



**Queensland University of Technology**  
Brisbane Australia

This is the author's version of a work that was submitted/accepted for publication in the following source:

Melby, Melissa K., [Anderson, Debra J.](#), Sievert, Lynnette Leidy, & Obermeyer, Carla Makhlouf (2011) Methods used in cross-cultural comparisons of vasomotor symptoms and their determinants. *Maturitas*, 70(2), pp. 110-119.

This file was downloaded from: <http://eprints.qut.edu.au/47232/>

© © 2011 Elsevier Ireland Ltd. All rights reserved.

This is the author's version of a work that was accepted for publication in *Maturitas*. Changes resulting from the publishing process, such as peer review, editing, corrections, structural formatting, and other quality control mechanisms may not be reflected in this document. Changes may have been made to this work since it was submitted for publication. A definitive version was subsequently published *Maturitas* Volume 70, Issue 2, October 2011, Pages 110-119 doi:10.1016/j.maturitas.2011.07.01

**Notice:** *Changes introduced as a result of publishing processes such as copy-editing and formatting may not be reflected in this document. For a definitive version of this work, please refer to the published source:*

<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.maturitas.2011.07.010>

1 Review

2 **Methods used in cross-cultural comparisons of vasomotor symptoms**  
3 **and their determinants**

4 Melissa K. Melby<sup>a\*</sup>, Debra Anderson<sup>b</sup>, Lynnette Leidy Sievert<sup>c</sup>, Carla Makhoulouf  
5 Obermeyer<sup>d</sup>

6  
7 <sup>a</sup> Department of Anthropology, University of Delaware, Newark, DE 19716 USA; National Institute of  
8 Health and Nutrition, Shinjuku, Tokyo, Japan

9 <sup>b</sup> Institute of Health and Biomedical Innovation, Queensland University of Technology, Victoria Park  
10 Rd, Kelvin Grove, QLD 4059 Australia

11 <sup>c</sup> Department of Anthropology, University of Massachusetts Amherst, Amherst, MA 01003-9278 USA

12 <sup>d</sup> Department of HIV/AIDS, WHO, 20 Avenue Appia, 1211 Geneva, Switzerland

13  
14 \*Corresponding author: Tel: +1 302 831 1857; fax: +1 302 831 4002  
15 *E-mail address:* mmelby@udel.edu (M.K. Melby)

16  
17 Abstract Word Count: 237

18 Text word count (minus references): 3186

19 Reference count: 50

20  
21 *Abbreviations:*

22 BMI, body mass index;

23 E2, estradiol;

24 FSH, follicle stimulating hormone;

25 SHBG, sex hormone binding globulin;

26 HT, hormone therapy

27 HF, hot flush;

28 NS, night sweats;

29 QOL, quality of life;

30 VMS, vasomotor symptoms

31  
32 *Study Abbreviations:*

33 AJMWHs, Australian/Japanese Midlife Women's Health Study;

34 DAMEs, Decisions At Menopause Study;

35 FMEG, Four Major Ethnic Groups;

36 HWHS, Hilo Women's Health Survey;

37 MAHWIS, Mid-Aged Health in Women from the Indian Subcontinent;

38 POAS, Penn Ovarian Aging Study;

39 SWAN, Study of Women's Health Across the Nation;

40 WHiMNS, Women's Health in Midlife National Study;

41 WISHeS, Women's International Study of Health and Sexuality;

42

43

44

1 **ABSTRACT**

2 Methodological differences among cross-cultural studies of vasomotor symptoms  
3 limit attempts at comparison or systematic review. We reviewed only cross-cultural  
4 studies of menopausal symptoms that explicitly examined symptoms in general  
5 populations of women in different countries or different ethnic groups in the same  
6 country. This resulted in the inclusion of nine studies: *Australian/Japanese Midlife*  
7 *Women's Health Study (AJMWHs)*, *Decisions At Menopause Study (DAMeS)*, *Four*  
8 *Major Ethnic Groups (FMEG)*, *Hilo Women's Health Survey (HWHS)*, *Mid-Aged*  
9 *Health in Women from the Indian Subcontinent (MAHWIS)*, *Penn Ovarian Aging*  
10 *Study (POAS)*, *Study of Women's Health Across the Nation (SWAN)*, *Women's Health*  
11 *in Midlife National Study (WHiMNS)*, and *Women's International Study of Health and*  
12 *Sexuality (WISHeS)*.

