# Low plasma retinol predicts coronary events in healthy middle-aged men: The Prime Study 

Gey, K. F., Ducimetiere, P., Evans, A., Amouyel, P., Arveiler, D., Ferrieres, J., ... Cambien, F. (2010). Low plasma retinol predicts coronary events in healthy middle-aged men: The Prime Study. Atherosclerosis, 208(1), 270-274. DOI: 10.1016/j.atherosclerosis.2009.07.018

## Published in:

Atherosclerosis

## Queen's University Belfast - Research Portal:

Link to publication record in Queen's University Belfast Research Portal

## General rights

Copyright for the publications made accessible via the Queen's University Belfast Research Portal is retained by the author(s) and / or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing these publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

Take down policy
The Research Portal is Queen's institutional repository that provides access to Queen's research output. Every effort has been made to ensure that content in the Research Portal does not infringe any person's rights, or applicable UK laws. If you discover content in the Research Portal that you believe breaches copyright or violates any law, please contact openaccess@qub.ac.uk.

# Low plasma retinol predicts coronary events in healthy middle-aged men: The PRIME Study 

K. Fred Gey ${ }^{\mathrm{a}, *, 1,2}$, Pierre Ducimetière ${ }^{\mathrm{b}, 1}$, Alun Evans ${ }^{\mathrm{c}, 1}$, Philippe Amouyel ${ }^{\mathrm{d}, 1}$, Dominique Arveiler ${ }^{\mathrm{e}, 1}$, Jean Ferrières ${ }^{\mathrm{f}, 1}$, Gerald Luc ${ }^{\mathrm{d}, 1}$, Frank Kee ${ }^{\mathrm{c}, 1}$, Annie Bingham ${ }^{\mathrm{b}, 1}$, John Yarnell ${ }^{\mathrm{c}, 1}$, François Cambieng,1<br>${ }^{\text {a }}$ The MONICA Reference Centre for Vitamins, Bern, Department of Biochemistry and Molecular Biology, University of Bern, Switzerland<br>${ }^{\mathrm{b}}$ France MONICA Co-ordinating Centre, INSERM U258, Hôpital Paul Brousse, Villejuif, France<br>${ }^{\text {c }}$ The UKCRN Centre of Excellence for Public Health (NI), Queen's University of Belfast, UK<br>${ }^{\text {d }}$ Lille MONICA Centre, INSERM U508, Institut Pasteur de Lille, France<br>${ }^{\text {e }}$ Strasbourg MONICA Centre, Department of Epidemiology and Public Health, Medical School of Strasbourg, France<br>${ }^{\mathrm{f}}$ Toulouse MONICA Centre, INSERM U558, Department of Epidemiology, Paul Sabatier-Medical School of Purpan, Toulouse, France<br>${ }^{\mathrm{g}}$ INSERM U525, Université Pierre et Marie Curie, Paris, France

## A R TICLE INFO

## Article history:

Received 26 September 2008
Received in revised form 24 June 2009
Accepted 6 July 2009
Available online 14 July 2009

## Keywords:

Vitamin A
Plasma retinol
Incipient vitamin A-deficiency
Carotenoids
Coronary heart disease
Risk factors
Epidemiology


#### Abstract

The role of plasma retinol and carotenoids in coronary heart disease (CHD) remains unclear. The PRIME Study prospectively evaluated these in France and Northern Ireland in 9758 men aged 50-59 years who were free of CHD at baseline. After five years' follow-up 150 incident cases of CHD (non-fatal myocardial infarction and fatal CHD) were compared with 285 controls matched for age, date of blood collection and study centre. Geometric means of major carotenoids did not differ significantly between cases and controls ( $P>0.05$ ), whereas the absolute and lipid-standardized plasma retinol levels were $9 \%$ lower in cases than controls in both countries ( $P<0.002$ ), without correlation with carotenoids. After adjusting for risk factors, the relative risks (RRs) of CHD in the first four quintiles of retinol distribution in controls ( $\leq 601$, $-683,-760$, and $-846 \mu \mathrm{~g} / \mathrm{l}$ ) were $2.65(P=0.0009), 1.70,1.03$, and 1.12 (all $P>0.05$ ) respectively, relative to the top quintile (retinol $\geq 846 \mu \mathrm{~g} / \mathrm{l}$; linear trend $P=0.0001$ ). The 10th percentile of lipid-standardized retinol ( $\leq 544 \mu \mathrm{~g} / \mathrm{l}$ ) predicted an RR of $4.7(P<0.001)$. The risk associated with low retinol was comparable to strong risk factors (e.g. HDL-cholesterol, Interleukin-6) and behaved additively.

In conclusion, plasma retinol levels of $<601 \mu \mathrm{~g} / \mathrm{l}$ in a fifth of middle-aged European men place them at an approximately threefold RR of developing CHD. Thus the intake of vitamin A might be too low in middle-aged men. These findings must be confirmed.


© 2009 Published by Elsevier Ireland Ltd.

