, 2010): 380.

randomly transition to different settings of place and time, the songs in Brahms's cycle also shift structurally and metrically, varying from modified strophic to more aria-like forms (such as ABA).

Even with an understanding of the literary genre, however, certain parts of Brahms's song cycle still pose interpretive challenges. Most of the *Romanzen* cycle is sung from the perspective of Tieck's hero, Count Peter of Provence. Only three songs are sung from a different perspective: the opening song of the wandering minstrel whose song persuades Peter to travel abroad, the eleventh song in which Magelone yearns for Peter after he has been lost at sea, and the thirteenth song (entitled "Sulima") in which Sulima tries to seduce Peter. Especially Brahms's setting of "Sulima" has called forth harsh criticism against his ability to set texts. For example, in a stylistic study of the *Romanzen*, Russell Marshall criticized Brahms's "poor declamation" and considered "Sulima" to be the "least rewarding [song] of the cycle."³² Max Harrison noted that the "allegedly oriental accents" of Sulima's piece were "wholly unconvincing."³³ Other critics noted that this particular piece is distinctly different from the rest of the cycle but found it ineffective due to its relatively simplistic nature and Brahms's failure to evoke the exotic nature of Sulima.³⁴

The criticism of Brahms's representation of Sulima seems to have resulted from the critics' reliance upon the "Exotic Only" approach. At a surface level, Brahms's music does not sound explicitly exotic, because Sulima's song lacks obvious musical markers of exoticism, such as arabesque melodies, excessive ornamentations, or the stereotypical "sultry voice" often employed by female voices, particularly mezzo-sopranos.³⁵ Yet, Brahms's musical setting does reflect Sulima's exotic, non-European nature in a more subtle and intellectual manner. In this chapter, I analyze the text-to-music relationship and the programmatic elements in the *Romanzen* using Locke's alternative

³² Russell Joseph Marshall, "A Stylistic Study of the *Magelone Lieder* of Johannes Brahms" (master's thesis, University of Washington, 1955), 26, 55.

³³ Harrison, 2.

³⁴ Several analyses scantily address *Sulima*, often only briefly mentioning the programmatic content of Tieck's story and describing the form in a basic manner.

³⁵ Locke, 54.

and more inclusive approach and argue that Brahms presented Magelone as the superior, more refined “European Us” and her counterpart, Sulima, as the clearly exotic and inferior “Other.”³⁶

The “Full Context” view involves examining a variety of extramusical elements, such as the general features of a story on which a musical work is based, programmatic titles of that musical work, or even the composer’s performance indications.³⁷ All of these elements point to a more precise interpretation of “Sulima” in Brahms’s song cycle, though they have not been addressed in earlier scholarly literature. The two women’s pieces do not occur until the latter half of the song cycle. At this point in Tieck’s story, Magelone and Peter intend to elope, but their plans are thwarted by Peter’s misfortune. While resting during their travels, Peter admires Magelone in her sleep. A bird makes off with three rings that he had given her, and during his pursuit, he becomes lost at sea. Upon awakening, Magelone discovers that Peter is missing and feels anguish. Meanwhile, Sulima attempts to seduce Peter, with whom she has fallen in love and who is being held in the Sultan’s captivity. Sulima tries to coerce Peter into fleeing with her and pays no attention to his love for and loyalty to Magelone. The story already reflects the differences between the two women and also indicates the “self” versus “other” dichotomy—the pure, sentimental Magelone and the manipulative, sensual Sulima.

Numerous other aspects of the song cycle clearly point to Sulima as the threatening “other.” Sulima did not exist in the original medieval French story or its German translation upon which Tieck’s fairy tale was based, but Tieck created her for his version where she complicates the Peter-Magelone love story.³⁸ Brahms entitled her piece “Sulima,” the only song in the cycle that specifically

³⁶ As Sindhumathi Revuluri notes in her review of Locke’s book, it is important to provide a perspective regarding the question, “Who is ‘Us?’” She suggests that it should be reiterated that “Us” is very probably “an upper-class (if not aristocratic) western European audience.” One can assume that this is true of the Brahms *Romanzen*.

³⁷ Locke, 59-71.

³⁸ Margaret Gene Boyer, “A Study of Brahms’ Setting of the Poems from Tieck’s *Liebesgeschichte der schönen Magelone und des Grafen Peter von Provence*” (master’s thesis, Washington University, 1980), 12.

identifies a character. Sulima, described as famous for her beauty, is depicted as a disloyal, lustful seductress. Rather than remaining faithful to her father and her homeland, she is driven by her love and lust for Peter to completely abandon her duties. The depictions of Eastern female leaders as seductresses who choose sensual desires over their obligations to their country or their families were quite typical for European exotic works, particularly in operas from the Baroque period into the early twentieth century.³⁹

Magelone and Sulima are also substantially differentiated through the verbiage of their poems. The first and perhaps most obvious difference is Magelone's emotional appeal versus Sulima's physical appeal. Magelone's poem is focused on loss and anguish (as stated in the sixth stanza), which is expressed in various ways through nature-oriented metaphors that contain various depictions of vanishing light, a metaphor for her happiness. For example, the opening stanza that reads, "Wie schnell verschwindet so Licht als Glanz, der Morgen findet verwelkt den Kranz" ("How quickly light and radiance vanish, morning finds a withered garland") serves as a metaphor for Magelone's losing Peter as she slept and awakening alone. The poem contains several references to darkness overtaking: "denn er verblühte in dunkler Nacht" ("for it faded in the dark of night"), "der Schatten steigt und Dunkel zieht" ("the shadows advance and darkness closes in"), and "es löscht der Strahl" ("the glimmer is extinguished"). These images of light describe Magelone's growing sadness, hopelessness, and perhaps even shock at discovering that Peter has vanished without explanation.

The emotional appeal of "Wie schnell verschwindet" is further highlighted through the use of the pronouns "wir" and "uns" ("we" and "us") in the final two stanzas. These grammatical choices could refer to Peter and Magelone, but that makes little sense considering that Magelone believes herself to be abandoned and has no explanation as to why Peter vanished. In other words,

³⁹ Locke, 87-105.

she is not speaking directly to Peter, so the language is more emotionally appealing to readers since the emotional loss is spoken about in general terms rather than exclusively the loss of Magelone's relationship.

In contrast, "Sulima" is centered on a more physical appeal and sensual actions, and though the nature-oriented imagery is still present in this piece, it is used more directly and contains fewer metaphors than Magelone's. The imagery is filled with suggestive turns of phrase that reflect the seductive nature of Sulima. For example, the second stanza uses the terms "flüstern" (to whisper) and "schlüpfen" (to slip into) which sets up a seductive scene. The following stanza immediately shifts to actual physical sensations and, unlike Magelone's song, is directed to Peter: "Ach! Kennst du das Schmachten der klopfenden Brust?" ("Ah! Do you know the yearning of a throbbing breast?"). In this sense, various forms of the pronouns "you" and "me" shows that the focus is on Peter and Sulima's impatient, physical desire for him.

Perhaps the most significant linguistic detail that establishes Sulima as the "other" is the role of the nightingale in her song. This songbird is referenced frequently in German poetry, especially in the Romantic period, and usually represents something beautiful or is described as having a beautiful and alluring song. For example, during the same time Brahms composed the *Magelone* cycle, he also produced his Opus 46 Lieder that contained "An die Nachtigall" ("To the Nightingale") in which the nightingale awakens love in the main character through its enticing and skilled song. In Sulima's case, however, the nightingale does not sing of beauty or love; rather, it *chatters* of emotional and physical sensuality: "die Nachtigall plaudert von Sehnsucht und Kuss" ("the nightingale chatters of longing and kisses"). The replacement of the nightingale's song with chattering depicts Sulima as unskilled and somewhat silly.

Another series of poetic images that denotes Sulima as fundamentally different from the European "Us" is her attitude towards the night. Magelone viewed the nighttime as negative, as a

source of darkness, as a point of disappearance of love and life. For Sulima, the night time is seductive, and it provides the opportunity to flee with Peter in secrecy. In the statement “Bei nächtlicher Weile entfliehn wir von hier” (“while it is night, let us flee from here”), she specifically urges that they escape during the night so as not to alert anyone of her intentions. Brahms further emphasized this by providing a performance instruction of “Zart, heimlich” (or “tender, secret”) that alludes to Sulima’s devious and sensual intentions before the music even begins. The corporeality of her language, the unorthodox use of the nightingale, and her fascination with the night clearly mark Sulima as different from the elevated Magelone, as the distinctly non-European “Other.”

Musical analysis of these two pieces reveals that Brahms picked up on the exotic subtleties within the plot and poetry. Each poem contains several quatrains of text, and though the length of each poem is similar, both pieces are structurally quite different. Brahms mirrored the textual structures and emotional content with his musical forms. He especially emphasized these elements through his approaches to text painting and emulation of Tieck’s setting, which highlights the refinement of Magelone and the exotic crudeness of Sulima.