13 Vasomotor symptoms generally include hot flushes and night sweats although  
14 other associated symptoms exist. Prevalence rates vary between and within  
15 populations, and data on frequency and bothersomeness/severity should be collected.  
16 Significant cultural differences in vasomotor symptoms were observed in 8/9 studies,  
17 and symptoms were influenced by the following determinants: menopausal status,  
18 hormones (and variance), age (or actually, the square of age, age<sup>2</sup>), education, BMI,  
19 depression, anxiety, poor physical health, perceived stress, lifestyle factors (hormone  
20 therapy use, smoking and exposure to passive smoke), and acculturation (in  
21 immigrant populations). These studies highlight the methodological challenges  
22 involved in conducting multi-population studies, particularly when languages differ,  
23 but also highlight the importance of performing multivariate and factor analyses.  
24 Recommendations are made to improve methodological rigor and facilitate  
25 comparisons in future cross-cultural menopause studies.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9

*Keywords:*

Menopause

Cross-cultural

Methodology

Symptom reporting

Vasomotor symptoms

Hot flushes

1	<b>Contents</b>
2	1. Introduction
3	2. Methods
4	3. Results and Discussion
5	3.1. Study Design and methodological considerations
6	3.1.1. Study design
7	3.1.2. Constituent vasomotor symptoms
8	3.1.3. Factor analyses
9	3.1.4. VMS measures
10	3.1.4.1. Subjective
11	3.1.4.2. Objective
12	3.2. Determinants of VMS
13	3.2.1. Culture (country/ethnicity)
14	3.2.2. Menopausal status and hormonal
15	3.2.3. Demographic
16	3.2.4. Anthropometric
17	3.2.5. Mental/physical health
18	3.2.6. Lifestyle
19	3.2.7. Environmental
20	4. Conclusions
21	

## 1 **1. Introduction**

2 Vasomotor symptoms (VMS) are considered hallmark symptoms of menopause in  
3 most cultures. Cross-cultural differences in the prevalence and experience of VMS  
4 have been well-documented [1-3], but rigorous comparisons are hampered by  
5 methodological differences [2]. In order to increase the understanding of cultural  
6 variation in, and influences on, VMS and to improve methodological rigor in future  
7 research, this review examines nine studies that explicitly compare symptoms across  
8 different cultural (country/ethnic) groups using similar methodology: *Australian/  
9 Japanese Midlife Women's Health Study* (AJMWHs) [4], *Decisions At Menopause  
10 Study* (DAMeS [5-9]), *Hilo Women's Health Survey* (HWHS) [10-12], *Four Major  
11 Ethnic Groups* (FMEG) [13]; *Mid-Aged Health in Women from the Indian  
12 Subcontinent* (MAHWIS)[14, 15]), *Penn Ovarian Aging Study* (POAS) [16-19], *Study  
13 of Women's Health Across the Nation* (SWAN) [20-28], *Women's Health in Midlife  
14 National Study* (WHiMNS) [29]; and *Women's International Study of Health and  
15 Sexuality* (WISHeS) [30]. The objectives of this review are to: (1) assess whether  
16 VMS differ cross-culturally; (2) identify determinants of VMS; (3) make  
17 recommendations on methods for future cross-cultural studies.

## 18 **2. Methods**

19 This review includes only studies that compare VMS frequencies across  
20 ethnic groups within or between countries. The studies are described in detail in the  
21 overview to this series of review papers [31].

22 We reviewed methodological and study design characteristics, frequencies of  
23 VMS, and determinants of VMS identified in multivariate analyses in the studies.

1 Recommendations are made throughout this review to enable more rigorous  
2 cross-cultural comparisons in future research.

### 3 **3. Results and Discussion**

#### 4 *3.1 Study design and methodological considerations*

##### 5 *3.1.1 Study design*

6 Following an earlier publication [2], this review focuses on publications since  
7 2004. Individual studies utilized similar instruments and methodology for comparison  
8 between subpopulations, but design characteristics and methods varied considerably  
9 among studies (**Table 1** and **Overview** [31]). Eight of 9 studies documented  
10 significant cultural (ethnic/country) differences in VMS (**Table 2**), but more rigorous  
11 comparisons across studies would be facilitated by greater standardization of  
12 methodology and study design.

13 Detailed discussion of and recommendations concerning methodological issues  
14 can be found in the Overview [31]. We must distinguish between occurrence,  
15 perception and reporting of VMS [20], as these are differently assessed by different  
16 methods and mediated by language. Most studies translated and administered  
17 language-specific versions of questionnaires, but some (FMEG, HWHS) did not.  
18 Linguistic variation in symptom terminology complicates estimates of symptom  
19 prevalence and highlights potentially more nuanced physiological experiences. Rates  
20 of hot flush prevalence in one Japanese population differed by more than 7-fold,  
21 depending on the term [32]. To avoid influence of menopausal stereotypes on  
22 reporting, VMS should be embedded in an everyday complaint list, as in DAMEs and  
23 HWHS.

24 To characterize relevant variation in the menopausal transition, we recommend  
25 an age range of 45-55. This could be expanded to 40-60 if a more extended profile is

1 desired, or shifted earlier in populations with earlier age at menopause or in  
2 longitudinal studies (when inclusion of more premenopausal women at baseline  
3 would be recommended). However data should be reported for ages 45-55 to enable  
4 cross-study comparisons. Most questionnaires use either a 2-week or 1-month recall  
5 period. A shorter recall period may be more accurate, but a 1-month recall period  
6 covers an average menstrual cycle. We need studies that ask both, to provide data on  
7 how these are related (e.g., are 1 month recall rates similar to or double 2-week recall  
8 rates?) and to assess how they may change by factors such as menopausal status.  
9 Longer or ambiguous recall periods should not be used, although it may be  
10 informative to ask women if they have *ever* experienced VMS.