## 1. Introduction

Low serum vitamin $D$ has recently been shown to predispose to coronary heart disease (CHD), but whether vitamin A, another liposoluble vitamin with 'hormone-like' activity, is involved in atherosclerosis is unclear. This is plausible since retinoic acid, the bioactive form of vitamin $A$, regulates genes expression concerning cellular growth, differentiation and apoptosis, has antioxidative properties, participates in angiogenesis and reactivity of endothelial and smooth muscle cells, modulates cell interactions in inflammation [1-7], and can impair arterial re-stenosis [3,5].

[^0]We aimed to assess CHD risk associated with low levels of plasma carotenoids/vitamin A. The PRIME Study (prospective epidemiological study of myocardial infarction) in France and Northern Ireland provided the opportunity, thanks to striking differences in CHD incidence and lifestyle between the countries [6-8]. Plasma levels of vitamin A and carotenoid-precursors reflect bioactivity fairly accurately, for although $80-90 \%$ of vitamin A is stored in the liver, retinol is recycled extensively between plasma, liver and extrahepatic tissues according to retinoic acid needs [1,2,4].

## 2. Subjects and methods

### 2.1. Pooled study cohorts

From 1991 to 1993, 10,600 50-59-year old males, were recruited from the MONICA populations in Belfast, Northern Ireland, and Lille, Strasbourg and Toulouse in France [6-8]. Medical questionnaires included diseases affecting vitamin A status and consumption of
fruit/vegetables, and vitamin supplements, over a typical week [9]. Written informed consent was obtained from all subjects. After 12-hours' fasting, heparinized plasma, prepared immediately from venous blood, was frozen within 15 min at $-80^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$, and shipped weekly for liquid nitrogen storage at SERLIA, Lille [6-8].

According to Minnesota coding and history, 9758 men were CHD-free at baseline: 2399 in Northern Ireland and 7359 in France. After five years, 175 non-fatal MI or fatal CHD events, defined by MONICA criteria, included sudden coronary death (confirmed by clinical data/autopsy [7]): 69 in France ( 57 non-fatal MI, 14 coronary deaths), and 106 in Northern Ireland ( 89 non-fatal MI and 21 coronary deaths). Incident cases of stable and unstable angina were rejected as cases or controls. For each case, two controls were randomly selected from those free of CHD, at the time of the case's event, and matched for centre, age ( $\pm 3$ years), and date of examination ( $\pm 3$ days). Subjects consuming vitamins or 'tonics,' containing vitamins, at least weekly, were excluded. The few cases of diabetes precluded meaningful analysis. Full matching was possible for 167 cases and 334 controls, missing tubes/analyses reducing these to 150 cases ( 123 non-fatal MI; 27 CHD fatalities) and 285 controls: 58/111 in Northern Ireland, and 92/174 in France, respectively. To gain statistical power, pooled cases of CHD were compared with pooled controls.

### 2.2. Chemical analysis

In 2001, the plasma samples were blindly analysed by reverse-phase high-performance liquid chromatography [10] in the Swiss Reference Laboratory for Liposoluble Plasma Antioxidants (appointed by the National Institute of Standards \& Technology, Gaithersburg, MD, after inter-laboratory calibration) and for triglycerides, total and HDL-cholesterol by automated standard assay. A random sample $(n=100)$ of all plasma samples, analysed after recruitment, and 6-7 years later, demonstrated no significant change in retinol or $\beta$-carotene (linear correlation coefficients $>0.9$ ).

Because absolute plasma retinol correlates with cholesterol and triglycerides, despite being carried by retinol-binding protein [1], lipid-standardized values are also presented using multiple linear regression to a cholesterol of $2.49 \mathrm{~g} / \mathrm{l}(5.7 \mathrm{mmol} / \mathrm{l})$ and triglycerides of $1.09 \mathrm{mg} / \mathrm{l}(1.25 \mathrm{mmol} / \mathrm{l})$ [11]. A similar matching for inflammatory markers [8] provided an overlap for nearly all cases ( $n=143$ ) and controls ( $n=242$ ).

### 2.3. Statistics

Geometric means (keeping centre constant) were calculated for pooled cases and controls to adjust for statistically significant differences between centres: fruit/vegetables score, plasma HDL-cholesterol, carotenoids and retinol being higher in France, whereas alcohol intake, plasma total cholesterol, triglycerides and inflammation markers were higher in Northern Ireland. Univariate or multivariate comparisons of cases/controls (including interactions) were by unconditional logistic regression models. Interaction terms with specific covariates, examined seriatim, were introduced into the models. Covariates were dichotomized by their median distribution in controls, tobacco consumption excepted (smokers/non-smokers).