Though several scholars disagree about the form of Magelone’s song, an examination of the relationship between Tieck’s poetic structure and Brahms’s harmonic setting points to an ABA’ form. Magelone’s poem is composed of seven stanzas of text divided as such:

A	Wie schnell verschwindet So Licht als Glanz, Der Morgen findet Verwelkt den Kranz,	How quickly vanishes light and radiance, morning finds wilted the wreath,
	Der gestern glühte In aller Pracht, Denn er verblühte In dunkler Nacht.	which yesterday glowed in all its splendor, for it wilted in the dark of night.
	Es schwimmt die Welle Des Lebens hin, Und färbt sich helle, } Hat's nicht Gewinn; } 2x	Swims the wave of life onward, colored brightly but with no quickening;
B	Die Sonne neiget, Die Röte flieht, Der Schatten steigt Und Dunkel zieht:	The sun sinks, the redness flees, the shadows rise and darkness moves:
A'	So schwimmt die Liebe Zu Wüsten ab, Ach! Dass sie bliebe Bis an das Grab!	So swims love into the deserts, Ah! That it might stay until the grave!
	Doch wir erwachen Zu tiefer Quall: Es bricht der Nachen, Es löscht der Strahl,	But we awaken to deep anguish: the boat breaks, the glimmer is extinguished,
	Vom schönen Lande Weit weggebracht Zum öden Strande } Wo um uns Nacht. } 2x	from the beautiful land far away stranded on the shore where night surrounds us.

The first A section consists of three stanzas of text that concludes with a textual repetition at the end of the third stanza. In comparison to “Sulima,” the sentences in Magelone’s text are much longer and often stretch over multiple stanzas thus providing a continuous thought flow. The musical setting reflects this in that the vocal line contains continuous phrasing. Also, the alternating emotions are reflected through distinct harmonic shifts. For instance, the harmony suddenly shifts to a borrowed V chord (C major) in measure 16 on “Kranz” (“wreath”), the final word of the first stanza, which immediately transitions to the next stanza that reads, “Der gestern glühte in aller

Pracht” (“which yesterday shone in all its splendor”). This line refers to the wreath, and a series of major chords emphasizes the “splendor” in measures 17 through 20 which is musically connected to the C major chord of the previous stanza. During the next line, “denn er verblühte in dunkler Nacht” (“for it faded in the dark of night”), the harmony shifts back to minor chords, beginning on the word “verblühte” (“faded”) on the downbeat of measure 22. This depicts the fading into night and begins the transition into the third stanza, which again contains more negative connotations. The repetition of the final phrase “und färbt sich helle, hat’s nicht Gewinn” (“and colored brightly but with no gain”) alludes to hopelessness of Magelone’s situation and along with the following interlude, concludes the first A section.

Figure 8. Harmonic connection between the first and second stanzas, mm. 13-18.

The musical score for Figure 8 consists of a vocal line and piano accompaniment. The key signature is F minor (three flats) and the time signature is 4/4. The lyrics are: "Mor - gen fin - det ver - welkt - den Kranz, der ge - stern glüh - te in". The piano part includes a dynamic marking 'p' (piano) in measure 15. The score shows the harmonic connection between the first and second stanzas, measures 13-18.

The brevity of the B section has for some scholars been a source of confusion pertaining to the form of this piece, but Brahms, who had strong knowledge of poetry, conveyed the shift in tone through a very distinct modulation.⁴⁰ In measure 43, the key shifts from F minor to F major via a common tone modulation. This musically depicts the shift in tone of the text in which the statements become shorter, more direct phrases: “Die Sonne neiget” (“the sun sinks”), “die Röte flieht” (“the red recedes”), and so on. Brahms immediately reflected the sun sinking with a descending vocal line that spans a ninth. In measures 44 to 45 when the text refers to the receding red, the tessitura is much lower than the rest of the piece which audibly depicts the receding of the

⁴⁰ Bozarth, 11.

vocal line, thus further enhancing the text through crafty word painting. The second half of the B section quatrain, “der Schatten steigt und Dunkel zieht” (“the shadows advance and darkness closes in”), also emulates the sinking of the sun and advancing darkness. The melodic line is constructed almost identically to the previous phrase, only it is one half-step lower until the words “und Dunkel zieht” in measures 50 to 52, and the key has again modulated, this time from F major to the lower key of Db major. In doing so, Brahms both emulated the sinking of the sun (the descending line) as well as the advancing shadows and enclosing darkness (the ending on Db rather than C). The following interlude continues this thought of advancing darkness by transitioning back to the key of F minor.

Figure 9. Sequenced phrase in the B section that depicts the shadows and darkness, mm. 49-54.

The tone of text and Brahms’s musical representation in the B section foreshadow the tone of the final A section in which Magelone has completely resigned herself to the loss of her love. The A’ section begins in measure 59 and contains a mixture of both the more passive sentences from the A section stanzas and the urgency of the B section stanza. Brahms reflected this by maintaining the continuous textual phrasing as in the first A section, but he created urgency by implementing a cascading sixteenth note pattern in the accompaniment. Not only does this generate more forward motion, but it also connects to one of the previous pieces in the song cycle. Here, the text reads, “So schwimmt die Liebe zu Wüsten ab” (“the love swims away into the wastelands”). A similar pattern is present in one of Peter’s pieces (“Verzweiflung,” or “Despair”) whenever he becomes lost at sea.

The sixteenth note pattern serves as a connection, a musical representation of the waves, between Peter and Magelone.

In the sixth stanza of text (measures 66 to 74), that refers to the awakening of anguish, the musical depiction highlights the tone of the text. The tessitura is much higher than the rest of the piece, set in a hefty part of the baritone voice for which this song cycle was composed, which creates tension and allows for a more powerful sound to illuminate Magelone's anguish. To reflect the extinguishing of the glimmer ("es löscht der Strahl," referring to light), the vocal line leaps back and forth, as if flickering, before finally descending to the tonic F. As in the A section, the A' section is concluded by the repetition of the final two lines of text followed by a postlude that restates the vocal line.

Figure 10. Excerpt of the cascading effect in the A' section, mm. 61-65.



The image shows a musical score excerpt for Figure 10. It consists of two staves: a vocal line (treble clef) and a piano accompaniment (grand staff). The vocal line is in a high tessitura, with notes ranging from G4 to D5. The piano accompaniment features a cascading sixteenth-note pattern in the right hand, with a bass line in the left hand. The lyrics are: "Wü - sten ab, ach, daß sie blie - be bis an das".

In contrast, *Sulima's* structural simplicity separates Sulima's character from the other characters within the cycle, and the song appears less refined than the others due to the excessive repetitions and lack of attention to specific expressions of text painting as in Magelone's piece. Through the "Exotic Style" lens, this appears to be some sort of compositional negligence since "Sulima" is so drastically different from the rest of the song cycle; however, approaching it through the "Full Context" lens allows for a more comprehensive and accurate understanding of Brahms's depiction of "Sulima."

The poem for “Sulima” contains eight stanzas of text which are musically set in a compound binary form (ABAB’), a structure more simple and unlike any other song form in the cycle. It also contains multiple repetitions that accentuate the more physical phrases of text and appear excessive especially in comparison to Magelone:

A	<p> Geliebter, wo zaudert Dein irrendur Fuss? Die Nachtigall plaudert Von Sehnsucht und Kuss. (2x) </p> <p> Es flüstern die Bäume Im goldenen Schein, Es schlüpfen mir Träume Zum Fenster herein. (2x) </p>	<p> Beloved, where wanders your hesitant foot? The nightingale chatters of longing and kisses. </p> <p> Whisper the trees in the golden light, dreams slip into my window. </p>
B	<p> Ach! Kennst du das Schmachten Der klopfenden Brust? Dies Sinnen und Trachten Voll Qual und voll Lust. </p> <p> Beflüge die Eile Und rette mich dir, Bei nächtlicher Weile Enfliehn wir von hier. } 2x </p>	<p> Ah, know you the yearning of a pounding breast? This thoughtful reflection full of torment and desire. </p> <p> Make haste and save me for you, while it is night let us flee from here. </p>
A	<p> Die Segel sie schwellen, Die Furcht ist nur Tand: Dort, jenseit er Wellen Ist väterlich Land. (2x) </p> <p> Die Heimat enfliehet, So fahre sie hin! Die Liebe sie ziehet Gewaltig den Sinn. (2x) </p>	<p> The sails swell, fear is only a trifle there beyond the waves is your fatherland. </p> <p> My homeland recedes, let it go! Love holds powerful sway over our senses. </p>
B’	<p> Horch! Wollustig klingen Die Wellen im Meer Sie hüpfen und springen Mutwillig einher, </p> <p> Und sollten sie klagen? Sie rufen nach dir! Sie wissen, sie tragen Die Liebe von hier. } 2x </p>	<p> Listen! Lustfully sound the waves of the sea they gambol and leap mischievously, </p> <p> and should they cry out? They call to you! They know that they carry love away from here. </p>

Brahms's choice of musical structure poses a major challenge regarding text painting in that it is difficult to specifically express the individual thoughts within each quatrain of text when the harmonies are restricted by the binary form. Additionally, Sulima's thoughts and text flow are much more erratic than Magelone's, which creates even more complication in expressing the meaning of the text. The stanzas constantly alternate between sensual imagery and Sulima's impatience regarding her desire to flee with Peter. The limitations of the binary form and the constant thought shifts allowed Brahms to utilize a different approach to text painting in order to convey Sulima's character.