11

### 12 3.1.2 Constituent vasomotor symptoms

13 Hot flushes (HFs) are the defining VMS, but associated symptoms vary  
14 considerably between studies, and include thermoregulatory, sexual and sleep-related  
15 symptoms. Many studies include night sweats (NSs), which are HFs that occur at  
16 night with significant perspiration. These may disturb sleep, and sleep troubles may  
17 be a proxy for them in symptom reports. The extent to which sleep and sexual  
18 symptoms (see Sexual review [33]) are associated with vasomotor symptoms is  
19 influenced by cultural and individual practices related to sleep [34] and sexual  
20 behavior. In DAMEs, sleep disturbances were associated with VMS in Spain but with  
21 general somatic symptoms in Morocco [9]. HFs and NSs have been shown to have  
22 different determinants [35], and thus should be queried separately to enable  
23 comparisons between studies.

24 WISHes examined age patterns of symptom prevalence in women aged 20-70yrs  
25 and found that in addition to HFs and NSs, vaginal dryness, sexual arousal difficulties,



1 sleeping difficulties, aches from head to shoulders, and poor memory also peaked at  
2 age 50, the average age of menopause [30]. In contrast, symptoms such as sweating,  
3 sexual desire changes, and psychological symptoms peaked earlier [30]. Thus  
4 difficulty sleeping, vaginal dryness and sexual arousal difficulties might share  
5 underlying etiology with VMS.

6

### 7 *3.1.3 Factor analyses*

8 Factor analysis identifies symptoms that can be classified together (often assumed  
9 to share underlying etiology, such as hormonal changes), based on statistical rather  
10 than a priori concepts, to which cross-cultural work is particularly susceptible. Factor  
11 analysis can determine whether VMS constitutes a unique symptom factor and  
12 whether other symptoms are associated with VMS.

13 In DAMEs, factor analysis of the 20 symptoms shared among sites resulted in up  
14 to 8 factors in different countries. When final factor analyses were constrained to  
15 permit only three factors, HFs factored with sexual symptoms in Spain and with  
16 somatic symptoms in Morocco, but were not included in the US or Lebanon final  
17 solutions [9]. When more factors were permitted, HFs often showed high factor  
18 loading scores, suggesting that for some populations a greater number of factors may  
19 be required to include this symptom (rated most bothersome in 3 of 4 sites),  
20 particularly when everyday complaint lists are used [36]. In WHiMNS, HFs were  
21 excluded a priori [29], and thus assumed to constitute a unique symptom factor.

22 In DAMEs, HFs and NSs did not load onto the same factor as anxiety and  
23 depression in any country. Similarly in SWAN, two consistent symptom factors  
24 emerged from analyses across ethnic groups: vasomotor and  
25 psychological/psychosomatic [22]. In HWHS, factor analyses identified 3 factors,

1 with one factor containing HFs, NSs, loss of sexual desire, trouble sleeping and  
2 vaginal dryness [11]. Cross-sectional results may differ from longitudinal studies, as  
3 POAS found that psychological factors were associated with, and even predicted,  
4 VMS [18].

5 We recommend that factor analyses should be performed on the whole sample as  
6 well as each subgroup separately as in DAMEs; and all symptoms with high  
7 prevalence should be included in final solutions (the number of factors should not be  
8 limited a priori, so that symptoms associated with HFs can be assessed).

9

### 10 *3.1.4 VMS Measures*

#### 11 *4.1.4.1. Subjective*

12 Self-reported symptoms often include measures of frequency, severity, and/or  
13 bothersomeness. Of these, frequencies may be the most comparable across cultures  
14 because populations may vary in the degree to which they are bothered by symptoms  
15 or rate their severity. HF frequencies range from 21 to 84%, but methodological  
16 differences between studies render comparisons difficult (**Table 3**).

17 Although HF frequency generally accounts for the majority (60-75%) of  
18 variability in treatment outcome, additional information is gained from severity [37].  
19 If a single endpoint is desired, a combined Frequency x Severity score could be used  
20 [36, 37]. The terms severity and bothersomeness are often used interchangeably.  
21 While severe symptoms are likely to be bothersome, this may not always be the case.  
22 For example, severe HFs at home or in cold environments may be less bothersome  
23 than less severe HFs in public (where removing clothes is not possible) or in warmer  
24 environments.