Skewed variables, i.e. triglycerides, high sensitivity C-Reactive Protein (hs-CRP), Interleukin-6 (IL-6), carotenoids, absolute and lipid-standardized retinol were log-transformed and geometric rather than simple means calculated. Correlations between variables were computed as Spearman's rank correlation coefficients for controls from each population, and as pooled cases versus controls. Relative risk (RR) of CHD for any variable was assessed for

Table 1
Comparison of geometric means (keeping the centre constant) of pooled cases with non-fatal myocardial infarction or coronary death versus pooled controls at baseline: The PRIME Study.

|  | CHD cases ( $n=150$ ) | Controls ( $n=285$ ) | $P$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Body mass index ( $\mathrm{kg} / \mathrm{m}^{2}$ ) | 26.9 | 26.9 | 0.93 |
| Smoking (cigarettes/day) ${ }^{\text {a }}$ | 6.9 | 3.8 | 0.002 |
| Present smokers, \% | 39.3 | 28.4 | 0.01 |
| Alcohol intake, ml/day | 30.9 | 33.3 | 0.65 |
| Fruit-vegetables consumption ${ }^{\text {b }}$ | 11.9 | 12.0 | 0.50 |
| Systolic blood pressure, mm Hg | 137.6 | 134.6 | 0.09 |
| Diabetes, \% | 8.0 | 2.1 | 0.008 |
| Total cholesterol, $\mathrm{g} / \mathrm{l}$ | 2.28 | 2.23 | 0.30 |
| HDL-cholesterol, g/l | 0.43 | 0.48 | 0.0003 |
| HDL-cholesterol/total cholesterol | 0.19 | 0.22 | 0.0002 |
| Triglycerides, $\mathrm{g} / \mathrm{l}^{\text {c }}$ | 1.48 | 1.35 | 0.09 |
| Fibrinogen, g/l | 3.62 | 3.43 | 0.06 |
| hs-C-Reactive Protein ${ }^{\text {c }}$ | 1.99 | 1.36 | 0.0002 |
| Interleukin-6 ${ }^{\text {c }}$ | 1.85 | 1.32 | 0.0001 |
| $\alpha$-Carotene, $\mu \mathrm{g} / \mathrm{l}^{\text {c }}$ | 40.5 | 42.7 | 0.57 |
| $\beta$-Carotene, $\mu \mathrm{g} / \mathrm{l}^{\text {c }}$ | 175.8 | 184.3 | 0.52 |
| $\beta$-Cryptoxanthin, $\mu \mathrm{g} / \mathrm{l}^{\text {c }}$ | 61.5 | 66.2 | 0.47 |
| Lutein, $\mu \mathrm{g} / \mathrm{l}^{\text {c }}$ | 118.2 | 121.4 | 0.51 |
| Zeaxanthin, $\mu \mathrm{g} / \mathrm{l}^{\text {c }}$ | 21.5 | 22.9 | 0.17 |
| Lycopene, $\mu \mathrm{g} / \mathrm{l}^{\text {c }}$ | 155.0 | 153.9 | 0.90 |
| Total carotenoids, $\mu \mathrm{g} / \mathrm{l}^{\mathrm{c}}$ | 640.1 | 662.8 | 0.51 |
| Retinol, absolute, $\mu \mathrm{g} / \mathrm{l}^{\mathrm{c}}$ | 664.9 | 715.7 | 0.002 |
| Retinol, lipid-standard, $\mu \mathrm{g} / \mathrm{l}^{\mathrm{c}}$ | 658.1 | 718.1 | 0.0001 |

Statistical significance ( $\mathrm{p}<0.05$ ) is indicated in bold.
a $>1$ cigarette daily.
b Arbitrary units.
${ }^{c}$ Log-transformed.
percentiles or standardized regression coefficients. Statistical significance denotes $P<0.05$ unless otherwise stated. All $P$-values are two-tailed.

## 3. Results

### 3.1. Geometric means of retinol in cases and controls (Table 1) and correlations with fruit/vegetables and plasma carotenoids (Table 2)

At baseline, pooled cases had significantly higher levels ( $P<0.05$ ) of several classic risk factors than controls, e.g. cigarette smoking, HDL-cholesterol/total cholesterol, hs-CRP and IL-6, whereas no differences were observed ( $P<0.06-0.09$ ) for fibrinogen, systolic blood pressure, and triglycerides. Body mass index, total cholesterol, intake of alcohol, fruit/vegetables and all plasma carotenoids did not differ significantly between cases and controls ( $P>0.1$ ) despite fruit/vegetables score and all plasma carotenoids (except lycopene) being significantly lower in Northern Ireland than France (not shown). The fruit/vegetables score was positively associated with total carotenoids (partial Spearman correlation coefficient $r=0.34 ; P<0.001$ ) and all single carotenoids ( $r=0.21-0.36 ; P<0.001$ ). The levels of individual carotenoids (except $\alpha$-carotene) and their total were negatively associated with smoking ( $r=0.10-0.22 ; P<0.01-0.001$ ) and positively with years of schooling: $r=0.16$ and 0.20 in controls and cases respectively ( $P<0.01$ ).