Rather than assigning specific musical ideas for each line of text or each image, Brahms generated an overall feeling of anticipation and excitement through his use of meter, style, and repetition. Sulima's 2/4 meter song metrically stands out from Magelone's and the other songs in the cycle, thus again distinguishing her as an outsider. Locke associates the triple meter (as in Magelone's song) with more sophisticated music but describes the use of duple meter, specifically 2/4 with strong downbeats such as those found in "Sulima," as an exotic indicator.⁴¹ Eight of the fifteen songs in Brahms's cycle are in a triple meter. Of the remaining songs, five are 4/4 meter and two are in 2/4 meter, including Sulima's song. Brahms appears to have "Europeanized" all of the duple-meter songs except Sulima's: the common time pieces and the other 2/4 piece include several harmonic and metric shifts as well as triplet patterns that evoke a triple meter rather than the indicated duple meter. Furthermore, the prelude of "Sulima" begins unusually (on an offbeat), which makes the meter difficult to discern until the voice enters and creates a feeling of instability.

Once the meter is established, the style of the piece is easily distinguishable as a march. This style, with its quick tempo and strong downbeats, musically reflects the anticipation that Sulima feels while waiting for Peter. For example, the phrase "Ach! Kennst du das Schmachten der klopfenden Brust?" ("Ah! Do you know the yearning of a throbbing breast?") is reflected in the march style and

⁴¹ Locke, 118-19.

permeates the piece: the downbeats effectively depict the pounding of Sulima’s heart while the upbeat tempo generates excitement. These elements are perpetuated and developed in each section through musical and textual repetitions, traits that appear to be excessive, especially in comparison to “Wie schnell verschwindet.”

Figure 11. Unstable beginning and eventual downbeat emphasis that audibly establishes meter, mm. 1-9.



The A sections are musically identical, but each musical phrase is shared amongst four quatrains of text—half of the poem. Because the stanzas are confined within the boundaries of the harmonic structure, effective text painting is achieved in part by repetitions of phrases that emphasize the sensual desires of Sulima’s character. For example, two repetitions from the first in particular stand out: “von Sehnsucht und Kuss” (“of longing and kisses”) in measures 19 to 22 of the first A section and “gewaltig den Sinn” (referring to love’s powerful “pull over the senses”) in measures 66 to 69 of the second A section. Though each stanza reflects a different thought, there exists an interesting harmonic idea that further illuminates the stress on sensuality. The words “Sehnsucht” (“longing”) and “gewaltig” (“powerful”) fall on the same chords in their respective

stanzas, and when they are repeated, these words are emphasized by a borrowed minor iv chord (A minor in second inversion) in which the vocal line rests on the altered pitch of C natural, thus creating tension in the phrase before finally resolving to the tonic E major chord.

Figure 12. Repetition of “von Sehnsucht und Kuss,” mm. 19-23.

The musical score for measures 19-23 is in E major (one sharp) and 3/4 time. It consists of a vocal line and piano accompaniment. The lyrics are: "Kuß, von Sehnsucht und Kuß. ein, zum Fenster herein." The piano part features a complex harmonic structure with a prominent chromatic sequence in the bass line. Dynamics include piano (p) and a crescendo leading to a fortissimo (f) section.

The B sections also contain repetitions that have a significant purpose in that they again highlight the nature of Sulima’s character, particularly in the first one. The repetition of “bei nächtlicher Weile entfliehn wir von hier” (“while it is night let us flee from here”) in measures 42 to 47 emphasizes Sulima’s attitude towards the night (her opportunity to flee). The harmonic structure of this section also exaggerates her anticipation. The melodic contour alternates between ascending and descending leaps, but it consistently and chromatically increases. For example, the third stanza of text contains a chromatic musical sequence. However, in the second couplet, “Dies Sinnen und Trachten voll Qual und voll Lust” (“this thoughtful reflection of torment and joy”), the bass in the accompaniment remains the same rather than shifting harmonies which in turn creates a tension that depicts the conflict between “Qual” and “Lust.” These musical and textual repetitions accentuate the linguistically pre-determined differences between the two women and, in conjunction with the metrical and stylistic qualities, depict Sulima as more primitive, aggressive, and more carnal than Magelone.

This primitivism which implies a lack of nuance has led many scholars to believe that Brahms did not know what to do with this text or character.⁴² If that were the case, he could have easily eliminated this piece without disrupting the flow of the story for the purposes of creating a song cycle; without program notes or research prior to hearing the work, a non-German audience would likely have no clue that this work is a musical representation of Tieck's Magelone story. However, it seems most logical that Brahms purposely isolated Sulima, considering that not only is Sulima's character radically different from the others within Tieck's story, but also because the musical setting of her piece is starkly contrasting to the others within Brahms's cycle.⁴³

Figure 13. Repetition of “bei nächtlicher Weile entfliehn wir von hier,” mm. 39-49.

The image displays two systems of musical notation for a vocal and piano setting. The top system (measures 39-49) features a vocal line with lyrics: "näch - li - cher Wei - le ent - fliehn wir von hier, bei nächt - li - cher". The piano accompaniment is marked "leggiero" and "cresc.". The bottom system (measures 50-59) features a vocal line with lyrics: "Wei - le ent - fliehn wir von hier.". The piano accompaniment is marked "f" and "p".

The rhythmic emphasis of textual meter in Brahms's setting also plays an important role in differentiating Magelone from Sulima in that it complements Magelone's text and works against

⁴² Several analyses failed to address the construction of *Sulima*, mentioning only that she was a “different” character in Tieck's story. Previous scholarship does not explain the text-music connection or structural simplicity.

⁴³ John Daverio, “Brahms's Magelone Romanzen and the ‘Romantic Imperative,’” *The Journal of Musicology*, 7, no. 3 (Summer, 1989): 346.

Sulima's. The dotted rhythms in Magelone's song, such as the entrance in the pickup to measure 9 when the text reads "Wie schnell verschwindet" ("How quickly disappears"), emphasize the natural syllabic stresses of the language through melodic contour and careful phrasing. The descending patterns make the entire piece sound like a series of heavy sighs, a motion that helps depict Magelone as the sentimental heroine. But in Sulima's piece, nearly every syllable sounds stressed due to Brahms's melodic contour and repetitive rhythmic pattern. Unlike the descending lines in Magelone's song, Sulima's contains several ascending lines. This motion generates much excitement and anticipation to reflect Sulima's impure intentions, especially in the B sections.

Certain parallels between "Sulima" and the rest of the cycle could potentially undermine the exotic interpretation of Sulima, specifically the fact that in Tieck's story, Magelone, who was betrothed to another man, fled with Peter and that Brahms implemented some textual repetition in the other songs in the cycle. However, much of the story builds up to the love that Magelone and Peter develop and it is presented more nobly than Sulima's desire for Peter, whose relationship in the story is undeveloped and quite random. Furthermore, Brahms treated the textual repetitions that exist in a few other songs of the *Magelone* cycle differently from what he did in "Sulima." They include more harmonic variation and more specific text painting (such as having an individual treatment of lines rather than the overall feel generated by a phrase as seen in Sulima's "pounding breast"). This more refined treatment in the other pieces alludes to the superiority of the European "us" over the exotic "other."

The differences between noble couples like Peter and Magelone and their exotic counterparts like Sulima are not uncommon in European exotic works. A similar situation occurred in Mozart's *Die Zauberflöte*, particularly with Monostatos's character whose second-act aria "Alles fühlt der Liebe Freuden" contains many striking similarities to "Sulima." Monostatos is frequently referred to as the "Moor." Driven by lust, he states that he will force himself upon Pamina, who is

sleeping while held in captivity, a situation similar to Peter's. Like Sulima's song, Monostatos's aria contains excessive textual and musical repetitions, particularly on the phrase "weil ein Schwarzer häßlich ist" ("because a black man is ugly"). Though Monostatos is already depicted in a negative manner, the repetition of this line especially sets him apart from the rest of the characters and designates him as inherently different and even unacceptable due to his skin color. Heavy syllabic stresses that make the German language sound very harsh are also present in the aria, and a very rushed, almost manic tempo in the same 2/4 meter seen in "Sulima" creates a similar sense of urgency and impatience. Actually, Locke associates this with "Turkish-style figurations" that "features relentless rapid forward motion – suggesting Monostatos's unbridled lust," which certainly translates to Brahms's setting of "Sulima."⁴⁴

Figure 14. Monostatos's opening phrase, mm. 10-17.

1. Al - - les fühlt der Lie-be Freuden, schnäbelt, tändelt, herzt und küsst; und ich soll die Lie-be meiden, weil ein
 2. Drum so will ich, weil ich le-be, schnäbeln, küssen, zärtlich sein. — Lie - ber gu-ter Mond ver-ge-be, ei-ne

⁴⁴ Locke, 116.