1 Not all women who experience VMS are bothered [24], but bothersomeness may  
2 be important to quality of life (QOL). In DAMEs, there appeared to be a correlation  
3 between frequency and bothersomeness of HFs, as well as other emotional and  
4 somatic symptoms [7]. In SWAN, negative affect, symptom sensitivity, sleep  
5 problems and number of visits reporting HFs were associated with HF bother, even  
6 after adjusting for HF frequency [24]. Women with frequent but not bothersome HFs  
7 had lower negative affect and were more likely to be married. Women with infrequent  
8 but bothersome HFs were more likely to be in poorer health, have lower education,  
9 and to be African-American vs. Caucasian, and less likely to be Japanese [24]. Since  
10 perception of severity or bothersomeness may exhibit significant cultural differences,  
11 collection of such data in addition to frequency is recommended.

12

#### 13 3.1.4.2. *Objective*

14 While most studies of menopausal symptoms rely on subjective report, recent  
15 studies have used skin conductance as an 'objective' measure of thermoregulatory  
16 instability associated with HFs [10, 38]. However, skin conductance relies on  
17 sweating, and HFs are heat dissipation events that involve vasodilation but not always  
18 sweating. Thus measurements do not exhibit one-to-one correspondence with  
19 self-reports [39], suggesting that information on severity or bothersomeness may be  
20 important, particularly in terms of QOL. Ambulatory HF monitors have been  
21 developed [40, 41], and are recommended for use in future cross-cultural studies.

22 In a 24-hour ambulatory study and a 3-hour laboratory study in HWHS,  
23 Japanese-Americans (JAs) and European-Americans (EAs) showed no significant  
24 differences between reported or objectively demonstrated HFs. In contrast, 2-week  
25 recall of bothersome symptoms was significantly lower in JAs, possibly due to

1 reporting bias because JAs also reported fewer symptoms of other conditions [10].  
2 Lower recall of bothersome HFs by JAs [12] might also result from physiological  
3 differences in HFs, as JAs experienced fewer HFs as flushing with an associated  
4 change in pulse compared to EAs [10].

5 Subjective and objective measures of HFs may provide insight into the range of  
6 differences between occurrence, perception and bothersomeness [20]. Thus, future  
7 research should collect data on symptom frequency (subjective and objective) and  
8 severity and/or bothersomeness (as measure of interference with daily life activities  
9 and QOL).

10

### 11 *3.2 Determinants of vasomotor symptoms*

12 To answer the question of whether cultural differences in VMS derive from  
13 confounding variables that exhibit cultural variation, and to identify determinants of  
14 menopausal symptoms (**Table 4**), multivariate analyses are essential. Many factors  
15 appear significant in bivariate analyses, but are no longer significant in multivariate  
16 models.

17 WISHeS reported regression coefficients, permitting estimation of symptom  
18 prevalence at age 50 in subpopulations with various determinants [30]. For example,  
19 the estimated prevalence of HFs =  $36.8 + 3.9*(\# \text{ mental morbidity items}) + 2.1*(\#$   
20  $\text{ physical morbidity items}) + 5.8*(\text{early surgical menopause: yes}=1, \text{no}=0)$ . Thus for  
21 50-year old women with no morbidity and not surgically menopausal, 36.8% would  
22 be expected to have HFs. For 50-year old women with early surgical menopause, 2  
23 chronic physical diseases, and 3 mental morbidity items, the prevalence of HFs would  
24 be 56.7%. Similar regression analyses in non-western populations with additional

1 determinants may lead to more complex and culturally-diverse models of VMS  
2 variability and midlife symptoms in general.

3

#### 4 *3.2.1. Culture (country/ethnicity)*

5       The 9 studies reviewed here used country (3/9), ethnicity (5/9) and both (1/9) as  
6 proxies for cultural group, and ranged from only western countries with similar health  
7 profiles (mean BMI  $\geq$  25, clinically overweight) (WISHeS) to more culturally diverse  
8 populations such as Western/Asian (AJWMHS, MAHWIS) and US/European/Middle  
9 Eastern (DAMeS). Seven of the eight studies conducting multivariate analyses on  
10 VMS reported significant differences in VMS by culture group (only WISHeS, with  
11 significance  $P < 0.001$ , did not). Yet the significance of difference decreased in some  
12 studies when confounding variables were controlled for (POAS) but not in others  
13 (SWAN, WHiMNS).

14

#### 15 *3.2.2. Menopausal status and hormonal*

16       After adjusting for other risk factors, menopausal status showed the most  
17 consistent association with HFs. Data on menopausal status should be collected and  
18 reported following STRAW stages [42, 43], and data on surgical menopause and  
19 hormone therapy (HT) use should be collected and reported separately. Comparison  
20 of VMS frequency is complicated by varying rates of HT use, ranging from 0%  
21 among surgically menopausal women in Morocco to 42% among postmenopausal  
22 women in the US (DAMES) [7].

23       Hormone data may clarify menopausal status, and be correlated with VMS. In the  
24 POAS, the standard deviation in estradiol (E2), but not E2 levels were significantly  
25 associated with symptoms, highlighting the importance of repeated measures and

1 measures of variability over the menopausal transition [18]. In the SWAN, serum sex  
2 steroid, FSH and SHBG levels varied by ethnicity, but were highly confounded by  
3 ethnic disparities in body size [25].