The carotenoid-linked RRs for quintiles of the various carotenoids did not differ significantly and adjustment on classic risk factors had no effect, in either Northern Ireland, where carotenoids (except lycopene) were 27-54\% lower ( $P$ mostly <0.0001), or France (not shown). In contrast, the geometric means of plasma levels of total and lipid-standardized retinol were respectively 665 and $658 \mu \mathrm{~g} / \mathrm{in}$ cases compared to 716 and $718 \mu \mathrm{~g} / \mathrm{l}$ in controls, i.e. $9 \%$ lower ( $P<0.002$ ), without interaction for country ( $P>0.05$ ).

Table 2
Partial Spearman correlation coefficients (holding region constant) of retinol and lipid-standardized retinol levels with risk factors in pooled controls ( $n=285$ ): The PRIME Study.

| Potential risk factor for CHD | Absolute Retinol | Lipid-standardized Retinol |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| Age, years | -0.06 | 0.06 |
| Fruit/vegetable score | 0.03 | 0.06 |
| Cigarette smoking | 0.07 | 0.06 |
| Alcohol intake | $\mathbf{0 . 2 1}$ | $\mathbf{0 . 2 1 ^ { * * * }}$ |
| Systolic blood pressure | $0.12^{* *}$ | 0.10 |
| Diabetes mellitus, \% | 0.00 | 0.03 |
| Body mass index | -0.01 | -0.04 |
| Plasma total cholesterol | $\mathbf{0 . 2 1}$ | 0.01 |
| HDL-cholesterol | 0.08 | $\mathbf{0 . 1 6}$ |
| HDL-cholesterol/total cholesterol | -0.08 | $\mathbf{0 . 1 2}$ |
| Triglycerides | $\mathbf{0 . 3 0 ^ { * * }}$ | 0.09 |
| Fibrinogen | $-\mathbf{0 . 1 7}$ | $-\mathbf{0 . 1 6}$ |
| Hs-C-Reactive Protein | $-\mathbf{0 . 1 7}$ | $-\mathbf{0 . 2 1}$ |
| Interleukin-6 | -0.07 | -0.10 |
| $\beta-C a r o t e n e$ | -0.04 | 0.01 |
| $\beta$-Cryptoxanthin | -0.05 | -0.05 |
| Total carotenoids | 0.01 | 0.03 |

Statistical significance ( $p<0.05$ ) is indicated in bold.

* Statistically significant correlation: $P<0.05$.
** Statistically significant correlation: $P<0.01$.
${ }^{* * *}$ Statistically significant correlation: $P<0.001$.


### 3.2. Centre-adjusted correlations of plasma retinol with other variables (Table 2)

The pooled levels of absolute and lipid-standardized retinol varied independently of plasma carotenoids and fruit/vegetable intake in controls and cases, with identical correlation coefficients (not shown). In controls globally (Table 2), and in France and Northern Ireland separately (centre-specific analysis not shown), absolute and lipid-standardized retinols were significantly confounded by alcohol intake, without significant case/control differences. Plasma levels of fibrinogen and hs-CRP in cases and controls were positively correlated with absolute and lipid-standardized retinol ( $P=0.001$ ), but this was absent for IL-6. The weak positive association of retinol with cholesterol and triglycerides disappeared after lipid-standardization, but a positive correlation with HDLcholesterol and HDL-cholesterol/total cholesterol ratio became significant.

### 3.3. CHD-related RR of low retinol (Figs. 1 and 2 and Table 3)

The RR of CHD increased with decreasing plasma retinol (Fig. 1). This obtained for the quintiles of absolute, lipid-standardized and multivariate-adjusted retinal-without significant centre differences. Taking the fifth quintile ( $>846 \mu \mathrm{~g} / \mathrm{l}$ ) as reference, the RR of quintiles 2 and $3(602-760 \mu \mathrm{~g} / \mathrm{l}$ ) rose moderately (to $1.61-$ and 1.98 -fold). The RR for quintile 1 ( $\leq 601 \mu \mathrm{~g} / \mathrm{l}$ retinol) varied, depending on adjustment (see Fig. 1), between 2.60 ( $P<0.004$ ) and 3.58 ( $P<0.001$ ). The lowest decile ( $\leq 544 \mu \mathrm{~g} / \mathrm{l}$ ) predicted an RR of 3.58 ( $95 \%$ CI: 1.42-6.39) for crude retinol and 4.70 ( $95 \%$ CI: 2.21-9.97) after lipid-standardization ( $P<0.001$ ). Despite a significant linear trend ( $\mathrm{Chi}^{2}=4.8, P=0.0001$ ), the RR in quintile 4 ( $761-846 \mu \mathrm{~g} / \mathrm{l}$ ) and the reference quintile $5(\geq 846)$ did not differ significantly. They might be considered 'optimal' in terms of having the smallest RRs. The few subjects ( $n=3$ ) with retinol levels $<400 \mu \mathrm{~g} / \mathrm{l}$ (previously taken as borderline A-hypovitaminosis [12]) precluded analysis.