As Sindhumathi Revuluri pointed out in her review of Locke's book, a certain level of ambiguity exists regarding stylistic markers of exoticism which often contradict each other. Though I agree with this statement and the fact that exoticism often "gives rise to multiple, contradictory interpretive possibilities," in the case of Brahms, employing the techniques described in Locke's "Full Context" view provides a hitherto unexplored perspective of "Sulima" that makes it possible to interpret and appreciate the song, its role within the cycle, and the song cycle as a whole.⁴⁵ Furthermore, it reveals Brahms's comprehension of and imaginative approach to setting Tieck's text rather than an inability to deal with poetic complexity. The interpretive misunderstanding of the *Romanzen* throughout the twentieth century to some extent results from the fact that earlier critics subscribed to the "Exotic Style" viewpoint and therefore were unable to comprehend why Brahms set "Sulima" (and the entire cycle) as he did. However, using the "Full Context" approach allows us to see that although he did not utilize explicit markers of musical exoticism, Brahms operated within the common stereotypes of the sympathetic European "Us" and the threatening though alluring exotic "Other."

⁴⁵ Sindhumathi Revuluri, Review of *Musical Exoticism: Images and Reflections*, by Ralph P. Locke, *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 64, no. 1 (Spring 2011): 259.

CHAPTER III BRAHMS AND THE *STYLE HONGROIS*

Around the mid-eighteenth century, the music of yet another exotic group made its way into Western music—that of the Hungarian Romani people. The emulation of the “Gypsy” style, with its liveliness, laments, and intense emotional expression, emerged in the works of several German composers in a variety of settings and became known as the *style hongrois* (“Hungarian style”). This, of course, was a Western depiction of Gypsy music rather than an authentic representation of the Romani culture, but even this construction became a highly refined style by the late nineteenth century. Brahms especially took interest to the style, writing for various types of ensembles. His most popular “Hungarian” work, and thus the work at which most scholarship has been directed, is the set of 21 *Hungarian Dances* from 1869.

But Brahms also aimed his fascination with the *style hongrois* to the *Lieder* tradition, something few composers did since the use of voices was not really a characteristic of the *style hongrois*. His Opus 103 *Zigeunerlieder* (*Gypsy Songs*) were first published in 1888 as an eleven-song vocal quartet with piano, but they became so popular in German concert halls that Brahms published eight of the songs in solo versions the following year and even wrote an additional collection (Opus 112) of more Gypsy song vocal quartets.⁴⁶ The quartets were based upon the *Ungarische Liebeslieder: 25 Ungarische Volkslieder für mittlere Stimme*, a collection of Hungarian folk songs written by Zoltán Nagy with texts translated into German by Hugo Conrat, who gave a personal copy to Brahms.⁴⁷

At one extreme, some scholars have criticized the collection, making unsubstantiated statements such as, “Brahms’s *Zigeunerlieder* further illustrate how ill-focused his interest in folk music

⁴⁶ Max Friedländer, *Brahms’s Lieder: An Introduction to the Songs for One and Two Voices* (London: Oxford University Press, 1928), 173.

⁴⁷ Valerie Errante, “Brahms Civilizes the Gypsy: The *Zigeunerlieder* and Their Sources,” in *The Pendragon Review: A Journal of Musical Romanticism* (Vol. 2, No. 1: 2003), 47. Brahms owned a copy of the *Ungarische Liebeslieder*, Friedländer, 173. The *Ungarische Liebeslieder* will hereafter be referred to as Nagy’s since Conrat did not change any of the music.

of any sort was... few Hungarian (Gypsy) characteristics survived in Brahms's melodies," and some even dismiss the work altogether without explanation, suggesting that the setting was "one of Brahms's least successful ventures."⁴⁸ Some scholars compared the Opus 103 collection to Nagy's original tunes, claiming that "[t]he musical settings [of the *Zigeunerlieder*] are pure Brahms, with only an occasional hint of a rhythm or a melodic contour from the original Hungarian tunes."⁴⁹ This issue was raised even at the time of composition. Brahms's close friend Elizabet von Herzogenberg's initial response to the collection was that it displayed "more Bohemian-Dvorakesque than Hungarian" characteristics—she likely found them to be more folk-like than authentically Gypsy.⁵⁰

At the other extreme, some scholars did find specifically Hungarian elements in the *Zigeunerlieder* but only vaguely described some of them as a means of helping the performers with expression and interpretation. In his book *The Style Hongrois in the Music of Western Europe*, for example, Jonathan Bellman addressed Brahms's "Hungarian" style and the way he implemented Hungarian elements through Western conventions, but the focus is more on his instrumental rather than vocal works. Regarding Opus 103, Bellman stated that, "[t]he *Zigeunerlieder*, brimming with such Hungarian characteristics as syncopations and parallel sixths, illustrates how far the *style hongrois* had come into the musical mainstream."⁵¹ He goes on to say, "this kind of work exemplifies the final stages of the *style hongrois*," yet the work is not really examined. In reference to the Herzogenberg letters, Bellman noted, moreover, that, "[a]s ... Herzogenberg implied (and few could disagree), Brahms may have reached the summit of *style hongrois* use: a thoroughly vernacular feel while avoiding crudity, the discovery of hidden beauties without sacrificing the feel of a scratching,

⁴⁸ Harrison, 94; Bell, 183.

⁴⁹ Stark, 312.

⁵⁰ *Johannes Brahms: The Herzogenberg Correspondence*, edited by Max Kalbeck, translated by Hannah Bryant (New York: Da Capo Press, 1987), 338.

⁵¹ Jonathan Bellman, *The Style Hongrois in the Music of Western Europe* (Boston: Northeastern University Press, 1993), 210.

shrieking Gypsy band, in short maintaining the best of both worlds, vernacular and cultivated.”⁵²

Contrary to Bellman’s interpretation of the Herzogenberg correspondence, however, Brahms himself suggested that his pieces were crude.⁵³ He expressed hesitation in sending them to Herzogenberg, fearing that “the humor will prove too violent” for her; furthermore, Brahms wondered if his friend would like the pieces at all and even requested that she keep them to herself.⁵⁴

Working with Bellman’s lexicon for interpreting Hungarian style characteristics, Valerie Errante provided a more in depth analysis of the *Zigeunerlieder*, which is mostly centered on how the work relates to Brahms’s source of inspiration, Nagy’s *Ungarische Liebeslieder*. Through the analysis, Errante shows that some Hungarian elements certainly remained, most notably the rhythmic qualities, but they appear to be quite domesticated in comparison to the original tunes and “are thus only loosely ‘Gypsy songs.’”⁵⁵ Although she indicated that the *style hongrois* sometimes suggested that Gypsies were an “exotic other,” she left that idea unexplored.⁵⁶

All of these observations show that the exotic qualities within the *Zigeunerlieder* have been examined in an isolated manner—Hungarian elements, Gypsy elements, and *style hongrois* elements have all been considered individually, which generated some confusion regarding the work. This approach focuses purely on musical features of style and the absence of overt exotic indicators rather than the interaction of musical and non-musical elements. However, the way these styles are used collectively reveals not only an intricate blending of subtle exotic characteristics but also how Brahms used that blending to depict the Gypsy as an “other.”

⁵² Bellman, *Style Hongrois*, 213. Herzogenberg had written to Brahms on 28 October 1888, “The more I play the *Zigeunerlieder*, the more I love them... They are so gloriously alive—rushing, throbbing, stamping along, then settling down to a smooth, gentle flow.”

⁵³ Kalbeck, 335. Brahms enclosed his manuscript with hesitation in a letter to Herzogenberg, dated 11 March 1888, Vienna.

⁵⁴ Kalbeck, 335. Letter from Brahms to Herzogenberg, dated 11 March 1888.

⁵⁵ Errante, 62.

⁵⁶ Errante, 53.

Examining this work using the “Exotic Only” lens only results in more confusion given that there are no explicit exotic markers of the Gypsy traditions. Moreover, Brahms’s inspiration, the *Ungarische Liebeslieder*, was a collection of Hungarian folk tunes, not Gypsy tunes. Though Hungarian folk tunes and Gypsy band tunes were certainly not the same thing, in the Western musical tradition, they become almost interchangeable due to a stereotyped exotic depiction that used similar musical tropes to represent a variety of non-Western “others” rather than authentically representing individual cultures. The *Zigeunerlieder* do contain Gypsy elements as well as Hungarian folk elements, but they are domesticated through Brahms’s Western interpretation of the Hungarian style and use of general subtle markers of exoticism.

This chapter will address and even rebut claims previous researches have made, mostly because they question the purely “Hungarian” musical elements within the work but fail to address the exotic nature of the songs as a whole. Many prominent exotic elements, moreover, were present in the original SATB version but disappear in the solo arrangements, something that one must consider in order to provide a more well-rounded and accurate interpretation of the pieces, especially for performance practices. I will also show how, employing the “Full Context” view, Brahms represented the Gypsy as sensual and primitive, although he avoided explicit exotic markers. By blending different styles with the song cycle’s texts, Brahms created a subtle and intellectual manner of characterization similar to what he did in the *Romanzen*. The pieces are therefore not “authentic” or overtly exotic but they still resonate with nineteenth-century cultural tropes of representing non-Western cultures.

Previous scholars have focused primarily on the solo versions of the Opus 103 *Zigeunerlieder*. As a result, they often misunderstood and overlooked several of the cycle’s exotic qualities since their presence is much stronger in the original SATB compositions. One of the most prominent of these overlooked exotic characteristics is the unconventional reliance upon melodic and harmonic

thirds and sixths, especially when the sixths are doubled.⁵⁷ For example, parallel thirds and sixths are strongly emphasized in the SATB version of "Hochgetürmte Rimaflut." Throughout the song, these intervals exist in both the SATB and solo accompaniments, particularly on a specific "sighing" motion in the treble voice, but they are used also by the voices in the SATB version and often function melodically as moving in a parallel motion in addition to the harmonic function in the accompaniment. In the solo version, however, the voice only doubles the dominant pitch in the accompaniment, so the parallel sixth motion is no longer doubled and therefore much less prominent than in the SATB setting.

