

# Public libraries and the unemployed in Sheffield, United Kingdom: Comparison between Internet search engines and gateways

By: Zapopan Martín Muela Meza  
PhD Student in Information Studies  
University of Sheffield

**Submitted to:**

**Mrs. V. A. Harding, Course Administrator  
and Mr. Alastair Allan, Module Coordinator**

**The University of Sheffield**

**Department of Information Studies**

as part of the Research Training Program module:

**RTP: GSC6100: Library and Info Skills for Successful Research  
The Assessment Portfolio**

**Sheffield, Great Britain**

**30.06.2004**

**Second Submission**

## **1. The Introduction**

Name: Mr. Zapopan Martín Muela Meza  
Department: Information Studies  
Registration Number: 030305010  
Topic of research: Public libraries and the unemployed  
Supervisor: Prof. Dr. Bob Usherwood

I have an undergraduate degree in librarianship (bibliotecología) at the University Autonomous of Nuevo León in Monterrey, Nuevo León, México, a masters degree in library science at the State University of New York at Buffalo, NY, USA. I entered the Department of Information Studies at the University of Sheffield to do PhD studies on the public libraries fields under the supervision of Prof. Bob Usherwood. The topics I have chosen are related the core of my MPhil/PhD Transfer and to my PhD per se. In the MPhil/PhD I am assessing the needs and problems of the unemployed people at the Broomhall Community of Sheffield. In the PhD I will try to discover ways of how the public library or other sectors provide services to those people in order to satisfy their needs.

The methodology I am using for my projects is qualitative. I have made a research essay for my supervisor of 5, 000 words on the subject just clarify better which methodologies and methods to employ. Tthis paper can be accessed at: <http://www.geocities.com/zapopanmuela/qualitativemethodologyinlis.htm> . But in this module I did not include anything related to methodologies, so nothing from that work, which covered over 40 pertinent bibliographic records, was included here. My searches were more focused only on the research problem itself which is: first, which are the needs and problems of the unemployed people in Broomhall and the second part throughout the whole doctoral studies will be how those problems are solved or alleviated through the library service provision.

The following must be recorded:

The format you have adopted for your bibliography.

The format I adopted was bibliographic following the Harvard Style as explained at my department in the 2003-2004 Handbook for Research Students.

The major databases you have searched and relied on.

The major databases I relied on to search my information were: Star at the University of Sheffield, COPAC, LISA, Dissertation Abstracts, Index to Thesis (the British thesis database), the Publications Database of the Dept. of Information Studies at the University of Sheffield and other which supported electronic journals.

The style you have used to cite and list references in your literature review.

Harvard Style as explained at my department in the 2003-2004 Handbook for Research

Students.

The search engines you have used for your Internet comparison.

AlltheWeb and Google.

The subject gateways you have used for your Internet comparison.

Mainly Resource Discovery Network and from there pointed me out to several other gateways like AskJeeves and The Internet Public Library.

### **Comparison between two search engines:**

The best web search engines chosen were Google and Alltheweb, they are the best according to the rankings web guides show. Therefore that is the reason these two search engines were chosen.

The search in the search engines was divided in two parts. First it was searched by the terms of this research in the advanced mode searching the terms "library services for the unemployed" in quotes and then looking for the same terms but without quotes. In this part of this section first it will be shown the search with quotes and below the search without quotes. Thus first it is compared Google with Alltheweb with quotes and then Google and AlltheWeb without quotes.

### **Searching in Google with quotes:**

Looking by "library services for the unemployed" as a phrase found 3 pages in Google, but none of the three were pertinent as scholarly research. Number 1 hit was an institution of welfare which helps the unemployed and uses the word library because they lend clothes as a library lends books, but it has nothing to do with libraries. Number 2 is overlapped with number 1. And number 3 is a newsletter from a library system. Although it is not a scholarly piece of research it is good to know what other libraries do about to serve the unemployed, in that case it can be worthwhile for the research as best practices in libraries.

1. Belmont Clothes Library

<http://www.communitywise.wa.gov.au/cases/belmont.htm>

Date retrieved: 26.06.2004

2. Empowering community members

<http://www.communitywise.wa.gov.au/pdfs/cases-4.pdf>

Date retrieved: 26.06.2004

3. How Libraries can Help the Unemployed Worker

<http://clc.lib.mi.us/capital/newsletter/2003/03-August.PDF>

Date retrieved: 26.06.2004

**Searching in Alltheweb with quotes:**

By searching in Alltheweb it was found 5 sites. The first two overlapped and were about library discussion lists, not exactly pieces of scholarly information. Number 3 deals with a community agency for the unemployed which uses the word library, but it has nothing to do with libraries at all. Numbers 4 and 5 are overlapped and presents a newsletter showing actual library services for the unemployed. Numbers