Quantifying the contribution of the significant risk factors in a continuous regression model (Table 3) indicated that a 1 SD increase in log retinol ( 0.224 in the control group) decreased the RR significantly by $29 \%$, of lipid-standardized retinol by $35 \%$ in univariate analysis, and by $30 \%$ in unconditional logistic mul-


Fig. 1. Low plasma retinol (<601 $\mu \mathrm{g} / \mathrm{l}$, quintile 1) predicts significantly increased relative risk (RR) of CHD: the PRIME Study. Ordinates, and figures above all columns indicate centre-adjusted RRs in comparison with the reference status (quintile 5). Abcissa: quintiles in controls of plasma retinol in $\mu \mathrm{g} / \mathrm{l}$. Front row: unadjusted retinol; Middle row: multi-adjusted retinol (for systolic blood pressure, smoking, alcohol intake, diabetes, HDL- and total cholesterol, triglycerides, Body mass index, fibrinogen, hs-CRP, and log Interleukin-6). Back row: lipid-standardised retinol (to $220 \mathrm{mg} / \mathrm{dl}$ cholesterol and $110 \mathrm{mg} / \mathrm{dl}$ triglycerides). Statistical significance of columns of quintile $1(<600 \mu \mathrm{~g} / \mathrm{l})(P<0.004,0.02,0.004)$ and of the linear trend of increasing RR from quintile 5 to $1(P=0.0001)$.
tivariate analysis. The effect size equated with that observed for an increase in HDL-cholesterol/total cholesterol ratio or an increase in IL-6 by 1 SD. The standardized RRs of these factors suggested the ranking: HDL-cholesterol/total cholesterol ratio $\approx$ IL$6 \geq$ retinol $\geq$ smoking $\approx$ systolic blood pressure. In contrast total


Fig. 2. Centre-adjusted RRs of retinol and of other risk factors for CHD behave additively but independently: the PRIME Study. Ordinates and figures within columns: RRs after multivariate adjustment for covariates as for column (c) of Fig. 1. Front row: low plasma retinol ( $<601 \mu \mathrm{~g} / \mathrm{l}$ ) associated with high RRs; Back row: higher retinol levels ( $>601 \mu \mathrm{~g} / \mathrm{l}$ ) associated with moderately low to no substantial RR. Abscissae: other risk factors in combination with plasma retinol: Panel A: tertiles of plasma Interleukin-6 (IL-6) in $\mu \mathrm{g} / \mathrm{ml}$ with increasing risk gradient; Panel B: tertiles of HDL-cholesterol/total cholesterol ratio with decreasing risk gradient. Grey columns: observed RRs. Black columns: RRs computed under the hypothesis of no interaction between paired risk factors. The lack of statistically significant differences between grey columns (observed RRs) and the adjoining black columns (computed RRs) excludes significant multiplicative interaction between the paired variables $\left(\right.$ Chi $^{2}(2 \mathrm{DF})=1.26$, NS for IL-6, and Chi ${ }^{2}(2 \mathrm{DF})=0.38$, NS for HDL-cholesterol/total cholesterol ratio).

Table 3
Standardized relative risk of retinol and the strongest risk factors for CHD: The PRIME Study.

|  | Standardized RR | $(95 \% \mathrm{CI})$ | $P$ |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| a Retinol absolute (log) | 0.71 | $(0.57-0.88)$ | 0.002 |
| Lipid-standardized retinol (log) | 0.65 | $(0.52-0.81)$ | 0.0001 |
| b HDL-cholesterol/total cholesterol | 0.53 | $(0.36-0.77)$ | 0.001 |
| Interleukin-6 (log) | 1.56 | $(1.14-2.14)$ | 0.006 |
| Retinol absolute (log) | 0.70 | $(0.53-0.93)$ | 0.01 |
| Smoking | 1.35 | $(1.06-1.72)$ | 0.02 |
| Systolic blood pressure | 1.30 | $(1.00-1.67)$ | 0.05 |

Standardized RR denotes the RR observed with an increase of a variable by 1 SD of control levels before (upper panel) and after multivariate adjustment (lower panel). Variables, e.g. carotenoids, consumption indices for alcohol and fruit/vegetables, Body mass index, and total cholesterol failed to enter this regression model with statistical significance ( $P>0.05$ ).
${ }^{\text {a }}$ Univariate conditional logistic regression.
${ }^{\text {b }}$ Multiple conditional logistic regression adjusting for the listed covariates of statistical significance.
cholesterol, triglycerides, Body mass index, hs-CRP, fibrinogen and alcohol intake (not shown) lacked significance in this model. Although HDL-cholesterol/total cholesterol ratio was the key explanatory variable, other analyses identified HDL-cholesterol as equally strong. None of the interaction terms between low retinol and the levels of carotenoids was significantly associated with CHD (not shown).