Similarly, the problem of disappearing thirds and sixths afflicts the fourth song, "Lieber Gott, du weisst." In the SATB version, the voices expose the "Hungarian" intervals through doubling and elongation. For instance, when all four voices enter in measure nine, the thirds and sixths are stretched out over quarter notes in the vocal parts rather than in passing sixteenth notes in the treble of the accompaniment, thus making the harmonic quality much more audible and easy to distinguish without viewing the score. Though the accompaniment is identical in each setting, the extra voices and their differing timbres add depth and weight to the parallel sixths in the SATB setting. In contrast, the intervals that exist in the piano accompaniment of the solo version are quite subtle since they occur sparsely and very rapidly as sixteenth-note arpeggiations rather than full chords, so it is difficult to discern where the sixths occur unless looking directly at the score. These two pieces are the most obvious examples, but the issue of deemphasized "Hungarian" melodic and harmonic elements is present in nearly all of the pieces.

⁵⁷ Bellman, *Style Hongrois*, 111.

Figure 15. “Lieber Gott, du weisst” (No. 4), SATB, mm. 9-12. The sixths are stressed in the voices, particularly between the soprano, alto, and tenor parts (C to A, A to F, etc.).

The image shows a musical score for four voices (Soprano, Alto, Tenor, Bass) and piano accompaniment. The vocal parts are written in a four-part setting. The lyrics are: Herz ge - - - bot, daß ich ihn küs - sen muß, Lieb ist süß, wenn bit - ter auch die Reu, Herz ge - - - bot, ihn küs - - sen muß, Lieb ist süß, wenn bit - - ter Reu, The piano accompaniment features a prominent sixteenth-note figure in the right hand, which is de-emphasized in this SATB version compared to the solo arrangement. Dynamics include *f* and *p*. The score is labeled 'J. B. 107' at the bottom.

Figure 16. “Lieber Gott, du weisst,” solo arrangement, mm. 9-12. Though the sixths are still present, they are strongly deemphasized due to the brevity of the accompaniment figures and the absence of the alto, tenor, and bass voices.

The image shows a solo arrangement of the same piece. It consists of a single vocal line and piano accompaniment. The lyrics are: Herz ge - - - bot, daß ich ihn küs - sen muß, Lieb ist süß, wenn bit - ter auch die Reu, The piano accompaniment features a more prominent sixteenth-note figure in the right hand, which is de-emphasized in the SATB version. Dynamics include *f* and *p*.

Another exotic element that is easily overlooked in the solo version is Brahms’s emulation of the *czárdás*, Hungary’s national dance, through his manipulation of the vocal lines in the SATB version of “Wisst ihr, wann mein Kindchen am allerschönsten ist.” Stark criticized the solo version of this song, stating that it “presents the dilemma of a man’s first verse but a woman’s second.” The issue is that the text clearly depicts two different genders that are supposed to be represented by a

solo singer.⁵⁸ However, this “dilemma” can be explained by examining the innovative use of the voices in the original SATB version.

The *czárdás* dance typically features alternations between male and female solo singing and dancing. The dance has many roots, most notably the *verbunkos*, another national dance that was intended for military recruiting, which contained an alternation between slow and fast passages.⁵⁹ These primary characteristics of the *czárdás* and *verbunkos* dance styles are represented by the voices in the SATB setting of “Wisst ihr.”⁶⁰ The text clearly contains two different characters (the dancers), and the use of male and female voices in the original composition depicts the dance more convincingly than in the solo version.

[Tenor, slow]	Wisst ihr, wann mein Kindchen am allerschönsten ist? Wenn ihr süßes Muendchen scherzt und lacht und küsst.
[All, fast]	Mägdelein, du bist mein, inniglich küss ich dich, Dich erschuf der liebe Himmel einzig nur für mich!
[Soprano, slow]	Wisst ihr, wann mein Liebster am besten mir gefällt? Wenn in seinen Armen er mich umschlungen hält.
[All, fast]	Schätzelein, du bist mein, inniglich küss ich dich, Dich erschuf der liebe Himmil einzig nur für mich!

Do you know when my fairest little child is?
When her sweet little mouth jokes and laughs and kisses.
Maiden, you are mine, heartfelt I kiss you,
You created the dear heaven just for me alone!
Do you know when my beloved pleases me best?
When in his arms he embraces and holds me.
Sweetheart, you are mine, heartfelt I kiss you.
You created the dear heaven just for me alone!

In its original version, the song begins with an eight-measure *allegretto* section for the tenor and can be understood as representing the male solo dance at a moderately slow tempo. It then abruptly transitions to an *allegro* section in which all four voices sing, representing the communal dancing that occurs in the *czárdás*. After the male solo and communal refrain, the soprano solo section begins,

⁵⁸ Stark, 312.

⁵⁹ *Music in Hungary*, 134-8.

⁶⁰ It is somewhat strange though considering that the dance does not occur in “Brauner Bursche führt zum Tanze” (No. 5) in which the text describes a couple dancing the *czárdás*.

which is melodically identical to the tenor solo section, also at an *allegretto* tempo marking. This vocally depicts the solo dance of the female character. The communal refrain then returns with an *allegro* marking. In the SATB setting, the words “Schätzelein” and “Mägdelein” are sung simultaneously by the women and men respectively, again reflecting the communal dance. Obviously this is not possible in the solo setting, though singers sometimes opt to perform the song as a duet. Nevertheless, by using the voices in this way, Brahms showed that his folk interest was not as “ill-focused” as Harrison suggested, but instead revealed his understanding of the Hungarian dance and how he represented it in an unconventional way.

Brahms also implemented distinct “Hungarian” rhythms into each section. For example, the communal sections prominently feature the Hungarian anapest, an accented short-short-long rhythm, in the voice parts and the treble of the accompaniment. The solo sections contain a pattern of dotted eighths followed by sixteenths that was characteristic of the verbunkos tradition.⁶¹

⁶¹ Bellman, *Style Hongrois*, 116.

Figure 17. “Wisst ihr, wann mein Kindchen” (No. 3), mm. 1-14. The tenor solo section and communal refrain. The dotted eighth-sixteenth rhythm appears in the vocal line and is echoed in the accompaniment. The rhythms shift to the Hungarian anapest (eighth-eighth-quarter) at the start of the communal refrain in measure ten.

Tenor

1
 Wißt ihr, wann mein Kind - chen am al - ler - schön - sten ist?

5
 Wenn ihr sü - Bes Münd - chen scherzt und lacht und küßt.

dolce

Allegro

Schä - tze - lein, du bist mein, in - nig - lich küß ich dich, dich er - schuf der

Mäg - de - lein, du bist mein, in - nig - lich küß ich dich, dich er -

Allegro

10
p cresc.

Figure 18. “Wisst ihr, wann mein Kindchen,” Solo version, mm. 6-11.

Münd - chen scherzt und lacht und küßt. Mäg - de - lein, du bist mein,
 Ar - mener mich umschlungen hält. Schät - ze - lein, du bist mein,

In addition to some of the exotic elements being overlooked in general, the issue of how Brahms depicted the Gypsies as a primitive “other” has remained unexplored. Though Errante’s analysis was certainly helpful in sorting out several “Hungarian” rhythmic elements that had not been studied, but it failed to explain how these elements and Brahms’s changes from Nagy’s original folk tunes construct a sense of “otherness” in the work.

Since the title of Opus 103 is *Zigunerlieder*, it can be assumed that Brahms purposely intended to represent the Romani in some way, though very little in this work is authentically “Gypsy.” In fact, the only explicit reference occurs in the text of the opening “He, Zigeuner” in which the speaker of the poem specifically addresses the Gypsy. This was quite common in the representations of the “Gypsies,” who were known for improvising tunes at the request of patrons and were seen as conveying the feelings of the patron through their music.⁶² Lament tunes were among the most popular requests, and the text of “He, Zigeuner” falls into that category.

He, Zigeuner, greife in die Saiten ein!	Hey, Gypsy, play into the strings! ⁶³
Spiel das Lied vom ungetreuen Mägdelein!	Play the song of the unfaithful maiden!
Lass die Saiten weinen, klagen, traurig bange,	Let the strings weep, lament, sadly fearful,
Bis die heisse Träne netzet diese Wange!	Until hot tears wet these cheeks!

⁶² Bellman, *Style Hongrois*, 139.

⁶³ Implying the violin, which was the most prominent Gypsy instrument.

Going beyond the “authentic” elements of the poem and much like his depiction of Sulima in the *Romanzen*, Brahms’s use of tempo and rhythm depicts the Gypsy in this song as a seductive and often primitive “Other.” In Nagy’s version of “He, Zigeuner,” the lament is emphasized by the *langsam* (slow) tempo indication as well as the excessive ornamentation. Rather than functioning as a display of virtuosity for the performer, the use of ornamentation in Gypsy works typically displayed intense expression in slower pieces.⁶⁴ For example, the phrase “Lass die Saiten weinen, klagend traurig bange” is extraordinarily expressive, containing several ornaments in the accompaniment that bring out the weeping and lamenting by dramatically leading into the descending sighing pattern. The slow cries (descending dotted figures) express the grief of the one who is lamenting.