1. [or-roots] New Index of 1850 - Library Services

<http://www.sos.state.or.us/pipermail/or-roots/2004-January/003494.html>

Date retrieved: 26.06.2004

2. [or-roots] New Index of 1850 - Library Services

<http://www.sos.state.or.us/pipermail/or-roots/2004-January/003493.html>

Date retrieved: 26.06.2004

3. Belmont Clothes Library

<http://www.communitywise.wa.gov.au/cases/belmont.htm>

Date retrieved: 26.06.2004

4. <http://www.clc.lib.mi.us/capital/newsletter/2003/03-August.PDF>

Date retrieved: 26.06.2004

5. Upper Hudson Library System

[http://www.uhls.org/uhls/mem\\_services/outreach/grants.cfm](http://www.uhls.org/uhls/mem_services/outreach/grants.cfm)

Date retrieved: 26.06.2004

**Searching Google without quotes:**

Out of 8 results, Google retrieved 7 results relevant and pertinent to the research of library services for the unemployed. Only the 8th was not relevant or pertinent. Nevertheless all the 7 hits were about services for the unemployed offered in libraries, they were not sources from scholarly publications.

1. Monmouthshire Council - Library Services -

[http://www.monmouthshire.gov.uk/Monmouth/English/Education and Learning/Librari es/Library Services/](http://www.monmouthshire.gov.uk/Monmouth/English/Education_and_Learning/Librari es/Library_Services/)

Date retrieved: 26.06.2004

2. Norfolk County Council Library Services - Charities and Disability ...

<http://www.norfolk.gov.uk/communities/communityinformation/disability.htm>

Date retrieved: 26.06.2004

3. Bucks CC - Library Service - Buckinghamshire People's Network

[http://www.buckscc.gov.uk/libraries/lima\\_lib\\_peoples\\_network\\_info1.htm](http://www.buckscc.gov.uk/libraries/lima_lib_peoples_network_info1.htm)

Date retrieved: 26.06.2004

4. Learneast | Library Services | Libraries ... unemployed people and employed people

<http://www.suffolkcc.gov.uk/libraries/learneast.html>

Date retrieved: 26.06.2004

5. Monash Public Library Service Information

<http://www.monlib.vic.gov.au/about.html>

6. Cork City Library Service

[http://www.corkcorp.ie/facilities/facilities\\_libraries\\_membership.html](http://www.corkcorp.ie/facilities/facilities_libraries_membership.html)

Date retrieved: 26.06.2004

7. Dublin City Public Libraries

<http://www.iol.ie/dublincitylibrary/DOD/Page13.htm>

Date retrieved: 26.06.2004

8. Classified Ads

<http://www.berkeleydailyplanet.com/classifieds/111.html>

Date retrieved: 26.06.2004

### **Searching AlltheWeb without quotes:**

Searching in Alltheweb these terms without quotes: library services for the unemployed, the first 8 results were as follows. Only records 6 to 8 were related to the research topics, they were libraries offering library services for the unemployed, the other first 5 records did not show any relevance or pertinence to the topics researched. Unlike Google, Alltheweb's results are not very high in relevance and pertinence in the results. Therefore Google is a lot far better than AlltheWeb.

1. Find in a Library: Job search and reemployment services for the unemployed : hearing before the Subcommittee on Human

<http://www.worldcatlibraries.org/wcpa/ow/e636a0fc658937dfa19afeb4da09e526.html>

Date retrieved: 26.06.2004

2. New relations of welfare in the contracting state: the marketisation of services for the

unemployed in Australia

<http://www.coss.net.au/library/7652.html>

Date retrieved: 26.06.2004

3. The Greenspun family server maintained (sort of) by Philip Greenspun.

<http://www.greenspun.com/>

Date retrieved: 26.06.2004

4. GOVERNMENT GRANTS AND LOANS: - Assistance and Services for the Unemployed

<http://www.idimagic.com/htmls/grants/pf0070006.htm>

Date retrieved: 26.06.2004

5. Health Services Research Web Sites

<http://www.nlm.nih.gov/nichsr/hsrsites.html>

Date retrieved: 26.06.2004

6. State Library of Queensland Services for Public Libraries - Young Peoples Services

<http://www.slq.qld.gov.au/publib/yps/future.htm>

Date retrieved: 26.06.2004

7. Services for Students (SIAS-T-Wide)

<http://www.sias.sk.ca/sias/servicesforstudents>

Date retrieved: 26.06.2004

8. Services for Adult Learners.

[http://www.birmingham.gov.uk:81/preview/GenerateContent?CO... ITEM\\_TYPE=0&MENU\\_ID=5260](http://www.birmingham.gov.uk:81/preview/GenerateContent?CO... ITEM_TYPE=0&MENU_ID=5260)

Date retrieved: 26.06.2004

### **Searchs in gateways**

The two gateways used were BUBL and Humbul Humanities Hub.