The combination of low retinol with tertiles of major risk factors, e.g. IL-6 (Fig. 2: Panel A) and the HDL-cholesterol/total cholesterol ratio; Panel B displayed independent, additive risk. Multiplicative interaction was excluded over the range of covariates. The strongest CHD risk was observed for low retinol and high IL-6 and with low HDL-cholesterol/total cholesterol ratio and HDL-cholesterol. Case numbers were inadequate for multiple risk factor testing.

## 4. Discussion

### 4.1. Carotenoids

In PRIME, as in the Physicians' Health Study [13], low carotenoid levels did not predict CHD. This contrasts with results in healthy middle-aged US smokers [14], and in Swiss with a $42 \%$ smoking prevalence [15]. Since smoking was strongly predictive in PRIME and was associated with low carotenoid levels, these results [ 14,15 ] may have been due to confounding by lifestyle factors, e.g. fruit/vegetable intake.

### 4.2. Vitamin $A$

In PRIME, low plasma retinol predicted CHD independently of carotenoids (Tables 2 and 3 ). This is plausible because vitamin A is only partly replaced by $\beta$-carotene (its major precursor) [1,2,16], since, in industrialized countries, conversion is poor and inconsistent [17]. Many studies have found no significant increase in plasma retinol associated with intake or plasma levels of carotenoids, and vitamin A-deficiency is not fully remediable by carotenoids in a herbivorous diet [16]. Thus the contribution of potential vitamin A-precursor [1,2] to vitamin A status may be overestimated in middle-aged westernised men.

There was a $9 \%$ significantly lower geometric mean in plasma retinol in cases than controls (Table 1), which was probably related to the risk associated with retinol levels $<601 \mu \mathrm{~g} / \mathrm{l}$ (quintile 1, Fig. 1). Previous studies may have failed to detect this because of adequate retinol levels [18-20]. Presumably, this was also the case in US Physicians whose retinol lacked any prediction of CHD [13]. A Dutch study in men and women of broad age-range, which included low retinol levels [21] probably lacked significance because of gender
differences and the age-dependent rise in plasma retinol in males [1,22].

Research on vitamin A initially concentrated on severe Aavitaminosis in children in under-developed countries which may be prevented at plasma retinol levels $\geq 284 \mu \mathrm{~g} / \mathrm{l}$ [1,2], whereas in adult men A-hypovitaminosis with anaemia, cytological and functional abnormalities, can occur at $\leq 400 \mu \mathrm{~g} / 1$ [1,12]. In PRIME subjects the plasma retinol generally lay in the $500-1000 \mu \mathrm{~g} / \mathrm{l}$ range, previously considered as safe [1]. The association of CHD with the lower end of this range ( $<600 \mu \mathrm{~g} / \mathrm{l}$ ) suggests that these men could benefit from levels of $750-850 \mu \mathrm{~g} / \mathrm{l}$ (avoiding Ahypervitaminosis A [1,2] at $>940 \mu \mathrm{~g} / \mathrm{l}$ ).

Factors affecting retinol levels are complex, but the intake of preformed retinol [1] may be crucial since, under steady-state conditions, it has a weak, albeit significant, positive association with plasma retinol in healthy adult males, as in NHANES III [22]. Thus, our results reinforce the current Recommended Daily Intake (or 'Allowance') of at least $0.7-1 \mathrm{mg}$ (safe range $\geq 3 \mathrm{mg}$ in adult males) [1,2]. Vitamin A status would best be improved from preformed vitamin A, preferably from natural sources [1], which are unlikely to cause overdose.

Strengths of the PRIME Study include its prospective design and the assessment of multiple risk factors. A weakness is the limited number of events and the modest number of controls, so confirmation of our findings is crucial. Of the numerous confounders of plasma retinol [1,2], the most obvious are:

- Lipids: the weak positive association of cholesterol and triglycerides with absolute levels of retinol disappeared after lipid-standardization [11] (Table 2). Secondly, retinol and lipids behave inversely regarding CHD (Table 3). Thirdly, regardless of the positive correlation of retinol with HDL-cholesterol/total cholesterol ratio (Table 2), their combination results in an independent additive risk (Table 3; Fig. 2: Panel B) which is almost identical to the combination of retinol with HDL-cholesterol (not shown).
- Alcohol: the weak positive association between retinol and alcohol intake in controls (Table 2) and cases may be unimportant since globally - in contrast to France (data not shown) - alcohol consumption in cases and controls did not differ significantly (Table 1). Similarly, alcohol intake was not significant in multivariate analysis (Table 3).
- Inflammation: plasma retinol correlated inversely with fibrinogen and hs-CRP $(P<0.01)$ but not significantly $(P>0.05)$ with IL-6, which displayed the closest association with CHD [8](Tables 1-3). Furthermore, the combinations of low retinol with rising IL-6 increased the CHD risk independently and additively (Fig. 2: Panel A).
- Ageing: any increase in plasma retinol in the narrow age range of 50-59 years cannot be substantial in PRIME males whose plasma retinol was not significantly correlated with age (Table 2). Nevertheless, all controls were carefully matched for age.
- Season: any effect was excluded by matching.
- Medication: all subjects with CHD at baseline were excluded from analyses. Some apparently healthy subjects took hypotensives ( $\mathrm{HR}=1.83$; CI 1.10-3.06) but this did not correlate significantly with absolute and lipid-standardized retinol in cases or controls. This also held for hypolipidaemics.
- Other: in controls, absolute levels of retinol were unrelated to cigarette smoking, diabetes, and Body mass index (Table 2). Absolute and lipid-standardized retinol also varied independently of the number of years of schooling (a proxy for social class).