Figure 19. Excerpt from Nagy’s “He, Zigeuner,” mm. 7-9. This is the most ornamented passage in the song, expressing the weeping and lamenting described in the text.

The image shows a musical score for the excerpt from Nagy's "He, Zigeuner" (mm. 7-9). It consists of a vocal line and a piano accompaniment. The key signature is one flat (F major), and the time signature is 3/4. The vocal line has lyrics: "Lass die Saiten weinen, klagend traurig bange". The piano accompaniment is highly ornamented with trills, grace notes, and slurs. Dynamics include *mf*, *f*, and *p*.

Though musical elements such as the excessive ornaments often signal “otherness” in Western music, Brahms completely eliminated the ornaments which were so prevalent in Nagy’s songs. Instead, he established a strong feeling of irrationality by adding new, subtle elements of primitivism, continuing his trope of the “Other.” For example, he marked the tempo *allegro agitato* (quick and agitated) in his setting of “He, Zigeuner,” which changes the tone of the text from mournful to, as the tempo indicates, extremely agitated. The disjunct melodic line illustrates the character’s lack of control over his emotions. This inability to control emotion is further expressed

⁶⁴ Bellman, *Style Honrois*, 102.

through rhythmic qualities that create tension, as the bass of the accompaniment with its sixteenth notes at an extreme range (octave leaps in the pedal tones) works against the triplets in the treble voice.

The leaping bass notes that occur on the downbeats also perpetuate the *agitato* feel, because they create an aggressive sound, even more so at the final repeat of text which is marked *più presto*. It sounds primitive because the leaps are open, simple harmonies—primarily fourths, fifths, and octaves. For example, the introductory measures begin with fourth and fifths in both the treble and bass of the accompaniment, and when the voice enters in measure three, the bass switches to octaves and the treble alternates between thirds and fourths. This coincides with static harmony that rests primarily on an A minor tonic chord. The rhythmic complexity of the two-against-three feel is undermined by the harmonic simplicity. The large leaps give the piece an aggressive feel that reflects the *allegro agitato* tempo indication.

Figure 20. Brahms's "He, Zigeuner," mm. 1-9.

Allegro agitato

Singstimme

Pianoforte

He, Zi - geu - - - ner,

grei - - - fe in die Sai - - - ten ein! - - - spiel das

f

sotto voce ma agitato

Brahms also added other interesting stylistic elements in “He, Zigeuner” that can be interpreted as primitive. He set the song in A minor, the most simple minor key, which was commonly used to depict the simplistic nature of “other” non-Western people.⁶⁵ This primitivism is also perpetuated by dynamic contrast. The softer dynamics are often accompanied (and undermined) by a secondary instruction, such as the *mp ma agitato* (mezzo piano, but agitated) in measure 15, which changes the color of the dynamic from restrained to urgent. The song often abruptly peaks on unexpected chords, such as in measure 23 where the *forte* dynamic occurs on a fully diminished D-sharp chord (a tri-tone away from the tonic rather the expected minor iv chord). This dissonant, chromatic chord is especially aggressive in the SATB setting since the voices add more weight to the harmony.

Brahms’s use of Western-sounding techniques to depict the “Gypsy” as a primitive “other” also becomes particularly prominent in “Hochgetürmte Rimaflut,” the second song of the collection. This text is also a lament, though it reflects more longing and anguish than “He, Zigeuner.”

Hochgetürmte Rimaflut,	High-towering Rima river,
Wie bist du so trüb,	How are you so cloudy,
An dem Ufer klag’ ich	On the shore I lament
Laut nach dir, mein Lieb!	Aloud for you, my love!
Wellen fliehen, Wellen strömen,	Waves flow, waves stream,
Rauschen an dem Strand heran zu mir;	Roar forward to me on the shore;
An dem Rimaufer lasst mich	On the bank of the Rima let me
Ewig weinen nach ihr!	Eternally weep for her!

Nagy's original setting reflects a typical Hungarian lament in that it is somewhat recitative-like (and therefore more naturally indicative of unpredictable speech patterns) and contains several expressive ornaments.⁶⁶ In particular, the rolled chords and ornamentation set at a *langsam* tempo marking bring out the emotional intensity of the phrase “an dem Ufer last mich klagen nach dir

⁶⁵ Locke, 118.

⁶⁶ Since Conrat translated the Hungarian but did not alter Nagy’s tunes, some of the German language stresses are a bit odd in the *Ungarische Liebeslieder*.

mein Lieb.”⁶⁷ The excessive ornamentation in the accompaniment sounds like an emulation of the cimbalom, a standard instrument in Gypsy music which often implemented rolled chords and several grace notes that lead into the downbeat of each measure.

Figure 21. Nagy’s “Hochgetürmte Rimaflut,” mm. 4-6.

The image shows a musical score for three measures. The top staff is the vocal line in G major, with lyrics: "an dem U-fer lasst mich kla-gen nach dir mein Lieb!". The bottom two staves are the piano accompaniment, also in G major. The piano part features a heavy, rhythmic bass line with a "limping" pattern (quarter note flanked by two eighth notes). The piano part includes dynamics like *p* and *rit.* (ritardando).

Brahms once again eliminated most of the explicitly exotic musical markers from Nagy’s tunes, but this helped him construct the image of a compulsive rather than melancholy “Other.” He changed the tempo of the lament from *langsam* to a rapid *allegro molto* which makes the strange melody sound even more disjunct since there are large leaps in both the piano and the voice. He did incorporate a few grace notes, likely to maintain some of the original expression, which incidentally do not appear in any of the vocal lines from the other pieces. Brahms further emphasized the new subjectivity of the song’s narrator through dynamics and rhythm. Whereas Nagy's setting is at the *piano* dynamic level, most of Brahms's setting is at a *forte*. The dynamic level is exaggerated (and made more abrasive) by the heavy downbeats in the bass of the piano accompaniment. A strong *alla zoppa* (limping) rhythm, which was the most commonly used rhythmic characteristic of the *style hongrois*, also brings out the aggressive nature of this altered lament.⁶⁸ It usually appears as a quarter note flanked by two eighth notes, as is the case in this setting. The distinct rhythm occurs throughout most of the song, and since the rhythm’s dominant pitches (which appear in the upper treble voice

⁶⁷ Brahms slightly altered the text in his setting.

⁶⁸ Bellman, *Style Hongrois*, 114.

of the accompaniment) are at such a distant interval from the bass accompaniment pattern, the *alla zoppa* stands out even more. Also, the accompaniment is marked *ben marcato*, or "well marked," indicating a distinctly strong and accented style. Without this instruction, the treble patterns in the accompaniment could be heard as sentimental, but Brahms's stylistic suggestion makes them sound aggressive.

Figure 22. Brahms's "Hochgetürmte Rimaflut," mm. 1-12.

The image shows a musical score for Brahms's "Hochgetürmte Rimaflut" (mm. 1-12). The score is in 2/4 time, key of B-flat major, and marked "Allegro molto". It features a vocal line (Singstimme) and piano accompaniment (Pianoforte). The lyrics are: "Hoch - ge - türm - te Ri - - ma - flut, wie bist du so trüb, an dem U - fer klag ich laut nach". The piano accompaniment is marked "f non troppo ma ben marc." and features a strong, accented style.

In case of "Röslein dreie in der Reihe blühen so Rot," the sixth song of the collection, Brahms's stylistic choices in fact intensified the exotic characterization of the "Gypsy" subject of the poem. The speaker stresses the importance of finding a mate, even stating that it would be sinful not to do so, yet he completely focuses more on outward appearances rather than personality or character traits.

Röslein dreie in der Reihe blühen so Rot,
 Dass der Bursch zum Mäd'el geht, ist kein Verbot!
 Lieber Gott, wenn das verboten wär,
 Ständ' die schöne weite Welt schon längst nicht mehr;

Ledig bleiben Sünde wär!

Schönstes Städtchen in Alföld ist Ketschkemet,
Dort gibt es gar viele Mädchen schmuck und nett!
Freunde, sucht euch dort ein Bräutchen aus,
Freit um ihre Hand und gründet euer Haus,
Freudenbecher leeret aus.

Rosebuds three in the row bloom so red
That a lad to a girl goes is not forbidden!
Dear God, if that forbidden were,
The beautiful wide world would long since stand no more;
To remain single would be a sin!

The most beautiful town in Alföld is Ketschkemet,
There are there so many girls pretty and nice
Friends, seek out there a little bride for yourselves,
Woo for her hand and found your house,
The cup of joy drain out.

Of all the Opus 103 *Zigeunerlieder*, Brahms's setting of this text most closely relates to Nagy's setting, but the playfulness present in Nagy's "Röslein dreie" grows into impatience in Brahms's version. Nagy set the song at a lively tempo (*lebhaft*), but Brahms set it at a much quicker *vivace grazioso*, creating a sense of urgency. Abrupt dynamic changes appear in the original tunes. With Nagy's setting, however, the contrast is restricted to closely related dynamics, such as *mezzo forte* to *forte* and then *forte* to *fortissimo*. Brahms, on the other hand, frequently alternates between *piano* and *forte*, exaggerating the already abrasive dynamic contrast which emphasizes the narrator's impatient need for his "little bride."