4

### 5 3.2.3. Demographic

6 Truly menopausal symptoms, the increased prevalence of which is due to  
7 underlying changes of menopause, should exhibit an inverted U-shaped curve with  
8 age (or an inverse relationship with  $age^2$ ), achieving maximum prevalence around the  
9 average age of menopause (50 yrs), while symptoms of aging should exhibit a  
10 positive linear relationship with  $age$ . In WISHeS, all of the symptoms that peaked at  
11 50 had significant regression coefficients for early reproductive surgery, no  
12 significant coefficients for age, negative coefficients for  $age^2$  (ie, inverted parabola),  
13 and significant positive coefficients for mental and physical morbidity [30] Thus  
14 controlling for age or menopausal status in a linear fashion is inadequate, and future  
15 studies of midlife symptoms should include a quadratic age term in models.

16 When examined, demographic factors such as socioeconomic status and  
17 education showed inconclusive or non-significant patterning across studies. Education  
18 showed a negative relationship with VMS in 2 studies, a positive relationship in one  
19 study, and was not significant in two studies.

20

### 21 3.2.4. Anthropometric

22 High BMI may increase the risk of HFs due to increased insulating effects of  
23 excess body fat [26, 27], which may increase core body temperature. BMI exhibited  
24 positive relationships with VMS in 2/5 studies, and a strong positive relationship with  
25 total symptom number in FMEG.

1

2 *3.2.5. Mental/physical health*

3 Measures of mental and physical morbidity should be included in any  
4 cross-cultural study of menopausal symptoms, as these often vary by culture group  
5 and contribute significantly to prevalence (and bothersome) rates (see Psychological  
6 symptom review [44] and Somatic symptom review [45]). Both depression and  
7 anxiety were positively related to VMS in 3/3 studies. Women with depression were  
8 more likely to report HFs (POAS and WHiMNS), and an Australian longitudinal  
9 study showed that depression often preceded HFs [46]. In POAS, anxiety scores at  
10 previous assessment significantly predicted HFs, with those reporting high anxiety  
11 being nearly 5 times more likely to experience HFs [19]. Physical morbidity and  
12 perceived stress were positively related to VMS in 3/4 and 2/2 studies, respectively.

13

14 *3.2.6. Lifestyle*

15 Lifestyle variables included in the studies reviewed here are not exhaustive, and  
16 lack of significant relationships may reflect inadequate variation or statistical power.  
17 However, smoking and passive smoke exposure were identified as significant  
18 determinants of VMS. Dietary factors such as soy isoflavones were not [21], possibly  
19 due to relatively low intake levels compared to Asian intakes [2, 47]. Religion was not  
20 significant in studies reviewed here, but religious differences have been observed in  
21 other studies [38]. Hormone therapy is included in Table 4 as a lifestyle variable  
22 because, although HT use influences endogenous hormone concentrations, it also  
23 reflects access to medical care and medicalization of menopause.

24

25 Attitudes toward menopause and medicalization of menopause vary  
cross-culturally [3], and may influence rates of VMS reporting. Westernization,

1 acculturation and medicalization are not always highly correlated and future research  
2 is required to parse the variance in VMS attributed to these factors. In DAMEs, the  
3 highest HF rates were reported in the site (Morocco) that is least medicalized, and  
4 where the traditional vocabulary does not even have a word for menopause [7]. In the  
5 SWAN, Chinese- and Japanese-American women who were least acculturated tended  
6 to report more negative attitudes toward the menopause [28], yet had lower rates of  
7 vasomotor symptoms compared to African-, Caucasian- and Hispanic-Americans. In  
8 contrast, in MAHWIS, UK Asian women who were less acculturated reported more  
9 VMS [14]. In MAHWIS, although UK Asian and Delhi women reported poorer health  
10 and higher physical and emotional symptoms than the UK Caucasian, the 2 UK  
11 groups reported significantly higher rates of HFs and night sweats than the Delhi  
12 group [15], suggesting that westernization might correlate with higher rates of VMS.

13

#### 14 *3.2.7. Environmental variables*

15 Ethnic and cultural differences in VMS frequency may derive not only from  
16 individual physiological and lifestyle differences but also environmental differences  
17 such as ambient temperature [48, 49], which may be influenced by indoor heating and  
18 air conditioning.

19

## 20 **4. Conclusions**

21 Among menopausal symptoms, VMS are of great clinical importance, as they  
22 impact quality of life and often lead women to seek treatment. Evaluation of how  
23 VMS rates vary between cultural (country and ethnic) groups, and which factors  
24 influence them, has been complicated by methodological and reporting differences.  
25 Culture group was not significant in regression analyses of HFs in WISHeS, nor in



1 AJMWHs. In POAS ethnic differences decreased significantly when many  
2 confounding variables were controlled for in adjusted models [16], suggesting that in  
3 same country multi-ethnic studies much of the variability may be attributed to  
4 confounding variables that correlate with ethnicity. In contrast, SWAN found  
5 significant ethnic differences even after adjusting for many covariates [21]. In studies  
6 such as DAMEs and MAHWIS with greater cultural differences between populations  
7 (e.g., western, Middle Eastern, Asian), country differences remained significant, even  
8 in multivariate models, suggesting that indeed there may be true cultural differences,  
9 or at least that the relevant local biological factors have not yet been identified [50].