We believe these are unlikely to contribute to the increased CHD risk we observed at low plasma retinol levels.

## 5. Conclusion

These novel results suggest that plasma retinol levels of $<601 \mu \mathrm{~g} / \mathrm{l}$ in a fifth of middle-aged European men place them at an approximately threefold RR of developing CHD. This acts independently, but additively to HDL-cholesterol and IL-6 and possibly to other risk factors, e.g. smoking and systolic blood pressure. Our findings await replication, particularly as to whether increasing the intake of preformed vitamin A can correct low vitamin A levels and reduce CHD risk.

## Conflict of interest

None.

## Acknowledgements

We thank the following organizations which allowed the recruitment of the PRIME subjects: the Health screening centers organized by the Social Security of Lille (Institut Pasteur), Strasbourg, Toulouse and Tourcoing; Occupational Medicine Services of Haute-Garonne, of the Urban Community of Strasbourg; the Association Interentreprises des Services Médicaux du Travail de Lille et environs; the Comité pour le Développement de la Médecine du Travail; the Mutuelle Générale des PTT du Bas-Rhin; the Laboratoire d'Analyses de l'Institut de Chimie Biologique de la Faculté de Médecine de Strasbourg; the Department of Health (NI) and the Northern Ireland Chest Heart and Stroke Association.

We also thank the members of the event validation Committees: Pr L. Guize, Dr C. Morrison, Dr M.-T. Guillanneuf, Pr M. Giroud; and the Alliance Partnership Programme for its financial support.

Thanks for invaluable practical assistance are due to the Department of Atherosclerosis SERLIA-INSERM U325, Lille, France (G. Luc, J.M. Bard, J. Fruchart) for storing plasma samples, and the NIST-approved Swiss Reference Laboratory of Liposoluble Vitamins, Vitamin Analytics, F. Hoffmann-La Roche Ltd, Basel, Switzerland (W. Schüepp, C. Aebischer, V. Spitzer) for carriage and blinded courtesy measurement of plasma vitamins, carotenoids, and lipids.

## Appendix A. The PRIME Study Group

The PRIME Study is organized under an agreement between INSERM and the Merck, Sharpe and Dohme-Chibret Laboratory, with the following participating Laboratories:

- The Strasbourg MONICA Project, Laboratoire d'Epidemiologie et de Sante Publique, EA 3430, Strasbourg F-67085, France; and Universite Louis Pasteur, Strasbourg, F-67085, France (D. Arveiler, B. Haas).
- The Toulouse MONICA Project, INSERM, U558; and Département d'Epidemiologie, Universite Paul Sabatier - Toulouse Purpan, Toulouse, France (J. Ferrières, J.B. Ruidavets).
- The Lille MONICA Project, INSERM, U744, Lille, France; and Institut Pasteur de Lille, Lille, France; Université de Lille 2, Lille, France (P. Amouyel, M. Montaye).
- The UKCRN Centre of Excellence for Public Health (NI), Queen's University of Belfast, UK (A. Evans, J. Yarnell, F. Kee). The Department of Atherosclerosis, INSERM, U545, Lille; Institut Pasteur de Lille, Lille; Université de Lille 2, Lille, France (G. Luc, J.M. Bard).
- The Laboratory of Haematology, INSERM, U626, Marseille, Hôpital La Timone, Marseille, France (I. Juhan-Vague, P. Morange).
- The Laboratory of Endocrinology, INSERM, U563, Toulouse, France (B. Perret).
- The Vitamin Research Unit, The University of Bern, Bern, Switzerland (K.F. Gey).
- The Nutrition and Metabolism Group, Centre for Clinical and Population Sciences, Queen's University Belfast, Northern Ireland (J. Woodside, I. Young).
- The DNA Bank, INSERM, U525, Paris, France (F. Cambien).
- The Coordinating Centre, INSERM, Unit 909, Villejuif, F-94807, France; and Université de Paris V, Paris Cardiovascular Research Centre (PAARC), Paris, F-75015, France (P. Ducimetiere, A. Bingham).