While Brahms used the voices to depict Hungarian dance traditions in "Wisst ihr," he utilized an interesting vocal technique to depict the "Gypsy" pizzicato fiddle style in "Röslein dreie." This was not only one of the most typical conventions of the *style hongrois*, but also a common subtle exotic indicator that depicted "Other" cultures as simplistic or unrefined.⁶⁹ The pizzicato effect occurs in the piano through the use of staccato markings but also in the voice part. Though some of

⁶⁹ Bellman, *Style Hongrois*, 98; Locke, 54.

the other pieces occasionally use staccato markings (usually only on a brief phrase), the extensive use of the pizzicato emulation which is unique to this song not only displays Brahms's creativity but brings out the lighthearted and superficial attitude presented in the text.

Interestingly, the piece begins with two half notes that contrast the rest of the piece. This relatively uncharacteristic rhythm could depict that the speaker himself is quite serious about his quest for a mate. However, the speaker goes about it quite immaturely, which Brahms highlighted by using the playful pizzicato style immediately after the opening sustained notes. He also stressed the focus on appearances with a repetition of the first couplet of each stanza—both lines of repeated text address the beauty of the girls, first metaphorically and second literally.

Figure 23. Brahms's "Röslein dreie in der Reihe blühen so Rot," mm. 1-6.

Vivace grazioso

1. Röslein dreie in der Reihe blühen so rot,
2. Schönstes Städtchen in Alfeld ist Ketschke met,

In "Rote Abendwolken ziehn am Firmament," the final song of the collection, Brahms most aggressively used the subtle exotic indicators to strongly exaggerate the sensuality of the text as well as reiterate his depiction of the "Gypsy" as primitive. Rather than being lamenting, the longing expressed in this poem is much more impassioned, and similar to Sulima's piece, the narrator describes physical sensations (e.g. "das Herze brennt," or "the heart burns").

Rote Abendwolken ziehn am Firmament,
Sehnsuchtsvoll nach dir, mein Lieb, das Herze brennt;
Himmel strahlt ih glüh'nder Pracht,

Und ich träum' bei Tag und Nacht
Nur allein von dem süßen Liebchen mein.

Rosy evening clouds move in the sky,
Filled with longing for you, my love, the heart burns;
Heaven glows with radiant splendor,
And I dream by day and night
Alone only of the sweet beloved mine.

Brahms's setting highlights the impassioned nature of the text in various ways, most obviously through his use of rhythm. The piece begins abruptly with a spondee, a rhythmic convention of the *style hongrois* that consists of two accented long notes that punctuate a phrase and usually disrupts or suspends the motion of the piece.⁷⁰ Though the two accented beats are not long, the staccato eighth notes function as a spondee in that they punctuate the musical phrases and textual repetitions and they are heavily weighted and disruptive. Nagy's original tune contains no break in the flow of the text; there are no rests or rhythmic interruptions. In Brahms's setting, however, the spondee breaks up the lines, again suggesting irrationality, as if the narrator has been overcome with excitement. The text interruptions occur as follows:

Rote Abendwolken ziehn am Firmament,	[spondee]
Sehnsuchtsvoll nach dir, mein Lieb, das Herze brennt;	[spondee]
Himmel strahlt ih glüh'nder Pracht,	
Und ich träum' bei Tag und Nacht	[double spondee]
Nur allein von dem süßen Liebchen mein.	[double spondee]

The rhythmic spondees serve a dual purpose in that they unexpectedly alternate between distant keys in the first half of the song (the first two lines of text and their repetition), another exotic indicator and primitive quality.⁷¹ After the opening "Rote Abendwolken ziehn am Firmament," the key abruptly shifts from D-flat major to the distant key of E major at a *forte* dynamic in measure nine, which is stressed by the flanking soft dynamic levels. The dynamic and harmonic change is quite startling, but it brings out the impassioned longing in the text. For

⁷⁰ Bellman, *Style Hongrois*, 112.

⁷¹ Locke, 51.

instance, unlike the first phrase that contains a descending melodic line and ends on a half cadence, the second phrase, beginning with “sehnsuchtsvoll” in measure ten, ends on ascending melodic line and a strange deceptive cadence, the root of which is a tri-tone away from the tonic chord. This creates tension that never really resolves due to the spondee shifting back to the key of D-flat major. More excitement is generated from not only the key being higher, but also the melodic line of this phrase is an augmented second higher—a typical exotic marker described by Locke—than the opening statement in D-flat.

Brahms also utilized the *alla zoppa* rhythm in the bass of the accompaniment throughout the entire piece. At the *allegro passionato* tempo, this rhythm sounds like a very strong pulse, perhaps reflecting a pounding (or burning, as the text states) heart.⁷² The pulsing rhythms, bold harmonic shifts, harmonic tension, and the rise and fall of the vocal line create a feeling of arousal or even carnal excitement.

⁷² Nagy’s original tune is marked *ziemlich langsam* (moderately slow).

Figure 24. Brahms's "Rote Abendwolken," mm. 5-16.

ziehn am Fir - ma - ment, —
 sehn - - - suchts - voll nach dir, mein
 Lieb, das Her - ze brennt; —

Though the majority of the pieces are quite lively, one piece contrasts the rest. In the same way that "Sulima" stood out among the rest of the *Romanzen* Lieder, "Kommt dir manchmal in den Sinn, mein süßes Lieb" is distinctly different from the other *Zigeunerlieder*. In this case, though, "Kommt dir manchmal" might be understood as representing a more humanistic side of the "Gypsy" character rather than a primitive or sensual one. Several scholars noted that it sounds distinctly "German" (and/or "Brahms"). The text is quite different from the others included in the collection—rather than sensual longing or agitated lamenting, this text discusses a sacred vow.

Kommt dir manchmal in den Sinn, mein süßes Lieb,
Was du einst mit heil'gem Eide mir gelobt?
Täusch mich nicht, verlass mich nicht,
Du weisst nicht, wie lieb ich dich hab',
Lieb' du mich, wie ich dich,
Dann ströt Gottes Huld auf dich herab!

Does it come to mind sometimes, my sweet love,
What you once swore to me with a holy vow?
Deceive me not, leave me not,
You do not know how much I love you,
Love me as I love you,
Then God's grace will stream down upon you!

This song has been interpreted by Sams as a lament by someone who “is doomed to be deserted,” yet the text expresses more of an insecure need for reassurance and reminder of a vow rather than something as strong as a lament for a lover that has not yet been lost.⁷³ The gender of the speaker in this text is unnamed, though some assume that it is a woman since laments were typically of women in “the Romantic lieder tradition in general (and often in real life).”⁷⁴ But in fact, examining various poems and songs show that many of the laments in German literature and the *Lieder* tradition were expressed by men, not women. Given that Brahms had a strong understanding of German poetry, he most likely would have been aware of this narrative voice. Evidence for this exists in the song itself—the textual repetitions are the same as in the solo versions yet the lines of text (first the couplet, then the remaining four lines) are introduced by a tenor solo in the SATB setting. Considering that Brahms’s setting of “Kommt dir manchmal” is much more delicate and sentimental than other songs, the male “Gypsy” here is presented as more sentimental than the other subjects in the collection.

Brahms’s musical setting is more refined than the other songs within the *Zigunerlieder*. He wrote it in a more sentimental style, and it is the only piece in the solo version of Opus 103 that is entirely lyrical. Brahms utilized a slower tempo (*andante grazioso*, or slow and graceful) than the rest of

⁷³ Sams, 334.

⁷⁴ Sams, 334.

his *Zigeunerlieder* and implemented more rhythmic variation and complexity, though in a subtle and delicate manner. For example, in the first couplet of text, each line has a different rhythmic quality in the treble of the accompaniment. The opening “Kommt dir manchmal in den Sinn, mein süßes Lieb” is straightforward and consists primarily of a strict eighth note pattern. During the following line, “was du einst mit heil’gem Eide mir gelobt,” the accompaniment shifts to a syncopated rhythm in measure six. It contrasts the syncopations in the previously examined songs, because the inner rhythms (sixteenth-eighth) are tied together. This creates a drag-triplet feel, which gives the effect of a slower tempo rather than an aggressive one. The repetition of “Kommt dir manchmal” in measure nine then transitions to a staccato style, though the notes are slurred and marked *dolce* (sweetly) which shows delicacy rather than excitement. Brahms blended the connected syncopations and the legato-staccato style from the previous phrases at the repetition of the text beginning with “was du einst.” Though the text is repeated, the variation in the accompaniment style keeps the repetition from sounding excessive or redundant. Brahms appears to have paid more attention to individual lines here, similar to the way he did in Magelone’s song from the *Romanzen*.

Figure 25. Brahms’s “Kommt dir manchmal in den Sinn,” mm. 13-16.