10 Cross-cultural differences in VMS are likely confounded by differences in  
11 important determinants such as hormonal, health, and lifestyle factors. Of the  
12 determinants examined by at least 3 studies (ie, denominator of 3 or greater in  
13 Summary column of Table 4), age, menopausal status and mental/physical health  
14 factors were significant in a majority of the studies. Few studies found significant  
15 relationships with the following: demographic variables such as education and  
16 employment status; lifestyle variables such as smoking, activity level and diet; and  
17 BMI. However, inadequate variation in variables such as BMI and activity level, and  
18 lack of statistical power, might explain these results. Additionally, in some studies the  
19 most appropriate variable may not have been examined: exposure to passive smoke  
20 might be more important than smoking (as in SWAN), and age<sup>2</sup> might be better than  
21 age (WISHeS).

22 Recommendations on study design and analysis are presented in **Table 5**. With  
23 the exception of hormonal data and objective measures of hot flushes, all of these  
24 recommendations can be easily followed in any study, thereby strengthening the field  
25 of menopausal research and facilitating cross-cultural comparisons. In choosing which

1 data to collect, researchers must evaluate issues and constraints such as: subject and  
2 researcher burden; invasiveness (eg, daily diaries may be more burdensome for some  
3 than wearing a HF monitor or having blood drawn); cost; questionnaire administration  
4 (ranging from postal questionnaires not requiring interviewer contact to those  
5 requiring blood samples, dietary assessments and objective HF measurements). For  
6 variables such as socioeconomic status and activity level, relative assessments (e.g.,  
7 financial comfort, or ability to meet basic needs in local context) may be more useful  
8 than absolute numbers.

9 Non-vasomotor symptoms, such as psychological symptoms (eg, anxiety and  
10 depression), may influence VMS or be influenced by them (eg, night sweats may  
11 affect sleep). Thus even if the primary interest is VMS, collection of data on other  
12 symptoms is important. Future research should build on the foundational studies  
13 reviewed here and methodological recommendations proposed in this review and the  
14 Overview [31] , to identify local cultural and biological determinants that will explain  
15 more of the observed cross-cultural variability in vasomotor symptoms and  
16 experience.

17

18

## 19 **List of Tables**

20 **Table 1** Study design characteristics

21 **Table 2** Significance of ethnic/country group differences observed in VMS by study

22 **Table 3** Hot flush (HF) or night sweat (NS) rates by ethnic/country group and study

23 **Table 4** Significance and direction of influence of determinants of vasomotor  
24 symptoms identified in multivariate analyses

25 **Table 5** List of methodological recommendations for studies of vasomotor symptoms

26

**Contributors and their role**

Paper conception, review, data extraction, drafting of manuscript and preparation of tables were done by MKM. Critical review and editing was done MKM, DA, LLS, and CMO.

**Competing interests**

None of the authors have a conflict of interest or competing interests.

**Provenance and peer review**

Commissioned and externally peer reviewed.

**REFERENCES**

- [1] Obermeyer CM. Menopause across cultures: a review of the evidence. *Menopause* 2000;7:184-92.
- [2] Melby MK, Lock M, Kaufert P. Culture and symptom reporting at menopause. *Human Reproduction Update* 2005;11:495-512.
- [3] Freeman EW, Sherif K. Prevalence of hot flushes and night sweats around the world: a systematic review. *Climacteric* 2007;10:197-214.
- [4] Anderson D, Yoshizawa T, Gollschewski S, Atogami F, Courtney M. Menopause in Australia and Japan: effects of country of residence on menopausal status and menopausal symptoms. *Climacteric* 2004;7:165-74.
- [5] Obermeyer CM, Ghorayeb F, Reynolds R. Symptom reporting around the menopause in Beirut, Lebanon. *Maturitas* 1999;33:249-58.
- [6] Obermeyer CM, Reher D, Alcalá LC, Price K. The menopause in Spain: results of the DAMES (Decisions At MENopause) study. *Maturitas* 2005;52:190-8.
- [7] Obermeyer CM, Reher D, Saliba M. Symptoms, menopause status, and country differences: a comparative analysis from DAMES. *Menopause* 2007;14:788-97.
- [8] Obermeyer CM, Schulein M, Hajji N, Azelmat M. Menopause in Morocco: symptomatology and medical management. *Maturitas* 2002;41:87-95.
- [9] Sievert LL, Obermeyer CM, Saliba M. Symptom groupings at midlife: cross-cultural variation and association with job, home, and life change. *Menopause* 2007;14:798-807.
- [10] Brown DE, Sievert LL, Morrison LA, Reza AM, Mills PS. Do Japanese American women really have fewer hot flashes than European Americans? The Hilo Women's Health Study. *Menopause* 2009;16:870-6.
- [11] Sievert LL, Morrison LA, Reza AM, Brown DE, Kalua E, Tefft HA. Age-related differences in health complaints: the Hilo women's health study. *Women Health* 2007;45:31-51.
- [12] Sievert LL, Morrison L, Brown DE, Reza AM. Vasomotor symptoms among Japanese-American and European-American women living in Hilo, Hawaii. *Menopause* 2007;14:261-9.
- [13] Im EO, Lee B, Chee W, Brown A, Dormire S. Menopausal symptoms among four major ethnic groups in the United States. *West J Nurs Res* 2010;32:540-65.