## References

[1] Olson JA. Vitamin A. In: Machlin LJ, editor. Handbook of vitamins. 2nd ed. New York \& Basel: M Dekker; 1990. p. 1-57.
[2] Sommer A, West KPJ, Olson JA, Ross CR. Vitamin A deficiency. In: Health, survival and vision. New York \& Oxford: Oxford University Press; 1996. p. 1-438.
[3] Streb JW, Miano JM. Retinoids: pleiotropic agents of therapy for vascular diseases? Curr Drug Targets Cardiovasc Haematol Disord 2003;3:31-57.
[4] Blomhoff R, Blomhoff HK. Overview of retinoid metabolism and function. J Neurobiol 2006;66:606-30.
[5] Gidlof AC, Ocaya P, Krivospitskaya O, Sirsjo A. Vitamin A: a drug for prevention of restenosis/reocclusion after percutaneous coronary intervention? Clin Sci (Lond) 2008;114:19-25.
[6] Yarnell J. The PRIME Study: classical risk factors do not explain the severalfold differences in risk of coronary heart disease between France and Northern Ireland. QJM 1998;91:667-76.
[7] Ducimetiere P, Ruidavets JB, Montaye M, Haas B, Yarnell JW. Five-year incidence of angina pectoris and other forms of coronary heart disease in healthy men aged 50-59 in France and Northern Ireland: the PRIME Study. Int J Epidemiol 2001;30:1057-62.
[8] Luc G, Bard JM, Juhan-Vague I, Ferrieres J, et al. C-reactive protein, interleukin6 , and fibrinogen as predictors of coronary heart disease: the PRIME Study. Arterioscler Thromb Vasc Biol 2003;23:1255-61.
[9] Dauchet L, Ferrieres J, Arveiler D, et al. Frequency of fruit and vegetable consumption and coronary heart disease in France and Northern Ireland: the PRIME study. Br J Nutr 2004;92:963-72.
[10] Hess D, Keller HE, Oberlin B, Bonfanti R, Schuep W. Simultaneous determination of retinol, tocopherols, carotenes and lycopene in plasma by means of high-performance liquid chromatography on reversed phase. Int J Vit Nutr Res 1991;61:232-8.
[11] Jordan P, Brubacher D, Moser U, Stähelin HB, Gey KF. Vitamin E and vitamin A concentrations in plasma adjusted for cholesterol and triglycerides by multiple regression. Clin Chem 1995;41:924-7.
[12] Brubacher G, Vuillemier JP, Ritzel G, Bruppacher R, Stähelin HB, Stransky M. Early signs of hypovitaminosis A. Ernährung-Nutrition 1982;6:211-6.
[13] Hak AE, Stampfer MJ, Campos, et al. Plasma carotenoids and tocopherols and risk of myocardial infarction in a low-risk population of US male physicians. Circulation 2003;108:802-7.
[14] Street DA, Comstock GW, Salkeld RM, Schuep W, Klag MJ. Serum antioxidants and myocardial infarction. Are low levels of carotenoids and alpha-tocopherol risk factors for myocardial infarction? Circulation 1994;90:1154-61.
[15] Gey KF, Stähelin HB, Eichholzer M. Poor plasma status of carotene and vitamin $C$ is associated with higher mortality from ischemic heart disease and stroke: Basel Prospective Study. Clin Investig 1993;71:3-6.
[16] Sommer A, Davidson FR. Assessment and control of vitamin A deficiency: the Annecy Accords. J Nut 2002;132, 2845S-50S.
[17] Hickenbottom SJ, Follett JR, Lin Y, et al. Variability in conversion of beta-carotene to vitamin A in men as measured by using a double-tracer study design. Am J Clin Nutr 2002;75:900-7.
[18] Salonen JT, Salonen R, Penttila I, et al. Serum fatty acids, apolipoproteins, selenium and vitamin antioxidants and the risk of death from coronary artery disease. Am J Cardiol 1985;56:226-31.
[19] Stähelin HB, Eichholzer M, Gey KF. Nutritional factors correlating with cardiovascular disease: results of the Basel Study. Bibl Nutr Diet 1992;49:24-35.
[20] Evans RW, Shaten BJ, Day BW, Kuller LH. Prospective association between lipid soluble antioxidants and coronary heart disease in men. The Multiple Risk Factor Intervention Trial. Am J Epidemiol 1998;147:180-6.
[21] Kok FJ, de Bruijn AM, Vermeeren R, et al. Serum selenium, vitamin antioxidants, and cardiovascular mortality: a 9-year follow-up study in the Netherlands. Am J Clin Nutr 1987;45:462-8.
[22] Ballew C, Bowman BA, Sowell AL, Gillespie C. Serum retinol distributions in residents of the United States: third National Health and Nutrition Examination Survey, 1988-1994. Am J Clin Nutr 2001;73:586-93.


[^0]:    * Corresponding author. Present address: c/o Alun Evans, The UKCRN centre of Excellence for Public Health (NI), Queen's University of Belfast, Mulhouse Building, Grosvenor Road, Belfast BT12 6BJ, UK. Tel.: +44 289023 7153; fax: +44 2890231907.

    E-mail address: a.evans@qub.ac.uk (K.F. Gey).
    ${ }^{1}$ On behalf of the PRIME Study Group (see Appendix A).
    ${ }^{2}$ Formerly affiliation 'a'.