### **Searching in the BUBL**

The best results came from the gateway BUBL. Since the gateway is only library and information science related it was easier to find information within it. Nevertheless BUBL searching architecture is not well built since it does not accept syntax logic operators, thus it was not possible to search "library services for the unemployed." Thus, only the word "unemployed" was possible to be retrieved. Yes, all the hits are relevant and pertinent. What helped was that the gateway being exclusive for LIS field then unemployed was considered as an issue in LIS, fortunately all hits deal with library needs or services for the unemployed. Still, only record number 8 showed a table of contents of a journal containing the research terms in question.

1: Public library services for unemployed (B. Beach, Queensland, 11.93)  
<http://130.159.187.223/ns-search/archive/lis/surveys/1993/publib101.htm?NS-search-set=\40e24\s8k.e2459d&NS-doc-offset=0&>  
Date retrieved: 26.06.2004

2: CPU Number 11 1994  
<http://130.159.187.223/ns-search/archive/journals/cpu/n1194.htm?NS-search-set=\40e24\s8k.e2459d&NS-doc-offset=1&>  
Date retrieved: 26.06.2004

3: Wired Whitehall  
<http://130.159.187.223/ns-search/archive/subject/politics/whiteh13.htm?NS-search-set=\40e24\s8k.e2459d&NS-doc-offset=2&>  
Date retrieved: 26.06.2004

4: Edupage 13/01/94  
<http://130.159.187.223/ns-search/archive/journals/edupage/940113.htm?NS-search-set=\40e24\s8k.e2459d&NS-doc-offset=3&>  
Date retrieved: 26.06.2004

5: CPU Number 7 1994  
<http://130.159.187.223/ns-search/archive/journals/cpu/n0794.htm?NS-search-set=\40e24\s8k.e2459d&NS-doc-offset=4&>  
Date retrieved: 26.06.2004

6: AMERICAN MEDICAL ASSOCIATION  
<http://130.159.187.223/ns-search/archive/subject/medicine/health/clinto14.htm?NS-search-set=\40e24\s8k.e2459d&NS-doc-offset=5&>  
Date retrieved: 26.06.2004

7: Archie  
<http://130.159.187.223/ns-search/archive/internet/tools/archie/archie8.htm?NS-search-set=\40e24\s8k.e2459d&NS-doc-offset=6&>  
Date retrieved: 26.06.2004

8: Scandinavian Public Library Quarterly Volume 26 Number 4 1993  
<http://130.159.187.223/ns-search/archive/journals/splq/v26n0493.htm?NS-search-set=\40e24\s8k.e2459d&NS-doc-offset=7&>

Date retrieved: 26.06.2004

### **Searching at the gateway Humbul Humanities Hub:**

Searching at the gateway Humbul Humanities Hub, unlike in BUBL showed much less precision, relevance and pertinence in the results. This gateway it is also devoted for LIS resources, but its searching capabilities are even weaker than those of BUBL. It was not possible to search for the phrase of this research "library services for the unemployed", and it was not possible to search for the sole word of unemployed, thus unemployment was the only successful term to retrieve information for. And still, the two hits retrieved are not as much related to the topics being researched.

Interdisciplinary research on discourse, politics and identity, Austrian Academy of Sciences

<http://www.oeaw.ac.at/wittgenstein/>

Date retrieved: 26.06.2004

Social policy pamphlets at the LSE

[http://www.lse.ac.uk/library/pamphlets/SocialPolicy/social\\_policy\\_pamphlets.htm](http://www.lse.ac.uk/library/pamphlets/SocialPolicy/social_policy_pamphlets.htm)

Date retrieved: 26.06.2004

### **General summary:**

In general terms the search engines have better retrieving information architectures than those of the gateways. From the Google and Alltheweb engines, Google is far more better than alltheweb. Google linked both with boolean and syntax logic operators giving relevance, and pertinence to the results as well as precision in ranking. As for the gateways, BUBL was much better than Humbul Humanities Hub. The general results are that gateway organize better information than search engines, but the search engines have better searching capabilities. And information from search engines are superficial and not deeper, it does not retrieve invisible or deep web pages as gateways do. Perhaps in the future if search engines should be able to retrieve information from gateways, thus in this way Web searchers might find more relevant information than as these exercises do. Overall this exercise showed also how the term library is misused in the results from Australia dealing with clothing confusing the LIS community researchers.