- 1 [14] Hunter MS, Gupta P, Papitsch-Clark A, Sturdee DW. Mid-Aged Health in  
2 Women from the Indian Subcontinent (MAHWIS): a further quantitative and  
3 qualitative investigation of experience of menopause in UK Asian women,  
4 compared to UK Caucasian women and women living in Delhi. *Climacteric*  
5 2009;12:26-37.
- 6 [15] Gupta P, Sturdee DW, Hunter MS. Mid-age health in women from the Indian  
7 subcontinent (MAHWIS): general health and the experience of menopause in  
8 women. *Climacteric* 2006;9:13-22.
- 9 [16] Freeman EW, Sammel MD, Lin H, Gracia CR, Pien GW, Nelson DB et al.  
10 Symptoms associated with menopausal transition and reproductive hormones  
11 in midlife women. *Obstet Gynecol* 2007;110:230-40.
- 12 [17] Freeman EW, Sammel MD, Lin H, Gracia CR, Kapoor S. Symptoms in the  
13 menopausal transition: hormone and behavioral correlates. *Obstet Gynecol*  
14 2008;111:127-36.
- 15 [18] Freeman EW, Sammel MD, Lin H. Temporal associations of hot flashes and  
16 depression in the transition to menopause. *Menopause* 2009;16:728-34.
- 17 [19] Freeman EW, Sammel MD, Lin H, Gracia CR, Kapoor S, Ferdousi T. The role  
18 of anxiety and hormonal changes in menopausal hot flashes. *Menopause*  
19 2005;12:258-66.
- 20 [20] Crawford SL. The roles of biologic and nonbiologic factors in cultural  
21 differences in vasomotor symptoms measured by surveys. *Menopause*  
22 2007;14:725-33.
- 23 [21] Gold EB, Block G, Crawford S, Lachance L, FitzGerald G, Miracle H et al.  
24 Lifestyle and Demographic Factors in Relation to Vasomotor Symptoms:  
25 Baseline Results from the Study of Women's Health Across the Nation. *Am J*  
26 *Epidemiol* 2004;159:1189-99.
- 27 [22] Avis NE, Stellato R, Crawford S, Bromberger J, Ganz P, Cain V et al. Is there  
28 a menopausal syndrome? Menopausal status and symptoms across  
29 racial/ethnic groups. *Soc Sci Med* 2001;52:345-56.
- 30 [23] Gold EB, Sternfeld B, Kelsey JL, Brown C, Mouton C, Reame N et al.  
31 Relation of demographic and lifestyle factors to symptoms in a  
32 multi-racial/ethnic population of women 40-55 years of age. *Am J Epidemiol*  
33 2000;152:463-73.
- 34 [24] Thurston RC, Bromberger JT, Joffe H, Avis NE, Hess R, Crandall CJ et al.  
35 Beyond frequency: who is most bothered by vasomotor symptoms?  
36 *Menopause* 2008;15:841-7.
- 37 [25] Randolph JF, Jr., Sowers M, Gold EB, Mohr BA, Luborsky J, Santoro N et al.  
38 Reproductive hormones in the early menopausal transition: relationship to  
39 ethnicity, body size, and menopausal status. *J Clin Endocrinol Metab*  
40 2003;88:1516-22.
- 41 [26] Thurston RC, Sowers MR, Chang Y, Sternfeld B, Gold EB, Johnston JM et al.  
42 Adiposity and reporting of vasomotor symptoms among midlife women: the  
43 study of women's health across the nation. *Am J Epidemiol* 2008;167:78-85.
- 44 [27] Thurston RC, Sowers MR, Sutton-Tyrrell K, Everson-Rose SA, Lewis TT,  
45 Edmundowicz D et al. Abdominal adiposity and hot flashes among midlife  
46 women. *Menopause* 2008;15:429-34.
- 47 [28] Sommer B, Avis N, Meyer P, Ory M, Madden T, Kagawa-Singer M et al.  
48 Attitudes toward menopause and aging across ethnic/racial groups. *Psychosom*  
49 *Med* 1999;61:868-75.