The image displays a musical score for measures 13-16 of Brahms's song. It consists of a vocal line and piano accompaniment. The vocal line is written in a treble clef with a key signature of three sharps (F#, C#, G#) and a common time signature. The lyrics are: "was du einst mit heil - gem Ei - de mir ge.lobt?". The piano accompaniment is written in a grand staff (treble and bass clefs) with the same key signature and time signature. The treble clef part shows a complex rhythmic pattern with syncopation and tied sixteenth-eighth notes, while the bass clef part provides a more steady accompaniment with some slurs and ties.

The melodic contour also conveys sentimentality, expressing emotion through sighing patterns rather than aggressive rhythms. Brahms musically divided the six lines of text in a grouping of two plus four, and though there are descending, sighing patterns present in the first couplet of

text, they are expressed mostly in the latter four lines of text. He first uses a cascading effect in the accompaniment, beginning in measure 17. A sixteenth-note pattern descends out of the vocal line, outlining an inverted D-sharp half-diminished seventh chord. They continue until the beginning of the phrase “lieb du mich” in measure 22 when the sentimental style gradually shifts from descending sighing patterns to predominantly ascending harmonies, turning from a melancholy tonality to major harmonies and eventually a quiet resolution which allude to the notion of “God’s grace” depicted in the text.

Figure 26. Brahms, No. 7, mm. 17-23.

The image shows a musical score for Brahms, No. 7, measures 17-23. The score is in G major (one sharp) and 3/4 time. It consists of two systems. The first system (measures 17-20) features a vocal line with the lyrics "Täusch mich nicht, ver - laß mich nicht, du weißt nicht, wie" and a piano accompaniment with a descending sixteenth-note pattern in the right hand and a cascading effect in the left hand. The piano part is marked "mp" and "cresc.". The second system (measures 21-23) features a vocal line with the lyrics "lieb_ ich dich hab, lieb du mich_ wie ich dich,_" and a piano accompaniment with ascending harmonies. The piano part is marked "cresc.".

Even though some critics have challenged his ability to successfully integrate folk elements, Brahms clearly had knowledge of the Hungarian folk tradition as evidenced by the strong presence of “Hungarian” folk and “Gypsy” interpretations in the *Zigeunerlieder*. As Locke suggested, exotic depictions in *Lieder* are almost always subtly and intellectually presented, rarely obviously evoking an

exotic locale, and this is certainly the case with Opus 103.⁷⁵ Though not obvious, the blending of various styles and elements corresponds to the typical nineteenth century trope of using general characteristics to depict an “Other” rather than authentically representing a specific culture.

Examining this collection of songs using the “Full Context” view challenges the critical scholarship, especially when studied in context to the original SATB setting, and shows that Brahms was not only a master craftsman in regards to text painting, but also his refined, innovative, progressive style.

⁷⁵ Locke, 134.

CONCLUSION

Examining the Opus 32 “ghazals,” the *Romanzen*, and the *Zigeunerlieder* with Locke’s inclusive “Full Context” approach resolves many conflicts in existing scholarship in Brahms *Lieder*. Without consideration of all the extra-musical qualities that exist in these three song collections, it would seem that Brahms’s works contained few elements that could be considered exotic. This new approach, however, shows how rich and exotic these *Lieder* truly are.

The “ghazals” cleverly and subtly depict aspects of Sufi ideology and themes from Hafiz’s poetry as well as highlights traits of “others” that were considered unbecoming during Brahms’s times, such as an emphasis on irrationality or sensuality. In the *Romanzen*, Brahms illuminated the difference between the sentimental, refined “European” character and the primitive, sensual exotic “other” subject. And in his later work, *Zigeunerlieder*, he depicted a variety of exotic subjects and characters within his blended “Hungarian” and Western styles.

Using the “Full Context” view provides both listeners and performers with a broader, more comprehensive understanding of Brahms *Lieder*. Though Brahms was often widely criticized for a purported inability to set texts, both during his lifetime and long after, this analysis has shown that he, in fact, had a unique ability to set even the most difficult texts in innovative, effective ways, all while still “sounding like Brahms.”

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Avins, Styra, ann. *Johannes Brahms: Life and Letters*. Translated by Josef Eisinger and Styra Avins. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1997.
- Bartók, Béla. *The Hungarian Folk Song*. Ed. by Benjamin Suchoff. Translated by M.D. Calvocoressi. Albany, NY: State University of New York Press, 1981.
- Bell, A. Craig. *Brahms: The Vocal Music*. London: Associated University Press, 1996.
- Bellman, Jonathan. "Aus alten Märchen: The Chivalric Style of Schumann and Brahms." *The Journal of Musicology* 13, no. 1 (Winter, 1995): 117-135.
- Bellman, Jonathan. *The Style Hongrois in the Music of Western Europe*. Boston: Northeastern University Press, 1993.
- Birrell, Colin. *The Boundless Present: Space and Time in the Literary Fairy Tales of Novalis and Tieck*. Chapel Hill, NC: The University of North Carolina Press, 1979.
- Bodo, Victor Bill. *Hungarian Folk Music*. 1980.
- Boyer, Thomas. "Brahms as Count Peter of Provence: A Psychosexual Interpretation of the 'Magelone' Poetry." *The Musical Quarterly* 66, no. 2 (Apr., 1980): 262-286.
- Bozarth, George S. and Walter Frisch. "Brahms, Johannes: Lieder and Solo Vocal Ensembles," *Grove Music Online, Oxford Music Online*.
<http://oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/51879pg11> (accessed September 14, 2013).
- Brody, Elaine and Robert A. Fowkes. *The German Lied and Its Poetry*. New York: New York University Press, 1971.
- Daverio, John. "Brahms's Magelone Romanzen and the 'Romantic Imperative.'" *The Journal of Musicology* 7, no. 3 (Summer, 1989): 343-365.
- de Bruijn, J.T.P., ed. *General Introduction to Persian Literature*. London: I.B. Tauris & Co. Ltd., 2009.
- Errante, Valerie. "Brahms Civilizes the Gypsy: The *Zigeunerlieder* and Their Sources." *The Pendragon Review: A Journal of Musical Romanticism* 2, no. 1 (2003): 46-73.
- Fellinger, Imogen. "Cyclic Tendencies in Brahms's Song Collections" in *Brahms Studies: Analytical and Historical Perspectives*. Ed. by George S. Bozarth. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1990.
- Finscher, Ludwig. "Brahms's Early Songs: Poetry versus Music" in *Brahms Studies: Analytical and Historical Perspectives*. Ed. by George S. Bozarth. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1990.
- Harrison, Max. *The Lieder of Brahms*. New York: Praeger Publishers, 1972.

Kalbeck, Max, ed. *Johannes Brahms: The Herzogenberg Correspondence*. Trans. by Hannah Bryant. New York: Da Capo Press, 1987.

Kárpáti, János. "Hungarian Dances—From Ungaresca to Csárdás." In *Music in Hungary: An Illustrated History*. Budapest: Rózsavölgyi & Company, 2011.

Kodály, Zoltán. *Folk Music of Hungary*. Trans. by Ronald Tempest and Cynthia Jolly. London: Barrie and Rockliff, 1960.

Locke, Ralph P. *Musical Exoticism: Images and Reflections*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2009.

Marshall, Russell Joseph. "A Stylistic Study of the *Magelone Lieder* of Johannes Brahms." Master's thesis, University of Washington, 1955.

Momand, Elizabeth Blanton. "Finding the Connection: Hafez—Daumer—Brahms." DMA treatise, University of Texas at Austin, 2001.

Muhammad-i-Hafiz-i-Shirazi, Shamsu-d-Din. *The Divan-I-Hafiz*. Trans. by H. Wilberforce Clarke. London: The Octagon Press LTD, 1974.

Musgrave, Michael. *The Music of Brahms*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1985.

Paulin, Roger. *Ludwig Tieck: A Literary Biography*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1985.

Rearick, Elizabeth C. *Dances of the Hungarians*. New York: Bureau of Publications, Columbia University, 1939.

Revuluri, Sindhumathi. "Review: *Musical Exoticism: Images and Reflections* by Ralph P. Locke." *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 64, no. 1 (Spring 2011): 253-261.

Russell, Peter. *The Themes of the German Lied from Mozart to Strauss*. Lewiston, NY: The Edwin Mellen Press, 2002.

Sams, Eric. *The Songs of Johannes Brahms*. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 2000.

Schönberg, Arnold. "Brahms the Progressive." Reprinted in *Style and Idea: Selected Writings of Arnold Schönberg*. Ed. Leonard Stein. Trans. Leo Black. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1984: 398-441.

Stark, Lucien. *A Guide to the Solo Songs of Johannes Brahms*. Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press, 1995.

Stein, Deborah and Robert Spillman. *Poetry Into Song: Performance and Analysis of Lieder*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1996.

Stein, Jack M. *Poem and Music in the German Lied from Gluck to Hugo Wolf*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1971.

Strangways, A.H. Fox. "Brahms and Tieck's 'Magelone.'" *Music & Letters* 21, no. 3 (Jul., 1940): 211-229..

Van Rij, Inge. *Brahms's Song Collections*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2006.

Walker, Ernest. "Brahms as a Song-Writer." *The Musical Times* 74, no. 1083 (May, 1933): 406-410.

Wightman, Alistair. *Karol Szymanowski: His Life and Work*. Burlington, VT: Ashgate Publishing Company, 1999.