- 1 [29] Lerner-Geva L, Boyko V, Blumstein T, Benyamini Y. The impact of  
2 education, cultural background, and lifestyle on symptoms of the menopausal  
3 transition: the Women's Health at Midlife Study. *J Womens Health (Larchmt)*  
4 2010;19:975-85.
- 5 [30] Dennerstein L, Lehert P, Koochaki PE, Graziottin A, Leiblum S, Alexander JL.  
6 A symptomatic approach to understanding women's health experiences: a  
7 cross-cultural comparison of women aged 20 to 70 years. *Menopause*  
8 2007;14:688-96.
- 9 [31] Melby MK, Sievert LL, Anderson D, Obermeyer CM. Overview of Series:  
10 Methods used in cross-cultural comparisons of menopausal symptoms and their  
11 determinants. *Maturitas* in press;
- 12 [32] Melby MK. Vasomotor symptom prevalence and language of menopause in  
13 Japan. *Menopause* 2005;12:250-7.
- 14 [33] Anderson D, Sievert LL, Melby MK, Obermeyer CM. Methods used in  
15 cross-cultural comparisons of sexual symptoms and their determinants. *Maturitas* in  
16 press;
- 17 [34] Worthman CM, Melby MK. Toward a comparative developmental ecology of  
18 human sleep. In: Carskadon MA (editor) *Adolescent Sleep Patterns:  
19 Biological, Social, and Psychological Influences*. New York: Cambridge  
20 University press; 2002, p. 69-117.
- 21 [35] Sievert LL, Obermeyer CM, Price K. Determinants of hot flashes and night  
22 sweats. *Ann Hum Biol* 2006;33:4-16.
- 23 [36] Melby MK. Factor analysis of climacteric symptoms in Japan. *Maturitas*  
24 2005;52:205-22.
- 25 [37] Sloan JA, Loprinzi CL, Novotny PJ, Barton DL, Lavoie BI, Windschitl H.  
26 Methodologic lessons learned from hot flash studies. *J Clin Oncol*  
27 2001;19:4280-90.
- 28 [38] Sievert LL, Begum K, Sharmeen T, Chowdhury O, Muttukrishna S, Bentley G.  
29 Patterns of occurrence and concordance between subjective and objective hot  
30 flashes among Muslim and Hindu women in Sylhet, Bangladesh. *Am J Hum  
31 Biol* 2008;20:598-604.
- 32 [39] Freedman RR. Chapter 14: Menopausal Hot Flashes. In: *Menopause: Biology  
33 and Pathobiology*: Academic Press; 2000, p. 215-27.
- 34 [40] Freedman RR, Wasson S. Miniature hygrometric hot flash recorder. *Fertil  
35 Steril* 2007;88:494-6.
- 36 [41] Carpenter JS, Andrykowski MA, Freedman RR, Munn R. Feasibility and  
37 psychometrics of an ambulatory hot flash monitoring device. *Menopause*  
38 1999;6:209-15.
- 39 [42] Soules MR, Sherman S, Parrott E, Rebar R, Santoro N, Utian W et al.  
40 Executive summary: Stages of Reproductive Aging Workshop (STRAW).  
41 *Climacteric* 2001;4:267-72.
- 42 [43] Harlow SD, Crawford S, Dennerstein L, Burger HG, Mitchell ES, Sowers MF.  
43 Recommendations from a multi-study evaluation of proposed criteria for  
44 staging reproductive aging. *Climacteric* 2007;10:112-9.
- 45 [44] Anderson D, Melby MK, Sievert LL, Obermeyer CM. Methods used in  
46 cross-cultural comparisons of psychological symptoms and their determinants.  
47 *Maturitas* in press;
- 48 [45] Sievert LL, Anderson D, Melby MK, Obermeyer CM. Methods used in  
49 cross-cultural comparisons of somatic symptoms and their determinants. *Maturitas*  
50 in press;

- 1 [46] Dennerstein L, Lehert P, Guthrie JR, Burger HG. Modeling women's health  
2 during the menopausal transition: a longitudinal analysis. *Menopause*  
3 2007;14:53-62.
- 4 [47] Kimira M, Arai Y, Shimoi K, Watanabe S. Japanese intake of flavonoids and  
5 isoflavonoids from foods. *Journal of Epidemiology* 1998;8:168-75.
- 6 [48] Sievert LL, Flanagan EK. Geographical distribution of hot flash frequencies:  
7 considering climatic influences. *Am J Phys Anthropol* 2005;128:437-43.
- 8 [49] Sievert LL, Freedman RR, Garcia JZ, Foster JW, del Carmen Romano Soriano  
9 M, Longcope C et al. Measurement of hot flashes by sternal skin conductance  
10 and subjective hot flash report in Puebla, Mexico. *Menopause* 2002;9:367-76.
- 11 [50] Lock M. *Encounters with Aging: Mythologies of menopause in Japan and*  
12 *North America.* Berkeley: University of California Press; 1993.  
13  
14